Ruḥamā' Baynahum

VOLUME 3 UTHMĀNĪ SECTION

By:

Shaykh Muḥammad Nāfi

WWW.MAHAJJAH.COM

Transliteration key

ļ [†] - '	d - ض
Ĩ-ā	t- ط
b - ب	z - ظ
t - ت	`-3
th - ث	gh - غ
jj	f - ف
∠- 'n	q - ق
h-خ	<u>s</u>] - k
d – د	J – ل
dh - ذ	m - م
r - ر	u - ن
j- Z	w, ū - و
S – س	• - h
sh - ش	- y, ī
ڊ <i>-</i> ص	

Contents

Brief Introductory Points	10
Some Significant Rules of the Ahl al-Sunnah for the Acceptance of a Narration	11
The Rules of the Shīʿī Scholars for the Acceptance of a Narration	12
The Intermarriages between the ${\tt Ban}\bar{{\tt u}}{\tt H}\bar{{\tt a}}{\tt shim}$ and ${\tt Family}$ of 'Uthmān at a glance	13
Chapter One - Ties of Kinship and Marriage	15
1. 'Uthmān's Mother, Arwā bint Kurayz	16
Family Links	18
2. The Marriage of Ruqayyah bint Rasūlillāh كالمنتغضة to ʿUthmān	19
Corroboration from Shī ī Books	20
'Uthmān's Inclusion in the Booty and Reward of the Battle of Badr	21
Corroboration from Shī ī Books	21
Removal of a Misconception	22
3. The Marriage of Umm Kulthūm bint Rasūlillāh حَالْتُنْعَبِينَةُ to ʿUthmān	22
Some Added Virtues	23
Corroboration from Shī ī Books	25
Daughters and ʿUthmān's Link عَاسَتَنْهَوَتَهُ Daughters and ʿUthmān's Link	26
ʿAlī's Statement as Support	27
Beneficial Points	28
Fallacy	31
Removal of this Fallacy	31
4. The Marriage of Umm Kulthūm to 'Uthmān's son, Abān	34
5. The Marriage of Sukaynah bint al-Ḥusayn to Zayd ibn ʿAmr ibn ʿUthmān	35
6. The Marriage of Fāṭimah bint al-Ḥusayn to ʿAbd Allāh ibn ʿAmr ibn ʿUthmān	35
7. The marriage of Umm al-Qāsim to Marwān ibn Abān	37
Exploration of Family Links	37
Chapter Two - The Aspect of Bayʿah	41
Corroboration from Shīʿī Books	44
Another Angle	46
This Statement is Not Ilzāmī	47
Removing a Misconception	47

Conclusion	49
Chapter Three	51
1. 'Uthmān's Sincere Assistance in 'Alī's Marriage	51
2. ʿUthmān serves as a Witness to ʿAlī's Marriage	53
3. ʿAlī's Testimony of ʿUthmān being a Mu'min, Ṣāliḥ, Muttaqī, and Muḥsin	54
4. 'Uthmān's title Dhū al-Nūrayn in the light of 'Alī's statement coupled with	
other virtues	55
First Narration	56
Second Narration	56
A statement of the 'Ulamā'	57
5. The Status of 'Uthmān in the Ummah from the Tongue of 'Alī	58
6. The Position of 'Uthmān's Dīn in the Sight of 'Alī	59
7. ʿAlī's Testimony of ʿUthmān being a Forerunner to Goodness, a Dweller of	
Jannah, and not Being Punished	59
8. ʿAlī recites Qur'ān during the Khilāfah of ʿUthmān	61
9. ʿAlī listens to ʿUthmān's Recitation	61
10. ʿUthmān gifts ʿAlī a Conveyance	62
11. ʿUthmān invites ʿAlī for a Meal	63
The Declarations of the Hāshimīs in Favour of ʿUthmān	63
12. The Statement of ʿAbd Allāh ibn ʿAbbās	63
13. The Statement of Hasan ibn ʿAlī ibn Abī Ṭālib	66
14. The Statement of Zayn al-ʿĀbidīn ibn Ḥusayn	67
15. The Statement of Jaʿfar al-Ṣādiq ibn Muḥammad al-Bāqir	69
Deductions and Points	69
The Status of 'Uthmān on the Tongues of the Senior Hāshimīs with reference	e to
Shī ī books	72
1. Ḥasan ibn ʿAlī ibn Abī Ṭālib's Declaration	72
2. ʿUthmān's Excellence on the Tongue of Jaʿfar al-Ṣādiq	72
3. Another Statement of Imām Jaʿfar al-Ṣādiq	73
Noteworthy Points	75
4. The Statement of ʿAbd Allāh ibn ʿAbbās	76
Announcement	78

Chapter Four	79
1. ʿUthmān and ʿAlī's Mutual Assistance in Implementation of Aḥkām (Decrees)	79
a. Including ʿAlī in Consultations over Judgements	80
b. The Punishment for Drinking Alcohol: the Incident of Walīd ibn ʿUqbah	81
Clarification	82
c. The Punishment for Adultery	84
d. The Punishment for Homosexuality	84
e. A Case regarding Loss of Eyesight	85
2. Hāshimī Positions and Stations during the 'Uthmānī khilāfah	86
a. Judiciary Post	86
b. Governor	87
c. Appointment over Significant Activities in Makkah	88
3. Hāshimīs resorting to 'Uthmānī courts for Settlement of Disputes, Reaching	
Decision through Mutual Consultation, and Supporting 'Uthmān's Judgements	88
4. 'Uthmān's reverence for the Hāshimīs and leading their Ṣalāt al-Janāzah	92
a. Veneration for ʿAbbās ibn ʿAbd al-Muṭṭalib	92
b. ʿUthmān Led the Ṣalāt al-Janāzah of ʿAbbās	94
c. Abān ibn ʿUthmān led the Ṣalāt al-Janāzah of Muḥammad ibn	
al-Ḥanafiyyah, ʿAlī's son	94
Reminder	95
d. Abān ibn ʿUthmān leads the Ṣalāt al-Janāzah of ʿAbd Allāh ibn Jaʿfar	
al-Ṭayyār	95
5. Hāshimī Participation in Jihād during the ʿUthmānī khilāfah	96
a. The Battle of Tripoli and Africa (26 A.H.)	96
b. The Expedition of Khurāsān, Ṭabristān, and Jurjān (30 A.H.)	97
c. Participation in Jihād in 32 A.H.	98
d. Maʿbad ibn al-ʿAbbās's Martyrdom in 35 A.H.	99
6. The Monetary Rights of the Relatives of Rasūlullāh ماللنتينينية	100
Gifts for ʿAlī	101
Fulfilment of Monetary Rights (from the books of the Shī´ah)	103
Significant Points and Deductions	105

Chapter Five	109
Points Regarding the Siege of 'Uthmān	109
1. Representative for Ḥajj and the Selection of Ibn ʿAbbās	110
Corroboration by Shīī Historians	112
2. The Efforts of 'Alī and His Children to Protect 'Uthmān	113
More quotations on Incidents during the Siege in Sequence	116
Corroboration from the Shīʿah	117
Corroboration from Shīī books	122
Another Narration of this Occasion	124
Corroboration from the Shīʿah	128
Conclusion of the Siege Discussion	128
The Name of ʿUthmān was prevalent in the Children of ʿAlī	129
ʿUthmān's name in ʿAlī's Offspring From Shīʿī books	131
Conclusion	134
Bibliography	136
Shī ī Books	140

بسم الله الرحمن الرحيم

الحمد لله رب العلمين الرحمن الرحيم و الصلوة و السلام على سيد الأولين و الآخرين إمام الرسل و خاتم النبيين و على آله الطيبين و بناته الأربعة الطاهرات و أزواجه المطهرات و أصحابه المزكين المنتخبين و على سائر أتباعه بإحسان إلى يوم الدين و على جميع عباد الله الصالحين رضوان الله عليهم أجمعين

All praise belongs to Allah, the Lord of the worlds, the Most Compassionate, Most Merciful. Salutations and peace be upon the leader of the former and later generations; the leader of the Messengers and seal of the Prophets, his pure family, his four chaste daughters, his noble and chosen Companions, all his followers with goodness until the Day of Recompense, and all Allah's righteous servants. May Allah's pleasure be upon them all.

After the masnūn khuṭbah, this humble servant, Muḥammad Nāfiʿ ibn Moulānā ʿAbd al-Ghafūr ibn Moulānā ʿAbd al-Raḥmān (may Allah forgive them) living in Muḥammadī Village (adjacent to Jāmiʿah Muḥammadī Sharīf), Jhang District, Western Punjab, Pakistan, submits that the third section of *Ruḥamā' Baynahum* (ʿUthmānī) is being presented to the esteemed readers. This section will cover the harmonious relationship and mutual respect between the third khalīfah of Islam Sayyidunā ʿUthmān and Sayyidunā ʿAlī and his family. Moreover, due to the pressing need of the current times, some allegations against Sayyidunā ʿUthmān (i.e. *Mas'alah Aqribā' Nawāzī*) have been answered which will be presented as a separate treatise, Allah willing.

This section has been divided into five chapters just as the previous sections (\dot{q} and $F\bar{a}r\bar{u}q\bar{q}$). Those who love the number five will be delighted with this selection.

We have clarified aforetime that the purpose of this book is not to challenge, nor do we anticipate an answer to it. We only wish to present their mutual closeness and connection as confirmed in the Book of Allah.

Presently, there is extremism in religious matters. We live in an era where radicalism abounds. It is a vital necessity of this time that the correct status

of the noble Ṣaḥābah ﷺ is preserved according to the method of the pious predecessors. Moreover, their emulation should be determined as the purpose of life in the light of the Qur'ān and Sunnah. This will secure salvation in the Hereafter.

We implore the respected readers to read each incident of this book and contemplate:

- What was the relationship between Sayyidunā ʿUthmān ibn ʿAffān and Sayyidunā ʿAlī ?
- What regard did they have of one another?
- How did they behave towards each other?
- What was their methodology in their practical life?
- What do their social dealings from the beginning to end teach us?

Bearing these points in mind, one should study this book. The doubts and misgivings fabricated about these august personalities will disappear, Allah willing.

Brief Introductory Points

- Our fundamental proof for the correctness of their congenial relationship is found in the glorious Qur'ān. The Qur'ān emphatically announced that a relationship of religious brotherhood always existed between the noble Companions of Rasūlullāh حَالَيْتَعَدِّوَتَكَمُ. The narrations and historical reports, etc., all what we will quote in this chapter, only serve as corroborations for the Qur'ānic declaration.
- 2. When the fundamental proof for this fact is the Book of Allah, then only those narrations may be relied upon which are not contrary to the Qur'ān and authentic Sunnah. Those reports which paint a picture of dispute and disagreement between these personalities will not prove beneficial as counter-proofs. Using them as proof will be incorrect.

Some Significant Rules of the Ahl al-Sunnah for the Acceptance of a Narration

1. In this regard, Khaṭīb al-Baghdādī has reported a ḥadīth in *al-Kifāyah fī ʻIlm al-Riwāyah* via his chain which leads up to Sayyidunā Abū Hurayrah ********:

عن أبي هريرة عن النبي صلى الله عليه و سلم أنه قال سيأتيكم عني أحاديث مختلفة فما جاءكم موافقا لكتاب الله و سنتي فهو مني و ما جاءكم مخالفا لكتاب الله و سنتي فليس مني

Abū Hurayrah reports that Rasūlullāh كالتنتيدينة declared:

Scores of contradictory narrations will soon come to you from me. Whatever conforms to the Book of Allah and my Sunnah is from me and whatever contradicts the Book of Allah and my Sunnah is not from me.¹

This ḥadīth makes it crystal clear that all those narrations found in aḥādīth books, or history books, or books dealing with virtues and merits which are contrary to the Qur'ān and Sunnah are not worthy of consideration.

2. The masters of ḥadīth observe the following rule which has been documented by Ḥāfiẓ al-Dhahabī in *Tadhkirat al-Ḥuffāẓ*. While discussing Sayyidunā ʿAlī , he quotes his statement and then presents a goodwill commentary from his side. He writes:

عن أبي الطفيل عن علي قال حدثوا الناس بما يعرفون و دعوا ما ينكرون أتحبون أن يكذب الله و رسوله قال الذهبي فقد زجر الإمام علي عن رواية المنكر و حث على التحديث بالمشهور و هذا أصل كبير في الكف عن بث الأشياء الواهية و المنكرة من الأحاديث في الفضائل و العقائد و الرقائق

From Abū al-Ṭufayl—from ʿAlī who said:

Relate to people what they are familiar with and avoid what they are unfamiliar with. Do you want Allah and His Messenger to be belied?

Al-Dhahabī comments, "Imām ʿAlī has warned against strange reports and encouraged reporting well-known issues. This is a core essential in

¹ Al-Kifāyah fī ʿIlm al-Riwāyah, pg. 430.

avoiding the spread of weak and munkar reports regarding virtues, beliefs, and heartfelt advices." $\ensuremath{^{11}}$

The Rules of the ${\rm Sh}\bar{\imath}\bar{\imath}$ Scholars for the Acceptance of a Narration

 Imām Muḥammad al-Bāqir while citing the prophetic final sermon mentioned that Rasūlullāh مَرْتَنَعَيْهُ وَمَالَمُ announced:

فإذا أتاكم الحديث فأعرضوه على كتاب الله عز و جل و سنتي فما وافق كتاب الله و سنتي فخذوا به و ما خالف كتاب الله و سنتي فلا تأخذوا به

When a narration reaches you, then examine it in the light of the Book of Allah—the Mighty and Majestic—and my Sunnah. Take what is in harmony with Allah's Book and my Sunnah and discard what contradicts them.²

2. Mughīrah ibn Saʿīd was an extremely cunning man. He would disseminate numerous fabricated narrations in the name of Imām al-Bāqir. Imām Jaʿfar al-Ṣādiq would caution people to be wary of the shrewdness and concoctions of Mughīrah ibn Saʿīd and would apprise them of a blanket ruling:

```
فاتقوا الله و لا تقبلوا علينا ما خالف قول ربنا تعالى و سنة نبينا محمد صلى الله عليه و سلم
```

Fear Allah and do not accept in our name anything that contradicts the declaration of our Rabb, the Exalted, and the Sunnah of our Nabī Muḥammad $J_{\rm all}^{\rm all}$.

Note: More details of these rules were included in the introduction to the $Sidd\bar{q}\bar{q}$ and $F\bar{a}r\bar{u}q\bar{q}$ sections. It was briefly mentioned here.

Now the main section of the book will begin. Chapter one contains links through kinship.

¹ *Tadhkirat al-Ḥuffāẓ*, vol. 1 pg. 12; *Kanz al-ʿUmmāl*, vol. 5 pg. 242, book of knowledge, etiquettes of knowledge, with reference to Khaṭīb, first print.

² *Iḥtijāj al-Ṭabarsī*, pg. 229, old print, Iran.

³ *Rijāl Kashī*, pg. 146, discussion on Mughīrah ibn Saʿīd, old Mumbai print; pg. 195, new Tehran print; *Tuhfat al-Aḥbāb fī Nawādir Āthār al-Aṣḥāb*, pg. 373, under Mughīrah ibn Saʿīd.

The Intermarriages between the Banū Hāshim and Family of 'Uthmān at a glance

- - » Sayyidunā ʿAlī's تَعَلِيَّهُ عَنْهُ paternal cousin.
 - » Sayyidunā ʿUthmān's مَعْلَيْهُ mother.
- 2. Sayyidah Ruqayyah تَعَوَّلْنَكُ عَنَا اللهُ
 - » Rasūlullāh's سَلَالَنَّهُ عَلَيْهُ وَسَلَمَ
 - » Sayyidunā ʿUthmān's نَعْنَيْنَكُ wife.
- 3. Sayyidah Umm Kulthūm وَعَالِيَهُمَا اللهُ
 - » Rasūlullāh's سَلَّالَنَّهُ عَلَيْهُ وَسَنَلَة daughter.
 - » Sayyidunā ʿUthmān's المنظنة wife.
- 4. Umm Kulthūm bint ʿAbd Allāh ibn Jaʿfar al-Ṭayyār
 - » Granddaughter of Sayyidunā ʿAlī.1
 - » The wife of Abān, Sayyidunā ʿUthmān's تعَلِينَهُمَا son.
- 5. Sukaynah bint al-Ḥusayn
 - » Granddaughter of Sayyidunā 'Alī.
 - » Wife of Zayd ibn 'Umar, Sayyidunā 'Uthmān's 🕬 grandson.

^{1 &#}x27;Abd Allāh ibn Ja'far is the nephew of Sayyidunā 'Alī سنان (Alī سنان), and to whom Sayyidunā 'Alī wed his beloved daughter Zaynab, the daughter of Sayyidah Fāṭimah and the granddaughter of Nabī المنابية). Thus Umm Kulthūm is the granddaughter of Sayyidunā 'Alī and Sayyidah Fāṭimah منابة). She was married to Abān, the son of Sayyidunā 'Uthmān ibn 'Affān. [translator]

- 6. Fāṭimah bint al-Ḥusayn
 - » Granddaughter of Sayyidunā ʿAlī.
 - » Wife of ʿAbd Allāh ibn ʿUmar, Sayyidunā ʿUthmān's 🏎 grandson.
- 7. Umm al-Qāsim bint al-Ḥasan al-Muthannā
 - » Sayyidunā Ḥasan ibn ʿAlī's 🕬 granddaughter
 - » Wife of Marwān ibn Abān, Sayyidunā ʿUthmān's 🕬 grandson.

Note: Details of this may be found in chapter one.

Chapter One

Ties of Kinship and Marriage

In social life, the strongest bond is accepted to be that of family. A family contracting a relationship with another family is understood as a strong expression of goodness and intermarriage between tribes is considered a sign of unity. Family rituals always remain among tribes, by virtue of which one tribe draws closer to another and is considered compatible to the other. These are natural laws of social life which every sensible and experienced man understands as correct. Keeping this in mind, some of the connections between the blessed families of Sayyidunā 'Uthmān ibn 'Affān ibn Abī al-ʿĀṣ ibn Umayyah and Sayyidunā 'Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib ibn 'Abd al-Muṭṭalib ibn Hāshim will be mentioned below. It will be introduced by Sayyidunā ʿAlī's statement recorded in Shīʿī books like *Nahj al-Balāghah* which he made addressing Sayyidunā Muʿāwiyah . Sayyidunā ʿAlī , in this statement, acknowledges the intermarriages between these two families and attests to their compatibility with each other, although there exists variation of ranks in reality. He states:

```
لم يمنعنا قديم عزنا و لا عادي طولنا على قومك أن خلطناكم بأنفسنا فنكحنا و أنكحنا فعل الأكفاء
```

Our ancient glory and age-old subjugation over your tribe did not prevent us from joining you with ourselves. We married into your tribe and got our daughters married to your boys, just as compatible tribes do.¹

The famous Shī'ī scholar Sayyid 'Alī Naqī titled Fayd al-Islām translated this statement into Persian in the following words:

¹ Nahj al-Balāghah, vol. 2 pg. 32, from his letters to Muʿāwiyah, one of the finest letters, Egypt print.

² Tarjamah wa Sharḥ Fārisī Fayḍ al-Islām, vol. 5 pg. 888.

Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd commentator of *Nahj al-Balāghah* has mentioned 6 links between the Banū ʿAbd Shams and Banū Hāshim after quoting this statement. Those who wish to see the details may refer to his book.

The family links and intermarriages shared by the families of Sayyidunā 'Uthmān and Sayyidunā 'Alī come found in historical reports will now be mentioned in sequence. It is hoped that the readers after studying the historical realities will not find difficulty in reaching sensible conclusions.

1. 'Uthmān's Mother, Arwā bint Kurayz

Sayyidunā 'Uthmān's ﷺ family tree goes as follows: Abū 'Abd Allāh 'Uthmān Dhū al-Nūrayn ibn 'Affān ibn Abī al-ʿĀṣ ibn Umayyah ibn 'Abd Shams ibn 'Abd Manāf. His mother is Sayyidah Arwā bint Kurayz ﷺ. Her mother's ('Uthmān's maternal grandmother) name is Umm Ḥakīm al-Bayḍā' bint 'Abd al-Muṭṭalib ibn Hāshim ibn 'Abd Manāf.

The texts of the genealogists and famous historians will now be presented.

1. Ibn Saʿd mentions under Arwā:

أروى بنت كريز بن ربيعة بن حبيب بن عبد شمس بن عبد مناف بن قصي و أمها أم حكيم البيضاء بنت عبد المطلب بن هاشم بن عبد مناف بن قصي تزوجها عفان بن أبي العاص بن أمية فولدت له عثمان و آمنة ابني عفان ... و أسلمت أروى بنت كريز و هاجرت إلى المدينة بعد ابنتها أم كلثوم بنت عقبة و بايعت رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم و لم تزل بالمدينة حتى ماتت في خلافة عثمان بن عفان

Arwā bint Kurayz ibn Rabī ah ibn Ḥabīb ibn ʿAbd Shams ibn ʿAbd Manāf ibn Quṣayy. Her mother is Umm Ḥakīm al-Bayḍā' bint ʿAbd al-Muṭṭalib ibn Hāshim ibn ʿAbd Manāf ibn Quṣayy. ʿAffān ibn Abī al-ʿĀṣ ibn Umayyah married her and she gave birth to two of his children, ʿUthmān and Āminah. Arwā bint Kurayz embraced Islam and emigrated to Madīnah after her daughter Umm Kulthūm bint ʿUqbah where she pledged allegiance to Rasūlullāh جَمَعَيْتُ . She remained in Madīnah until she passed away in the khilāfah of ʿUthmān ibn ʿAffān.¹

¹ *Țabaqāt Ibn Saʿd*, vol. 8 pg. 166, discussion on Arwā, Leiden print; *Tārīkh Khalīfah ibn Khayyā*ţ, vol. 1 pg. 131, Najaf Ashraf print, Iraq; *Ansāb al-Ashrāf*, vol. 5 pg. 1, Baghdād print, discussion on Uthmān ibn ʿAffān; *Kitāb al-Muḥabbar*, pg. 407, Hyderabad Dakkan print.

2. *Usd al-Ghābah* of Ibn Athīr and *al-Mustadrak* of al-Hakim mention the lineage as follows:

أروى بنت كريز بن ربيعة بن حبيب بن عبد شمس وهو أم عثمان بن عفان رضي الله عنه و أمها أم حكيم و هي البيضاء بنت عبد المطلب عمة النبي صلى الله عليه و سلم ماتت في خلافة عثمان

Arwā bint Kurayz ibn Rabī ah ibn Ḥabīb ibn ʿAbd Shams. She is the mother of ʿUthmān ibn ʿAffān مرالله . Her mother is Umm Ḥakīm al-Bayḍā' bint ʿAbd al-Muṭṭalib, the paternal aunt of Rasūlullāh المرالية. She passed away during the khilāfah of ʿUthmān.¹

The readers should be cognisant of the fact that Sayyidunā 'Uthmān's منتشخة maternal grandmother Umm Ḥakīm al-Bayḍā' bint 'Abd al-Muṭṭalib, who is Rasūlullāh's متَاتَسْعَتِدوسَةُ paternal aunt is the twin of Rasūlullāh's متَاتَسْعَتِدوسَةُ father 'Abd Allāh. This elucidation appears in *al-Istī āb*². The lovers of research may refer to it.

This is a historical fact, documented in books of history and genealogy. All scholars, whether they be Shīʿī, Sunnī, or anyone else, accept this. Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd writes in the commentary of *Nahj al-Balāghah* at many places that Sayyidunā ʿAlī www.would address Sayyidunā ʿUthmān as *Ibn khālī* (son of my maternal uncle). Those who read the book will be aware of this.

The Shīʿī mujtahid and scholar of the 14th century, ʿAbbās Qummī has written about this in *Muntahā al-Āmāl* in the following words:

و اما ام حكيم بنت عبد المطلب پس او زوجهء كريز بن ربيعه بن عبد شمس بن عبد مناف بوده

Umm Ḥakīm ibn ʿAbd al-Muṭṭalib was the consort of Kurayz ibn Rabīʿah ibn Ḥabīb ibn ʿAbd Shams ibn ʿAbd Manāf.³

¹ Al-Mustadrak, vol. 3 pg. 96, Dakkan print; Usd al-Ghābah, vol. 5 pg. 191, chapter on women.

² *Al-Istīʿāb*, vol. 4, discussion on Umm Ḥakīm bint ʿAbd al-Muṭṭalib.

³ Muntahā al-Āmāl, vol. 1, section 9, chapter on the condition of the relatives of Rasūlullāh مكالتشتينينية.

In short, both Shīʿī and Sunnī scholars accept this relationship between Sayyidunā ʿAlī and Sayyidunā ʿUthmān as a result of this relationship will now be presented.

Family Links

- Umm Ḥakīm al-Bayḍā' bint ʿAbd al-Muṭṭalib ibn Hāshim is Rasūlullāh's عَالَمَتَعَدِينَةُ father's twin and his paternal aunt as well as ʿAlī's paternal aunt. She is ʿUthmān's maternal grandmother and ʿUthmān is her grandson.
- 'Uthmān is Ṣafiyyah bint 'Abd al-Muṭṭalib's niece's son. Ṣafiyyah is the maternal aunt of 'Uthmān's mother.
- 'Alī's father, Abu Ṭālib, is the maternal uncle of 'Uthmān's mother. 'Uthmān's mother, Arwā, is his niece.
- 'Alī and 'Uthmān's mother were cousins. Similarly, Ja'far al-Ṭayyār and 'Aqīl are cousins of 'Uthmān's mother.
- 'Uthmān and the children of 'Alī, Ja'far, and 'Aqīl are cousins.
- 'Uthmān's mother is the niece of Sayyid al-Shuhadā' Ḥamzah and 'Abbās ibn 'Abd al-Muṭṭalib.
- Hamzah and 'Abbās are the maternal uncles of Arwā, 'Uthmān's mother.

In short, Sayyidunā 'Uthmān's ¹¹/₁₀ mother is the grandchild of the Banū Hāshim, i.e. the Banū Hāshim are her maternal family. Due to this, Sayyidunā 'Uthmān and Sayyidunā 'Alī ¹¹/₁₀ are related. Other aspects which are worthy to mention will appear shortly. Hopefully you will be delighted to witness the realisation of *but those of [blood] relationship are more entitled.*¹

¹ Sūrah al-Anfāl: 75.

2. The Marriage of Ruqayyah bint Rasūlillāh مَالَنَهُ عَلَى دَعَالَ لَعَلَى عَالَمُ عَالَهُ عَلَى عَالَ عَالَمُ عَالَ ع

Two daughters of Rasūlullāh عَالَيَهُ viz. Sayyidah Ruqayyah and Sayyidah Umm Kulthūm (whose mother is Sayyidah Khadījah عَالَيهُ) came into the marriage of Sayyidunā ʿUthmān ibn ʿAffān عَالَيهُ one after the other. Owing to this double link, the ummah remembered him with the title *Dhū al-Nūrayn* (The Possessor of the Two Lights).

'Allāmah Jalāl al-Dīn al-Suyūṭī affirms in *Tārīkh al-Khulafā*' and Ibn Ḥajar Makkī concurs in *al-Ṣawā'iq al-Muḥriqah* that besides Sayyidunā 'Uthmān ibn 'Affān '''''''''''', there is no human from the sons of Ādam to enjoy the honour of marrying two daughters of a nabī.

قال العلماء و لا يعرف أحد تزوج بنتي نبي غيره و لذلك سمي ذا النورين

The 'Ulamā' declare: No one is known to have married two daughters of a nabī besides him. Owing to this, he was named Dhū al-Nūrayn.¹

The connection enjoyed by Sayyidunā ʿUthmān with the family of the Banū Hāshim due to these blessed unions is independent of a reference. The Dhū al-Nūrayn link is accepted by both sects. Nonetheless, a few references will be presented for the benefit of the masses.

1. Ibn Saʿd writes in the biography of Sayyidah Ruqayyah 🕬 :

رقية بنت رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم و أمها خديجة بنت خويلد ... كان تزوجها عتبة بن أبي لهب بن عبد المطلب قبل النبوة فلما بعث رسول الله و أنزل الله تبت يدا أبي لهب و تب فقال له أبو لهب ... ففارقها و لم يكن دخل بها و أسلمت حين أسلمت أمها خديجة بنت خويلد و بايعت رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم هي و أخواتها حين بايعه النساء و تزوجها عثمان بن عفان و هاجرت معه إلى أرض الحبشة ... قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم إنهما لأول من هاجر إلى الله تبارك و تعالى بعد لوط ... ولدت له بعد ذلك ابنا سماه عبد الله و كان عثمان يكنى به في الإسلام و بلغ ست سنين ... فمات و لم تلد له شيئا

¹ *Tārīkh al-Khulafā*', pg. 105, chapter on mention of 'Uthmān ibn 'Affān, Mujtabā'ī print, Delhi; *al-Şawā'iq al-Muḥriqah*, pg. 107, chapter 7, section 1; *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, vol. 6, pg. 371, virtues of Dhū al-Nūrayn 'Uthmān; *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, vol. 6 pg. 275, with reference to Ibn 'Asākir.

بعد ذلك و مرضت و رسول الله يتجهز إلى بدر فخلف عليها رسول الله عثمان بن عفان فتوفيت و رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم ببدر في شهر رمضان ... و قدم زيد بن حارثة من بدر بشيرا فدخل المدينة حين سوى التراب على رقية بنت رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم و ضرب رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم لعثمان و سهمه و أجره لا خلاف بين أهل السير في ذلك

Ruqayyah bint Rasūlillāh المنتخبة. Her mother is Khadījah bint Khuwaylid. 'Utbah ibn Abī Lahab ibn 'Abd al-Muṭṭalib married her prior to Nubuwwah. When Rasūlullāh المنتخبة was appointed a nabī and Allah revealed, *May the hands of Abu Lahab be ruined, and ruined is he*¹, Abū Lahab told him to divorce her. Accordingly, he divorced her prior to consummation of the marriage.

She embraced Islam when her mother Khadījah bint Khuwaylid embraced Islam and pledged allegiance to Rasūlullāh with her sisters when the women pledged allegiance to him. 'Uthmān ibn 'Affān married her and she immigrated with him to Abyssinia. Rasūlullāh with a stated, "Indeed, they were the first couple to emigrate towards Allah with after Lūt." Thereafter, she bore a son for him and named him 'Abd Allāh. 'Uthmān was given the agnomen Abū 'Abd Allāh in Islam. The boy reached the age of six and passed away. She did not bear any other children for him thereafter.

She fell ill when Rasūlullāh المعتقدة was preparing for Badr. So Rasūlullāh اوران العربين left 'Uthmān ibn 'Affān behind (to look after her). She passed away while Rasūlullāh بالمعتقد was at Badr during the month of Ramaḍān. Zayd ibn Ḥārithah came from Badr to sound glad tidings of the victory and entered Madīnah just as they had filled Ruqayyah's grave with sand. Rasūlullāh المعتقدة apportioned a share of the booty to 'Uthmān and guaranteed him the reward. There exists no dispute among the historians in this matter.²

Corroboration from Shīʿī Books

2. The renowned Shīʿī historian al-Masʿūdī (d. 345 A.H.) supports this union in his book *al-Tanbīh wa al-Ashrāf*. He writes:

¹ Sūrah Lahab: 1.

² *Usd al-Ghābah*, vol. 5 pg. 456, discussion on Ruqayyah; *Usd al-Ghābah*, vol. 3 pg. 377, discussion on 'Uthmān ibn 'Affān.

و كان له من البنين تسعة عبد الله الأكبر توفي و له من العمر ست سنين أمه رقية بنت رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم على ما قدمنا

'Uthmān had 9 sons, viz. ʿAbd Allāh al-Akbar: he lived to the age of six. His mother is Ruqayyah, the daughter of Rasūlullāh حالتنا , as we mentioned previously.¹

'Uthmān's Inclusion in the Booty and Reward of the Battle of Badr

Rasūlullāh كَالْتَعْدَيْتَ included Sayyidunā 'Uthmān ibn 'Affān كَالْتَعْدَيْتَ with the other mujāhidīn in the booty and rewards of the Battle of Badr. Details of this appear in the books of ḥadīth and history. Study the following references for satisfaction:

- 1. Usd al-Ghābah, vol. 5 pg. 456, mention of Ruqayyah.
- 2. Usd al-Ghābah, vol. 3 pg. 377, mention of 'Uthmān.
- Şaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī, vol. 1 pg. 523, chapter on the merits of 'Uthmān ibn 'Affān (Nūr Muḥammadī print, Delhi).

Corroboration from Shīʿī Books

The leading Shīī authorities have supported this. They concur that Sayyidunā 'Uthmān نوانه could not participate in the epic battle due to tending to Sayyidah Ruqayyah ترابع المعالية . Despite this, Rasūlullāh مرابع apportioned for him a share from the booty of Badr and affirmed his partnership in the rewards as well. Al-Masʿūdī documents this in *al-Tanbīh wa al-Ashrāf*:

'Uthmān ibn 'Affān stayed behind from Badr due to Ruqayyah bint Rasūlillāh's المنتشخة sickness. Rasūlullāh المنتشخية apportioned for him his share. He submitted, "O Messenger of Allah, what about my reward?"

عثمان بن عفان تخلف عن بدر لمرض رقية بنت رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم فضرب له بسهمه فقال يا رسول الله و أجري قال و أجرك إلخ

¹ Al-Tanbīh wa al-Ashrāf, pg. 255, mention of 'Uthmān's khilāfah.

Rasūlullāh مَالَمَتْعَيْدَوَيَدَلُ affirmed, "And you receive your reward too."1

Removal of a Misconception

Since Sayyidunā ʿUthmān تَعَلَيْنَا stayed in Madīnah to nurse Rasūlullāh's مَكَالَتُعَا يَوَسَلُهُ daughter in compliance to Rasūlullāh's مَكَالَتُعَا يَوَسَلُهُ instruction, he did not in any way act contrary to any Islamic directive.

Similar was the case of Sayyidunā ʿAlī مَوَالَقَعَةُ who did not participate in the Battle of Tabūk in obedience to Rasūlullāh's مَرَاللَّهُ عَلَيْهُ orders. The same thing happened here, i.e. he did not participate due to Rasūlullāh's مَرَاللَّهُ عَلَيْهُ مَعْلَيْهُ command. Coupled with this is that Allah's honoured Messenger مَرَاللَّهُ عَلَيْهُ مَعْلَيْهُ in this matter. Awarding him a share of the booty and affirming his inclusion in the reward is an explicit evidence of Rasūlullāh's مَرَاللَهُ عَدَى اللهُ

3. The Marriage of Umm Kulthūm bint Rasūlillāh مَكَانَتُنَعَلُهُ وَسَلَمُ to 'Uthmān

It appears in *Ṭabaqāt Ibn Saʿd* in the biography of Sayyidah Umm Kulthūm

Umm Kulthūm is Rasūlullāh's طالعتين daughter. Her honoured mother's name is Khadījah al-Kubrā bint Khuwaylid. Prior to Rasūlullāh's سالتنين Nubuwwah, she was married to 'Utaybah ibn Abī Lahab ibn 'Abd al-Muṭṭalib ibn Hāshim. However, she had not begun living with him yet. When Rasūlullāh المنتخف was appointed as a Nabī and the glorious Qur'ān was revealed humiliating the kuffār, Abū Lahab and his wife, Umm Jamīl, forced their son 'Utaybah to divorce her.

She then remained with her father in Makkah. She embraced Islam when her mother embraced Islam and she pledged allegiance to him with her sisters when the women pledged allegiance. She then made hijrah to Madīnah with Rasūlullāh's مالتنايينا family.

When Ruqayyah ('Uthmān's wife) passed away, Rasūlullāh منظمة married Umm Kulthūm to him. The nikāḥ was contracted in Rabīʿ al-Awwal 3

¹ Al-Tanbīh wa al-Ashrāf, pg. 205, under the second year, Cairo print, Egypt.

A.H. and she began living with him in Jumādā al-Ukhrā of the same year. She remained with 'Uthmān until her demise. She had no children with 'Uthmān. She passed away in Shaʿbān 9 A.H.¹

Some Added Virtues

It is explicitly mentioned in the books of history and ḥadīth that Sayyidunā 'Uthmān نوایت was grief stricken at the loss of Sayyidah Ruqayyah الموایت. He passed his days in a realm of sorrow and mourning. Once, he voiced his grief to Rasūlullāh موایت who stated:

يا عثمان هذا جبريل عليه السلام يأمرني عن الله عز و جل أن أزوجك أختها أم كلثوم على مثل صداقها و على مثل عشرتها فزوجه إياها أخرجها الثلاثة (ابن مندة و أبو نعيم و اين عبد البر)

O 'Uthmān! Here is Jibrīl Raise informing me that Allah has commanded me to give her sister Umm Kulthūm to you in marriage. The same dowry stipulated for Ruqayyah will be binding for Umm Kulthūm and she will be treated and looked after just as her."²

A similar narration is quoted by al-Bukhārī in *al-Tārīkh al-Kabīr* which also appears in *Kanz al-ʿUmmāl* and *Tārīkh Baghdād*:

عن ام عياش و كانت امة لرقية بنت رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم قالت قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم ما زوجت ام كلثوم من عثمان الا بوحي من السماء

Umm 'Ayyāsh, who was the slave girl of Ruqayyah bint Rasūlillāh المنتخبينة relates that Rasūlullāh المنتخبينة mentionedn "I got Umm Kulthūm married to 'Uthmān in compliance with divine revelation."³

¹ *Țabaqāt Ibn Saʿd*, vol. 8 pg. 25, biography of Umm Kulthūm bint Rasūlillāh بالمنتشية, Leiden print; *al-Istīʿāb* with *al-Isābah*, vol. 4 pg. 463, 463, biography of Umm Kulthūm, Egypt print; *Usd al-Ghābah*, vol. 5, pg. 612, biography of Umm Kulthūm, Tehran print.

² Usd al-Ghābah, vol. 5 pg. 613, biography of Umm Kulthūm bint al-Nabī عالا ; al-Mustadrak, vol. 4 pg. 49.

³ *Al-Tārīkh al-Kabīr*, vol. 2 pg. 281 section 1, chapter concerning the soul; *Kanz al-ʿUmmāl*, vol. 6 pg. 148, 149, 150, the virtues of Dhū al-Nūrayn; *Tārīkh Baghdād*, vol. 12 pg. 364, the virtue of Ibn Jaʿfar ibn ʿAbd Allāh; *Majmaʿ al-Zawāʾid*, vol. 9 pg. 83.

When Sayyidah Umm Kulthūm نفاقة passed away in 9 A.H. Sayyidunā 'Uthmān نفاقة was devastated. It was in this period that Rasūlullāh نالتنابين declaration highlighting the lofty virtue and honour Sayyidunā 'Uthmān نفاقة enjoys. Sayyidunā 'Alī نفاقة is responsible for transmitting this prophetic declaration to the ummah.

Muḥaddith Ibn Mandah reported this with his sanad and Ibn Athīr al-Jazarī reported it from him in *Usd al-Ghābah.* Ḥāfiẓ Ibn ʿAsākir reported it via his sanad from Sayyidunā ʿAlī . Thereafter, al-Suyūṭī documented it in *Tārīkh al-Khulafā*' in the biography of Sayyidunā ʿUthmān and Ibn Ḥajar Makkī recorded it in *al-Ṣawāʿiq al-Muḥriqah* with reference to Ibn ʿAsākir.

There are a number of narrations of this kind in the books of hadīth. However, we have sufficed on transmitting Sayyidunā 'Alī's al-Ghābah:

عقبة بن علقمة قال سمعت علي بن أبي طالب يقول سمعت رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم يقول لو أن لي أربعين بنتا زوجت عثمان واحدة بعد واحدة حتى لا يبقى منهن واحدة

ʿUqbah ibn ʿAlqamah says—I heard ʿAlī ibn Abī Ṭālib saying—I heard Rasūlullāh مَالْسَتَبَعَيْنَةُ declaring:

Had I had 40 daughters, I would have married them to 'Uthmān one after the other, to the very last of them.'

Thirdly, when Sayyidah Umm Kulthūm passed away, Rasūlullāh سَاللَّنَعَيْمَتَمُ himself led the Ṣalāt al-Janāzah. Sayyidunā ʿAlī نَعَنَى descended into the grave together with Faḍl ibn ʿAbbās ibn ʿAbd al-Muṭṭalib and Usāmah ibn Zayd ibn Ḥārithah نَعْنَى to lay his sister-in-law to rest.

¹ *Usd al-Ghābah*, vol. 3 pg. 376, biography of 'Uthmān; *Tārīkh al-Khulafā*', pg. 108, section on the aḥādīth in his virtue besides what has passed, Mujtabā'ī print, Delhi; *al-Ṣawā'iq al-Muḥriqah*, pg. 110, section on the merits of 'Uthmān, second edition, Egypt.

و توفيت في تسع من الهجرة و صلى عليها أبوها رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم و نزل في حفرتها علي و الفضل و أسامة بن زيد

She passed away in 9 A.H. Her father Rasūlullāh المنتشخة led her Ṣalāt al-Janāzah. ʿAlī, Faḍl ibn ʿAbbās, and Usāmah ibn Zayd descended into her grave.¹

Corroboration from Shīʿī Books

We have presented a couple of texts from our books to prove this union for the benefit of the unaware. Majority were already aware of this marriage. I feel it appropriate to prove this union from Shīī books.

This marriage has been documented in their ancient and modern books and their scholars are well informed of it. However, as per their despicable habit, they label this blessed union with nasty labels and document it in a negative way.² They only wish to blemish the lofty image of Sayyidunā 'Uthmān نهنینه and paint him in a bad light. At the same time, the lofty station of Rasūlullāh's نام المنافية is discredited and Sayyidunā 'Alī's نهنینه high status is tarnished, but they do not care of this. May Allah forbid! Our complaint is to Allah and guidance is from Him only.

Nonetheless, we only wish to display to the masses corroboration from their books. The correctness of the primary issue will be clear to those of understanding and insight and the truth will be manifest. Those given to impartiality readily accept the truth. And Allah guides to the truth. And the truth is more deserving to be followed.

The esteemed readers should be cognisant of the fact that former and latter books of the $Sh\bar{i}$ ah have documented this marriage. Only a few references will be reproduced hereunder. The object is not to gather them all.

¹ *Țabaqāt Ibn Saʿd*, vol. 8 pg. 26, Leiden print; *al-Istīʿāb*, vol. 4 pg. 264, Egypt pint; *Usd al-Ghābah*, vol. 5 pg. 612, Tehran print.

² Ḥayāt al-Qulūb, vol. 2 pg. 718 – 723, section one, chapter 51, Nawl Kashawr print, Lucknow.

After presenting the snippets from the books with their translations, deductions and points obtained from them will then be listed, Allah willing.

Mention of Rasūlullāh's سَأَلْسَمَا اللهُ Daughters and 'Uthmān's Link

Al-Masʿūdī, the famous Shīʿī scholar, lists the children of Rasūlullāh سَلَسْتَعَدَمَتَمَ in his book Murūj al-Dhahab:

كل أولاده صلى الله عليه و سلم من خديجة خلا إبراهيم ولد له صلى الله عليه و سلم القاسم و به كان يكنى و كان أكبر بنيه سنا و رقية و أم كلثوم و كانتا تحت عتبة و عتيبة ابني أبي لهب عمه فطلقاهما لخبر يطول ذكره فتزوجهما عثمان ابن عفان واحدة بعد واحدة إلخ

All the children of Rasūlullāh المنتخبية save Ibrāhīm are from Khadījah. Qāsim was born to him with whose name he was designated an agnomen (i.e. Abū al-Qāsim). He was the eldest child. Ruqayyah and Umm Kulthūm were then born, who were married to 'Utbah and 'Utaybah—the sons of his uncle Abū Lahab. They divorced them due to a lengthy incident. Thereafter 'Uthmān ibn 'Affān married them one after the other.¹

2. Mullā Bāqir Majlisī writes in Ḥayāt al-Qulūb:

ابن بابویه بسند معتبر احضرت روایت کرده است که از برائے حضرت رسول متولد شد از خدیجه قاسم و طاہر و نام طاہر عبد الله بود و ام کلثوم و رقیہ و زینب و فاطمہ و حضرت امیر المؤمنین فاطمہ را تزویج نمود و تزویج نمود زینب را ابو العاص بن ربیع و او مردے بود از بنو امیہ و عثمان بن عفان ام کلثوم را تزویج نمود و پیش ازاں کہ نجانہ اور برود برحمت الہی واصل شد پس چوں بجنگ بدر رفتند حضرت رسول رقیہ را باو تزویج نمود

Ibn Bābuwayh al-Qummī relates with an authentic chain from Imām Jaʿfar al-Ṣādiq that these children of Rasūlullāh سناينيك were born from Khadījah: Qāsim, Ṭāhir whose name was ʿAbd Allāh, Umm Kulthūm, Ruqayyah, Zaynab, and Fāṭimah. ʿAlī married Fāṭimah and Abū al-ʿĀṣ—who was from the Banū Umayyah—married Zaynab. ʿUthmān ibn ʿAffān married Umm Kulthūm. Before she could go to his house, she reached the mercy of Allah (i.e. she passed away). Thereafter, when Rasūlullāh سنايك went to Badr, he married Ruqayyah to ʿUthmān.²

¹ Murūj al-Dhahab, vol. 2 pg. 298, fifth edition, 1387 A.H./1967 print.

² *Ḥayāt al-Qulūb*, vol. 2 pg. 718, chapter 51, Nawl Kashawr print, Lucknow.

 Abbās al-Qummī writes in Muntahā al-Āmāl while discussing the children of Rasūlullāh صَالَتَمَاتِيوَسَدَّ

در قرب الاسناد از حضرت صادق علیه السلام روایت شده است از برانے رسول خدا صلی اللہ علیہ و سلم از خدیجہ متولد شدند طاہبر و قاسم و فاطمہ و ام کلثوم و رقیہ و زینب و تزویج نمود فاطمہ را بحضرت امیر المؤمنین علیہ السلام و زینب را بابی العاص بن ربیع از بنی امیہ بود و ام کلثوم را بعثمان بن عفان پیش ازانکہ بخانہ عثمان برود رحمت الہی و اصل شد و بعد از و حضرت رقیۃ را با و تزویج نمود

In *Qurb al-Isnād*, al-Ṣādiq المالية reports that the children of Rasūlullāh المالية born from Khadījah are Ṭāhir, Qāsim, Fāṭimah, Umm Kulthūm, Ruqayyah and Zaynab. Fāṭimah was married to ʿAlī; Zaynab was married to Abū al-ʿĀṣ ibn Rabīʿ from the Banū Umayyah, and Umm Kulthūm was married to ʿUthmān ibn ʿAffān. When she passed away, Ruqayyah was then married to him.¹

The readers should be cognisant of the fact that there exists difference of opinion among the Shīʿī scholars as to whether Sayyidah Ruqayyah or Sayyidah Umm Kulthūm was married to Sayyidunā 'Uthmān ibn 'Affān ﷺ first. However, there is no dispute among them that he did in fact marry both of them. This is an undisputed fact. These texts from Ḥayāt al-Qulūb and Muntahā al-Āmāl are in conformity to one opinion. Nevertheless, they support and corroborate the matter under discussion which is desired.

'Alī's Statement as Support

4. The following statement of Sayyidunā ʿAlī is documented in the renowned Shīʿī book, Nahj al-Balāghah. When the rebels surrounded the house of Sayyidunā ʿUthmān and tightened their grip, Sayyidunā ʿAlī came to him and spoke to him. He expresses these words during his dialogue with Sayyidunā ʿUthmān :

¹ *Muntahā al-Āmāl*, vol. 1 pg. 108, section 8, while mentioning the biographies of the children; *Tanqīḥ al-Maqāl fī 'Ilm al-Rijāl*, vol. 3 pg. 73, 74, from the section on women.

و الله ما أدري ما أقول لك ما أعرف شيئا تجهله و لا أدلك على أمر لا تعرفه ما سبقناك إلى شيء فنخبرك عنه و لا خلونا بشيء فنبلغكه و قد رأيت كما رأينا و سمعت كما سمعنا و صحبت رسول الله صلى الله عليه و آله كما صحبنا و ما ابن أبي قحافة و لا ابن الخطاب أولى بعمل الحق منك و أنت أقرب إلى رسول الله صلى الله عليه و آله و سلم وشيجة رحم منهما و نلت من صهره ما لم ينالا

By Allah, I do not know what to say to you. I do not know anything you are ignorant of, nor can I notify you of something you are unaware of. We have not surpassed you in anything that we may inform you of, nor are we the sole recipients of any information we may pass on to you. You have seen what we have seen, you heard what we heard, and you sat in Rasūlullāh's company just as we did. Neither is Ibn Abī Quḥāfah nor Ibn al-Khaṭṭāb more entitled to practicing on the truth than you. You have a closer family connection to Rasūlullāh and you have secured a link though marriage to him which they have not.¹

5. Sayyid ʿAlī Naqī Fayḍ al-Islām writes in the Persian commentary of this text of *Nahj al-Balāghah*:

تو از جېت خویشی برسول خدا صلی اللہ علیہ و اِلہ غز انہا نزدیک تری یعنی خویشاوندی عثمان از ابو بکر و عمر بہ پیغمبر اکرم نزدیک تر است و بدامادئ پغمبر مرتبہء یافتی کہ ابو بکر و عمر نیافتند

You have a closer family link to Rasūlullāh تستنقبت than them (i.e. 'Uthmān's link to Rasūlullāh مستنقبت is closer than Abū Bakr's and 'Umar's) and you are the son in law of Rasūlullāh حستنقبت , a connection they have not secured.²

Beneficial Points

After mentioning the merit of $Dh\bar{u}$ al- $N\bar{u}rayn$, it is important to clarify few aspects.

 After studying all the above quotations from Sunnī and Shīī sources, it becomes clearer than the sun in broad daylight that Rasūlullāh سَأَلَنْتَعَيْدَوَمَاتُهُ

¹ Nahj al-Balāghah, vol. 1 pg. 303, 322, Egypt print.

² Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah Fārisī, vol. 3 pg. 519, Tehran print.

had four biological daughters. Allah سَبْحَانَةُوْعَالَ declares in the 22nd Juz' of the glorious Qur'ān, towards the end of Sūrah al-Aḥzāb, when sounding the command of ḥijāb:

يَا أَيُّهَا النَّبِيُّ قُلْ لَأَزْوَاجِكَ وَبَنَاتِكَ وَنِسَاءِ الْمُؤْمِنِيْنَ يُدْنِيْنَ عَلَيْهِنَ مِنْ جَلَابِيْبِهِنَ

Prophet, tell your wives, **your daughters**, and the women of the believers to bring down over themselves [part] of their outer garments.¹

Historical Islamic reports of the Sunnī and Shīʿah bear testimony to the fact that all of Rasūlullāh's المنتخفين children, besides Ibrāhīm المنتخفين, were from Sayyidah Khadījah المنتخفين The names of the blessed daughters are: Sayyidah Zaynab, Sayyidah Ruqayyah, Sayyidah Umm Kulthūm, and Sayyidah Fāṭimah

In front of the testimony of the Book of Allah (which is the weightiest) and the attestation of all reliable Islamic historical reports, the claim—due to any corrupt motive or hidden malice—that Rasūlullāh المؤافية had only one biological daughter is totally false and is a grave slander against the pure lineage of Rasūlullāh مؤافية and is a denial of historical facts. May Allah guide everyone to the truth.

 Secondly, it is imperative to clarify that some ill-informed people insist that these daughters were from the previous husbands of Sayyidah Khadījah نستیت or were her nieces, and were not the biological daughters of Rasūlullāh متاليتيني.

This is a distortion and misrepresentation of facts. The reality is something else. It is in direct conflict to what the books of history, biography, and genealogy have asserted. The Muslims know very well that all four girls are the biological daughters of Rasūlullāh حَالَتُنْعَيْمَةُ from the chaste Sayyidah Khadijah تَوَالَعَانَةُ

¹ Sūrah al-Aḥzāb: 59.

To claim that they are the daughters of her previous husband or her nieces has been debunked by Shīī scholars and mujtahidīn themselves. Accordingly, Mullā Bāqir Majlisī—a mujtahid of the 11th century—refutes both these lies in his book *Ḥayāt al-Qulūb* in the following words:

بر نفی ایں ہر دو قول روایات معتبرہ دلالت می کند

Reliable and authentic narrations refute both these views.¹

In conclusion, these false views that are being disseminated and are opposed to what is correct and accurate are not worthy of consideration or acceptance. It will be appropriate to mention for the benefit of those that are into research that just as Mullā Bāqir Majlisī, 'Abd Allāh al-Māmaqānī has written a detailed response to the misconception of these three girls being Rasūlullāh's مَالَتَكَمَاتُ step-daughters or Sayyidah Khadījah's المعادية nieces while speaking about them in his book *Tanqīḥ al-Maqāl*². If only a pinch of impartiality is added, there will be no need for a further response.

- The references of both the sects affirm that two lights of Rasūlullāh مَاللَّن المحمدة (Uthmān viz. Ruqayyah and Umm Kulthūm, were wedded to Sayyidunā 'Uthmān نقاب one after the other and he was awarded the fortune of being the son-in-law of Rasūlullāh مَاللَّن twice. Owing to this, the ummah awarded him the noble title *Dhū al-Nūrayn* (which no one else achieved). At the same time, he attained the honour of being the brother-in-law of Sayyidunā 'Alī نقاب By securing these honours, he is unique in his fortune.
- It is worthy to note that Sayyidunā 'Uthmān نفي obtained this honour by the command of Allah نشبت , as confirmed by prophetic traditions, just as Sayyidunā 'Alī نفی secured the honour of being Rasūlullāh's son-in-law by divine permission. Both have been favoured with a

¹ Hayāt al-Qulūb, vol. 2 pg. 719, chapter 51, Nawl Kashawr print, Lucknow.

² Tanqīḥ al-Maqāl, vol. 3 pg., 73, 77, 78, 79, section 4, biographies of his wives.

link to Rasūlullāh's مَالَّسَتَنَعَيَّدَوَتَكُمُ family by divine leave. This is due to the fact that Rasūlullāh's مَالَسَتَعَيَّدَوَتَكُمُ tongue is under divine command. The glorious Qur'ān announces:

وَمَا يَنطِقُ عَنِ الْهَوَىٰ إِنْ هُوَ إِلَّا وَحْيٌ يُوحَ

Nor does he speak from [his own] inclination. It is not but a revelation revealed.¹

Fallacy

To blemish the image of Sayyidunā 'Uthmān ibn 'Affān نفاف , some have broadcasted a story of him torturing the first daughter of Rasūlullāh موال المعنية ال معنينية المعنية ال معنينية المعنية الم المعنية ال المعنية المعنية

Removal of this Fallacy

It is appropriate to mention on the onset that the narrations of the martyrdom of these daughters rests upon one narrator, Yūnus ibn Khabbāb al-Kūfī. The masters of rijāl have condemned this man using the following words:

Yūnus ibn Khabbāb al-Kūfī

- An evil man.
- He condemns 'Uthmān.
- He verbally abused 'Uthmān.
- He claims that 'Uthmān killed the two daughters of Rasūlullāh مَاللَّ المَاللَة عَدَاللَّهُ مَاللَه مُن مُ

¹ Sūrah al-Najm: 3, 4.

² *Ḥayāt al-Qulūb*, vol. 2, pg. 720 – 723, chapter 51.

³ Yaḥyā ibn Maʿīn: *al-Tārīkh*, vol. 2 pg. 687, 688.

Ibn ʿAdī writes in *al-Kāmil*:

Yūnus ibn Khabbāb al-Kūfī

- He had rāfidī ideologies.
- An evil man. He would swear 'Uthmān ibn 'Affān.
- A great liar and fabricator.
- One of the fanatics in Tashayyu'.1 $\,$

Secondly, if hypothetically these stories are true, then the following objections will be raised against Rasūlullāh حَالَتَنْعَادَ مَعَالَةُ مَالَعَانَةُ مَعَالَةُ مُعَالَةًا مُعَالَةًا مُعَالًا مُعَ

- Why did Rasūlullāh سَأَسْتَعَيْدُوسَةُ give him a share of the booty of Badr and why did he include him in the reward?
- When the first daughter suffered immensely at his hands, how could the second daughter be wedded to such a ruthless bully?
- How were the following verses forgotten and discarded?

And cooperate in righteousness and piety, but do not cooperate in sin and aggression. And fear Allah; indeed, Allah is severe in penalty.²

And do not incline toward those who do wrong, lest you be touched by the Fire.³

وَاسْتَقِمْ كَمَا أُمِرْتَ وَلَا تَتَّبِعْ أَهْوَاءَهُمْ

¹ Al-Kāmil, vol. 7 pg. 2629, 2630, 2631.

² Sūrah al-Mā'idah: 2.

³ Sūrah Hūd: 113.

And remain on a right course as you are commanded and do not follow their inclinations. $^{\scriptscriptstyle 1}$

If any ordinary man's daughter is put through such oppression and tyranny which finally proves fatal, will he ever consider handing over another daughter's hand in marriage to such a tyrant and continue living normally with him? This defies intellect and morality. No intelligent, sound, sensible man of dignity will do this. Rasūlullāh عَالَيْنَا اللَّهُ free from every blemish and ignominy. It is unfathomable for him to commit this.

Moreover, every honourable family and noble tribe honours and respects their sons-in-law. Therefore, whoever respects the son-in-law of Rasūlullāh مَكَانَتُ and the brother-in-law of Sayyidunā ʿAlī مَكَانَتُ will deem all these accusations as false and worthless.

The statement of Sayyidunā ʿAlī ﷺ documented in *Nahj al-Balāghah* which we quoted above clarifies many aspects, for example:

- There existed no religious difference between Sayyidunā 'Uthmān and Sayyidunā 'Alī . They adhered to the same religion and remained unified on the same till their end.
- Sayyidunā ʿAlī considered Sayyidunā ʿUthmān his equal in knowledge and intelligence.
- He did not consider himself to enjoy precedence towards good actions over Sayyidunā ʿUthmān .
- Raising Sayyidunā 'Uthmān نوالله to his own pedestal in obtaining the honour of seeing Rasūlullāh مرالله and sitting in his company is a strong proof and weighty testimony for Sayyidunā 'Uthmān's نوالله perfect īmān and righteous practices.

¹ Sūrah al-Shūrā: 15.

Sayyidunā ʿAlī confirmed Sayyidunā ʿUthmān نوافعة being the son-in-law of Rasūlullāh مرافعة and his own brother-in-law. Sayyidah Fāțimah, Sayyidah Ruqayyah, and Sayyidah Umm Kulthūm نوافعة are full sisters and the biological daughters of Rasūlullāh مرافعة مرافعة and Sayyidah Khadījah نوافعة.

In short, after Sayyidunā ʿAlī's ﷺ acknowledgement of this family connection, there remains no need for any reference or proof since the opposition believe firmly that the truth flows on the tongue of Sayyidunā ʿAlī .

4. The Marriage of Umm Kulthūm to ʿUthmān's son, Abān

Sayyidunā Jaʿfar is Sayyidunā ʿAlī's ﷺ full brother. His eldest son is Sayyidunā ʿAbd Allāh ibn Jaʿfar ﷺ whose daughter is Umm Kulthūm. Umm Kulthūm was married to Abān ibn ʿUthmān.

Ibn Qutaybah al-Dīnawarī (d. 276 A.H.) has mentioned this union twice in his book *al-Maʿārif*; first in the biography of Sayyidunā ʿUthmān ibn ʿAffān ﷺ and second when discussing Sayyidunā ʿAlī ibn Abī Ṭālib ﷺ. Have a look at his words which are quoted verbatim below.

He says while discussing Abān ibn 'Uthmān:

Umm Kulthūm bint ʿAbd Allāh ibn Jaʿfar was in his nikāḥ.¹

He mentions while discussing the children of 'Abd Allāh ibn Ja'far 🕬

¹ Al-Maʿārif, pg. 86.

Umm Kulthūm was first married to Qāsim ibn Muḥammad ibn Jaʿfar ibn Abī Ṭālib. Thereafter, Abān ibn ʿUthmān ibn ʿAffān married her.¹

5. The Marriage of Sukaynah bint al-Ḥusayn to Zayd ibn ʿAmr ibn ʿUthmān

Sayyidunā Husayn ibn ʿAlī's and daughter, Sukaynah, was in the wedlock of Sayyidunā ʿUthmān's and grandson, Zayd ibn ʿAmr ibn ʿUthmān.

The books of genealogy speak about this union in Sukaynah's biography:

تزوجها مصعب بن الزبير بن العوام ابتكرها فولدت له فاطمة ثم قتل عنها فخلف عليها عبد الله بن عثمان بن عبد الله بن حكيم بن حزام ... فولدت له عثمان الذي يقال له قرين و حكيما و ربيحة فهلك عنها فخلف عليها زيد بن عمرو بن عثمان بن عفان

First, Musʿab ibn al-Zubayr ibn al-ʿAwwām married her, and she bore Fāṭimah for him. He was then martyred. ʿAbd Allāh ibn ʿUthmān ibn ʿAbd Allāh ibn Ḥakīm ibn Ḥizām then married her. She gave birth to ʿUthmān—who is called Qarīn, Ḥakīm, and Rabīḥah. After he passed away, Zayd ibn ʿAmr ibn ʿUthmān ibn ʿAffān married her.²

و زيد بن عمرو بن عثمان بن عفان هذا هو الذي كانت عنده سكينة بنت حسين فهلك عنها فورثته

Zayd ibn ʿAmr ibn ʿUthmān ibn ʿAffān is the one in whose wedlock Sukaynah bint Ḥusayn was. He passed away before her so she inherited from him.³

6. The Marriage of Fāṭimah bint al-Ḥusayn to ʿAbd Allāh ibn ʿAmr ibn ʿUthmān

This union is recorded by Ibn Sa'd:

¹ Al-Maʿārif, pg. 90, Egypt print.

² *Ṭabaqāt Ibn Saʿd*, vol. 8, pg. 346, Leiden print; Nasab Quraysh, vol. 2 pg. 59, Egypt print.

³ Nasab Quraysh, vol. 4 pg. 120; al-Maʿārif, pg. 94, 187, Egypt print; Jamharat Ansāb al-ʿArab, vol. 1 pg. 86, latest edition.

تزوجها (فاطمة) ابن عمها حسن بن حسن بن علي بن أبي طالب فولدت له عبد الله (المحض) و إبراهيم و حسنا و زينب ثم مات عنها فخلف عليها عبد الله بن عمرو بن عثمان بن عفان زوجها إياه ابنها عبد الله بن حسن بأمرها فولدت له القاسم و محمد و هو الديباج سمي بذلك لجماله و رقية بني عبد الله بن عمرو

Fāțimah's paternal cousin Ḥasan ibn Ḥasan ibn ʿAlī ibn Abī Ṭālib married her. She gave birth to his children ʿAbd Allāh (al-Maḥḍ), Ibrāhīm, Ḥasan, and Zaynab. He then passed away. Subsequently, ʿAbd Allāh ibn ʿAmr ibn ʿUthmān ibn ʿAffān married her. Her son, ʿAbd Allāh ibn Ḥasan, gave her to him in marriage by her leave. She gave birth to his children, Qāsim, Muḥammad—who was titled *al-Dībāj* (lit. silk) due to his handsomeness, and Ruqayyah.¹

Remember that Fāṭimah bint al-Ḥusayn's mother is Umm Isḥāq bint Ṭalḥah ibn ʿUbayd Allāh.

The Shīʿī scholars have mentioned this union in the following places.

1. Abū al-Farj al-Aṣbahānī writes in the biography of Muḥammad ibn ʿAbd Allāh ibn ʿAmr ibn ʿUthmān ibn ʿAffān in his book *Maqātil al-Ṭālibiyīn*:

و أمه فاطمة بنت الحسين كان عبد الله بن عمرو بن عثمان بن عفان تزوجها بعد وفات الحسن بن الحسن بن علي بن أبي طالب

His mother is Fāțimah bint al-Ḥusayn. ʿAbd Allāh ibn ʿAmr ibn ʿUthmān ibn ʿAffān married her after the demise of (her first husband) Ḥasan ibn al-Ḥasan ibn ʿAlī ibn Abī Ṭālib.²

¹ *Țabaqāt Ibn Sa*ʿd, vol. 8, pg. 347, 348, Leiden print; Nasab Quraysh, vol. 4 pg. 114; Kitāb al-Muḥabbar, pg. 404, Hyderabad Dakkan print; Kitāb al-Jarḥ wa al-Taʿdīl, vol. 3 pg. 301, section 2, Hyderabad Dakkan print; al-Maʿārif, pg. 93, Egypt print.

² Maqātil al-Ṭālibiyīn, pg. 76, Iran print; al-Tanbīh wa al-Ashrāf, pg. 255, mention of the khilāfah of 'Uthmān ibn 'Affān; Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah, vol. 3 pg. 675; footnotes of 'Umdat al-Ṭālib fī Ansāb Āl Abī Ṭālib, second objective regarding the progeny of Ḥasan al-Muthannā.

2. It appears in Nāsikh al-Tawārīkh:

و بعد از حسن مثنى فاطمة بحباله، نكاح عبد الله بن عمرو بن عثمان بن عفان در إمد

After Ḥasan al-Muthannā, Fāṭimah came into the wedlock of 'Abd Allāh ibn 'Amr ibn 'Uthmān ibn 'Affān.'

Hopefully, this amount of references from the books of both sects will be considered sufficient.

7. The marriage of Umm al-Qāsim to Marwān ibn Abān

Umm al-Qāsim is the granddaughter of Sayyidunā Ḥasan 🏎 and Marwān is the grandson of Sayyidunā ʿUthmān ເພ

Mușʿab al-Zubayrī has spoken about this marriage in *Nasab Quraysh*. Ibn Ḥazm and Abū Jaʿfar al-Baghdādī concurred.

كانت أم القاسم بنت الحسن بن الحسن عند مروان بن أبان بن عثمان بن عفان فولدت له محمد بن مروان ثم خلف عليها حسين بن عبد الله بن عبيد الله بن العباس بن عبد المطلب فتوفيت عنده و ليس لها منه ولد

Umm al-Qāsim bint al-Ḥusayn ibn al-Ḥasan was in the marriage of Marwān ibn Abān ibn ʿUthmān ibn ʿAffān. She gave birth to his son Muḥammad ibn Marwān. After his demise, Ḥusayn ibn ʿAbd Allāh ibn ʿUbayd Allāh ibn al-ʿAbbās ibn ʿAbd al-Muṭṭalib married her. She passed away in his wedlock. He had no children from her.²

Exploration of Family Links

The Banū Umayyah and Banū Hāshim enjoy many family links as documented in Islamic history. Some links were there before Islam while some were after Islam.

¹ Nāsikh al-Tawārīkh, vol. 6 pg. 534, book 2, old print.

² Nasab Quraysh, pg. 53, section 2; Jamharat Ansāb al-ʿArab, vol. 1 pg. 85; Kitāb al-Muḥabbar, pg. 438.

Those with sound temperaments and impartial minds will now be able to determine using their intuition and answer the following questions:

- Is Sayyidunā 'Uthmān's المنتفقة' family a noble tribe?
- Are they good people or wicked?
- Is the tribe worthy of admiration and praise or deserving of hatred and disgrace?
- Does Sayyidunā 'Uthmān نوالله enjoy a family link to Rasūlullāh سَرَالله عَلَيْهُ الله and Sayyidunā 'Alī (مَوَالله عَنهُ 'Or is he totally alienated?
- Did there exist enmity and dispute between Sayyidunā ʿAlī and Sayyidunā ʿUthmān ເພ

What we wish to point out is that the Hāshimī, ʿAlawī, Ḥasanī, and Ḥusaynī families giving their daughters to the ʿUthmānī kinfolk pronounces emphatically that

there existed absolutely no hostility, aversion, disputes, family feuds, or ancestral quarrels between their seniors. They all enjoyed mutual unity, compassion, and mercy.

However, cunning narrators—to dramatise the story—concocted different types of tales and broadcasted these fabrications to cause disunity and division among the Muslims, so that family feuds become apparent and eyes of aggression be directed towards these families.

We have presented a glimpse of the family links these tribes enjoyed for people of understanding and contemplation and encouraged them to ponder and reflect deeply. There will be no barrier now for the balanced to reach sound conclusions, Allah willing.

Chapter Two

The Aspect of Bay'ah

In this chapter, the aspect of Sayyidunā ʿAlī pledging allegiance to Sayyidunā ʿUthmān will be discussed.

Just as Sayyidunā ʿAlī swore allegiance to Sayyidunā Abū Bakr and Sayyidunā ʿUmar , happily and willingly, in the very beginning, similarly he pledged allegiance to Sayyidunā ʿUthmān without force and compulsion.

Incidents of this bayʿah have been reported by the muḥaddithīn and historians. They report that during his final days, Sayyidunā ʿUmar al-Fārūq ﷺ selected six men from the Ṣaḥābah ﷺ, viz. Sayyidunā ʿUthmān, Sayyidunā ʿAlī ibn Abī Ṭālib, Sayyidunā Ṭalḥah, Sayyidunā Zubayr, Sayyidunā Saʿd ibn Abī Waqqāṣ, and Sayyidunā ʿAbd al-Raḥmān ibn ʿAwf ﷺ; and determined that whichever of these men are unanimously accepted will become the khalīfah of the Muslims.

Sayyidunā Ṭalḥah handed over his right to Sayyidunā 'Uthmān; Sayyidunā Zubayr gave his right to Sayyidunā 'Alī, and Sayyidunā Sa'd ibn Abī Waqqāṣ gave his choice to Sayyidunā 'Abd al-Raḥmān ibn 'Awf ﷺ, Sayyidunā 'Abd al-Raḥmān ibn 'Awf declared that he did not desire khilāfah for himself, so they should allow him to choose. The decision now rested between Sayyidunā 'Uthmān and Sayyidunā 'Alī

Sayyidunā ʿAbd al-Raḥmān ibn ʿAwf made necessary investigations and contemplated deeply and discussed privately with both these seniors. Finally, he delivered an inspiring sermon in front of the Ṣaḥābah and general Muslim masses in Masjid al-Nabawī, whereafter he caught hold of the hand of Sayyidunā ʿUthmān and pledged allegiance to him. Immediately after him, Sayyidunā ʿAlī gave his bayʿah which was followed by the bayʿah of all those present. Without any dispute, this significant station was passed.

Scores of scholars have documented this incident. A few references will be presented to the readers.

1. Ibn Saʿd writes:

Salamah ibn Abī Salamah ibn ʿAbd al-Raḥmān reports from his father who said:

The first to pledge allegiance to 'Uthmān was 'Abd al-Raḥmān ibn 'Awf, followed by 'Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib.'

2. Abd al-Razzāq records the incident with the following words:

He passed his hand over his and pledged allegiance to him. Thereafter the people pledged their allegiance to him and then [°]Alī pledged allegiance.²

3. Ibn Saʿd and Muḥammad ibn Yaḥyā al-Andalusī report:

حدثني عمر بن عميرة بن هنيء مولى عمر بن الخطاب عن أبيه عن جده قال أنا رأيت عليا بايع عثمان أول الناس ثم تتابع الناس فبايعوا

'Umar ibn 'Umayrah ibn Hanī', the freed slave of 'Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb, narrated to me—from his father—from his grandfather who said:

I saw 'Alī pledging allegiance to 'Uthmān first. The people followed suit and pledged allegiance.'

¹ *Ṭabaqāt Ibn Saʿd*, vol. 3 pg. 42, the bayʿah of ʿUthmān, Leiden print.

² Muṣannaf ʿAbd al-Razzāq, vol. 5 pg. 478, first Beirut print.

³ *Țabaqāt Ibn Saʿd*, vol. 3 pg. 43, the bayʿah of ʿUthmān; *Ṭabaqāt Ibn Saʿd*, vol. 3 pg. 245, Leiden print, *Kitāb al-Tamhīd wa al-Bayān*, pg. 11, chapter 3, Beirut print, Lebanon.

4. The narration of *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī* goes as follows:

فلما أخذ الميثاق قال ارفع يدك يا عثمان فبايعه فبايع له علي و ولج أهل الدار فبايعوه

After taking a solemn promise, he ('Abd al-Raḥmān ibn 'Awf) said, "Raise your hand, O 'Uthmān!" He then pledged allegiance to him. 'Alī then pledged allegiance to him. Then, the people of the house entered and pledged allegiance.¹

5. Al-Bayhaqī reports in *al-Sunan al-Kubrā* in the chapter of fighting the rebels:

فلما أخذ الميثاق قال ارفع يدك يا عثمان فبايعه فبايع له علي رضي الله عنه و ولج أهل الدار فبايعوه

After taking a solemn promise, he ('Abd al-Raḥmān ibn 'Awf) said, "Raise your hand, O 'Uthmān!" He then pledged allegiance to him. 'Alī then pledged allegiance to him. Then, the people of the house entered and pledged allegiance.²

6. Hāfiz Ibn Kathīr relates the incident under the events of the year 24 A.H.:

و جاء إليه الناس يبايعونه و بايعه علي بن أبي طالب أولا و يقال آخرا

People came to him to give him bay ah. Alī ibn Abī <code>Ţā</code>lib pledged allegiance first. And it is said: at the end.³

Although there exists some difference in the narrations as to whether he pledged allegiance first or last, there is unanimity on the fact that Sayyidunā ʿAlī did in fact pledge allegiance in that very gathering just like everyone else.

¹ *Şaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī*, vol. 1 pg. 525, chapter on the incident of bayʿah and unanimity on ʿUthmān ibn ʿAffān.

² *Al-Sunan al-Kubrā*, vol. 8 pg. 150, 151, Hyderabad Dakkan print, chapter on the one who leaves the matter (of khilāfah) to a council of those worthy of the post.

³ Al-Bidāyah wa al-Nihāyah, vol. 7 pg. 147.

7. In *Minhāj al-Sunnah*, Ibn Taymiyyah al-Ḥarrānī has quoted the declaration of Imām Aḥmad ibn Ḥambal concerning this matter, which we reproduce to increase the knowledge of the readers:

قال الإمام أحمد بن حنبل لم يتفق الناس على بيعة كما اتفقوا على بيعة عثمان ولاه المسلمون بعد تشاورهم ثلاثة أيام و هو مؤتلفون متفقون متحابون متوادون معتصمون بحبل الله جميعا ... فلم يعدلوا بعثمان غيره كما أخبر بذلك عبد الرحمن بن عوف إلخ

Imām Aḥmad ibn Ḥambal says, "People did not concur on a bayʿah the way they concurred on the bayʿah of ʿUthmān. The Muslims appointed him as leader after discussing the matter for three days. They were united, unanimous, mutually affectionate, mutually compassionate, and holding firmly to the Rope of Allah altogether. They never equated anyone to ʿUthmān as noted by ʿAbd al-Raḥmān ibn ʿAwf (in his decision).¹

Corroboration from Shīʿī Books

Senior Shīī scholars have acknowledged this bayʿah. This is an accepted fact among them, with no difference of opinion. However, they believe that the bayʿah was taken under coercion just as his bayʿah to Sayyidunā Abū Bakr and Sayyidunā ʿUmar . This is their ancient worn out trick, to colour every action of Sayyidunā ʿAlī , the fierce Lion of Allah, with the colour of compulsion and force. They fabricate such narrations for this purpose which depicts the helplessness and hopelessness of the Lion of Allah. I am not simply making this claim from my own side. Anyone who has studied the books of the Shīʿah will be cognisant of this fact. Anyways,

¹ *Minhāj al-Sunnah*, vol. 3 pg. 233, 234, the eighth difference regarding the matter of consultation.

² Al-Iṣābah fī Tamyīz al-Ṣaḥābah, Usd al-Ghābah fī Maʿrifat al-Ṣaḥābah.

the fact remains that all the $Sh\bar{1}\bar{1}$ senior scholars have acknowledged this bay ah.

We will now present a few quotations from their books which clearly mention Sayyidunā ʿAlī's bayʿah to Sayyidunā ʿUthmān .

9. Abū Jaʿfar al-Ṭūsī (d. 460 A.H.) speaks about the bayʿah in his widely accepted book in the Shīʿī world, *al-Amālī*. Sayyidunā ʿAlī reports:

```
لم قتل جعلني سادس ستة فدخلت حيث أدخلني و كرهت أن أفرق جماعة المسلمين و أشق عصاهم
فبايعتم عثمان فبايعته إلخ
```

When 'Umar was killed, he appointed me as one of six. So I entered where he entered me and I disliked disuniting the Muslims and causing dissension among them. So when you pledged allegiance to 'Uthmān, I pledged allegiance too.¹

10. Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd records the incident as follows in his commentary on *Nahj al-Balāghah*, in his personal fraudulent manner:

قال عبد الرحمن بن عوف لعلي بايع إذن و إلا كنت متبعا غير سبيل المؤمنين و أنفذنا فيك ما أمرنا به فقال لقد علمتم أني أحق بها من غيره ... ثم مد يده فبايع

'Abd al-Raḥmān ibn 'Awf said to 'Alī, "Pledge allegiance then. Otherwise, you will be following a path other than the path of the Muslims and we will execute upon you what we have been commanded to."

'Alī said, "You know fully well that I am most deserving of this post than everyone else." He then stretched out his hand and pledged allegiance.²

¹ *Al-Amālī*, vol. 2 pg. 121, section 18, al-Nuʿmān publishers, Najaf Ashraf, Iraq, 1384 A.H./1964 edition.

² Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah, vol. 2 pg. 97, under his statement: When they determined to pledge allegiance to 'Uthmān, Beirut print; Nāsikh al-Tawārīkh, vol. 2 pg. 449, book 2, discussion on the bay'ah to 'Uthmān ibn 'Affān, old Iran print.

The above author at another juncture in his book discusses this issue at length under the heading: from his statements at the time of consultation; under the text: no one before me hastened towards the true call and maintaining family ties.

11. He presents it using his favoured technique:

فقاموا إلى علي فقالوا قم فبايع عثمان قال فإن لم أفعل قالوا نجاهدك قال فمشي إلى عثمان حتى بايعه

They approached ${}^{^{\prime}}Al\bar{\imath}$ and said, "Stand up and pledge allegiance to 'Uthmān."

"And if I do not?" he remonstrated.

"We will wage war against you," they warned.

Hearing this, he proceeded to 'Uthmān and pledged allegiance.¹

Another Angle

According to the Shīʿah, Sayyidunā ʿAlī ibn Abī Ṭālib ﷺ determined the regulation and procedure of choosing the khalīfah and Imām of the Muslims. This is recorded in *Nahj al-Balāghah*. Even when taking this into consideration, the appointment of Sayyidunā ʿUthmān ﷺ as khalīfah is totally correct. Sayyidunā ʿAlī

إنما الشوري للمهاجرين و الأنصار فإن اجتمعوا على رجل و سموه إماما كان ذلك لله رضي

Consultation is the right of the Muhājirīn and Anṣār. Hence, if they unanimously agree on a man and appoint him the Imām, this is a sign of Allah's pleasure.²

¹ *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*, vol. 2 pg. 617, discussion on the manner of consultation and his bayʿah to ʿUthmān, Beirut print.

² Nahj al-Balāghah, vol. 2 pg. 7, Egypt print.

It becomes manifest from the above that:

- The statement of Sayyidunā 'Alī and makes it crystal clear that the selection of the khulafā' took place through mutual consultation, and not divine appointment.

This Statement is Not Ilzāmī

The readers should remember that this statement of Sayyidunā ʿAlī ﷺ wherein he outlines the procedure and regulation of appointing a khalīfah was addressed to Sayyidunā Muʿāwiyah ﷺ. This is an emphatic address. There is no word suggesting it being *ilzāmī* (to silence the opponent) like: according to you, in your opinion, etc. Instead, the very opposite exists. The word *innamā* (only) is a strong suggestion proving its definiteness.

To join it with a text from another alien book and consequently establish that it was only pronounced hypothetically is nothing more than dissimulation, and interpreting a statement to something other than what the person who made the statement intends. It is unnecessary alteration to Sayyidunā ʿAlī's the statement and contrary to the demands of confidence and trust.

Removing a Misconception

Some historians who gather all sorts of narrations, authentic and fabrications, have attributed some nasty statements to Sayyidunā ʿAlī which he allegedly

uttered at the juncture of the bayʿah which create negative thoughts and mistrust about these noble personalities (Sayyidunā ʿAlī, Sayyidunā ʿUthmān, and Sayyidunā ʿAbd al-Raḥmān ibn ʿAwf ﷺ). In fact, they paint a picture of conflict between them. They mention that Sayyidunā ʿAlī addressed Sayyidunā ʿAbd al-Raḥmān ibn ʿAwf ﷺ with harshness and labelled him a deceit and imposter, etc. To briefly clarify this we present the following:

1. Hāfiz Ibn Kathīr has suitably criticised all the inauthentic narrations while discussing the events of the year 24 A.H. He says that these type of narrations have been narrated by men who are unknown, i.e. their biographies are not found in the books of rijāl and it is unknown what type of people they were. He writes at the end of this discussion:

الأخبار المخالفة لما ثبت في الصحاح فهي مردودة على قائليها و ناقليها

Reports which contradict established narrations in the authentic books are rejected and thrown back at their narrators and reporters. (They carry no weight.)¹

2. After the demise of Sayyidunā 'Umar ﷺ, the senior Ṣaḥābah ﷺ especially the six men committee had many discussions and held a number of meetings at different times to discuss the issue of khilāfah which has been transmitted by senior authorities. These narrations totally debunk and refute reports of conflict. Therefore, such narrations which are filled with dispute and quarrels (and are labelled *munkar*) will be declared unreliable. The narrations that are well-known and founded will be declared *ma'rūf* (reliable). We will present one such narration which 'Allāmah al-Safārīnī quoted in '*Aqīdat al-Safārīnī* while reviewing this aspect and the renowned historian Ibn Khaldūn included in the discussion of the bay'ah.

و كانت مبايعته بعد موت عمر بثلاث ليال و كان عبد الرحمن بن عوف قبل أن يتخلى عنها أحد قد خلا بعثمان فقال له فإن لم نبايعك فمن تشير علي قال علي و قال لعلي إن لم نبايعك فمن تشير علي قال عثمان ثم دعا الزبير فقال إن لم نبايعك فمن تشير علي قال علي أو عثمان إلخ

¹ Al-Bidāyah wa al-Nihāyah, vol. 7 pg. 147.

He ('Uthmān) was given bay 'ah three nights after 'Umar's demise. 'Abd al-Raḥmān ibn 'Awf, prior to appointing anyone, sat in seclusion with 'Uthmān and asked, "If we do not give bay 'ah to you, then who do you suggest?"

"Alī," he suggested.

He asked 'Alī, "If we do not give bay ah to you, then who do you suggest?"

"Uthmān," he answered.

He then called Zubayr and asked, "If we do not give bay ah to you, then who do you suggest?"

He proposed, "Either 'Alī or 'Uthmān."

Conclusion

- It is proven from the books of both sects that the matter of khilāfah between Sayyidunā 'Alī and Sayyidunā 'Uthmān www.was decided in a pleasant manner. There was no conflict, no quarrel, no fitnah, and no discord.
- Sayyidunā 'Alī ﷺ found not the slightest of reservation in his heart regarding the matter of khilāfah nor did he turn away. Just as these luminaries were united prior to this incident, their relationship remained healthy after it. During the entire duration of Sayyidunā 'Uthmān's khilāfah (which is 12 days less 12 years), Sayyidunā 'Alī ﷺ always

¹ *Tārīkh Ibn Khaldūn*, vol. 2 pg. 996, discussion on the martyrdom of 'Umar, the consultation, and the bay'ah of 'Uthmān, Beirut print; *Lawā'iḥ al-Anwār al-Bahiyyah*, commonly known as 'Aqīdat al-Safārīnī, vol. 2 pg. 317, same discussion, Egypt print, 1323/1324 A.H. edition.

remained his assistant and supporter. All of this indicates that Sayyidunā ʿAlīزالمعناقَة gave bayʿah to Sayyidunā ʿUthmān المعناقة with complete acceptance, not under compulsion or duress.

• All of the above proves beyond doubt that there existed absolutely no family feuds or ancestral quarrels between Sayyidunā 'Alī and Sayyidah 'Uthmān . Moreover, these matters were not reached in view of tribal fanaticism.

Chapter Three

Every virtue mentioned below deserves a separate heading. Furthermore, there is a need to ponder over the high regard Sayyidunā ʿAlī had for Dhū al-Nūrayn and the lofty position he deemed him stationed on. The faith and reliance they had on one another and the compassion and love they cherished will also be highlighted. All of the above are found in the upcoming narrations. Only a little of impartiality needs to be exercised. The facts appear as incidents. Kindly ponder over them.

Instead of listing conclusions after every virtue, all the deductions will be mentioned at the end which are very attractive, and contemplating over them will prove very beneficial.

1. 'Uthmān's Sincere Assistance in 'Alī's Marriage

The details of Sayyidunā ʿAlī's marriage to Sayyidah Fāṭimah ﷺ have been included in the Ṣiddīqī section of this book. We wish to highlight here that all the monetary demands to buy things for the marriage and to make other necessary arrangements were met by Sayyidunā ʿUthmān ﷺ. He gifted Sayyidunā ʿAlī ʿʾʾʾʾ a sum of money which the latter gladly accepted. When news of this gift reached Rasūlullāh ʿʾ···, he favoured Sayyidunā ʿUthmān ʿʾ·· with his prayers. This incident may be studied in both Sunnī and Shīʿī books. We will quote a few narrations here for brevity.

1. Sharḥ Mawāhib al-Ladunniyyah

It appears in *Sharḥ Mawāhib al-Ladunniyyah* of al-Zarqānī that Rasūlullāh مَالَسَتَكِموَتَلَهُ advised Sayyidunā ʿAlī مَوَالَيَّكَ to sell his armour to make necessary preparations for his marriage. The narration mentions:

Rasūlullāh كَالْسَتَعْدِينَةُ commanded, "Sell the armour."

Accordingly, ʿAlī sold it to ʿUthmān ibn ʿAffān for 480 dirhams. Thereafter ʿUthmān returned the armour back to ʿAlī who came to Rasūlullāh نائنتین with the armour and the dirhams. Rasūlullāh نائنتین supplicated abundantly for ʿUthmān.¹

2. Kashf al-Ghummah fī Maʿrifat al-A'immah and Biḥār al-Anwār

ʿAlī ibn ʿĪsā al-Arbilī, a Shīʿī scholar of the seventh century, in *Kashf al-Ghummah* as well as Majlisī in *Biḥār al-Anwār* report this incident in great detail in their works. Rasūlullāh استَنَعَيْنَ instructed Sayyidunā ʿAlī ibn Abī Ṭālib تَنَعَيْنَ to sell his armour.

قال علي فانطلقت و بعته بأربع مائة دراهم (سود هجرية) من عثمان بن عفان فلما قبضت الدراهم منه و قبض الدرع مني قال يا أبا الحسن ألست أولى بالدرع منك و أنت أولى بالدراهم مني فقلت بلى قال فإن الدرع هدية مني إليك فأخذت الدراهم و الدرع و أقبلت إلى رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم فطرحت الدرع و الدراهم بين يديه و أخبرته بما كان من أمر عثمان فدعا له بالخير

'Alī continues:

So I went and sold it for 400 dirhams (black hijriyyah ones) to 'Uthmān ibn 'Affān. After I took possession of the dirhams and he took possession of the armour, he said, "O Abū al-Ḥasan! Am I not more worthy of the armour than you and are you not more worthy of the dirhams than me?"

I replied in the affirmative.

¹ Sharḥ Zarqānī, vol. 2 pg. 3, discussion on 'Alī's marriage to Fāṭimah, first print, 1325 edition, Egypt.

He re-joined, "The armour is a gift to you from me."

So I took the dirhams and the armour and went straight to Rasūlullāh المستعمد. I placed them in front of him and informed him of 'Uthmān's conduct. He prayed for goodness for him.¹

2. 'Uthmān serves as a Witness to 'Alī's Marriage

Sayyidunā ʿUthmān نها was invited along with other Ṣaḥābah نها to be present at the nikāḥ proceedings of Sayyidunā ʿAlī نها a witness to the same. This incident is documented in books of both sects.

1. Muḥibb al-Ṭabarī documents this in *al-Riyāḍ al-Naḍirah* as well as *Dhakhā'ir al-'Uqbā*:

Rasūlullāh سَأَنَسْمَا instructed Sayyidunā Anas سَأَنَسْمَا مَعَانَدَهُ عَنْهُ مَعْنَا وَمَسْلَمَ

اخرج ادع لي أبا بكر و عمر و عثمان و عبد الرحمن بن عوف و سعد بن أبي وقاص و طلحة و الزبير و بعدة من الأنصار قال فدعوتهم فلما احتمعوا عنده كلهم و أخذوا مجالسهم ... ثم قال النبي صلى الله عليه و سلم إن الله تعالى أمرني أن أزوج فاطمة من علي بن أبي طالب فاشهدوا أني قد زوجته

Go out and call for me Abū Bakr, ʿUmar, ʿUthmān, ʿAbd al-Raḥmān ibn ʿAwf, Saʿd ibn Abī Waqqāṣ, Ṭalḥah, Zubayr, and a group of Anṣār.

Anas says, "Accordingly, I called them. When they all gathered by him and sat down, the Nabī المستعمد said, 'Surely, Allah المستعمد instructed me to marry Fāțimah to ʿAlī ibn Abī Ṭālib. Bear witness that I have married her to him.'"²

2. The Shīī scholars have also reported this incident in books they consider authentic. Few portions of relevant texts will be quoted below.

ʿAlī ibn ʿĪsā al-Arbilī says:

Kashf al-Ghummah fi Ma'rifat al-A'immah, vol. 1 pg. 485, with Tarjamat al-Manāqib Fārisī, 'Alī's marriage to Fāțimah, new print, Tehran; Bihār al-Anwār, vol. 10 pg. 39, 40, chapter on Fāțimah's marriage to 'Alī.
 Al-Riyāḍ al-Naḍirah, vol. 2 pg. 241, chapter on Fāțimah's marriage to 'Alī; Dhakhā'ir al-'Uqbā fi Manāqib Dhawī al-Qurbā, pg. 30, chapter on Fāțimah's marriage.

عن أنس قال كنت عند النبي صلى الله عليه و سلم ... قال فانطلق فادع لي أبا بكر و عمر و عثمان و عليا و طلحة و الزبير و بعددهم من الأنصار قال فانطلقت فدعوتهم له فلما أن أخذوا مجالسهم قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم ثم إني أشهدكم أني قد زوجت فاطمة من علي على أربع مائة مثقال فضة إلخ

Anas reports:

I was by the Nabī عَاتَنَعَيْتُ . He commanded me, "Go and call Abū Bakr, 'Umar, 'Uthmān, 'Alī, Ṭalḥah, Zubayr and a like number of Anṣār."

In compliance, I went and called them for him. When they took their seats, Rasūlullāh متشجعة announced: "I make you witness that I have married Fāțimah to ʿAlī for 400 mithqāl of silver."

3. ʿAlī's Testimony of ʿUthmān being a Mu'min, Ṣāliḥ, Muttaqī, and Muḥsin

During his khilāfah, once a person questioned Sayyidunā 'Alī ﷺ as to what response he should give when people ask him his opinion of Amīr al-Mu'minīn Sayyidunā 'Uthmān ﷺ. Sayyidunā 'Alī

أخبرهم أن قولي في عثمان أحسن القول إن عثمان كان من الذين أُمَنُوْا وَعَمِلُوا الصَّالِحَاتِ ثُمَّ اتَقَوْا وَامَنُوْا ثُمَّ اتَقَوْا وَأَحْسَنُوْا وَاللَّهُ يُحِبُّ الْمُحْسِنِيْنَ

Inform them that I have the best opinion of 'Uthmān. Indeed, 'Uthmān was from those who believe and do righteous deeds, and then fear Allah and believe, and then fear Allah and do good; and Allah loves the doers of good.^{2,3}

¹ *Kashf al-Ghummah*, vol. 1 pg. 471, 472, with *Tarjamat al-Manāqib Fārisī*, chapter on Fāṭimah's marriage, new print, Tehran; *al-Manāqib*, pg. 242, 252, 253, chapter on Fāṭimah's marriage, section 20, Ḥaydariyyah publishers, Najaf Ashraf, Iraq, 1385 A.H./1965 edition; *Biḥār al-Anwār*, vol. 10 pg. 37, 38, chapter on Fāṭimah's marriage, Iran print.

² Sūrah al-Mā'idah: 93.

³ *Muṣannaf Ibn Abī Shaybah*, vol. 4 pg. 1011, line 7, chapter on Jamal, Pīr Chandā, Sindh; *Ansāb al-Ashrāf*, vol. 5 pg. 8, chapter on the matter of 'Uthmān ibn 'Affān, new print, Jerusalem; *al-Mustadrak*, vol. 3 pg. 104, book on recognising the Ṣaḥābah, chapter on 'Uthmān's murder, first print, Dakkan; *al-Istī āb* with *al-Iṣābah*, vol. 3 pg. 72, biography of 'Uthmān, Egypt print; *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, vol. 6 pg. 379, Ḥadīth: 5879, with reference to Ibn Mardawayh and Ibn 'Asākir, chapter on the virtues of Dhū al-Nūrayn 'Uthmān ibn 'Affān, first print.

Hāfiẓ Ibn Kathīr has mentioned another declaration of Sayyidunā ʿAlī ﷺ regarding Sayyidunā ʿUthmān ﷺ which highlights more of his amazing qualities. He writes:

```
و في رواية أنه قال كان عثمان رضي الله عنه خيرنا و أوصلنا للرحم و أشدنا حياء و أحسننا طهورا و أتقانا
للرب عز و جل و في الإصابة قال علي كان عثمان أوصلنا للرحم إلخ
```

A report records that he said, "'Uthmān was the best of us, maintained family ties the most, had the highest level of modesty, the neatest and tidiest of us, and feared Allah—the Mighty and Majestic—the most."

It appears in *al-Iṣābah* that 'Alī declared, "'Uthmān maintained ties of kinship the best from us."¹

This declaration is supported by another report recorded by Abū al-Qāsim al-Sahmī (d. 427 A.H.) in *Tārīkh Jurjān*:

```
فقال له علي بأبي أنت و أمي يا رسول الله قد كنا عندك جماعة فما غطيتها و جاء عثمان فغطيتها فقال إني
أستحيي ممن استحيت منه الملائكة
```

'Alī said to him, "May my parents be sacrificed for you, O Messenger of Allah. A group of us were by you but you did not cover your shin. But as soon as 'Uthmān came, you covered it?"

Rasūlullāh المنتشرة said, "I certainly show modesty to whom the angels show modesty."²

4. 'Uthmān's title Dhū al-Nūrayn in the light of 'Alī's statement coupled with other virtues

To prove this point, a few narrations are mentioned hereunder. One is from Nazāl ibn Saburah which plenty 'Ulamā' have recorded. The second is from Kathīr ibn Murrah.

¹ *Al-Bidāyah wa al-Nihāyah*, vol. 7 pg. 194, biography of 'Uthmān; *al-Iṣābah* with *al-Istī āb*, vol. 2 pg. 455, biography of 'Uthmān.

² Tārīkh Jurjān, pg. 327, Dā'irat al-Maʿārif print, Hyderabad, Dakkan.

First Narration

روى أبو الخيثمة في فضائل الصحابة من طريق الضحاك عن النزال بن سبرة قلنا لعلي حدثنا عن عثمان قال ذاك امرء يدعي في الملأ الأعلى ذا النورين

Abū al-Khaythamah reports in Faḍā'il al-Ṣaḥābah—from the chain of Þaḥḥāk—from Nazāl ibn Saburah who reports:

We said to 'Alī, "Tell us about 'Uthmān."

He replied, "That is a man who is called Dhū al-Nūrayn in the High Assembly."¹

Abū al-Khaythamah documents in *Faḍāʾil al-Ṣaḥābah* and Ibn ʿAsākir that ʿAlī ibn Abī Ṭālib was questioned about ʿUthmān to which he replied:

That is a gentleman who is called *Dhū al-Nūrayn* in the High Assembly. He was the son-in-law of Rasūlullāh المستعمينة through two of his daughters.²

Second Narration

'Alī Muttaqī al-Hindī records it in Kanz al-'Ummāl with reference to Ibn 'Asākir:

عن كثير بن مرة قال سئل علي بن أبي طالب عن عثمان قال نعم يسمى في السماء الرابعة ذا النورين و زوجه رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم واحدة بعد واحدة ثم قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم من يشتري بيتا يزيده في المسجد غفر الله له فاشتراه عثمان فزاده في المسجد فقال رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم من يبتاع مربد بني فلان فيجعله صدقة للمسلمين غفر الله له فاشتراه عثمان فجعله صدقة على المسلمين فقال رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم من يجهز هذا الجيش يعني جيش العسرة غفر الله له فجهزهم عثمان حتى لم يفقدوا عقالا

¹ Al-Iṣābah with al-Istīʿāb, vol. 2 pg. 455, biography of ʿUthmān.

² Tārīkh al-Khulafā', pg. 105, biography of 'Uthmān ibn 'Affān, Mujtabā'ī Publishers, Delhi.

Kathīr ibn Murrah reports that ʿAlī ibn Abī Ṭālib was questioned about ʿUthmān and he replied:

Yes. He is called Dhū al-Nūrayn in the fourth heaven. Rasūlullāh المنتغينية married two of his daughters to him, one after the other.

Rasūlullāh المستعمَّة announced, "Who will buy a house to extend the Masjid and secure Allah's forgiveness?" 'Uthmān bought it and added it to the Masjid.

Rasūlullāh announced, "Who will purchase the animal enclosure of a certain tribe and give it as charity for the Muslims and obtain Allah's pardon?" 'Uthmān purchased it and gave it as charity to the Muslims.

Rasūlullāh announced, "Who will equip this army, i.e. the army of difficulty and is guaranteed Allah's forgiveness?" 'Uthmān equipped the army to such an extent that they were not short of a cord (used for hobbling the feet of a camel)."¹

A statement of the 'Ulamā'

ʿAllāmah al-Suyūṭī has quoted a statement of the ʿUlamā' while discussing the merits of Sayyidunā ʿUthmān نهن which we would like to reproduce here. In the first chapter, a portion of it was quoted.

و قال العلماء و لا يعرف أحد تزوج بنتي نبي غيره و لذلك سمي ذا النورين فهو من السابقين الأولين و أول المهاجرين و أحد العشرة المشهود لهم بالجنة و أحد الستة الذين توفي رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم و هو عنهم راض و أحد الصحابة الذين جمعوا القرآن إلخ

The 'Ulamā' have stated: No one is known to have the privilege of marrying two daughters of a nabī besides him. Owing to this, he was titled Dhū al-Nūrayn. Coupled with this, he is from the *al-sābiqīn al-awwalīn* (first forerunners), the first to make hijrah, one of the ten who have been

¹ *Kanz al-ʿUmmāl*, vol. 6 pg. 379, Ḥadīth: 5875, chapter on the virtues of Dhū al-Nūrayn ʿUthmān, first print, Dakkan.

guaranteed Jannah, one of the six whom Rasūlullāh was pleased with at his demise, and one of the Ṣaḥābah instrumental in compiling the Qur'ān.¹

5. The Status of 'Uthmān in the Ummah from the Tongue of 'Alī

Once, Sayyidunā ʿAlī ﷺ delivered a sermon during his khilāfah wherein he dealt with this topic. Abū Bakr ʿAbd Allāh ibn Abī Dāwūd ibn Sulaymān ibn Ashʿath al-Sijistānī (d. 316 A.H.) quoted it in *Kitāb al-Maṣāḥif* via his sanad.

عن عبد خير قال خطب علي رضي الله عنه فقال أفضل الناس بعد النبي صلى الله عليه و سلم أبو بكر و أفضلهم بعد أبي بكر عمر و لو شئت أن أسمي الثالث لسميته قال فوقع في نفسه من قوله أن اسمي الثالث لسميته فأتيت الحسين بن علي فقلت إن أمير المؤمنين خطب فقال إن أفضل الناس بعد النبي صلى الله عليه و سلم أبو بكر و أفضلهم بعد أبي بكر عمر و لو شئت أن أسمي الثالث لسميته فوقع في نفسه فقال الحسين فقد وقع في نفسي كما وقع في نفسك فسألته فقلت يا أمير المؤمنين من الذي لو شئت أن تسميه لسميته قال المذبوح كما تذبح البقرة

'Abd Khayr relates:

ʿAlī delivered a sermon and declared, "The most superior of people after the Nabī تراللتينينية is Abū Bakr. And the best of them after Abū Bakr is 'Umar. And if I wanted to name the third, I would have."

I was preoccupied over his statement, "if I wanted to name the third, I would have." So I approached Ḥusayn ibn ʿAlī and said, "Amīr al-Mu'minīn delivered a lecture and said, 'The most superior of people after the Nabī والمعادية is Abū Bakr. And the best of them after Abū Bakr is 'Umar. And if I wanted to name the third, I would have.' I am perturbed by this."

Husayn said, "I am also perturbed by this just as you are."

So I asked him saying, "O Amīr al-Mu'minīn, who is the one, if you wished you would have named him?"

He replied, "The one who was slaughtered like a cow (i.e. 'Uthmān)."2

¹ Tārīkh al-Khulafā', pg. 105, Mujtabā'ī print, Delhi.

² Al-Maṣāḥif, pg. 35, 36, under the heading: the maṣāḥif that ʿUthmān wrote, Egypt print.

This narration proves that Sayyidunā ʿAlī the considered Sayyidunā ʿUthmān the third best of the entire unmah.

6. The Position of 'Uthmān's Dīn in the Sight of 'Alī

We now wish to mention the significance of Sayyidunā ʿUthmān's dīn in the heart of Sayyidunā ʿAlī and how weighty he deemed the man.

Ibn ʿAbd al-Barr quotes the following statement of Sayyidunā ʿAlī in *al-Istīʿāb fī Asmāʾ al-Aṣḥāb* in the biography of Sayyidunā ʿUthmān :

قال علي رضي الله عنه من تبرا من دين عثمان فقد تبرأ من الإيمان

Sayyidunā 'Alī 🚎 declared: "Whoever washes his hands from 'Uthmān's religion, has washed his hands from īmān."¹

Sayyidunā ʿAlī has passed judgment that whoever considers Sayyidunā ʿUthmān irreligious is himself irreligious. Whoever is exempt from Sayyidunā ʿUthmān is exempt from Islam.

7. ʿAlī's Testimony of ʿUthmān being a Forerunner to Goodness, a Dweller of Jannah, and not Being Punished

The upcoming declarations of Sayyidunā ʿAlī نطلقة contain the above.

1. Al-Balādhurī reports through his chain in his famous book *Ansāb al-Ashrāf*:

عن أبي سعيد أخي محمد بن زياد قال قال علي أنا والله على أثر الذي أتى به عثمان لقد سبقت له في الله سوابق لا يعذبه بعدها أبدا

Abū Saʿīd, the brother of Muḥammad ibn Ziyād reports that ʿAlī stated:

¹ Al-Istīʿāb with al-Iṣābah, vol. 3 pg. 76.

By Allah, I am treading the path Uthmān treaded. He has to his name plenty achievements in the dīn of Allah. Allah will never punish him after them.¹

'Alī Muttaqī al-Hindī reports the following statement of Sayyidunā 'Alī
 in Kanz al-'Ummāl from a number of reliable 'Ulamā':

عن أبي سعيد مولى قدامة بن مظعون قال قال علي و ذكر عثمان أما والله لقد سبقت له سوابق لا يعذبه الله بعدها أبدا

Abū Saʿīd, the freed slave of Qudāmah ibn Maẓʿūn relates that ʿAlī stated while speaking about ʿUthmān:

By Allah, he has to his credit many accomplishments after which Allah will never punish him.²

3. Al-Balādhurī reports yet another narration:

عن يوسف بن سعيد مولى حاطب عن محمد بن حاطب و كان قدم البصرة مع علي أن عليا ذكر عثمان فقال و معه عود ينكت به إِنَّ الَّذِيْنَ سَبَقَتْ لَهُم مَّنَّا الْحُسْنِي أُولَٰئِكَ عَنْهَا مُبْعَدُوْنَ أولئك عثمان و أصحاب عثمان

Yūsuf ibn Saʿīd, the freed slave of Ḥāṭib—from Muḥammad ibn Ḥāṭib, who arrived in Baṣrah with ʿAlī:

[`]Alī spoke about [`]Uthmān and recited, while he had a stick in his hand which he was poking in the ground, "*Indeed, those for whom the best [reward] has preceded from Us - they are from it (Jahannam) far removed.*"³ They are [`]Uthmān and his companions.⁴

¹ Ansāb al-Ashrāf, vol. 5 pg. 9, Jerusalem print.

² Kanz al-'Ummāl, vol. 6 pg. 373, Ḥadīth: 5807, with reference to Ibn Abī al-Dunyā, al-Ḥākim in al-Kunā, and Ibn 'Asākir; Kanz al-'Ummāl, vol. 6 pg. 379, Ḥadīth: 5878, with reference to Ibn 'Asākir.

³ Sūrah al-Ambiyā': 101.

⁴ Ansāb al-Ashrāf, vol. 5 pg. 10, chapter on 'Uthmān ibn 'Affān's matter, new Jerusalem print.

8. ʿAlī recites Qur'ān during the Khilāfah of ʿUthmān

Recitation of the Qur'ān in optional prayer was always a practice in the era of the Ṣaḥābah ﷺ and would take place in congregation at times. This blessed practice was in particular held in Masjid al-Nabawī during the month of Ramaḍān. During the 'Uthmānī khilāfah, Sayyidunā 'Alī ﷺ would at times lead the congregation which indicates to his harmonious relationship with the khalīfah of the time. The muḥaddithīn have recorded such occurrences:

Qatādah narrates—from Ḥasan:

'Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib led us in Ṣalāh al-Tarāwīḥ during the era of 'Uthmān for 20 nights. Thereafter, he stopped coming. Some people said, "Probably, he is immersed in personal worship." Thereafter, Abū Ḥalīmah Muʿādh the Qāri' led them and he would recite the qunūt.

9. 'Alī listens to 'Uthmān's Recitation

Muhaddith 'Abd al-Razzāq has reported this incident in his al-Muṣannaf:

عبد الرزاق عن ابن عيينة عن مسعر عن الحسن بن سعد عن أبيه قال أقبلت مع علي بن أبي طالب من ينبع قال فصام علي و كان علي راكبا و أفطرت لأني كنت ماشيا حتى قدمنا المدينة ليلا فمررنا بدار عثمان بن عفان فإذا هو يقرأ قال فوقف علي يستمع قرأته ثم قال علي إنه يقرأ و هو في سورة أو قال في سورة النحل قال أبو بكر (عبد الرزاق) أخبرت أن بين ينبع و بين المدينة أربعة أيام

'Abd al-Razzāq—from Ibn 'Uyaynah—from Mis'ar—from Ḥasan ibn Sa'd —from his father who recalls:

I travelled with 'Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib from Yanbu'. 'Alī was fasting and he was mounted and I was not fasting since I was walking. We entered Madīnah at night and passed the house of 'Uthmān ibn 'Affān who was reciting Qur'ān. 'Alī paused to listen to his recitation. 'Alī commented, "He is reciting Sūrah al-Naḥl." Abū Bakr (ʿAbd al-Razzāq) says, "I was informed that Yanbuʿ to Madīnah is a four day journey."¹

Note:

The readers should be aware that Sayyidunā ʿAlī ﷺ owned a cultivated land in Yanbuʿ which Sayyidunā ʿUmar ﷺ allotted to him during his khilāfah. He would go there at times to oversee it. This was revealed in the Fārūqī section at the end of chapter two.

10. 'Uthmān gifts 'Alī a Conveyance

Hāfiẓ Abū Nuʿaym Aḥmad ibn ʿAbd Allāh al-Aṣbahānī (d. 430 A.H.) has recorded this incident in his magnum opus *Akhbār Aṣbahān* or *Tārīkh Aṣbahān* in the biography of Muḥammad ibn Muḥammad ibn Yūsuf al-Makkī al-Jurjānī. All the narrations of his book are backed with sanads. He writes:

Anas reports:

أهالة المناقبة came to the Nabī متالة المناقبة with a camel.

Rasūlullāh كالتشتينية asked him, "Whose camel is this?"

"'Uthmān gave it to me to ride," he replied.

The Nabī المنتقبية said, "O 'Alī, be careful of the world! Whoever's possessions increase becomes more occupied. And whoever is more occupied becomes greedier. And whoever's greed intensifies, his worries increase and he forgets his Rabb. And what do you think of a person who has forgotten Allah, O 'Alī?"²

¹ *Muṣannaf ʿAbd al-Razzāq*, vol. 2 pg. 570, Beirut print, from Majlis ʿIlmī Karachi, Dabhel.

² Akhbār Aṣbahān, vol. 2 pg. 289.

11. 'Uthmān invites 'Alī for a Meal

This incident is recorded in Sunan Abī Dāwūd:

و كان الحارث خليفة عثمان رضي الله تعالى عنه على الطائف فصنع لعثمان طعاما فيه من الحجل و اليعاقيب و لحم الوحش فبعث إلى علي رضي الله عنه فجاءه الرسول و هو يخبط لأباعر له فجاء و هو ينفض الخبط عن يده فقالوا له فقال أطعموه قوما حلالا فأنا حرم

Hārith was 'Uthmān's ﷺ governor over Ṭā'if. He prepared some food for 'Uthmān which contained the meat of partridge, mountain quails, and game. 'Uthmān sent someone to invite 'Alī ﷺ to join him. The messenger came to 'Alī who was dusting his hands from the leaves he just broke from the trees for his camels. The messenger invited him to come for the meal. He excused himself saying, "Feed it to people not in iḥrām. I am in iḥrām."

The Declarations of the Hāshimīs in Favour of 'Uthmān

Above, mainly the statements of Sayyidunā ʿAlī in favour of Sayyidah ʿUthmān were quoted. Now, the statements of Sayyidunā ʿAlī's children and nephews will be quoted which highlight the virtue, honour, and worth of Sayyidunā ʿUthmān Dhū al-Nūrayn .

12. The Statement of 'Abd Allāh ibn 'Abbās

Muḥammad ibn Yaḥyā ibn Abī Bakr al-Andalusī (d. 741 A.H.) has reported the narration of Ibn ʿAbbās in his book *Kitāb al-Tamhīd wa al-Bayān fī Maqtal al-Shahīd* ʿ*Uthmān* with reference to *Kitāb al-Sharīʿah* which has also been documented by Muḥibb al-Ṭabarī in *al-Riyāḍ al-Naḍirah* and Shāh Walī Allah in *Izālat al-Khafā*':

روى الآجري في كتاب الشريعة بإسناده عن ميمون بن مهران عن عبد الله بن عباس رضي الله عنهما قال قحط المطر (على عهد أبي بكر الصديق) فاجتمع الناس إلى أبي بكر فقالوا السماء لم تمطر و الأرض لم

¹ *Sunan Abī Dāwūd*, vol. 1 pg. 263, book on Ḥajj, chapter on the meat of game for a muḥrim, Mujtabā'ī print, Delhi.

تنبت و الناس في شدة شديدة فقال أبو بكر الصديق انصر فوا و اصبروا فإنكم لا تمسون حتى يفرج الله الكريم عنكم فما لبثنا إلا قليلا أن جاء أجراء عثمان من الشام فجاءته مائة راحلة برا أو قال طعاما فاجتمع الناس إلى باب عثمان فقر عوا عليه الباب فخرج إليهم عثمان في ملأ من الناس فقال ما تشاؤن قالوا الزمان قد قحط السماء لم تمطر و الأرض لم تنبت و الناس في شدة شديدة وقد بلغنا أن عندك طعاما فبعناه حتى نوسع على فقراء المسلمين فقال عثمان حبا و كرامة ادخلوا فاشتروا فدخل التجارفإذا الطعام موضوع في دار عثمان فقال معشر التجار كم تربحوني على شرائي من الشام قالوا للعشرة اثنا عشر قال عثمان زادوني قالوا للعشرة أربعة عشر قال عثمان حبا و كرامة ادخلوا فاشتروا فدخل التجارفإذا الطعام موضوع في ي أبا عمرو ما بقي في المدينة تجار كم تربحوني على شرائي من الشام قالوا للعشرة اثنا عشر قال عثمان زادوني يا أبا عمرو ما بقي في المدينة تجار غيرنا فمن الذي زادك قال زادني الله عز و جل بكل درهم عشرة أعندكم زيادة قالوا اللهم لا قال فإني أشهد الله أني قد جعلت هذا الطعام صدقة على فقراء المسلمين قال ابن عباس فرأيت من ليلتي رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم يعني في المنام و هو على برذون أبلق عليه حلة من نور و هو مستعجل فقلت يا رسول الله فقد اشتد شوقي إليك و إلى كلامك فأين تبادر فقال يا ابن عباس إن عثمان بن عفان قد تصدق بصدقة و إن الله عز و جل قد قبلها منه و زوجه بها عروسا في البر و قد دعينا إلى عرسه إلخ

Al-Ājurrī narrates in *Kitāb al-Sharīʿah* with his isnād—from Maymūn ibn Mahrān—from ʿAbd Allāh ibn ʿAbbās who reports:

There was a drought (during the era of Abū Bakr al-Ṣiddīq) so the people gathered by Abū Bakr and submitted, "No rain has fallen from the sky and the earth has not produced any plants. At the same time, people are suffering greatly."

Abū Bakr al-Ṣiddīq said, "Go back and observe patience, for before evening, Allah the Generous will make an opening for you."

Not after long, the employees of 'Uthmān arrived from Shām with 100 camels of wheat—or food. Subsequently, the traders gathered at 'Uthmān's door and knocked the door. 'Uthmān came out to the group of them and enquired, "What do you want?"

They explained, "Drought has gripped the people. No rain has fallen from the sky and the earth has not produced any plants. At the same time, people are suffering greatly. We have received information that you have some food. So sell it to us so that we may enrich the needy Muslims."

'Uthmān said, "By all means, enter with love and honour, and buy."

The traders thus entered. The food was packed in 'Uthmān's house. He asked, "Gathering of traders, how much profit will you give me on my merchandise from Shām?"

They said, "12 for every 10."

'Uthmān said, "I can obtain more profit."

The traders re-joined, "14 for every 10."

'Uthmān said, "Indeed, they offered me more."

They said, "15 for every 10."

'Uthmān said, "Indeed, they offered me more."

They submitted, "O Abū ʿAmr, there are no traders in Madīnah besides us. So who offered you more?"

"Allah—The Mighty and Majestic—did," he countered, "10 for every dirham. Do you have more to offer."

They said, "No, by Allah."

He announced, "I make Allah witness that I have given this food as charity to the needy Muslims."

Ibn 'Abbās continues, "I saw Rasūlullāh المنافعة in my dream that night. He was speeding off on a piebald Turkish steed, wearing a garment of light. I submitted, 'O Messenger of Allah, I am deeply enthusiastic to be in your company and converse with you. Where are you rushing to?' He said, 'O Ibn 'Abbās! Surely, 'Uthmān ibn 'Affān has given out charity and Allah the Mighty and Majestic has accepted it from him and married him to a damsel in Jannah and I have been invited to his wedding.'"¹

¹ *Kitāb al-Tamhīd wa al-Bayān*, pg. 242, 243, Beirut print; *al-Riyāḍ al-Naḍirah*, vol. 2 pg. 145, 146, mention of his alms; *Izālat al-Khafā'*, pg. 224, objective 2, 'Uthmān's acts of kindness, old Barelī print.

13. The Statement of Hasan ibn ʿAlī ibn Abī Ṭālib

The senior 'Ulamā' have cited a statement of Sayyidunā Ḥasan ﷺ in favour of 'Uthmān ﷺ which we wish to present to the readers. This report is recorded by Ḥāfiẓ Ibn Kathīr with reference to Abū Ya'lā in al-Bidāyah, al-Haythamī in *Majma' al-Zawā'id*, and Shāh Walī Allah in *Izālat al-Khafā'*. The wording of *Izālat al-Khafā'* is reproduced hereunder. The conclusion and deductions of these statements will appear at the end of this discussion, Allah willing.

قال (رضيع الجارود) كنت بالكوفة فقام الحسن بن علي خطيبا فقال يا أيها الناس رأيت البارحة في منامي عجبا رأيت الرب تعالى فوق عرشه فجاء رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم حتى قام عند قائمة من قوائم العرش فجاء أبو بكر فوضع يده على منكب رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم ثم جاء عمر فوضع يده على منكب أبي بكر ثم جاء عثمان فكان بيده رأسه فقال رب سل عبادك فيم قتلوني قال فانبعث من السماء ميزابان من دم في الأرض قال فقيل لعلي ألا ترى ما يحدث به الحسن قال يحدث بما رأى

Radī al-Jārūd reports:

I was in Kūfah when Ḥasan ibn ʿAlī stood up to deliver a sermon. He said, "O people! I saw something extraordinary in my dream last night. I saw Allah مراكبة above His throne (as befits His Majesty). Rasūlullāh مراكبة came and stood at one of the legs of the Throne. Then Abū Bakr came and placed his hand on Rasūlullāh's مراكبة shoulder. He was followed by 'Umar who placed his hand on Abū Bakr's shoulder. Thereafter, 'Uthmān came with his head in his hand. He submitted, 'O my Rabb! Ask Your bondsmen why they killed me.' Just then, two gutters of blood flowed onto the earth from the sky. (It was said that this is 'Uthmān's blood which will be demanded.)"

'Alī was told, "Do you not see what Hasan is narrating?"

He countered, "He is only narrating what he saw."

A report with the same subject matter from Sayyidunā Ḥasan ibn ʿAlī 🏎 has been reported with great detail in *Kitāb al-Tamhīd wa al-Bayān fī Maqtal al-Shahīd*

¹ *Izālat al-Khafā*', vol. 1 pg. 107, Barelī print; *Al-Bidāyah wa al-Nihāyah*, vol. 7 pg. 194, 195, biography of Sayyidunā 'Uthmān ibn 'Affān; *Majma*' *al-Zawā'id*, vol. 9 pg. 96, chapter on the demise of Sayyidunā 'Uthmān.

Uthmān together with other virtues of Sayyidunā *Uthmān Wiew*. The narration is reproduced below for those with passion. The author of *Kitāb al-Tamhīd* is Muḥammad ibn Yaḥyā ibn Abī Bakr (d. 741 A.H.), one of the renowned scholars of Andalus.

و في رواية عن عبد العزيز بن الوليد بن سليمان بن أبي السائب قال سمعت أبي يذكر عن الحسن بن علي رضي الله عنه أنه سمع أعمى يذكر عثمان و يتناوله فقال الحسن ألعثمان يقولون لقد قتل رحمه الله و ما على الأرض أفضل منه و ما على الأرض من المسلمين أعظم حرمة منه ... لو لم يكن إلا ما رأيت في منامي لكفاني فإني رأيت السماء انشقت فإذا أنا برسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم و أبو بكر عن يمينه و عمر عن يساره و السماء تمطر دما فقلت ما هذا فقيل هذا دم عثمان قتل مظلوما

In another narration from ʿAbd al-ʿAzīz ibn al-Walīd ibn Sulaymān ibn Abī al-Sā'ib who reports:

I heard my father reporting about Ḥasan ibn ʿAlī that once he heard a blind man speaking ill of ʿUthmān so Ḥasan said, "Are they speaking about ʿUthmān? Indeed, he was killed, may Allah have mercy upon him, and there was none on the earth superior to him and no Muslim had greater honour than him. Had it only been for the dream I saw, it would have been sufficient. For surely I saw the sky splitting asunder. Suddenly, I was in front of Rasūlullāh citika boud citika bakr to his right and 'Umar to his left. The sky was raining blood. So I enquired, "What is this?" "This is the blood of 'Uthmān who was killed unjustly," came the reply.¹

14. The Statement of Zayn al-ʿĀbidīn ibn Ḥusayn

This report of Zayn al-ʿĀbidīn has been documented by Abū Nuʿaym al-Aṣbahānī in *Ḥilyat al-Awliyā*' as well as the renowned Shīʿī scholar ʿAlī ibn ʿĪsā al-Arbilī (d. 687 A.H.) in *Kashf al-Ghummah*. The text of *Kashf al-Ghummah* is quoted below so that it brings greater satisfaction to the hearts of the Shīʿī readers.

قدم عليه نفر من أهل العراق فقالوا في أبي بكر و عمر و عثمان رضي الله عنهم فلما فرغوا من كلامهم قال لهم ألا تخبروني أنتم الْمُهَاجِرِيْنَ الَّذِيْنَ أُخْرِجُوْا مِن دِيَارِهِمْ وَأَمْوَالِهِمْ يَبْتَغُوْنَ فَضْلًا مِّنَ اللَّهِ وَرِضْوَانَا

¹ Kitāb al-Tamhīd wa al-Bayān fī Maqtal 'Uthmān, pg. 235, Beirut print.

وَيَنصُرُوْنَ اللَّهَ وَرَسُولَهُ أُولَئِكَ هُمُ الصَّادِقُوْنَ قالوا لا قال فأنتم الَّذِيْنَ تَبَوَّءُوا الدَّارَ وَالْإِيْمَانَ مِن قَبْلِهِمْ يُحِبُّوْنَ مَنْ هَاجَرَ إِلَيْهِمْ وَلَا يَجدُوْنَ فِي صَدُوْرِهِمْ حَاجَةٌ مَّمًا أُوْتُوَا وَيُؤْثِرُوْنَ عَلى أَنفُسِهِمْ وَلَوْ كَانَ بِهِمْ خَصَاصَةٌ قالوا لا قال أما أنتم قد تبرأتم أن تكونوا من أحد هذين الفريقين و أنا أشهد أنكم لستم من الذين قال الله فيهم وَالَذِيْنَ جَاءُوْا مِن بَعْدِهِمْ يَقُوْلُوْنَ رَبَّنَا اغْفِرْ لَنَا وَلِإِخْوَانِنَا الَّذِيْنَ سَبَقُوْنَا بِالإِيْمَانِ وَلَا تَجْعَلْ فِي قُلُوْبِنَا غِلَّا لَذِيْنَ أَمُنُوْا اخرجوا عني فعل الله بكم

A group of people from Iraq came to him and uttered some disparaging remarks about Abū Bakr, 'Umar, and 'Uthmān ﷺ. When they completed what they had to say, he said to them, "Are you from those described by the verse:

The Muhājirīn who were expelled from their homes and their properties, seeking bounty from Allah and (His) approval and supporting Allah and His Messenger. Those are the truthful ones.¹

The group from Iraq replied, "No!"

Zayn al-ʿĀbidīn then asked, "Are you then from those described by the verse:

And (also for) those who were settled in the abode (i.e. Madīnah) and adopted the faith before them. They love those who emigrated to them and find not any want in their breasts of what they (i.e. the Muhājirīn) were given but give them preference over themselves, even though they are in privation.²

The group from Iraq replied, "No!"

Zayn al-ʿĀbidīn then said, "As for you, you have absolved yourselves from being from these two groups, and I testify that you are not from those regarding whom Allah متحافظة says:

And those who came after them, saying, "Our Lord, forgive us and our brothers who preceded us in faith and put not in our hearts (any) resentment toward those who have believed."³

¹ Surah al Ḥashr: 8.

² Surah al Ḥashr: 9.

³ Surah al Hashr: 10.

Zayn al-ʿĀbidīn then yelled, "Get away from me! Allah will do with you what He wills!" $^{\!\!\!1}$

15. The Statement of Jaʿfar al-Ṣādiq ibn Muḥammad al-Bāqir

Ibn Saʿd has given a detailed biography of Sayyidunā ʿUthmān نهن in his magnum opus *Ṭabaqāt Ibn Saʿd* where he gives a description of his clothes as well. He relates from Jaʿfar al-Ṣādiq المنافقة regarding Sayyidunā ʿUthmān ibn ʿAffān's نهن ring:

عن جفعر بن محمد عن أبيه أن عثمان تختم في اليسار

Jaʿfar ibn Muḥammad—from his father:

'Uthmān would wear a ring on his left hand.²

We learn from here that the offspring of Sayyidunā ʿAlī and the noble A'immah did not only think good of Sayyidunā ʿUthmān . Rather, they regarded his personality worthy of emulation in religious matters and cited his actions as proof for the same.

Deductions and Points

Many aspects related to Sayyidunā ʿUthmān have been gathered in chapter three. At the end, we present the summary of them for the benefit of the readers. All of these points are established in light of the statements of Sayyidunā ʿAlī and other Hāshimīs.

• When Sayyidunā ʿAlī married Sayyidah Fāṭimah , Sayyidunā ʿUthmān favoured him with 400 dirhams as an act of goodwill and kindness which covered all the expenses of the marriage.

¹ *Kashf al-Ghummah*, vol. 2, p. 267, biography of Zayn al-ʿĀbidīn, with *Tarjamat al-Manāqib Fārisī*, Tehran print; *Ḥilyat al-Awliyā*', vol. 3 pg. 137, biography of Zayn al-ʿĀbidīn, Egypt print.

² *Țabaqāt Ibn Saʿd*, vol. 3 pg. 40, the clothing of 'Uthmān, Leiden print.

- Sayyidunā 'Uthmān ibn 'Affān نوالله is a perfect believer, Allah-conscious, righteous, magnanimous, modest, maintainer of family ties, pious and abstinent, and fearful of Allah نُبْحَانَةُوْتَالًا.
- He is honoured with the title Dhū al-Nūrayn i.e. being the son-in-law of Rasūlullāh حَالَيْتَعَدَّيْتَ twice. He is unique in this nobility and prestige. No one from the progeny of Sayyidunā Ādam عَدَالَتَكَمُ enjoys this distinction. Moreover, he generously assisted the Muslims constantly in arduous times.
- He holds the third highest position in the ummah of Rasūlullāh مَالَسْتَعَدِينَةُ after Sayyidunā Abū Bakr and Sayyidunā 'Umar نَالَسْتَعَدَيْنَ. Just as he is the third khalīfah, he is the third most superior of the ummah. The rebels and oppressors wrongfully martyred him. Definitely, he is a martyr in the path of Allah.
- He hastened to carry out good deeds and has many achievements to his credit. Owing to this, he will not be punished. He will be favoured with Jannah and remain far from Jahannam
- Sayyidunā ʿAlī and Sayyidunā ʿUthmān enjoyed a congruous relationship. The former led the ṣalāh in the khilāfah of the latter, they prepared conveyances for one another, and the latter invited the former for meals.
- Ibn 'Abbās نقض confirms that Sayyidunā 'Uthmān نقض openheartedly assisted the Muslims especially the Muslims of Madīnah in times of dire need and famine which was accepted in the court of Allah نشبت . Upon this, he was blessed with amazing glad tidings which are signs of his success in the Hereafter.
- Many aspects are established by Sayyidunā Ḥasan ibn ʿAlī's statement. Firstly, the khilāfah of Sayyidunā Abū Bakr al-Ṣiddīq, Sayyidunā ʿUmar al-Fārūq, and Sayyidunā ʿUthmān were entirely correct in this sequence. There exists no form of usurpation, rebellion, or enmity in

- The following is manifest by Zayn al-ʿĀbidīn's incident: All the offspring of Sayyidunā ʿAlī ﷺ held positive feelings towards Sayyidunā ʿUthmān ﷺ. Just as they would not tolerate anyone speaking negatively of Sayyidunā Abū Bakr and Sayyidunā ʿUmar, they detested hearing nasty remarks about Sayyidunā ʿUthmān ﷺ and abhorred objections.
- Those who dissociate themselves from the three khulafā', the offspring of Sayyidunā ʿAlī 🏎 dissociate from them.
- They expelled those who opposed and criticised the three khulafā'. This is a beautiful sign of the Hāshimīs reliance and faith on them and a practical demonstration of dissociating from their opposition.
- Sayyidunā Jaʿfar al-Ṣādiq's ﷺ report makes it clear that Sayyidunā 'Uthmān's ﷺ personality is worthy of being cited as proof for religious matters and his example is accepted and worthy of emulation.

The Status of 'Uthmān on the Tongues of the Senior Hāshimīs with reference to Shīʿī books

1. Ḥasan ibn ʿAlī ibn Abī Ṭālib's Declaration

Ibn Bābawayh al-Qummī quotes a marfū' narration from Sayyidunā Ḥasan 4466 in his $Ma' \bar{a}n\bar{n} al-Akhb\bar{a}r$ in which he focuses on the status of the three khulafā':

Hasan ibn ʿAlī reports that Rasūlullāh سَكَاللَهُ فَعَادِهُمُ declared:

Certainly, Abū Bakr holds the position of hearing in relation to me; 'Umar holds the position of seeing, and 'Uthmān holds the position of the heart.¹

2. 'Uthmān's Excellence on the Tongue of Ja'far al-Ṣādiq

According to the Shīʿah, a few signs will appear in the period of Imām Mahdī's emergence close to Qiyāmah. One of these signs is that a voice will be heard from the sky (from the side of Allah (شَبْحَانَاتُوْتَعَالَ at the beginning and end of the day:

قال الصادق ينادي مناد من السماء أول النهار ألا إن عليا صلوات الله عليه و شيعته هم الفائزون قال و ينادي مناد آخر النهار إلا إن عثمان و شيعته هو الفائزون

¹ Maʿānī al-Akhbār, pg. 110, Iran print, old print. It appears like this in Tafsīr al-Ḥasan al-ʿAskarī.

Al-Ṣādiq stated, "(During the era of Imām Mahdī) a caller will announce from the sky at the beginning of the day: 'Indeed, 'Alī—may Allah's salutations be upon him—and his partisans are successful.' And a caller will announce at the end of the day, 'Indeed, 'Uthmān and his partisans are successful.'"¹

3. Another Statement of Imām Jaʿfar al-Ṣādiq

Al-Kulaynī al-Rāzī has reported a lengthy narration from Imām Jaʿfar al-Ṣādiq in *Furūʿ al-Kāfī* via a sanad in which he speaks about the great services rendered by Sayyidunā ʿUthmān at the juncture of the reconciliation at Ḥudaybiyyah.

قال أبو عبد الله فأرسل إليه عثمان بن عفان رسول الله صلى الله عليه و آله فقال انطلق إلى قومك من المؤمنين فبشرهم بما وعدني ربي من فتح مكة فلما انطلق عثمان لقي أبان بن سعيد فتأخر عن السرج فتحمل عثمان بين يديه و دخل عثمان فأعلمهم و كانت المناوشة فجلس سهيل بن عمرو عند رسول الله صلى الله عليه و آله و جلس عثمان في عسكر المشركين و بايع رسول الله صلى الله عليه و آله المسلمين و ضرب بإحدى يديه على الأخرى لعثمان و قال المسلمون طوبى لعثمان قد طاف بالبيت و سعى بين الصفا و المروة و أحل فقال رسول الله صلى الله عليه و آله ما كان ليفعل فلما جاء عثمان قال له رسول الله صلى الله عليه و آله أطفت بالبيت فقال ما كنت لأطوف بالبيت و رسول الله صلى الله عليه و آله لم يطف

Abū 'Abd Allāh reports:

Rasūlullāh المستعمد summoned 'Uthmān ibn 'Affān and ordered, "Go to the believers among your people and convey to them glad tidings of the conquest of Makkah which my Rabb has promised me."

When 'Uthmān left, he met Abān ibn Sa'īd who moved back from the saddle and mounted 'Uthmān in front of him. 'Uthmān entered (Makkah) and conveyed to them (the glad tidings).

They (the disbelievers) were prepared for war. On one hand, Suhayl ibn ʿAmr sat by Rasūlullāh حَالَتَعَبَيْنَةُ and on the other hand, ʿUthmān sat in the

¹ *Furūʿ al-Kāfī*, 3rd part, Kitāb al-Rawḍah, pg. 146, Nawl Kashawr print, Lucknow; *Kitāb al-Rawḍah min al-Kāfī* with Persian translation, vol. 2 pg. 209, signs of the appearance of the Imām Qā'im, new Tehran print.

midst of the army of polytheists. Rasūlullāh المستغنينة took bayʻah from the Muslims and placed one hand on the other for ʿUthmān.

The Muslims commented, "How lucky is 'Uthmān! He has made ṭawāf of the House and ran between Ṣafā and Marwah, and has come out of iḥrām."

Hearing this, Rasūlullāh مَالتَعَيَّدَوَيَةُ said, "He would not do that."

When 'Uthmān returned, Rasūlullāh ناللنظينية asked him, "Did you make tawāf of the House?"

"It is not appropriate for me to make tawaf of the House when the Messenger of Allah has not had the opportunity," he replied.¹

While discussing the events of Ḥudaybiyyah, Mullā Bāqir Majlisī relates the above incident in Ḥayāt al-Qulūb in the following words:

کلینی بسند حسن کا صحیح از حضرت صادق علیہ السلام روایت کردہ است چوں حضرت رسول بغزوہ حدیبیہ در ماہ ذیقعدہ بیرون رفت ... پس حضرت رسول کریم بنزد عثهان فرستاد کہ برو بسونے قوم خود از مومناں و بشارت دہ ایشانرا بانجہ وعدہ دادہ است مرا خدا از فتح مکہ چوں عثهان روانہ شد ابان بن سعید را در راہ دید پس ابا از زین برجست و در عقب زین نشست و اورا بر رونے زین دار کرد پس عثهان داخل شد و رسالہ حضرت را رسانید و ایشاں مہیانے جنگ بودند پس سہیل نزد حضرت رسول نشست و عثمان نزد مشرکان و حضرت دراں وقت از مسلماناں بیعت رضوان گرفت و بروایت شیخ طبرسی چو مشرکاں عثمان را حبس کردند و خبر بحضرت رسید کہ اورا کشتند حضرت فرمود کہ ازیں ج حرکت نبی کنم تا بایشاں قتال کنم و مردم را بسونے بیعت دعوت نمائم و برخاست و پشت مبارک بدرخت داد تکیہ کرد و صحابہ بانحضرت بیعت کردند کہ با مشرکاں جہاد کند و نگریزند و بروایت کلینی حضرت یکدست خودرا بر دست دیگر زد و برانے عثمان بیعت گرفت ... بس مسلماناں گفتند کہ خوشاحال عثمان کہ طواف کمبہ کرد و سعی میان صفا و مروہ کرد و محل شرحان دیعت گرفت ... بس مسلماناں گفتند کہ خوشاحال عثمان کہ طواف کردی گفت چوں توں صفا و مروہ کر و محل شد حضرت فرمود کہ بخواہد کرد چون عثمان اومد حضرت پرسید کہ طواف کردی گفت چوں توں

Abū ʿAbd Allāh reports:

Rasūlullāh المنتخبينة summoned him ('Uthmān ibn 'Affān) and said, "Proceed to the believers among your people and convey to them glad tidings of the conquest of Makkah which my Rabb has promised me. When 'Uthmān left,

¹ *Furūʿ al-Kāf*ī, vol. 3 pg. 151, 3rd part, Kitāb al-Rawḍah, Nawl Kashawr print, Lucknow, happenings of the expedition of Ḥudaybiyyah; vol. 2 pg. 238, new Tehran print.

he met Abān ibn Saʿīd who (out of honour of ʿUthmān) moved back from the saddle and allowed ʿUthmān to mount and sit in front of him. ʿUthmān entered (Makkah) and conveyed Rasūlullāh's ماللنتينية message. They were ready for war.

Suhayl ibn ʿAmr sat by Rasūlullāh المستنبسة while ʿUthmān sat in the midst of the army of polytheists.

(Al-Ṭabarsī adds: During this time, the Muslims heard that the polytheists had murdered 'Uthmān. Rasūlullāh لمحافظة declared, "We will not move from this place until we do not fight and take revenge." He sat leaning against a tree and all the Ṣaḥābah gave bayʿah upon this.)

Rasūlullāh المنتخبينة took bayʿah from the Muslims. Rasūlullāh المنتخبينة placed one of his hands on the other for ʿUthmān.

(After it was ascertained that ʿUthmān was not killed and is still alive) the Muslims commented, "How lucky is ʿUthmān! He has made ṭawāf of the House and ran between Ṣafā and Marwah, and has come out of iḥrām." Hearing this, Rasūlullāh المنتخفينة said, "He would not do that."

When 'Uthmān returned, Rasūlullāh ناللنظينية asked him, "Did you make țawāf of the House?"

"It is not appropriate for me to make ṭawāf of the House when the Messenger of Allah المستجمعة has not had the opportunity."

Noteworthy Points

- Rasūlullāh سَاللَّعَنَّهُ selecting Sayyidunā 'Uthmān سَاللَّعَنَّهُ and sending him to convey his message and glad tidings to the people of Makkah highlights his acceptance and honour.
- 2. For negotiations and dialogues at the time of war, those individuals are chosen from both parties who are trusted by both parties. This shows that

¹ *Ḥayāt al-Qulūb*, vol. 2 pg. 489, 490, chapter 38, Nawl Kashawr print, Lucknow.

Rasūlullāh مَرَاتَعَنَيْنَا had full conviction in the dependability, credibility, and accurate speech of Sayyidunā ʿUthmān نتوَاتَعَة.

- The lofty status of Sayyidunā 'Uthmān is is clearly evident from the bay'ah taken to avenge his death after receiving news of his assassination. This is known as Bay'at al-Riḍwān.
- 4. Despite finding out of his well-being and safety, Rasūlullāh تَسْتَعْبَيْتُمُ continued the Bay'at al-Riḍwān and included him in its rewards by declaring his one hand as the hand of 'Uthmān and taking bay'ah on his behalf. This privilege is enjoyed by no one besides him.
- 5. Due to hindrances and obstacles, Rasūlullāh تراتشعتيني was unable to perform ţawāf and make saʿī between Ṣafā and Marwah. Sayyidunā ʿUthmān نرتيني, without these stoppages in his way, chose not to carry out these acts. This is clear evidence of his perfect love and complete obedience to Rasūlullāh ترتياتشتيتيوتر.

In short, Sayyidunā Jaʿfar al-Ṣādiq المنتخة listed all these virtues and excellences of Sayyidunā ʿUthmān المنتخة, thus manifesting his love and loyalty and making it clear that the Banū Hāshim have full confidence and faith in Sayyidunā ʿUthmān and harbour absolutely no aversion, hatred, or alienation from him.

4. The Statement of 'Abd Allāh ibn 'Abbās

Once, Sayyidunā 'Abd Allāh ibn 'Abbās went to Sayyidunā Amīr Mu'āwiyah ﷺ where other Quraysh dignitaries were present. Sayyidunā Mu'āwiyah asked Sayyidunā 'Abd Allāh ibn 'Abbās ﷺ few questions, *inter alia*, what his thoughts were about Sayyidunā 'Uthmān ﷺ. In response to this, Sayyidunā 'Abd Allāh ibn 'Abbās ﷺ listed his following qualities most eloquently:

قال (ابن عباس) رحم الله أبا عمرو كان والله أكرم الحفدة و أفضل البررة هجارا بالأسحار كثير الدموع عند ذكر النار نهاضا عند كل مكرمة سباقا إلى كل منحة حييا أبيا دنيا صاحب جيش العسرة ختن رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم آله فأصتب الله على من يلعنه لعنة اللاعنين إلى يوم الدين May Allah shower mercy upon Abū 'Amr! By Allah, he was compassionate to his slaves and servants and the most superior of the righteous. Spending his early mornings in worship and shedding tears in abundance when remembering Hell. Active in every good work and a forerunner in every charitable deed. Full of modesty, rejecter of evil, loyal. Mobiliser of the army of difficulty. And finally, the beloved son-in-law of Rasūlullāh May Allah continuously rain down upon the one who curses him the curse of all those who curse till the Day of Recompense.¹

Sayyidunā ʿAbd Allāh ibn ʿAbbās نَعَنَّهُ listed 11 virtues of Sayyidunā ʿUthmān نَعَنَّهُ. They are self-evident and need no commentary or elucidation. The readers should remember that it is documented in books the Shīʿah regard reliable and authentic that Sayyidunā Ibn ʿAbbās received his knowledge from Sayyidunā ʿAlī مَالَمُ فَعَانَهُ who received it from the Nabī مَالَمُ فَعَانَهُ مُنْ

فقال ابن عباس علي علمني و كان علمه من رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله و رسول الله علمه الله من فوق عرشه فعلم النبي صلى الله عليه و آله من الله و علم علي من النبي و علمي من علم علي

Ibn 'Abbās stated:

ʿAlī taught me and his knowledge was from Rasūlullāh نمينينيند. And Rasūlullāh ممانينيند was taught by Allah from above His ʿArsh. So the Nabī's knowledge is from Allah and ʿAlī's knowledge is from the Nabī and my knowledge is from ʿAlī.²

Friends! Realise that the above narration is part of the knowledge possessed by Sayyidunā Ibn ʿAbbās ﷺ in which he highlights the virtues and excellences of Sayyidunā ʿUthmān ﷺ in a marvellous manner.

¹ *Tārīkh al-Masʿūdī*, vol. 3 pg. 60, new Egypt print, 1930 edition; *Nāsikh al-Tawārīkh*, vol. 5 pg. 144, old Tehran print.

² *Kashf al-Ghummah* with Persian translation of *al-Manāqib*, vol. 5 pg. 507, new Tehran print; *al-Amālī*, vol. 1 pg. 11, Najaf Ashraf print, Iraq.

Announcement

- If any of the Shī ah have misgivings about the historian al-Mas ʿūdī's being Shī ah, he should take out some time to study the biography of ʿAlī ibn al-Husayn ibn ʿAlī al-Mas ʿūdī in *Tanqīḥ al-Maqāl fī Aḥwāl al-Rijāl*¹ of ʿAbd Allāh al-Māmaqānī and his heart and mind will be put to rest. We have made this humble request before. We mentioned it here just as a reminder.
- 2. ʿAbbās al-Qummī writes in *Tuhfat al-Aḥbāb* while discussing ʿAlī ibn al-Ḥusayn ibn ʿAlī al-Hudhalī known as al-Masʿūdī:

ایں شیخ جلیل از اجلہ امامیہ است و بر بعضے از علماء اشتباہ شدہ و اِنجناب را از علماء عامہ محسوب نمودہ اند

He is one of the renowned scholars of the Imāmiyyah. Some scholars who were unaware of this reality counted him among the Sunnī scholars.²

In conclusion, senior Shīʿī scholars and historians have documented this report of Sayyidunā Ibn ʿAbbās who is among the senior ʿUlamāʾ of the Banū Hāshim and spent his entire life supporting and assisting Sayyidunā ʿAlī .

We have quoted his words from the books of the Shīʿah. Hopefully, this quotation will prove sufficient to realise the position Sayyidunā ʿUthmān holds in the sight of the Hāshimīs.

¹ Tanqīḥ al-Maqāl fī Aḥwāl al-Rijāl, vol. 2 pg. 283.

² Tuḥfat al-Aḥbāb, pg. 227.

Chapter Four

Various interactions between Sayyidunā 'Uthmān 🏾 Various and the Hāshimīs, Sayyidunā 'Alī Various in particular, will be discussed in this chapter including:

- Implementation of Shar'ī rulings after mutual consultation. The punishments meted out to various crimes including drinking and adultery.
- Hāshimīs appointed to significant posts during the ʿUthmānī khilāfah.
- Hāshimīs going to 'Uthmānī courts and reaching resolutions after consultation.
- Sayyidunā ʿUthmān 🕬 leading the Ṣalāt al-Janāzah of Hāshimīs.
- Taking care of the monetary rights of Rasūlullāh's مَالَسْتَنْهُ relatives and Sayyidunā ʿAlī's مَالَسْتَنْهُ offspring.

The deductions and points drawn from all the forthcoming incidents—which are signs of the love and compassion they enjoyed and the absence of family rivalry—will be listed at the end to keeps things brief.

1. 'Uthmān and 'Alī's Mutual Assistance in Implementation of $A \dot{h} k \bar{a} m$ (Decrees)

Previously, it was clarified that Sayyidunā ʿAlī was appointed judge during the reigns of Sayyidunā Abū Bakr al-Ṣiddīq and Sayyidunā ʿUmar al-Fārūq . Many a time, Sayyidunā ʿAlī would supervise the implementation of legal punishments. In a similar way, Sayyidunā ʿAlī was tasked with passing judgements and enforcing laws. If any legal punishments were to be carried out, Sayyidunā ʿUthmān would at many times give the responsibility of this to Sayyidunā ʿAlī .

For the khalīfah of the Muslims to fulfil all tasks by himself at one and the same time is a formidable task, nay impossible. Bearing this in mind, for the smooth

running of state affairs, Sayyidunā ʿAlī ﷺ would be tasked with some of these aspects and he would fulfil them in a superb manner.

a. Including 'Alī in Consultations over Judgements

'Allāmah al-Bayhaqī has explained the methodology followed in settling court cases during the 'Uthmānī khilāfah in the following manner. He writes via his sanad:

عن عمر بن عثمان بن عبد الله بن سعيد وكان اسمه الصرم فسماه رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم سعيدا قال حدثني جدي قال كان عثمان رضي الله عنه إذا جلس على المقاعد جاءه الخصمان فقال لأحدهما اذهب ادع عليا و قال للآخر اذهب فادع طلحة و الزبير و نفرا من أصحاب النبي صلى الله عليه و سلم ثم يقول لهما تكلما ثم يقبل على القوم فيقول ما تقولون فإن قالوا ما يوافق رأيه مضاه و إلا نظر فيه بعد فيقومان و قد سلما

ʿUmar ibn ʿUthmān ibn ʿAbd Allāh ibn Saʿīd (whose name was Ṣarm (lit. severance, forsake) and Rasūlullāh المنتخفين named him Saʿīd (fortunate)) says—my grandfather narrated to me:

When 'Uthmān would sit to settle disputes, the two adversaries would approach him. He would order the one to call 'Alī and the other to call Ṭalḥah, Zubayr, and a group of Ṣaḥābah توانع of the Nabī براينتي . He would then tell them to present their case. Thereafter, he would look at the seniors and enquire, "What do you say?" If their opinion conformed to his, he would pass it. Otherwise, he would reflect over the matter afterwards. The parties would leave pleased with the judgement.¹

Shīʿī scholars have acknowledged that meting out legal punishments during the era of the three khulafā' was the job of Sayyidunā ʿAlī . This narration appears with a sanad in *Qurb al-Isnād* from Imām Jaʿfar:

جعفر بن محمد عن آبائه أن أبا بكر و عمر و عثمان كانوا يرفعون الحدود إلى علي ابن أبي طالب إلخ

¹ Al-Sunan al-Kubrā, vol. 10 pg. 112, book on the protocol of the judge, chapter on the one who consults.

Jaʿfar ibn Muḥammad narrates from his forefathers that Abū Bakr, ʿUmar, and ʿUthmān would hand over the meting out of legal punishments to ʿAlī ibn Abī Ṭālib.¹

Religious interactions between them was stable by mutual participation and mutual assistance. Some incidents will be mentioned below.

b. The Punishment for Drinking Alcohol: the Incident of Walīd ibn 'Uqbah

عن حصين بن ساسان الرقاشي قال عثمان بن عفان و أتى بالوليد بن عقبة قد شرب الخمر و شهد عليه حمران بن أبان و رجل آخر فقال عثمان لعلي أقم عليه الحد فأمر علي عبد الله بن جعفر أن يجلده فأخذ في جلده و علي يعد حتى جلد أربعين ثم قال له أمسك قال جلد رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم أربعين و جلد أبو بكر أربعين و عمر صدرا من خلافته ثم أتمها عمر ثمانين و كل سنة و هذا أحب إلي

Ḥuṣayn ibn Sāsān al-Raqqāshī narrates:

I was present in the company of 'Uthmān ibn 'Affān when Walīd ibn 'Uqbah, who had just consumed liquor, was brought and Ḥumrān ibn Abān and another man had testified against him. 'Uthmān told 'Alī, "Implement the legal punishment on him." In compliance, 'Alī ordered 'Abd Allāh ibn Ja'far to flog him. He began lashing him while 'Alī counted. As soon as he reached forty, 'Alī told him, "Stop!" He then recalled, "Rasūlullāh أستيت gave forty lashes. Abū Bakr gave forty and 'Umar did the same during the initial years of his khilāfah. 'Umar thereafter increased it to eighty. All are Sunnah and this is the most pleasing to me."²

This incident briefly appears in *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī* in the following words:

إن عثمان دعا عليا فأمره أن يجلده فجلده ثمانين

'Uthmān summoned 'Alī and ordered him to lash Walīd. Accordingly, he lashed him with 80 lashes.'

¹ Qurb al-Isnād, pg. 133, chapter on the blood money of a Hāshimī woman and others, Tehran print.

² Kanz al-ʿUmmāl, vol. 3 pg. 7102, Ḥadīth: 1875, first print, Dakkan

³ Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī, vol. 1 pg. 522, chapter on the merits of 'Uthmān.

This incident is corroborated by reports in books regarded authentic by the Shīʿah. Al-Kulaynī in *Furūʿal-Kāfī*, Ibn Shaharāshūb in *al-Manāqib*, and Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd in *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah* have related this incident:

قال سمعت أبا جعفر عليه السلام يقول إن الوليد بن عقبة حين شهد عليه يشرب الخمر قال عثمان لعلي صلوات الله اقض بينه و بين هؤلاء الذين يزعمون أنه شرب الخمر فأمر علي فجلد بسوط له شعبتان أربعين جلدة

I heard Abū Jaʿfar المنائلة saying:

After testimony was given against Walīd ibn 'Uqbah for drinking liquor, 'Uthmān told 'Alī (1996), "Pass verdict between him and these men who claim that he drank liquor." Accordingly, 'Alī instructed that he be whipped 40 lashes with a whip that contained two branches and this was carried out.¹

Clarification

The increase Amīr al-Mu'minīn Sayyidunā 'Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb ﷺ made to the punishment of drinking liquor to 80 lashes was due to the circumstances at the time, for there was a need for a more stern admonishment and rebuke. Moreover, this was decided upon in the presence and with the consent of the senior Ṣaḥābah ﷺ. An indication to this is that this practice continued during the khilāfah of Sayyidunā 'Uthmān ﷺ and Sayyidunā 'Alī ﷺ supported it through his statement and action. He declared, "Both are sunnah." No Ṣaḥābī (whether Hāshimī or non-Hāshimī) labelled this addition as a contradiction to the Sunnah.

For further satisfaction of the readers, we submit that if increase in punishment in times of need is labelled a *bidʿah* (innovation) (which was practiced by Sayyidunā ʿUmar), then:

¹ *Furūʿ al-Kāfī*, vol. 3 pg. 117, chapter on the compulsory punishment for drinking, Nawl Kashawr print, Lucknow; *al-Manāqib*, vol. 2 pg. 120, section on his readiness with determination and abandonment of leniency, India print; *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*, vol. 4 pg. 267, mention of Walīd' actions making him deserving of punishment and banishment. Beirut print; *Tārīkh Yaʿqūbī*, vol. 2 pg. 165, Beirut print.

ایں گناہیست کہ در شہر شما نیز کنند

This sin is also prevalent in your city.

The infallible Imāms have determined the punishment of consuming liquor to be 80 lashes. Study the following text from the Shī'ī book *Furū*' *al-Kāfī*:

عن إسحق بن عمار قال سألت أبا عبد الله عليه السلام عن رجل شرب حسرة خمر قال يجدل ثمانين جلدة قليلها و كثيرها حرام

Ishāq ibn 'Ammār reports:

I asked Abū ʿAbd Allāh ﷺ about a person who drinks a sip of wine. He replied, "He will be lashed 80 times. A little quantity and a large quantity of it are impermissible."

Another narration reads:

أبو عبد الله عليه السلام يقول إن في كتاب علي صلوات الله عليه يضرب شارب الخمر ثمانين و شارب النبيذ ثمانين

Abū ʿAbd Allāh ﷺ says, "It appears in the book of ʿAlī ﷺ: The consumer of wine will be lashed 80 times and the consumer of nabīdh will be lashed 80 times."²

We learn from the above statement of Ja'far al-Ṣādiq that the addition to the punishment of consuming liquor in times of need is not an innovation at all.

NB: The discussion on Walīd ibn 'Uqbah's drinking wine and his subsequent punishment will, Allah willing, appear in section 2³ [volume 4]. The answers to

¹ *Furū*° *al-Kāfī*, vol. 3 pg. 117, chapter on the compulsory punishment for drinking, Nawl Kashawr print, Lucknow.

² Ibid.

³ Answers to the criticisms against Sayyidunā 'Uthmān 🚟.

the allegations raised against Walīd ibn ʿUqbah will appear in detail and you will be able to study the rest of this discussion there.

c. The Punishment for Adultery

The following incident appears in *Musnad Aḥmad* under the narrations of 'Alī

عن الحسن بن سعد عن أبيه أن يحنس و صفية كانا من سبي الخمس فزنت صفية برجل من الخمس فولدت غلاما فادعاه الزاني و يحنس فاختصما إلى عثمان فرفعهما إلى علي بن أبي طالب فقال علي أقضي فيهما بقضاء رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم الولد للفراش و للعاهر الحجر و جلدهما خمسين خمسين

Hasan ibn Saʿd reports from his father:

Yaḥnus and Ṣafiyyah were from the prisoners of the khums. Ṣafiyyah committed adultery with another prisoner from the khums and subsequently gave birth to a boy. The fornicator as well as Yaḥnus claimed to be the father of the child. So they took their dispute to 'Uthmān who referred them to 'Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib. 'Alī stated, "I will pass between them the judgement of Rasūlullāh المنابعة: 'The child belongs to the husband and the fornicator receives stoning.' He then whipped them both 50 times each.¹

d. The Punishment for Homosexuality

In this incident, Sayyidunā ʿUthmān and Sayyidunā ʿAlī ﷺ discussed the matter and then the criminal was punished.

عن سالم بن عبد الله و أبان بن عثمان و زيد بن حسن أن عثمان بن عفان أتي برجل قد فجر بغلام من قريش فقال أحصن قالوا قد تزوج بامرأة و لم يدخل بها بعد فقال علي لعثمان لو دخل بها لحل عليه الرجم فأما إذا لم يدخل بها فاجلده الحد فقال أبو أيوب أشهد أني سمعت رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم يقول الذي ذكر أبو الحسن فأمر به عثمان فجلد مائة

¹ Musnad Aḥmad with selections of Kanz al-'Ummāl, vol. 1 pg. 104, the musnadāt of 'Alī, Egypt print.

Sālim ibn ʿAbd Allāh, Abān ibn ʿUthmān, and Zayd ibn Ḥasan report that a man who sodomised a lad from Quraysh was brought to ʿUthmān ibn ʿAffān. ʿUthmān enquired, "Is he *muḥṣan* (married)?"

They replied, "He did marry a girl but he has not consummated the marriage (he is not living with her yet)."

'Alī told 'Uthmān, "Had he consummated the marriage, he would have been stoned. But now that he has not, enforce the punishment (lashing) on him."

Hearing this, Abū Ayyūb said, "I testify that I heard Rasūlullāh المنتغبية say what Abū al-Ḥasan has mentioned."

 ${}^{^{\prime}}\text{Uthman}$ thus commanded that he be lashed and he was lashed 100 times. ${}^{^{1}}$

e. A Case regarding Loss of Eyesight

The Shī'ī scholars report this incident in Furū' al-Kāfī from Imām Ja'far al-Ṣādiq:

عن أبي عبد الله عليه السلام قال إن عثمان أتاه رجل من قيس بمولى له لطم عينه فأنزل الماء فيها و هي قائمة ليس يبصر بها شيئا فقال له أعطيك الدية فأبى قال فأرسل بهما إلى علي عليه السلام و قال احكم بين هذين فأعطاه الدية فأبى قال فلم يزالوا يعطونه حتى أعطو ديتين قال فقال ليس أريد إلا القصاص إلخ

Abū ʿAbd Allāh رَحَمَّانَتَهُ reports:

A man from Qays came to 'Uthmān with his master who slapped him and (poked his eye) which resulted in the eye losing its water. The eye was still intact, but he could not see a thing. (To reach a compromise) 'Uthmān said [to the victim], "I will give you blood money." But he refused. He sent them to 'Alī as and instructed him to pass judgement between them. 'Alī also presented blood money to him but he refused to accept it. They continued

¹ Majma' al-Zawā'id, vol. 6 pg. 272, with reference to al-Ṭabarānī, chapter on the reports on homosexuality; *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, vol. 3 pg. 99, Ḥadīth: 1830, with reference to al-Ṭabarānī, old print, first edition.

persuading him to accept the blood money and even offered him double the amount but he refused and said, "I do not want anything besides qisas (legal retribution)."¹

From the above incidents we learn that Sayyidunā 'Alī www worked as a right hand man for Sayyidunā 'Uthmān www during his khilāfah in implementing *hudūd* (legal punishments) and *ahkām* (decrees).

2. Hāshimī Positions and Stations during the 'Uthmānī khilāfah

Tribal segregation, specialities of lineage, and family feuds were unknown to them. These are ideologies which were created many years later. Let the readers make a special note of this assertion.

A handful of incidents will be displayed to the readers to prove these points. Hopefully, they will prove satisfactory.

a. Judiciary Post

The grandson of Abū Ṭālib's brother, Ḥārith ibn ʿAbd al-Muṭṭalib; Mughīrah ibn Nawfal ibn Ḥārith al-Qurashī al-Hāshimī was born in Makkah Mukarramah

¹ *Furūʿ al-Kāfī*, vol. 3 pg. 175, chapter regarding and for wounds is legal retribution, Nawl Kashawr print, Lucknow.

prior to the hijrah during the days of Rasūlullāh مَنَاللَمُعَبِّدَيَّهُ. He was a lad with superb intelligence, courage, and thought. After the demise of Sayyidunā 'Alī نوائلَمُعَبِّدَيَّةُ, he married Rasūlullāh's مَاللَمُعَبِّدَيَّةُ granddaughter Umāmah bint Abī al-'Āṣ نوائلَمُعَبَّدَةُ. Umāmah's mother is Sayyidah Zaynab مَوَائِمَةُ بَعَرَ

It is written about Mughīrah ibn Nawfal in the books of biographies:

و كان المغيرة بن نوفل قاضيا في خلافة عثمان

Mughīrah ibn Nawfal was a judge during the khilāfah of ʿUthmān.¹

b. Governor

The great grandson of Abū Ṭālib's brother, Ḥārith ibn ʿAbd al-Muṭṭalib, is ʿAbd Allāh ibn al-Ḥārith ibn Nawfal ibn al-Ḥārith ibn ʿAbd al-Muṭṭalib al-Qurashī al-Hāshimī. His mother is Sayyidah Hind bint Abī Sufyān نَعَنَى . ʿAbd Allāh was born during the lifetime of Rasūlullāh المالة and his mother Hind brought him to her sister Sayyidah Umm Ḥabībah نَعَنَى , Rasūlullāh's مَالَكَ wife. When Rasūlullāh ibn al-Ṣasūlullāh came home, he enquired as to who the child was. "He is the child of your paternal cousin (Abū Sufyān) and my sister," she replied. Rasūlullāh مَالَكُ thereafter placed his blessed saliva in the infant's mouth and supplicated in his favour.

It is recorded about him:

أنه كان على مكة زمن عثمان

He was the governor of Makkah during 'Uthmān's reign.²

Al-Istí āb with al-Işābah, vol. 3 pg. 366, the biography of Mughīrah ibn Nawfal al-Qurashī al-Hāshimī; Usd al-Ghābah, vol. 4 pg. 408, the biography of Mughīrah ibn Nawfal ibn al-Hārith ibn ʿAbd al-Muṭṭalib ibn Hāshim; al-Işābah with al-Istí āb, vol. 3 pg. 433, the biography of Mughīrah ibn Nawfal ibn al-Hārith.
 Ţabaqāt Ibn Saʿd, vol. 5 pg. 15, ʿAbd Allāh ibn al-Hārith ibn Nawfal ibn al-Hārith ibn ʿAbd al-Muṭṭalib ibn Hāshim; Tahdhīb al-Tahdhīb, vol. 5 pg. 15, ʿAbd Allāh ibn al-Hārith.

c. Appointment over Significant Activities in Makkah

The authors of the biographies of the Ṣaḥābah ﷺ affirm that ʿAbd Allāh's father, Sayyidunā Ḥārith ibn Nawfal ibn al-Ḥārith ibn ʿAbd al-Muṭṭalib al-Hāshimī ﷺ, was a Ṣaḥābī and Rasūlullāh ﷺ appointed him over significant affairs in Makkah. He remained in this position during the Ṣiddīqī and Fārūqī reigns and this was maintained during the ʿUthmānī khilāfah as well. Thereafter, he relocated to Baṣrah and passed away there towards the end of the ʿUthmānī khilāfah.

The following texts sum it up:

و استعمل رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم الحارث بن نوفل على بعض أعمال مكة ثم ولاه أبو بكر و عمر و عثمان مكة إلخ

Rasūlullāh المنتخبينة appointed Ḥārith ibn Nawfal to oversee few aspects of Makkah. Thereafter, Abū Bakr, 'Umar, and 'Uthmān appointed him as governor of Makkah.¹

فاستعمله على بعض عمله بمكة و أقره أبو بكر و عمر و عثمان ثم انتقل إلى البصرة و مات بها في آخر خلافة عثمان

Rasūlullāh المستعمد designated to him some of the state affairs in Makkah. Abū Bakr, ʿUmar, and ʿUthmān maintained this. He then relocated to Baṣrah and passed away there towards the ending of ʿUthmān's khilāfah.²

3. Hāshimīs resorting to 'Uthmānī courts for Settlement of Disputes, Reaching Decision through Mutual Consultation, and Supporting 'Uthmān's Judgements

Reports from hadīth compilations will now be reproduced to prove the above headings. People with sound natures will ponder deeply over these matters and very easily realise the correctness and worthiness of the 'Uthmānī khilāfah.

¹ *Țabaqāt Ibn Saʿd*, vol. 4 pg. 39, section 1, Hārith ibn Nawfal ibn al-Hārith.

² Al-Iṣābah, vol. 1 pg. 292, Ḥārith ibn Nawfal ibn al-Ḥārith.

a. 'Abd al-Razzāq in *al-Muṣannaf* and al-Bayhaqī and *al-Sunan al-Kubr*ā report this incident:

هشام بن عروة يحدث عن أبيه قال أتى عبد الله بن جعفر الزبير فقال إني ابتعت بيعا بكذا و كذا و إن عليا يريد أن يأتي عثمان فيسأله أن يحجر علي فقال له الزبير فأنا شريك في البيع فأتى علي عثمان فقال له إن ابن جعفر ابتاع كذا و كذا فاحجر عليه فقال الزبير أنا شريكه في البيع فقال عثمان كيف أحجر على رجل في بيع شريكه الزبير

Hishām ibn 'Urwah narrates—from his father who says:

ʿAbd Allāh ibn Jaʿfar approached Zubayr and said, "I made a purchase for so much. ʿAlī now wants to go to ʿUthmān and ask him to declare me legally incompetent."

Zubayr said to him, "I am a partner in the deal."

'Alī approached 'Uthmān and told him, "Jaʿfar's son made a deal for so much, so put restrictions on him."

Zubayr said, "I am his partner in the deal."

'Uthmān submitted, "How can I put restrictions on the deal of a man whose partner is Zubayr?"¹

 b. The second incident is recorded in Imām Mālik's magnum opus *al-Muwațța*'. Ibn Abī Shaybah and Saʿīd ibn Mansur have also recorded it:

عن محمد بن يحيى بن حبان قال كانت عند جدي حبان امرأتان هاشمية و أنصارية فطلق الأنصارية و هي ترضع فمرت بها سنة ثم هلك و لم يحض فقالت أنا أرثه لم أحض فاختصما إلى عثمان بن عفان فقضى لها بالميراث فلامت الهاشمية عثمان فقال هذا عمل ابن عمك هو أشار علينا بهذا يعني علي بن أبى طالب

Muḥammad ibn Yaḥyā ibn Ḥibbān reports:

My grandfather, Ḥibbān, had two wives, a Hāshimī woman and an Anṣārī woman. The latter would breastfeed infants. He divorced her, and passed

¹ *Muşannaf 'Abd al-Razzāq*, vol. 8 pg. 267, 268, chapter on the insolvent and restrictions on him; *al-Sunan al-Kubrā*, vol. 6 pg. 61, same chapter.

away after a year. She did not yet get her menstrual periods so she claimed, "I inherit from him as I did not yet get my menstrual periods."

They took their dispute to 'Uthmān ibn 'Affān who passed judgement in her favour that she will inherit. The Hāshimī woman criticised 'Uthmān for this who responded, "This is the practice of your paternal cousin (i.e. 'Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib.) He instructed us to pass this verdict."

Note: The name of this Hāshimī woman is Hind bint Rabīʿah ibn al-Ḥārith ibn ʿAbd al-Muṭṭalib. Her biography appears in *al-Istīʿāb* and *al-Iṣābah*. This incident appears there as well. It also appears in *Usd al-Ghābah* in the biography of Hind ibn Rabīʿah ibn ʿAbd al-Muṭṭalib.

The Shī'ī scholars have also mentioned this incident in their books after editing it to suit their fancy. Have a look at al-Manāqib².

c. Once, a dispute broke out between Sayyidunā ʿAqīl ibn Abī Ṭālib ﷺ and his wife Fāṭimah bint ʿUtbah. She became upset with her husband and took her complaint to Sayyidunā ʿUthmān ﷺ. It appears in the narration:

فشدت عليها ثيابها فجاءت عثمان فذكرت ذلك له فضحك فأرسل إلى ابن عباس و معاوية فقال ابن عباس لأفرقن بينهما فقال معاوية ما كنت لأفرق بين شيخين من بني عبد مناف فأتيا فوجداهما قد أغلقا عليهما أبوابهما و أصلحا أمرهما فرجعا

She covered herself with her ḥijāb and at once resorted to 'Uthmān and explained to him her grievance. He laughed and referred the case to Ibn 'Abbās and Mu'āwiyah. Ibn 'Abbās said, "I will definitely separate them."

Muʿāwiyah on the other hand said, "It is not appropriate for me to separate two elderly people from the Banū ʿAbd Manāf."

¹ Muwaṭṭa' Mālik, pg. 208, chapter of the divorce of the ill, Mujtabā'ī print, Delhi; *Muṣannaf Ibn Abī Shaybah*, vol. 5 pg. 210, chapter on the verdict given regarding a man who divorces his wife and then her hayd stops, Hyderabad print, Dakkan; *Kitāb al-Sunan*, pg. 308, first section of volume 3, Majlis 'Ilmī, Dabhel; *Mu'aṭta' Muhammad*, pg. 269, old Muṣṭafā'ī print.

² Al-Manāqib, vol. 3 pg. 13, ʿAlī's judgements in the third era, India print.

The two men came to their house but found that husband and wife had locked their doors and reached a compromise. They thus returned.¹

d. The following incident appears in *Muṣannaf ʿAbd al-Razzāq* in the chapters of divorce:

عن أيوب قال كتب الوليد إلى الحجاج أن سل من قبلك عن المفقود إذا جاء و قد تزوجت امرأته فسأل الحجاج أبا مليح بن أسامة فقال أبو مليح حدثتني بنيهمة بنت عمر الشيبانية أنها فقدت زوجها في غزوة غزاها فلم تدر أهلك أم لا فتربصت أربع سنين ثم تزوجت فجاء زوجها الأول و قد تزوجت قالت فركب زوجاي إلى عثمان فوجداه محصورا فسألاه و ذكرا له أمرهما فقال عثمان أعلى هذا الحال قالا قد وقع و لا بد قال فخير الأول بين امرأته و بين صداقها قال فلم يلبث أن قتل عثمان فركبا بعد حتى أتيا عليا بالكوفة فسألاه فقال أعلى هذه الحال قالا قد كان ما ترى و لا بد من القول فيه قالت و أخبراه بقضاء عثمان فقال ما أرى لهما إلا ما قال عثمان فاختار الأول الصداق قالت فأعنت زوجي الآخر بألفين كان الصداق أربعة آلاف

Ayyūb relates:

Walīd wrote to Ḥajjāj to ask those around him about a person who went missing and subsequently returns only to find that his wife has remarried. Ḥajjāj asked Abū Malīḥ ibn Usāmah.

Abū Malīḥ said, "Bunayhamah bint 'Umar al-Shaybāniyyah narrated to me that she lost her husband in a battle he joined. She was unaware whether he died or not. She waited for four years and then remarried. Thereafter, her first husband returned.

She related, 'My husband rode to 'Uthmān and found him besieged. They explained to him their situation and asked his verdict.

'Uthmān asked, "In this state?"

They submitted, "This is what really happened and a decision is necessary."

¹ *Muşannaf ʿAbd al-Razzāq*, vol. 6 pg. 513, Majlis ʿIlmī print; *al-Iṣābah*, vol. 4 pg. 372, Fāṭimah bint ʿUtbah.

He told the first husband to choose between his wife and her dowry. It was not long before 'Uthmān was martyred. They thus rode to 'Alī in Kūfah and asked him.

He said, "In this state?"

They submitted, "What you heard has actually transpired and a decision is necessary." They also informed him of 'Uthmān's decision.

He said, "I pass the same judgement as 'Uthmān."

The first husband chose the dowry.

She says, "I assisted my second husband with 2000. The dowry was 4000 in total." $\ensuremath{\mathbf{1}}$

4. 'Uthmān's reverence for the Hāshimīs and leading their Ṣalāt alJanāzah

A few aspects will be mentioned under this heading. The friendly interactions and amicable relationship between Sayyidunā ʿUthmān Dhū al-Nūrayn 🏎 and the senior Hāshimī gentlemen will be discussed.

a. Veneration for 'Abbās ibn 'Abd al-Muțțalib

Just as Sayyidunā ʿAbbās نَعَنَّكُ is the paternal uncle of Sayyidunā ʿAlī عَنَكُ نَعْلَكُ is the paternal uncle of Sayyidunā ʿAlī عَالَكُ he is the paternal uncle of Rasūlullāh سَرَاتُنْعَيْدُورَتْ revered him to the highest degree and was ever conscious of his status. It appears in the books of ḥadīth:

و قد كان رسول الله يجله و يعظمه و ينزله منزلة الوالد من الولد و يقول هذا بقية آبائي

Rasūlullāh would revere and venerate him and hold him in the position of a father. He would say, "This is the remainder of my forefathers."²

¹ Muṣannaf ʿAbd al-Razzāq, vol. 7 pg. 88, 89, chapter on the wife who is not sure of her husband's demise.

² Al-Bidāyah wa al-Nihāyah, vol. 7 pg. 161, mention of ʿAbbās ibn ʿAbd al-Muṭṭalib, year 32 A.H.

In emulation of Rasūlullāh مَالَسَّنَيَّ , the noble Ṣaḥābah مَالَسَّنَيَ also respected and held Sayyidunā ʿAbbās مَالَيَّ in high esteem.

It is reported about Sayyidunā 'Umar and Sayyidunā 'Uthmān 🕬

إن عمر بن الخطاب رضي الله عنه و عثمان بن عفان كانا إذا مر بالعباس و هما راكبان ترجلا إكراما له

When 'Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb or 'Uthmān ibn 'Affān would pass by 'Abbās ibn 'Abd al-Muṭṭalib while they were mounted, they would alight and begin to walk out of honour for him."¹

Once during the khilāfah of Sayyidunā 'Uthmān ﷺ, a person humiliated Sayyidunā 'Abbās ﷺ. Sayyidunā 'Uthmān had him punished for this despicable act. The incident appears in *Tārīkh al-Ṭabarī* and *Kanz al-'Ummāl*:

عن القاسم بن محمد قال كان مما أحدث عثمان فرضي به منه أنه ضرب رجلا في منازعة اسختف فيها بالعباس بن عبد المطلب فقيل له فقال أيفخم رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم عمه و أرخص في الاستخفاف به لقد خالف رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم من رضي فعل ذلك فرضي به منه

Qāsim ibn Muḥammad says:

One of the revolutions of 'Uthmān which was authorised is that he whipped a man who disrespected 'Abbās ibn 'Abd al-Muṭṭalib in an argument. 'Uthmān was asked as to why he acted in such a way. He answered, "Rasūlullāh مالله on one hand has extreme veneration for his paternal uncle and me on the other hand show leniency when he is disrespected? Whoever is pleased with this action has acted contrary to Rasūlullāh ''Limin','' This action of 'Uthmān was endorsed.²

¹ *Al-Bidāyah* wa *al-Nihāyah*, vol. 7 pg. 162, mention of 'Abbās ibn 'Abd al-Muṭṭalib, year 32 A.H.; *al-Istī āb* with *al-Iṣābah*, vol. 3 pg. 98, biography of 'Abbās ibn 'Abd al-Muṭṭalib; *Tahdhīb al-Tahdhīb*, vol. 5 pg. 123, same chapter.

² *Tārīkh al-Ṭabarī*, vol. 5 pg. 136, mention of some of characteristics of 'Uthmān; *Kitāb al-Tamhīd wa al-Bayān fī Maqtal al-Shahīd 'Uthmān*, pg. 85, 86; *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, vol. 7 pg. 69, book on virtues, mention of 'Abbās ibn 'Abd al-Muṭṭalib, first edition.

b. 'Uthmān Led the Ṣalāt al-Janāzah of 'Abbās

Ibn ʿAbd al-Barr in *al-Istīʿāb* and Ibn Kathīr in *Al-Bidāyah wa al-Nihāyah* record this event:

توفي العباس بالمدينة يوم الجمعة لاثنتي عشرة ليلة خلت من رجب و قيل بل من رمضان سنة اثنتين و ثلاثين قبل قتل عثمان رضي الله عنه بسنتين و صلى عليه عثمان رضي الله عنه و دفن بالبقيع و هو ابن ثمان و ثمانين سنة

'Abbās passed away in Madīnah on Friday, the 12th of Rajab—It is said: Ramaḍān—32 A.H. two years prior to the martyrdom of 'Uthmān ﷺ. 'Uthmān performed Ṣalāt al-Janāzah upon him and he was buried in al-Baqī'. He passed away at the age of 88.¹

c. Abān ibn 'Uthmān led the Ṣalāt al-Janāzah of Muḥammad ibn al-Ḥanafiyyah, ʿAlī's son

Muḥammad ibn al-Ḥanafiyyah's mother, Khawlā bint Jaʿfar ibn Qays, was from the Banū Ḥanīfah tribe. She was amongst the captives of the Battle of Yamāmah who were sent to Madīnah. Sayyidunā Abū Bakr al-Ṣiddīq ﷺ gifted her to Sayyidunā ʿAlī

Muḥammad ibn al-Ḥanafiyyah passed away in the beginning of Muharram 81 A.H. at the age of 65. The khalīfah at the time was ʿAbd al-Malik ibn Marwān and his governor over Madīnah was Abān ibn ʿUthmān ibn ʿAffān. When his bier was brought, Abān ibn ʿUthmān arrived. Muḥammad's sons, Abū Hāshim, ʿAbd Allāh, and others who were present, addressed him:

نحن نعلم أن الإمام أولى بالصلوة و لولا ذلك ما قدمناك فقال زيد بن السائب هكذا سمعت أبا هاشم يقول فتقدم فصلى عليه

We know that the Imām is more deserving to lead the ṣalāh. Had this not been the case, we would not have put you forward.

¹ *Al-Istī āb*, vol. 3 pg. 100, biography of 'Abbās ibn 'Abd al-Muṭṭalib; *Al-Bidāyah wa al-Nihāyah*, vol. 7 pg. 162, mention of 'Abbās, year 32 A.H.

Zayd ibn al-Sā'ib says, "This is what I heard Abū Hāshim say."

Accordingly, Abān went forward and led the Ṣalāt al-Janāzah.¹

Reminder

We feel it appropriate to remind the readers at this juncture of a ruling discussed previously. In Islam, the Amīr al-Mu'minīn or the ruler of the time has the right to lead the Ṣalāt al-Janāzah just as ʿAlī's grandson, the son of Muḥammad ibn al-Ḥanafiyyah, has confirmed here. Alternatively, that person may lead the Ṣalāt al-Janāzah who has been given permission by the ruler. In compliance to this sharʿī ruling, Sayyidunā Abū Bakr al-Ṣiddīq—and no one else—offered the Ṣalāt al-Janāzah for Sayyidah Fāṭimah al-Zahrā' . Wherever the contrary appears, it is only the speculation of the narrator which is rejected in the presence of this sharʿī ruling unanimously accepted by both sects. A detailed discussion of this issue appeared previously in the Ṣiddīqī section of this book while discussing Sayyidah Fāṭimah's janāzah. Kindly refer to it.

d. Abān ibn 'Uthmān leads the Ṣalāt al-Janāzah of 'Abd Allāh ibn Jaʿfar al-Ṭayyār

Sayyidunā ʿAbd Allāh ibn Jaʿfar ibn Abī Ṭālib ﷺ is the nephew of Sayyidunā ʿAlī ﷺ as well as his son-in-law. He is one of the renowned figures of the Banū Hāshim and a man of righteousness. Majority of historians agree that he passed away in Madīnah in 80 A.H. The governor over Madīnah at the time from the side of the khalīfah ʿAbd al-Malik was Abān ibn ʿUthmān ibn ʿAffān. When ʿAbd Allāh passed away, Abān ibn ʿUthmān led his Ṣalāt al-Janāzah. This happened the same year Makkah was struck with a huge flood which washed away camels laden with goods. It is called the year of *al-Jaḥāf* (ruin).²

¹ *Țabaqāt Ibn Saʿd*, vol. 5 pg. 86, biography of Muḥammad ibn al-Ḥanafiyyah, Leiden print.

² *Al-Istī āb* with *al-Iṣābah*, vol. 2 pg. 267, biography of 'Abd Allāh ibn Ja'far; *Usd al-Ghābah*, vol. 3 pg. 135, biography of 'Abd Allāh; *al-Iṣābah* with *al-Istī āb*, vol. 2 pg. 281, biography of 'Abd Allāh ibn Ja'far al-Ṭayyār.

5. Hāshimī Participation in Jihād during the 'Uthmānī khilāfah

Like the other Ṣaḥābah ﷺ, the Hāshimīs supported Sayyidunā ʿUthmān ﷺ at every step of his khilāfah. They assisted and backed one another at every juncture. There was no trace of tribal prejudice or mutual bias among them. A few incidents will now be reproduced which prove the participation of Sayyidunā ʿAlī's ﷺ sons (Sayyidunā Ḥasan and Sayyidunā Ḥusayn ﷺ) as well as his nephews and cousins and other Hāshimīs in Jihād expeditions.

a. The Battle of Tripoli and Africa (26 A.H.)

فاستشار عثمان من عنده من الصحابة فأشار أكثرهم بذلك فجهز إليه العساكر من المدينة و فيهم جماعة من أعيان الصحابة منهم عبد الله بن العباس و غيره فسار بهم عبد الله بن سعد إلى أفريقة فلما وصلوا إلى برقة لقيهم عقبة بن نافع فيمن معه من المسلمين

'Uthmān consulted the Ṣaḥābah who were by him [regarding attacking Tripoli and North West Africa]. Majority of them gave him the go ahead. As a result, he mobilised forces from Madīnah for the mission. A group of distinguished Ṣaḥābah, *inter alia*, 'Abd Allāh ibn 'Abbās, etc. were in the forces. 'Abd Allāh ibn Sa'd travelled with them to Africa. When they reached Barqah, 'Uqbah ibn Nāfi' and the Muslims with him met them.¹

ثم لما ولي عبد الله بن أبي سرح استأذن عثمان في ذلك و استمده فاستشار عثمان الصحابة فأشاروا به فجهز العساكر من المدينة و فيهم جماعة من الصحابة منهم ابن عباس و ابن عمر و ابن عمرو بن العاص و ابن جعفر والحسن و الحسين و ابن الزبير و ساروا مع عبد الله ابن أبي سرح سنة ست و عشرين و لقيهم عقبة بن نافع فيمن معه من المسلمين ببرقة ثم ساروا إلى طرابلس فتهيوا الروم عندها ثم ساروا إلى أفريقية و بثوا السرايا كل ناحية

When 'Abd Allāh (ibn Sa'd) ibn Abī Sarḥ was appointed as the governor of Egypt, he requested 'Uthmān permission to send troops [towards Tripoli and the other parts of North West Africa.] 'Uthmān in turn consulted with the senior Ṣaḥābah, who forwarded their opinion that they should be given permission to go ahead.

¹ Al-Kāmil, vol. 3 pg. 45, year 26 A.H., Egypt print.

An army was prepared in Madīnah which comprised of a group of Ṣaḥābah, *inter alia*, ʿAbd Allāh ibn ʿAbbās, ʿAbd Allāh ibn ʿUmar, ʿAbd Allāh ibn ʿAmr ibn al-ʿĀṣ, ʿAbd Allāh ibn Jaʿfar, Ḥasan, Ḥusayn, and ʿAbd Allāh ibn Zubayr.

This army, under the leadership of 'Abd Allāh (ibn Sa'd) ibn Abī Sarḥ, set out in 26 A.H and met up with 'Uqbah ibn Nāfi' and his group of Muslims at a place called Barqah. They all proceeded towards Tripoli and engaged with the Romans there. Thereafter, they proceeded to [North West] Africa and sent detachments in every direction.¹

Note: Some historians have recorded this under the events of the year 27 A.H. Khalīfah ibn Khayyāț has done the same.²

b. The Expedition of Khurāsān, Ṭabristān, and Jurjān (30 A.H.)

After a few years, the Muslim army advanced from Kūfah under the leadership of Saʿīd ibn al-ʿĀṣ al-Umawī in the year 30 A.H. to Khurāsān, Ṭabristān, and Jurjān. Senior Hāshimīs participated in these expeditions and remained in Jihād for a long period. They conquered territory after territory, took their share from the booty, and returned safely.

Ibn Jarīr al-Ṭabarī, Ibn Athīr al-Jazarī, Ibn Kathīr, and Ibn Khaldūn have recorded these happenings in their books with their respective wordings.

عن حنش بن مالك قال غزا سعيد بن العاص من الكوفة سنة ٣٠ يريد خراسان و معه حذيفة بن اليمان و ناس من أصحاب رسول الله و معه الحسن و الحسين و عبد الله بن العباس و عبد الله بن عمر و عبد الله بن عمرو بن العاص و عبد الله بن الزبير

Ḥanash ibn Mālik reports:

Sa īd ibn al-ʿĀṣ advanced from Kūfah in the year 30 A.H. towards Khurāsān. Ḥudhayfah ibn al-Yamān and other Companions of Rasūlullāh سيتشتينية were

¹ *Tārīkh Ibn Khaldūn*, vol. 2 pg. 1003, under the heading leadership of 'Abd Allāh ibn Abī Sarḥ over Egypt and the conquest of Africa.

² Tārīkh Khalīfah ibn Khayyāṭ, vol. 1 pg. 134, events of the year 27 A.H.

with him. Ḥasan, Ḥusayn, ʿAbd Allāh ibn ʿAbbās, ʿAbd Allāh ibn ʿUmar, ʿAbd Allāh ibn ʿAmr ibn al-ʿĀṣ, and ʿAbd Allāh ibn al-Zubayr accompanied him.¹

فإن سعيدا غزاها من الكوفة سنة ثلاثين و معه الحسن و الحسين و ابن عباس و ابن عمر بن الخطاب و عبد الله بن عمرو بن العاص و حذيفة بن اليمان و ابن الزبير و ناس من أصحاب رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم

Saʿīd attacked it from Kūfah the year 30 A.H. Ḥasan, Ḥusayn, Ibn ʿAbbās, Ibn ʿUmar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb, ʿAbd Allāh ibn ʿAmr ibn al-ʿĀṣ, Ḥudhayfah ibn al-Yamān, Ibn Zubayr, and a number of other Companions of Rasūlullāh نام

ذكر المادائني أن سعيد بن العاص ركب في جيش فيه الحسن والحسين و العبادلة الاربعة و حذيفة بن اليمان في خلق من الصحابة و سار بهم فمر على بلدان شتى يصالحونه على أموال جزيلة حتى انتهى إلى بلد معاملة جرجان فقاتلوه حتى احتاجوا إلى صلوة الخوف

Al-Madā'inī records that Saʿīd ibn al-ʿĀṣ al-Umawī (who at that time was the governor of Kūfah appointed by Sayyidunā ʿUthmān ﷺ), proceeded with an army which comprised of Ḥasan, Ḥusayn, ʿAbd Allāh ibn ʿAbbās, ʿAbd Allāh ibn ʿUmar, ʿAbd Allāh ibn ʿAmr ibn al-ʿĀṣ, ʿAbd Allāh ibn Zubayr, Ḥudhayfah ibn al-Yamān, and scores of other Ṣaḥābah. They passed many territories and cities where peace treaties were signed in lieu of a handsome amount of wealth, until they finally reached Jurjān. At Jurjān a fierce battle ensued in which they were compelled to perform Ṣalāt al-Khawf.³

c. Participation in Jihād in 32 A.H.

In the year 32 A.H. during the 'Uthmānī khilāfah, Sa'īd ibn al-ʿĀṣ al-Umawī led the Muslim army to Balanjar. The inhabitants of Balanjar coupled with the Turks attacked the Muslim forces with full fury and the battle raged. Ibn Kathīr continues:

¹ Tārīkh al-Umam wa al-Mulūk, vol. 5 pg. 57, events of the year 30 A.H., old Egypt print.

² Al-Kāmil, vol. 3 pg. 54, the Battle of Ṭabristān.

³ *Al-Bidāyah wa al-Nihāyah*, vol. 7 pg. 154, year 30 A.H.; *Tārīkh Ibn Khaldūn*, vol. 2 pg. 1018, Battle of Țabristān, Beirut print.

فقتل يومئذ عبد الرحمن بن ربيعة كان يقال له ذو النور و انهزم المسلمون فافترقوا فرقتين ففرقة ذهبت إلى بلاد الخزر و فرقة سلكوا ناحية جيلان و جرجان و في هؤلاء أبو هريرة و سلمان الفارسي رضي الله عنهما

'Abd al-Raḥmān ibn Rabī ah (a distinguished Muslim) was martyred on that day. He was called $Dh\bar{u}$ al- $N\bar{u}r$ (full of light). The Muslims faced a (temporary) defeat. So they separated into two groups. One group went to the land of Khazr while the other group took the road to Jīlān and Jurjān. Abū Hurayrah and Salmān al-Fārisī www were in the second group.¹

The books of history are replete with incidents of this nature of participation in jihād. Senior and prominent Ṣaḥābah ﷺ continued to participate in expeditions during the ʿUthmānī khilāfah. In the above incident, popular personalities like Sayyidunā Abū Hurayrah and Sayyidunā Salmān al-Fārisī ﷺ participated.

Sayyidunā Salmān al-Fārisī is that individual who in the light of Shīʻī traditions always acted in accordance to the desire and pleasure of Sayyidunā 'Alī is. He never conducted a practical program without his consultation. He was from the special devotees of Sayyidunā 'Alī is.

What we wish to indicate is that just as Hāshimīs participated in the jihad expedition during the 'Uthmānī khilāfah, their partisans also put their shoulders to the wheel by practically participating in jihād, understanding it to be a noble act of worship.

d. Maʿbad ibn al-ʿAbbās's Martyrdom in 35 A.H.

One of Sayyidunā ʿAbbās ibn ʿAbd al-Muṭṭalib's ﷺ sons is Maʿbad ibn al-ʿAbbās. The scholars write:

معبد بن العباس بن عبد المطلب بن هاشم القرشي الهاشمي يكنى أبا العباس ولد على عهد رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم و لم يحفظ عنه قتل بأفريقية شهيدا سنة خمس و ثلاثين في زمن عثمان رضى الله

¹ *Tārīkh al-Ṭabarī*, vol. 5 pg. 78, year 32 A.H., old Egypt print; *al-Kāmil*, vol. 3 pg. 66, year 32 A.H., Egypt print; *Al-Bidāyah wa al-Nihāyah*, vol. 7 pg. 160, year 32 A.H., Egypt print.

عنه و كان قد غزاها مع ابن أبي سرح و أمه أم الفضل لبابة بنت الحارث أخت ميمونة زوج النبي صلى الله عليه و سلم

Maʿbad ibn al-ʿAbbās ibn ʿAbd al-Muṭṭalib ibn Hāshim al-Qurashī al-Hāshimī. His agnomen is Abū al-ʿAbbās. He was born during the lifetime of Rasūlullāh نام المحمد but did not memorise any ḥadīth from him. He was killed as a martyr in Africa in 35 A.H during the reign of ʿUthmān المحمد. He attacked it with Ibn Abī Sarḥ. His mother is Umm al-Faḍl Lubābah bint al-Ḥārith, the sister of Maymūnah, Rasūlullāh's مالاتين wife.¹

Note: Other historians like al-Balādhurī in *Futūḥ al-Buldān* say it took place prior to the year 35 A.H.

Beloved readers, these historical facts have revealed that during the 'Uthmānī reign, there existed no tribal racism between the Hāshimīs and Umawīs. Tribal worship and family distinction was not their concern. They worked together with unity so that the word of Allah may reign supreme and participated in jihād to spread Islam.

6. The Monetary Rights of the Relatives of Rasūlullāh مَتَالَمَنْعَلَدُوسَلَمُ

The monetary rights of the family of Rasūlullāh أستكنين were taken care of during his blessed era from the khums, produce of Fadak, booty from other conquests, and stipends. Thereafter, Sayyidunā Abū Bakr al-Ṣiddīq well-being according to the prophetic system and so did Sayyidunā 'Umar al-Fārūq during their respective eras. We have provided sufficient evidence from books of both sects for the above in the Ṣiddīqī and Fārūqī sections of this book.

Now comes the 'Uthmānī khilāfah. We felt it appropriate to discuss the fulfilment of their monetary rights during it so that the respected readers are rest assured

¹ *Al-Istīʿāb*, vol. 3 pg. 436, 437, Maʿbad ibn al-ʿAbbās; *al-Iṣābah*, vol. 3 pg. 457, Maʿbad ibn al-ʿAbbās; *Usd al-Ghābah*, vol. 4 pg. 392, Maʿbad ibn al-ʿAbbās; *Futūḥ al-Buldān*, pg. 234, conquest of Africa, first edition, Egypt.

that Sayyidunā 'Uthmān ﷺ also fulfilled their rights in the correct prophetic manner. None of the three khulafā' usurped or trampled their rights. Rather, they continued giving them stipends and allowances from the captured booty.

The Muslims are unanimous upon the fact that the three khulafā' were just and impartial, not usurpers or oppressors. Sayyidunā ʿUthmān نوافق did not allow oppression on any individual. Fairness was his salient quality. He regarded fulfilling the rights of those deserving his responsibility. Allah نيتكافيرينان admires this quality of the Companions of Rasūlullāh مرافقاتينين in the glorious Qur'ān:

يَبْتَغُوْنَ فَضْلًا مِّنَ اللَّهِ وَرِضْوَانًا

Seeking bounty from Allah and [His] approval.¹

These personalities carried out those acts which earned Allah's شيكلاؤتلا pleasure and remained distant from those actions that incurred His wrath. After the emphatic words of the Qur'ān have been presented, we now wish to display some texts established on the pages of Islamic history which support the primary subject under discussion. Firstly, relevant texts from our books will be presented to the readers followed by snippets from Shīī books for corroboration.

Gifts for 'Alī

1. Saʿīd ibn al-ʿĀṣ was appointed governor over Kūfah by Sayyidunā ʿUthmān

قدم سعيد بن العاص المدينة وافدا على عثمان فبعث إلى وجوه المهاجرين و الأنصار بصلات و كسى و بعث إلى علي بن أبي طالب أيضا فقبل ما بعث إليه

Saʿīd ibn al-ʿĀṣ came to Madīnah to meet ʿUthmān. He sent gifts and garments to the distinguished Muhājirīn and Anṣār. He also sent gifts for ʿAlī ibn Abī Ṭālib who accepted what was sent to him.²

¹ Sūrah al-Ḥashr: 8.

² *Țabaqāt Ibn Saʿd*, vol. 5 pg. 21, Saʿīd ibn al-ʿĀṣ.

2. In 30 A.H., cities like Khurāsān, Āmil, Marw, etc., were conquered under the supervision of 'Abd Allāh ibn 'Āmir. After completing these significant tasks, 'Abd Allāh ibn 'Āmir returned to Madīnah and went to visit Amīr al-Mu'minīn Sayyidunā 'Uthmān ''''''''''''. He then began bestowing gifts to the inhabitants of Madīnah. He sent 3000 dirhams to Sayyidunā 'Alī '''''''''. The narration continues:

فقال (عثمان) لابن عامر قبح الله رأيك أترسل إلى علي بثلاثة آلاف درهم قال كرهت أن أغرق و لم أدر ما رأيك قال فأغرق قال فبعث إليه بعشرين ألف درهم و ما يتبعها قال فراح علي إلى المسجد فانتهى إلى حلقته و هم يتذاكرون صلات ابن عامر هذا الحي من قريش فقال علي هو سيد فتيان قريش غير مدافع

'Uthmān told Ibn 'Āmir, "Your view was dishonourable! You sent only 3000 dirhams to 'Alī?"

He submitted, "I disliked favouring one above another and I was unaware of your opinion."

'Uthmān commanded, "Give more to him."

Accordingly, he sent 20 000 dirhams to 'Alī coupled with other presents.

Thereafter 'Alī came to the Masjid and approached a circle who were speaking about the gifts of Ibn ' \bar{A} mir to the Quraysh tribe. 'Alī announced, "He is the leader of the youth of the Quraysh, without dispute."

3. Special Consideration for Muțțalibī Hāshimīs

عن سحيم بن حفص قال كان ربيعة بن الحارث بن عبد المطلب شريك عثمان في الجاهلية فقال العباس بن ربيعة لعثمان اكتب لي ابن عامر يسلفني مائة ألف فكتب فأعطاه مائة ألف و صله بها و اقطعه داره دار العباس بن ربيعة اليوم

Suḥaym ibn Ḥafṣ relates:

Rabīʿah ibn al-Ḥārith ibn ʿAbd al-Muṭṭalib was ʿUthmān's business partner in the time of jāhiliyyah. ʿAbbās ibn Rabīʿah (his son) submitted before

¹ *Ṭabaqāt Ibn Saʿd*, vol. 5 pg. 33, ʿAbd Allāh ibn ʿĀmir, Leiden print.

'Uthmān, "Write to Ibn 'Āmir (governor of Baṣrah) to lend me 100 000 dirhams. Moreover, I need a house to stay in." Accordingly, 'Uthmān wrote to Ibn 'Āmir who gave 'Abbās 100 000 dirhams and allocated a land to him which is known right up to today as the house of 'Abbās ibn Rabī'ah.¹

Fulfilment of Monetary Rights (from the books of the Shīʿah)

Sayyidunā 'Uthmān's ﷺ maternal cousin 'Abd Allāh ibn 'Āmir ibn Kurayz was one of the main strategisers in the conquest of Khurāsān. He conquered the area and obtained a handsome booty. Two daughters of the king of that area Yazdegerd were taken as captive as part of the spoils of war. Sayyidunā 'Uthmān ﷺ gifted them to Sayyidunā Ḥasan and Sayyidunā Ḥusayn ﷺ. This entire incident has been reported by Shīʿī scholars from the tongue of Imam 'Alī al-Riḍā ﷺ. We will now quote some supporting texts from their books considered reliable by them which corroborates the focus of our discussion.

The Shīʿī scholar, ʿAbd Allāh al-Māmaqānī, writes in his book, Tanqīḥ al-Maqāl:

عن سهل بن القاسم البوشنجاني قال قال لي الرضا بخراسان إن بيننا و بينكم نسبا قلت ما هو أيها الأمير قال إن عبد الله بن عامر بن كريز لما افتتح خراسان أصاب ابنتين ليزدجرد بن شهريار ملك الأعاجم فبعث بهما إلى عثمان بن عفان فوهب إحداهما للحسن و الأخرى للحسين فماتتا عندهما نفساوين و كانت صاحبة الحسين نفست بعلي بن الحسين عليهما السلام

Sahl ibn al-Qāsim al-Būshanjānī narrates, "'Alī al-Riḍā told me once while we were in Khurāsān that we are relatives to each other. I asked him, 'How is that so?'

'Alī al-Riḍā replied, 'When 'Abd Allāh ibn 'Āmir (Sayyidunā 'Uthmān's cousin) conquered Khurāsān, two daughters of the king, Yazdegerd ibn Shahriyār, fell into the Muslim hands as booty. He sent them to 'Uthmān, who gifted one to Ḥasan and the other to Ḥusayn. Both of them bore children for Ḥasan and Ḥusayn and passed away while being married to

¹ *Tārīkh al-Ṭabarī*, vol. 5 pg. 138, 139, 35 A.H., list of some of the characteristics of 'Uthmān ibn 'Affān, Egypt print.

them. The girl who was the wife¹ of <code>Husayn</code> gave birth to 'Alī ibn al-<code>Husayn</code> (Zayn al 'Ābidīn).'"²

In *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*, Ibn Maytham al-Baḥrānī has brought a lengthy discussion under the text:

Definitely, Fadak was is our possession.

He enumerates 18 themes. Under theme 8, he reports this incident which discusses the dialogue between Sayyidah Fāṭimah and Sayyidunā Abū Bakr al-Ṣiddīq over Fadak:

كان رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم يأخذ من فدك قوتكم و يقسم الباقي يحمل منه في سبيل الله و لك على الله أن أصنع بها كما كان يصنع فرضيت بذلك و أخذت العهد عليه به و كان يأخذ غلتها فيدفع إليهم منها ما يكفيهم ثم فعلت الخلفاء بعده كذلك

Abū Bakr explained, "Rasūlullāh ستشتيمة would take your expenses from Fadak and distribute and spend the rest in the path of Allah. You have my word in Allah's name that I will do just as your father did."

¹ It may be objected that this incident of Shahrbānū has been mentioned in the Fārūqī section of this book while discussing the conquests and booty of Sayyidunā 'Umar and 'Umar and 'Umar' and 'Umar'' and 'Umar'' and 'Umar'' and 'Umar'' and 'Umar'' and 'Umar'' and

² *Tanqīḥ al-Maqāl fī 'llm al-Rijāl*, vol. 3 pg. 80, section of women, chapter on Sīn and Shīn, Shahrbānū, Tehran print.

She was pleased with this and took a covenant from him upon it. He would take its produce and give them what was sufficient for them. Thereafter, the khulafā' after him acted in the very same way.¹

After presenting texts from two books the Shīʿah consider reliable, I felt it necessary to present another Shīʿī reference since in this text, Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd Shīʿī listed the khulafā' by name. He acknowledges:

```
كان أبو بكر يأخذ غلتها و يدفع إليهم منها ما يكفيهم و يقسم الباقي و كان عمر كذلك ثم كان عثمان كذلك
ثم كان على كذلك
```

Abū Bakr would take its produce and give them what was sufficient for them and distribute the rest (among the needy). 'Umar did the same. Thereafter, 'Uthmān did the same. And thereafter, 'Alī did the same.²

Sayyid 'Alī Naqī Fayd al-Islām—the renowned Shī'ī scholar of the 14th century—has mentioned the above in his Persian commentary of *Nahj al-Balāghah* in the following words:

```
خلاصه ابو بكر غله و سوداي گرفته بقدر كفايت بابل بيت عليهم السلام ميداد و خلفاء بعد از وبمم بران اسلوب رفتار نمودند
```

Abū Bakr would give a sufficient amount of the produce of Fadak to the Ahl al-Bayt 3000 and the khulafā' after him maintained this practice.³

Significant Points and Deductions

All the incidents in chapter four are glimpses of the friendly interactions and amicable relationship between Sayyidunā ʿUthmān and Sayyidunā ʿAlī and the Hāshimīs . The following points are established:

¹ *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*, vol. 5 pg. 107, theme 8, mention of Fadak, new Tehran print; *al-Durrah al-Najfiyyah*, pg. 332, mention of Fadak, old Iran print.

² *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*, vol. 4 pg. 111, chapter on what Abū Bakr did with Fadak and what he said about it, Beirut print.

³ *Tarjamah wa Shar*^h Fārisī *Nahj al-Balāghah*, vol. 5 pg. 960, under the text: definitely, Fadak was in our possession from all the sky covers, Tehran print.

- 1. Mutual consultation took place between Sayyidunā 'Uthmān and Sayyidunā 'Alī in implementation and enforcement of divine laws. They would practically implement the official punishments of Allah in partnership. They would aid and support one another in the enforcement of Islamic rulings. There existed no rancour between them. Most importantly, there existed no dispute in matters of the khilāfah and in implementation of legal proceedings. Rather, they practically assisted one another.
- 2. Hāshimīs were awarded positions of honour during the 'Uthmānī khilāfah just as the Banū Umayyah and other tribes were. The Hāshimīs were neither side-lined nor treated with family prejudice.
- 3. Hāshimīs would refer their disputes to the 'Uthmānī court to plead for settlement. These incidents prove that the 'Uthmānī khilāfah was correct according to the Banū Hāshim and his judiciary system was in order and his decisions were according to the dictates of Sharīʿah. This also clarifies that the 'Uthmānī khilāfah was not a produce of usurpation or rebellion, but rather it was just and fair. His judgements were not contrary to the Sharīʿah. To declare his khilāfah and judiciary system non-Islamic and oppose to Islamic fundamentals is denial of facts and destruction of equity.
- 4. Sayyidunā 'Uthmān 'E displayed the highest of esteem and respect for Hāshimī seniors like Sayyidunā 'Abbās ibn 'Abd al-Muțțalib 'E disp. He treated him with veneration due to his kinship with Rasūlullāh 'Uthmān 'E disp. When a Hāshimī passed away, Amīr al-Mu'minīn Sayyidunā 'Uthmān 'E disp. or his governor would fulfil their duty of offering the Ṣalāt al-Janāzah. The khalīfah has the right to perform the Ṣalāt al-Janāzah and this practice was upheld. In short, during those days, the Ṣalāt al-Janāzah of Hāshimīs was not led by Hāshimīs but rather by 'Umawīs which is manifest evidence of their unity in faith and unanimity is methodology.
- 5. The Hāshimīs (Sayyidunā ʿAlī's 🕬 children and others) would participate in the jihād expeditions against the kuffār during the khilāfah

of Sayyidunā 'Uthmān '''''''''. With hand in hand, they fought the enemies at strategic places and took their shares from the booty. The booty during that era was distributed strictly according to the rules laid down in Islam. The Hāshimīs had no objection to the manner of distribution. Their participation in expedition after expedition is a beautiful and strong support for the correctness of this matter. The accusation of the critics of the mishandling of the booty of Africa and its incorrect distribution is erroneous. Furthermore, just as their participation indicates to the unity they enjoyed, at the same time it is testimony to the correctness of the 'Uthmānī khilāfah. The Hāshimīs had not the slightest of doubt that Sayyidunā 'Uthmān '''''''' was the rightful khalīfah of the time. All the Hāshimīs supported Sayyidunā 'Uthmān ''''''' in matters of the state. There was absolutely no trace whatsoever of tribalism and nationalism and family feuds were non-existent. These are fictions concocted many years later.

6. It has been emphasized that during the khilāfah of all four khulafā', viz. Sayyidunā Abū Bakr al-Ṣiddīq, Sayyidunā 'Umar al-Fārūq, Sayyidunā 'Uthmān, and Sayyidunā 'Alī نال المنظور (Alī منظور), there was no difference in the manner the khums and produce of Fadak was distributed. The needs of the family of Rasūlullāh منظور and the children of Sayyidunā 'Alī منظور (Alī منظور) were taken care of from the produce of Fadak. No khalīfah, including Sayyidunā 'Uthmān منظور (Thmān منظور). The propaganda of the usurpation of their rights is only to spread a negative picture and evil thoughts about the noble Ṣaḥābah منظور). But it is in total polarity to reality.

فاروق ظل جاه و جلال محمد است	صدیق عکس حسن کمال محمد است
حيدر بېار باغ خصال محمد است	عثمان ضياء شمع جمال محمد است
بو بكر و عمر عثمان و على	ہیں کرنیں ایک ہی مشعل کی
کچہ فرق نہیں ان چاروں میں	ہم مشرب ہیں یاران نبی

Ṣiddīq is the reflection of Muḥammad's superb excellence.

Fārūq is the shadow of Muḥammad's awe and glory.

'Uthmān is the shining light of Muḥammad's beauty. Ḥaydar is the blooming garden of Muḥammad's characteristics. They are rays of the same light. Abū Bakr, 'Umar, 'Uthmān, and 'Alī.

The friends of the Nabī are from the same fountain.

There is no difference in these four.

Chapter Five

Points Regarding the Siege of 'Uthman

- Prior to the assassination of Amīr al-Mu'minīn Sayyidunā 'Uthmān Dhū al-Nūrayn all the Muslims were united. There was no rancour between them. They were diligently occupied in putting an end to the forces of kufr. After this incident, differences between the Muslims cropped up. The united force and power of the Muslims that was directed at termination of Islamic enemies was now being utilised in mutual skirmishes and clashes. The door for infighting opened. The blessings of Nubuwwah that were previously present among the Muslims no more endured after this incident, and slowly faded away.
- 2. During the final days of Sayyidunā 'Uthmān's www khilāfah, some people had few objections against the management of state by a couple of Sayyidunā 'Uthmān's www representatives. Evil conspirators led by 'Abd Allāh ibn Saba'—a Jewish hypocrite hiding in the garb of a new Muslim—added fuel to these objections and turned them into allegations and accusations. Slowly but surely, these criminal activities took the colour of a rebellion¹. The primary objective of these conspirators was to attack the headquarters of Islam thus causing a division among the Muslims which they fulfilled by spilling the blood of the noble khalīfah of Islam. To reach their goal, they attacked the capital of Islam, Madīnah Munawwarah, and laid siege to the house of the khalīfah. The siege lasted for few days. On the 18th of Dhū al-Ḥijjah 35 A.H. they oppressively martyred the third khalīfah Sayyidunā 'Uthmān www in cold blood. Further details of this incident may be studied in *Tārīkh al-Kāmil*² of Ibn Athīr al-Jazarī.

¹ What were the reasons for objections against the government turning into a rebellion? Who were the conspirators and plotters? Did the dwellers of Madīnah support the khalīfah of the time or oppose him during the siege? All these aspects need clarification and elucidation. However, these are matters out of the ambit of our primary object and core discussion. Therefore, we intentionally left them out in this book.

² Tārīkh al-Kāmil, vol. 3 pg. 77, under mention of the journey of those who travelled to besiege 'Uthmān.

3. The assistance and support the Hāshimīs awarded Sayyidunā 'Uthmān 'Uthmān' Uthmān' Uthmān'

1. Representative for Hajj and the Selection of Ibn 'Abbās

The rebels surrounded Madīnah and besieged the dwelling of Sayyidunā 'Uthmān ""(), restricting his movements. Going to Masjid al-Nabawī, a few paces from his house, was impossible. The season of Ḥajj was in and the days of Ḥajj were about to begin.

Among those who shielded the door of Sayyidunā ʿUthmān's نشانه house to protect it from the rebels were some Hāshimīs (details are coming). Special mention is made of Sayyidunā ʿAlī's beloved cousin, Sayyidunā ʿAbd Allāh ibn ʿAbbās, son of the beloved uncle or Rasūlullāh أَسَانَيْ , Sayyidunā ʿAbbās ibn ʿAbd al-Muṭṭalib مَالَيْنَا , He sternly prohibited the insurgents from acts of rebellion to the best of his ability and meticulously guarded the house. Sayyidunā Ibn ʿUmar شَنْهُ relates:

ما زال ابن عباس ينهى عن قتل عثمان و يعظم شأنه

Ibn 'Abbās continued prohibiting 'Uthmān's killing and continued announcing his honour and glory.¹

¹ Ansāb al-Ashrāf, vol. 5 pg. 101.

One day during this chaos, Sayyidunā 'Uthmān 'Ess climbed the roof of his house and summoned Sayyidunā 'Abd Allāh ibn 'Abbās 'Ess. He addressed him thus, "The days of Ḥajj have come close. Be the leader of Ḥajj on my behalf and go to supervise the smooth running of the Ḥajj." Sayyidunā Ibn 'Abbās 'Ess submitted, "By Allah, to clash with these rebels is more pleasing to me than making Ḥajj to the House of Allah." Sayyidah 'Uthmān 'Ess swore upon oath in Allah's name that he will definitely go. In compliance, Sayyidunā Ibn 'Abbās 'Ess became the Amīr of Ḥajj in the year 35 A.H and proceeded to fulfil the responsibilities as leader on behalf of Sayyidunā 'Uthmān 'Ess. The authors have recorded this incident in their books with their own words. Only the text of *Tārīkh al-Ṭabarī* will be quoted for brevity. References to other books have been presented and deemed adequate:

فأشرف عثمان على الناس فقال يا عبد الله بن عباس فدعي له فقال اذهب فأنت على الموسم و كان ممن لزم الباب فقال والله يا أمير المؤمنين لجهاد هؤلاء أحب إلي من الحج فأقسم عليه لينطلقن فانطلق ابن عباس على الموسم تلك السنة

'Uthmān stood above the people and yelled, "O 'Abd Allāh ibn 'Abbās." He was called. 'Uthmān instructed, "Leave, for you are the leader of the Ḥajj season."

He was among those who diligently defended the door so he submitted, "By Allah, O Amīr al-Mu'minīn! Fighting these rebels is more pleasing to me than Ḥajj!"

'Uthmān swore on oath that he will proceed, so Ibn 'Abbās proceeded as the leader of Ḥajj that year (35 A.H.).¹

عن ابن عباس قال دعاني عثمان فاستعملني على الحج فخرجت إلى مكة فأقمت للناس الحج و قرأت عليهم كتاب عثمان إليهم ثم قدمت المدينة قد بويع لعلي إلخ

Ibn 'Abbās narrates:

¹ Tārīkh al-Ṭabarī, vol. 5 pg. 127, Egypt print.

'Uthmān summoned me and appointed me as leader of the Ḥajj. I left towards Makkah and carried out the rituals of Ḥajj for the people and read 'Uthmān's letter to them. I then rushed back to Madīnah only to find that bay'ah had already been given to 'Alī.'

Corroboration by Shīʿī Historians

The famous Shīī historian Yaʿqūbī writes that during the siege of Sayyidunā ʿUthmān نوائع , Sayyidunā ʿAbd Allāh ibn ʿAbbās ibn ʿAbd al-Muṭṭalib نوائع led the people in Ḥajj. His text reads:

و السنة التي قتل فيها فإنه حج بالناس عبد الله بن عباس و هو سنة ٣٥

The year he was killed was the same year 'Abd Allāh ibn 'Abbās led the people in Ḥajj. It is the year 35 A.H.²

Sayyidunā Ibn ʿAbbās ﷺ was reluctant to travel and leave Sayyidunā ʿUthmān ﷺ in a realm of worry and anxiety. However, he regarded obedience to the rightful khalīfah of the time paramount and travelled to Makkah as the representative of the Khalīfah to perform Ḥajj. During these days, the rebels oppressively killed Sayyidunā ʿUthmān

When the news of Sayyidunā 'Uthmān's a martyrdom reached him, he was utterly devastated and expressed his emotions in the following words:

لو أن الناس أجمعوا على قتل عثمان لرموا بالحجارة كما رمي قوم لوط

¹ *Tārīkh al-Ṭabarī*, vol. 5 pg. 159, events of the year 35 A.H.; *Ansāb al-Ashrāf*, vol. 5 pg. 23, 24, new print; *al-Kāmil*, vol. 3 pg. 87, the martyrdom of 'Uthmān; *Kitāb al-Tamhīd wa al-Bayān fī Maqtal al-Shahīd 'Uthmān*, pg. 124, mention of preventing water from 'Uthmān, Beirut print; *Al-Bidāyah wa al-Nihāyah*, vol. 7 pg. 187, the killing of 'Uthmān; *Tārīkh Ibn Khaldūn*, vol. 2 pg. 1025, discussion on siege of 'Uthmān and his killing; *Usd al-Ghābah*, vol. 3 pg. 195, biography of 'Abd Allāh ibn 'Abbās; *al-Muḥabbar*, pg. 358, Hyderabad print, Dakkan.

² Tārīkh Yaʿqūbī, vol. 2 pg. 167, discussion on the final days of ʿUthmān ibn ʿAffān, Beirut print.

Had all the people united to kill 'Uthmān, they would have all being pelted with stones like the nation of $L\bar{u}t^{,1}$

2. The Efforts of 'Alī and His Children to Protect 'Uthmān

Efforts were made time and again to repel the rebels during the siege. The noble Ṣaḥābah ﷺ tried their level best to remove this evil. Sayyidunā ʿAlī and his offspring exhausted their efforts in trying to repulse this evil. However, Sayyidunā ʿUthmān ﷺ did not allow anyone to raise his hand against the rebels.

a. ʿAbd Allāh ibn Rabāḥ speaks about the efforts of Sayyidunā Ḥasan ibn ʿAlī ﷺ. He mentions:

فلقيت الحسن بن علي رضي الله عنه داخلا عليه فرجعنا معه نسمع ما يقول قال أنا هذا يا أمير المؤمنين فأمرني بأمرك قال اجلس يا ابن أخي حتى يأتي الله بأمره فإنه لا حاجة لي في الدنيا أو قال في القتال

I met Ḥasan ibn ʿAlī as he was on his way to ʿUthmān during the siege. We returned with him to listen to their conversation. Ḥasan told ʿUthmān, "Here I am, O Amīr al-Mu'minīn! Whatever command you give me, I will carry it out."

'Uthmān www replied: "O my nephew! Wait till the decree of Allah comes to pass. I do not have any need for this world—or he said, I do not have any need to fight."²

b. Nafī', the slave and student of Sayyidunā 'Abd Allāh ibn 'Umar ﷺ, relates about him:

عن عبيد الله عن نافع عن ابن عمر أقبل هو و الحسن بن علي يوم قتل عثمان فقالا لو أمرنا لقاتلنا و لكنه قال كفوا

¹ *Țabaqāt Ibn Saʿd*, vol. 3 pg. 56, biography of 'Uthmān ibn 'Affān, Leiden print; *Ansāb al-Ashrāf*, vol. 5 pg. 101, new print; *Kitāb al-Tamhīd wa al-Bayān*, pg. 234, Beirut print.

² Mușannaf ʿAbd al-Razzāq, vol. 11 pg. 447, Majlis ʿIlmī print.

From 'Ubayd Allah—from Nāfi':

Ibn 'Umar and Ḥasan ibn 'Alī came forward the day 'Uthmān was martyred and said: "If 'Uthmān had commanded us, we would have fought (and repelled these rebels), but he commanded that everyone should hold back their hands (and not take up arms)."¹

c. Shaykh Sayyid 'Alī al-Ḥajwīrī Lāhorī has also written in his famous Persian book *Kashf al-Maḥjūb* about Sayyidunā Ḥasan ﷺ and his efforts to defend Sayyidunā 'Uthmān ﷺ:

چوں حسن اندر اِمد و سلام گفت و ویرا بداں بلیت تعزیت کرد و گفت یا امیر المؤمنین من بے فرمان تو شمشیر بر مسلماناں نتوانم کشید و تو امام بر حقی مرا فرمان دہ تا بلانے این قوم از تو دفع کنم عثمان ویرا گفت یا ابن اخی ارجع و اجلس فی بیتک حتی یاتی اللہ بامرہ فلا حاجۃ لنا فی اہبراق الدماء ای برادر زادہء من بازگرد و اندر خانہء خود بنشیں تا فرمان خداوند تعالی و تقدیروی چہ باشد کہ مارا بخون ریختن مسلمانان حاجت نیست

Hasan www entered, greeted, and consoled 'Uthmān www on the difficulties facing him, and then said, "O Amīr al-Mu'minīn! Without your permission I do not want to unsheathe my sword. You are the rightful Imām and leader. If you permit me, I will repel this calamity which has befallen you."

'Uthmān www replied, "O my nephew! Return to your home and wait till the decree of Allah comes to pass. We do not want the blood of Muslims to be shed."²

d. The famous historian, Khalīfah ibn Khayyāṭ (d. 240 A.H.) has recorded with his chain of narrators from Muḥammad ibn Sīrīn المنافع, that Sayyidunā Ḥusayn ibn ʿAlī, and other Ṣaḥābah and Tābiʿīn accompanied Sayyidunā Ḥasan نفافع to protect the Khilāfah. He writes:

عن يحيى بن عتيق عن محمد بن سيرين قال انطلق الحسن و الحسين و ابن عمر و ابن الزبير و مروان كلهم شاك في السلاح حتى دخلوا الدار فقال عثمان أعزم عليكم لما رجعتم فوضعتم أسلحتكم و لزمتم بيوتكم

¹ Akhbār Aṣbahān, vol. 2 pg. 139, Leiden print.

² Kashf al-Maḥjūb, vol. 7 pg. 86, their A'immah from the Ṣaḥābah, Samarqand print, pg. 53, Lahore print.

From Yaḥyā ibn ʿAtīq—from Muḥammad ibn Sīrīn who reports:

Hasan, Husayn, 'Abd Allāh ibn 'Umar, 'Abd Allāh ibn Zubayr, and Marwān came to the house of 'Uthmān, armed with their weapons to defend him. 'Uthmān told them, "I entreat you on oath to return, lay down your weapons, and remain in your homes."¹

e. After relating all of the above, we finally quote the report of Ḥāfiẓ Ibn Kathīr which has a little more detail. He declares:

كذلك كان عثمان بن عفان يكرم الحسن و الحسين و يحبهما

'Uthmān would honour and treat Ḥasan and Ḥusayn with kindness and he loved them dearly.

He then states:

و قد كان الحسن بن علي يوم الدار و عثمان بن عفان محصور عنده و معه السيف متقلدا به يحاجف عن عثمان فخشي عثمان عليه فأقسم عليه ليرجعن إلى منزلهم تطييبا لقلب علي و خوفا عليه رضي الله عنهم

When 'Uthmān was besieged, Ḥasan ibn 'Alī was at his side (defending him). He had a sword hanging from his neck and he stood as a shield in front of 'Uthmān. 'Uthmān feared that he might be injured so he swore on oath that they will return to their homes, to soothe the heart of 'Alī and remove his concern.

f. Ibn Kathīr expounds further on the circumstances of this event:

كان الحصار مستمرا من أواخر ذي القعدة إلى يوم الجمعة الثامن عشر ذي الحجة سنة ٣٥ للذين عنده في الدار من المهاجرين و الانصار ... فيهم عبد الله بن عمر و عبد الله بن الزبير و الحسن و الحسين و مروان و أبو هريرة و خلق من مواليه و لو تركهم لمنعوه فقال لهم أقسم على من لي عليه حق أن يكف يده و أن ينطلق إلى منزله و عنده من أعيان الصحابة و أبنائهم جم غفير و قال لرقيقه من أغمد سيفه فهو حر

The siege lasted from the end of Dhū al-Qaʿdah till Friday the 18 of Dhū al-Ḥijjah 35 A.H. The Muhājirīn and Anṣār were at the home of ʿUthmān

¹ Tārīkh Khalīfah ibn Khayyāṭ, vol. 1 pg. 151, 152, Iraq print.

(to defend him). Amongst them were 'Abd Allāh ibn 'Umar, 'Abd Allāh ibn Zubayr, Ḥasan, Ḥusayn, Marwān, Abū Hurayrah, and a number of his servants and slaves. If 'Uthmān did not prevent them, they would have stopped the rebels. However, 'Uthmān implored them on oath to hold back their hands and return home, although the senior Ṣaḥābah and their sons were present in large numbers. In fact, 'Uthmān told his own slaves, "Whoever will put down his weapons is free!"¹

More quotations on Incidents during the Siege in Sequence

Dhū al-Nūrayn Sayyidunā 'Uthmān ﷺ prevented all the people, Hāshimīs and non-Hāshimīs, from any form of attack (against the rebels) for his sake as mentioned above. Nonetheless, out of concern and goodwill, these men exhausted their efforts to repel the insurgents and protect Sayyidunā 'Uthmān

The siege lasted for a good couple of days. Many attempts to drive them away were made. Sayyidunā ʿAlī ﷺ continued sending his close and dear ones and went himself on many occasions to ward off the evil doers.

Some of the Hāshimīs were even wounded. And if there was a shortage of water, Sayyidunā ʿAlī made a resolute effort to arrange water to be transported to Sayyidunā ʿUthmān's house, even though the Hāshimī servants were injured in the process.

The rebels and insurgents finally found an opening and martyred Sayyidunā 'Uthmān ﷺ. This devastating news propelled shockwaves through the hearts of the Ṣaḥābah ﷺ. Sayyidunā 'Alī with other Ṣaḥābah ﷺ, with regret and remorse, rushed to the house of Sayyidunā 'Uthmān ﷺ. They severely rebuked their dear ones, whom they had appointed to guard the door of Sayyidunā 'Uthmān ﷺ, for failing in their duty and were extremely sorrowful.

¹ Al-Bidāyah wa al-Nihāyah, vol. 7 pg. 181, the year 35 A.H.

All these occurrences will be presented briefly in sequence from the books of the Ahl al-Sunnah and Shīʿah. A clear picture of the compassion and love these two personalities shared will come to the fore.

1. Al-Balādhurī has recorded the following in Ansāb al-Ashrāf:

و قال للحسن و الحسين اذهبا بسيو فكما حتى تقوما على باب عثمان فلا تدعا احدا يصل اليه و بعث الزبير ابنه عبد الله وبعث طلحة ابنه ... و بعث عدة من اصحاب النبي صلى الله عليه و سلم ابناءهم ليمنعوا الناس الدخول على عثمان

 ${}^{\circ}Al\bar{\imath}$ instructed Hasan and Husayn, "Go with your swords and stand at the door of ${}^{\circ}Uthm\bar{a}n$ allowing no one to get to him."

Similarly, Zubayr sent his son 'Abd Allāh, Ṭalḥah sent his son, and many other Ṣaḥābah also sent their sons to prevent the rebels from entering 'Uthmān's home."¹

A party of the Ṣaḥābah's sons rushed to him on their father's orders. Among them were Ḥasan, Ḥusayn, ʿAbd Allāh ibn al-Zubayr, and ʿAbd Allāh ibn ʿUmar. They began reasoning on his behalf and defending him all round so that none of the rebels reach him.²

Corroboration from the ${\rm Sh}\bar{\rm i}$ ah

The topic of defending Sayyidunā ʿUthmān ibn ʿAffān ﷺ during the siege has been written by Shīʿī scholars and mujtahidīn in their own cunning way. Nonetheless, they also acknowledge that Sayyidunā ʿAlī ﷺ, his sons,

¹ Ansāb al-Ashrāf, vol. 5 pg. 68, 69, chapter on the people of the cities rushing to 'Uthmān, new print.

² *Al-Bidāyah wa al-Nihāyah*, vol. 7 pg. 176, the siege of Amīr al-Mu'minīn 'Uthmān; *al-Kāmil*, vol. 3 pg. 87, the killing of 'Uthmān; *Kitāb al-Tamhīd wa al-Bayān*, pg. 175, Beirut print; *Kitāb al-Tamhīd* of Abū al-Shakūr al-Sālimī, pg. 164, discussion on the fourth stance on the khilāfah of 'Uthmān, Lahore print.

and his dear ones fulfilled their duty in defending the Khalīfah from the rebels during the siege thereby displaying their compassion and goodwill. They defended with force and pleaded with the rebels, but it all fell on deaf ears. The rebels were hell-bent on achieving their nefarious goal.

Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd has spoken about this in many places of *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*. Have a look at some snippets from his book:

و مانعهم الحسن بن علي و عبد الله بن الزبير و محمد بن طلحة و مروان و سعيد بن العاص و جماعة معهم من أبناء الأنصار فزجرهم عثمان و قال أنتم في حل من نصرتي فأبوا و لم يرجعوا

Ḥasan ibn ʿAlī, ʿAbd Allāh ibn al-Zubayr, Muḥammad ibn Ṭalḥah, Marwān, and Saʿīd ibn al-ʿĀṣ together with a crew of the Anṣār's children prevented them (the rebels). ʿUthmān stopped them saying, "You are free not to help me." But they refused and did not return.¹

فقد حضر هو بنفسه مرارا و طرد الناس عنه و أنفذ إليه ولديه و ابن اخيه عبد الله

'Alī himself presented himself to 'Uthmān on many occasions. He chased the people away from him. He also sent his sons and nephew, 'Abd Allāh (ibn Ja'far), to assist him.²

[°]Alī prohibited the people of Egypt and others from killing [°]Uthmān plenty times before he was killed. He repelled them with his hands, tongue, and his children but to no avail. Matters reached alarming proportions until he was finally killed.³

¹ Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah, vol. 1 pg. 197, siege of 'Uthmān and preventing him from water, Beirut print.

² Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah, vol. 10 pg. 581, old Iran print.

³ *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*, vol. 14 pg. 161, old Iran print, vol. 3 pg. 449, Beirut print, under the text: the same people pledged allegiance to me who gave bayʿah to Abū Bakr.

Ibn Maytham al-Baḥrānī also speaks about this in Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah:

It is not reported from 'Alī regarding 'Uthmān's affair except that he stuck to his house and remained aloof after defending him for a long period with his hand and tongue, but was unable to repel (the rebels).¹

The above texts of $Sh\bar{1}\bar{1}$ scholars have substantiated our claim. We have presented these texts to corroborate our claim for the ease of the noble readers.

2. The siege lasted for a long time. At some times, the situation grew intense and stones were thrown. Sayyidunā 'Uthmān's son, Abān, went to Sayyidunā 'Alī is to inform him of the situation. The incident is recorded as follows:

عن إسحاق بن راشد عن أبي جعفر أنبأنا أبان بن عثمان بن عفان قال كثر علينا الرمي بالحجارة أتيت عليا فقلت يا عم قد كثرت علينا الحجارة فمشى معه فرماهم حتى فترت يده ثم قال يا ابن أخي اجمع مواليكم و من كان منكم بسبيل ثم لتكن هذه حالكم

Isḥāq ibn Rāshid—from Abū Jaʿfar—Abān ibn ʿUthmān ibn ʿAffān informed us:

We were being pelted with an abundance of stones, so I approached 'Alī and submitted, "O uncle, stones are raining heavily upon us."

He came with me and began to pelt them until his hand became languid. He then said, "O nephew, gather your freed slaves and those you can reach (who will support you) and continue pelting them in this manner."²

¹ *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*, vol. 31 pg. 483, old Iran print, vol. 4 pg. 354, Tehran print, under the text of Nahj: O Muʿāwiyah, if you looked intellectually rather than emotionally.

² Ansāb al-Ashrāf, vol. 5 pg. 78, new print.

The author of *Kanz al-'Ummāl* has also recorded Sayyidunā 'Alī's assistance during the siege.¹ Have a look at the reference.

3. Hasan gets Injured

While trying to arrange for the protection of the Khalīfah during the siege, Sayyidunā Ḥasan ibn ʿAlī ﷺ was injured. Al-Balādhurī and Ibn Kathīr record this happening:

و قد رمي الناس عثمان بالسهام حتى خضب الحسن بالدماء على بابه ... و شج قنبر مولى علي

People shot arrows at 'Uthmān until they covered Ḥasan with blood, at his door. Qanbar, 'Alī's salve, had a gash in the head.

عن سعدان ابن بشر الجهني عن أبي محمد الأنصاري قال شهدت عثمان في الدار و الحسن بن علي يضارب عنه فجرح الحسن فكنت فيمن حمله جريحا

From Saʿdān ibn Bishr al-Juhanī—from Abū Muḥammad al-Anṣārī who said:

I was present when 'Uthmān was besieged and killed in his house. Hasan ibn 'Alī was defending him and was injured as a result. I was among those who carried him away in this state.²

و جرح عبد الله بن الزبير جراحات كثيرة و كذلك جرح حسن بن علي و مروان بن الحكم

ʿAbd Allāh ibn Zubayr was wounded multiple times. Similarly, Ḥasan ibn ʿAlī was injured as well as Marwān ibn al-Ḥakam.³

4. There was a shortage of water in Sayyidunā 'Uthmān's and house on few occasions. Sayyidunā 'Alī and water shortage and

¹ Kanz al-'Ummāl, vol. 6 pg. 386, Ḥadīth: 5937, first print.

² Ansāb al-Ashrāf, vol. 5 pg. 69, 95, new print.

³ Al-Bidāyah wa al-Nihāyah, vol. 7 pg. 188; Ansāb al-Ashrāf vol. 5 pg. 68, 69.

the difficulty he was facing. He immediately made arrangements for water to be transported despite the danger. The Hāshimī servants were injured. Nonetheless, Sayyidunā ʿAlī డుత్రం did not waiver in his determination to transport water.

The text of al-Balādhurī is quoted here and al-Ṭabarī's reference is presented as well:

قال جبير بن مطعم حصر عثمان حتى كان لا يشرب إلا من فقير في داره فدخلت على علي فقلت أرضيت بهذا أن يحصر أبن عمتك حتى والله ما يشرب إلا من فقير في داره فقال سبحان الله أوقد بلغوا به هذه الحال قلت نعم فعمد إلى روايا ماء فأدخلها إليه فسقاه

Jubayr ibn Muțʿim reports:

'Uthmān was blockaded so severely that he could not drink water except from a pauper in his house. I entered 'Alī's presence and said, "Are you pleased with this? Your cousin is blockaded to the extent that, by Allah, he cannot drink water except from a pauper in his house?"

He said, "Glorified is Allah! Has his condition reached this limit?" I replied in the affirmative.

At once, he arranged for waterskins to be transported to him.¹

At another place, al-Balādhurī adds:

فبلغ ذلك عليا فبعث إليه بثلاث قرب مملوءة ماء فما كادت تصل إليه و جرح بسببها عدة من موالي بني هاشم و بني أمية حتى وصلت إلخ

News of this reached 'Alī so he sent to him three waterskins filled with water. It was very difficult to transport the water to him and many slaves of the Banū Hāshim and Banū Umayyah were wounded in the process. However, finally the water reached him.²

¹ Ansāb al-Ashrāf, vol. 5 pg. 77, the matter with 'Amr ibn al-'Ās and others.

² Ansāb al-Ashrāf, vol. 5 pg. 68, 69, chapter on the people of the cities rushing to 'Uthmān.

The incident of transportation of water appears in $T\bar{a}r\bar{i}kh$ al- $\bar{I}abar\bar{i}$ and $T\bar{a}r\bar{i}kh$ Ibn Ath $\bar{i}r$ as well.¹

Corroboration from Shīʿī books

Famous Shīī historian Mirzā Muḥammad Taqī Lisān al-Mulk writes about this in *Nāsikh al-Tawārīkh* in the following manner:

نگذاشتند کہ کس اِب بسرا نے او برد عثمان بر بام سرا نے اِمد ندادر داد کہ اِیا علی بن ابی طالب درمیان شما جائے دارد گفتند نیست عثمان خاموش شد و از بام فرود اِمد ایں خبر بعلی علیہ السلام بردند علی غلام خویش قنبر را بد و فرستاد و پیام داد کہ شنیدم مرا ندا کردہ ای بگو حاجت چیست گفت ایں قوم اِب از من باز گرفتہ اند و گروہیے از فرزنداں و عزیزان من تشنہ اند اگر توانی مرا اِب فرست علی علیہ السلام اِن جماعت را خطاب کرد فقال اِیپا الناس اِن الذی تفعلون لایشبہ اِمر المؤمنین و لا اِمر الکافرین اِن الفارس و الروم لتاسر فتطعم فتسقی فواللہ لا تقطعوا الماء عن الرجل فرمود کہ اے مردم کردار شما نہ با مسلماناں ماندہ ست و نہ با کافران ہمانا کافراں فارس و روم را اسیر میکند لیکن اِب و ناں می دہند و اِب را ازیں مردم بازنگیرید قوم ابا داشتند و رضانہی دادند لا جرم علی علیہ السلام ۳ مشک اِب بدست چند تن از بنی ہاشم بدو فرستاد و تاہمگاں بخورند و سیراب شدند

The rebels refused to allow 'Uthmān ibn 'Affān water. Once, 'Uthmān climbed on his house and shouted, "Is 'Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib present?"

Those who were present replied in the negative. 'Uthmān kept silent and descended. Someone went to inform 'Alī of this. Immediately, 'Alī sent his slave Qanbar to 'Uthmān with a message asking him the reason for calling him and that if there was any need, he should mention. 'Uthmān submitted, "The enemy has stopped our water supply. My son and other family members are thirsty. Thirst has overwhelmed us. If possible, please send some water."

Upon receiving the message, ʿAlī ibn Abī Ṭālib reprimanded the rebels, "O people, your behaviour is neither the behaviour of Muslims nor disbelievers. The Persians and Romans give their prisoner food to eat and water to drink. I beseech you in Allah's name not to stop his water."

¹ *Tārīkh al-Ṭabarī*, vol. 5 pg. 127, the year 35 A.H., Egypt print; *al-Kāmil*, vol. 3 pg. 87, 'Uthmān's assassination, Egypt print.

However, the rebels refused to listen and were not happy. Nevertheless, $Al\bar{i}$ ibn Ab \bar{i} , \bar{i} alib sent 3 waterskins of water with some members of the Ban \bar{u} Hāshim to 'Uthmān. Then they were all satiated.¹

'Abbās al-Qummī has reported this event briefly in the footnotes of *Muntahā al-Āmāl* in the following words:

مکشوف باد کہ عثمان بن عفان را مصریاں در مدینہ محاصرہ کردند و منع اِب ازوے نمودند خبر با امیر المومنین علیہ السلام رسید اِنجناب متغیر شدند و از براۓ او اِب فرستادند و شرح قضیہء او در تواریخ مسطور ست

When the Egyptians and others besieged 'Uthmān in Madīnah and stopped his water supply, 'Alī came to learn of this and changed colour out of fury. He sent water for 'Uthmān. Details of this incident are written in *Tawārīkh*.²

5. Attempts to safeguard him failed. Finally, the insurgents fulfilled their mission after a long siege, i.e. they murdered Sayyidunā 'Uthmān 'Uthmān 'Uthmān kall in cold blood. When this disturbing news spread through Madīnah, all the Ṣaḥābah (who were in Madīnah) were devastated and hurried to Sayyidunā 'Uthmān's 'See house. Sayyidunā 'Alī 'See in a fit of rage began beating his own sons and scolding them for failing to protect the Khalīfah. Sayyidunā 'Alī 'See cried uncontrollably. This hurtful incident appears in the following books.

Al-Balādhurī writes in Ansāb al-Ashrāf:

و صعدت امرأته إلى الناس فقالت إن أمير المؤمنين قد قتل فدخل الحسن و الحسين و من كان معهما فوجدوا عثمان مذبوحا فانكبوا عليه يبكون و خرجوا و دخل الناس فوجدوه مذبوحا و بلغ الخبر عليا و طلحة و الزبير و سعدا و من كان بالمدينة فخرجوا و قد ذهب عقولهم للخبر الذي أتاهم حتى دخلوا على عثمان فوجدوه مقتولا فاسترجعوا و قال علي لابنيه كيف قتل أمير المؤمنين و أنتما على الباب و رفع

¹ Nāsikh al-Tawārīkh, vol. 2 pg. 531, old Tehran print.

² Footnotes of *Muntahā al-Āmāl*, vol. 1 pg. 335, under maqṣad 3, section 1, while discussing Ḥusayn's arrival at Karbalā' and his conversation with 'Umar ibn Saʿd, Iran print; *Fawā'id al-Raḍwiyyah*, vol. 2 pg. 437, Iran print.

یده فلطم الحسن و ضرب صدر الحسین و شتم محمد بن طلحة و عبد الله بن الزبیر و خرج علی و هو غضبان حتی أتی منزله

His wife climbed up, faced the people, and shouted, "Indeed, the Amīr al-Mu'minīn has been killed." Hasan, Husayn, and those with them entered the house and found 'Uthmān slain. They hugged him and cried profusely, then left. People entered and found him murdered. The news reached 'Alī, Țalḥah, Zubayr, Sa'd, and others who were in Madīnah. They left their homes in utter bewilderment and denial of the news that reached them. They entered 'Uthmān's home and found him slayed upon which they recited, "To Allah we belong and to Him is our return." 'Alī rebuked his sons, "How was Amīr al-Mu'minīn killed when you were at the door?" He lifted his hand and slapped Hasan and punched Husayn in the chest. He reproached Muḥammad ibn Ṭalḥah and 'Abd Allāh ibn al-Zubayr. He then left the house in a fit of rage and went home.¹

Another Narration of this Occasion

Relating the incidents of this calamity, the historians write that Sayyidunā 'Alī www out of excessive weeping fell over 'Uthmān www:

روى الربيع بن بدر عن سيار بن سلامة عن أبي العالية أن عليا دخل على عثمان فوقع عليه و جعل يبكي حتى ظنوا أنه سيلحق به

Rabīʿ ibn Badr—from Sayyār ibn Salāmah—from Abū al-ʿĀliyah:

^cAlī entered the home of ^cUthmān and fell down over him and began crying uncontrollably until they thought that he will join him (i.e. he will also pass away).²

¹ *Ansāb al-Ashrāf*, vol. 5 pg. 69, 70, Jerusalem print; *Tārīkh al-Islām*, vol. 2 pg. 139, the siege of 'Uthmān, 35 A.H.; *Tārīkh al-Khulafā*', pg. 113, with reference to Ibn 'Asākir, section on 'Uthmān's khilāfah, Delhi print; '*Aqīdat al-Safārīnī*, vol. 2 pg. 326, Egypt print.

² Al-Bidāyah wa al-Nihāyah, vol. 7 pg. 193, the conditions surrounding 'Uthmān's martyrdom.

6. After this catastrophe, the house of Sayyidunā 'Alī www was filled with tears, mourning over Sayyidunā 'Uthmān www, which gives an idea of how painful and devastating Sayyidunā 'Uthmān's www ruthless murder was to Sayyidunā 'Alī www. Sayyidunā 'Alī www and his family wept over his oppressive killing.

Al-Balādhurī relates via his sanad:

عن سلمة بن عثمان عن علي بن زيد عن الحسن قال دخل علي يوما على بناته و هن يمسحن عيونهن فقال ما لكن تبكين قلن نبكي على عثمان فبكي و قال ابكين

Salamah ibn ʿUthmān—from ʿAlī ibn Zayd—from Ḥasan who said:

One day, 'Alī entered the presence of his daughters who were wiping tears from their eyes. He enquired, "What is the matter? Why are you crying?"

They replied, "We are crying over 'Uthmān."

He began crying and told them to cry.¹

7. ʿAlī and his Offspring's Participation in ʿUthmān's Janāzah and Burial

Allah's مَسْحَقَدُوَعَالَ decree overpowers and subdues everything. Sayyidunā 'Uthmān نَسْحَقَدُوْعَا 'Uthmān نَسْحَقَدُوْعَا 'Uthmān نَسْحَقَدُوْعَا 'Shrouding, janāzah, and burial to take place with peace was distasteful to them. Despite the adverse conditions, the noble Ṣaḥābah نَسْحَقَدُ took up great courage and fulfilled his last rights with full vigour. Among them were Sayyidunā 'Alī and Sayyidunā Ḥasan نَسْحَقَدَ.

The historians have according to their style of writing gathered all types of narrations, authentic and non-authentic. Nonetheless, they have recorded that Sayyidunā ʿAlī and Sayyidunā Ḥasan participated

¹ Ansāb al-Ashrāf, vol. 5 pg. 103, 'Uthmān's dream and martyrdom.

in the final rights of Sayyidunā ʿUthmān and fulfilled the right of companionship.

It appears in *Tārīkh al-Ṭabarī*:

خرج مروان حتى أتى دار عثمان فأناه زيد بن ثابت و طلحة بن عبيد الله و علي و الحسن و كعب بن مالك و عامة من ثم من أصحابه فتوافى إلى موضع الجنائز صبيان و نساء فأخرجوا عثمان فصلى عليه مروان ثم خرجوا به حتى انتهوا إلى البقيع فدفنوه فيه مما يلي حش كوكب

Marwān went out until he reached 'Uthmān's house. Zayd ibn Thābit, Țalḥah ibn 'Ubayd Allah, 'Alī, Ḥasan, Kaʿb ibn Mālik, and his general companions that were there came to him. Some youngsters and women proceeded with them to the place of janāzah. They took 'Uthmān out [of his house] and Marwān performed his Ṣalāt al-Janāzah. Thereafter, they proceeded with him until they reached al-Baqī and buried him there, near Ḥash Kawkab.¹

It appears in Kitāb al-Tamhīd wa al-Bayān with reference to Imām Aḥmad:

و خرج به ناس يسير من أهله و الزبير و الحسن بن علي و أبو جهم و مروان بن الحكم بين العشائين فأتوا به حائطا من حيطان المدينة يقال له حش كوكب خارج البقيع فصلى عليه جبير بن مطعم و قيل حكم بن حزام و قيل مروان و قيل صلى عليه الزبير كذا ذكره الإمام أحمد في المسند

Some members of his household, together with a few others, like Zubayr ibn al-ʿAwwām, Ḥasan ibn ʿAlī, Abū Jahm, Marwān ibn al-Ḥakam, etc., took

¹ *Al-Fitnah wa Waqʻat al-Jamal*, pg. 84, burial of 'Uthmān; *Tārīkh al-Ṭabarī*, vol. 5 pg. 144, mention of the narration on the place 'Uthmān was buried at.

the body of 'Uthmān out of the house between Maghrib and 'Ishā' and went to a garden outside al-Baqī' known as *Ḥash Kawkab*. The Ṣalāt al-Janāzah was led by Jubayr ibn Muṭ'im, Ḥākim ibn Ḥizām, Marwān, or Zubayr ibn al-'Awwām (as per the various narrations) and he was thereafter buried in that garden.

Imām Aḥmad has reported this in al-Musnad.1

Ibn Kathīr relates in Al-Bidāyah wa al-Nihāyah:

قيل بل دفن من ليلته ثم كان دفنه ما بين المغرب و العشاء خفية من الخوارج و قيل بل استوذن في ذلك بعض رؤسائهم فخرجوا به في نفر قليل من الصحابة فيهم حكيم بن حزام و حويطب بن عبد العزى و أبو الجهم بن حذيفة و نيار بن مكرم الأسلمي و جبير بن مطعم و زيد بن ثابت و كعب بن مالك و طلحة و الزبير و علي بن أبي طالب و جماعة من أصحابه و نسائه منهن امرأتاه نائلة بنت الفرافصة و أم البنين بنت عبد الله بن حصين و صبيان ... و جماعة من خدمه حملوه على باب بعد ما غسلوه و كفنوه و زعم بعضهم أنه لم يغسل و لم يكفن و الصحيح الأول

It is said: Instead, he was buried that very night. His burial took place between Maghrib and 'Ishā' in secret from the Khawārij. It is said: They asked some of their leaders for permission and then took him with a small group of Ṣaḥābah among whom were Ḥakīm ibn Ḥizām, Ḥuwayṭib ibn 'Abd al-'Uzzā, Abū al-Jahm ibn Ḥudhayfah, Nayyār ibn Mukarram al-Aslamī, Jubayr ibn Muṭ'im, Zayd ibn Thābit, Ka'b ibn Mālik, Ṭalḥah, Zubayr, and 'Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib and a group of his companions and women folk among whom were his two wives Nā'ilah bint al-Farāfiṣah and Umm al-Banīn bint 'Abd Allāh ibn Ḥuṣayn and some youngsters and a group of his servant. They carried him on a door after washing him and shrouding him.

Some think that he was not washed or shrouded. However, the first opinion is correct. $^{\scriptscriptstyle 2}$

¹ *Kitāb al-Tamhīd wa al-Bayān fī Maqtal al-Shahīd 'Uthmān*, pg. 142, Beirut print; *al-Kāmil*, vol. 3 pg. 91, mention of the place he was buried and who performed ṣalāt al-janāzah upon him; *Tārīkh Ibn Khaldūn*, vol. 2 pg. 1053, discussion on the siege of 'Uthmān and his killing, new Beirut print.

² Al-Bidāyah wa al-Nihāyah, vol. 7 pg. 111.

Corroboration from the Shīʿah

Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd has reported this incident as follows in *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*:

A few members of his household, coupled with Ḥasan ibn ʿAlī, Ibn al-Zubayr, and Abū Jahm ibn Ḥudhayfah took him between Maghrib and ʿIshā' and went to a garden of Madīnah known as Ḥash Kawkab situated outside al-Baqīʿ and performed Ṣalāt al-Janāzah over him.¹

Conclusion of the Siege Discussion

All the above incidents tell us of the great services Sayyidunā ʿAlī and his children rendered in this painful catastrophe and how they upheld the rights of love and brotherly relationship. In the final days of Sayyidunā ʿUthmān , Sayyidunā ʿAlī exhausted all his efforts to chase away the rebels. He responded to their stone throwing by throwing stones. His sons were injured while warding off and fighting the rebels. He sent water to Sayyidunā ʿUthmān's house, despite the carriers of water being wounded. After all these stages, when finally the insurgents were successful in their sinister plan, Sayyidunā ʿAlī was utterly devastated and sorrowful and he reproached his dear ones and beat them. Then finally, he participated in the last stage, i.e. the janāzah and burial of Sayyidunā ʿUthmān . All of these are manifest proofs to the continual love and compassion Sayyidunā ʿUthmān and Sayyidunā ʿAlī shared which lasted to the very end.

¹ *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*, vol. 1 pg. 97, old Iran print, vol. 1 pg. 198, Beirut print, under the text: from his sermon about the killing of 'Uthmān ibn 'Affān.

The Name of 'Uthmān was prevalent in the Children of 'Alī

It is only natural for a person to exercise prudence when naming his children. He gives those names to his sons and daughters which will be a source of honour and pride for them for their entire lives. His selection of names gives an idea to his understanding, preferences, and natural inclinations. Generally, names of honourable, respected, and distinguished individuals are favoured with whom one has compatibility and loves and who are regarded as blessed and great. Those for whom rancour is harboured in the heart or are the targets of one's anger and wrath or whom one despises; one does not name his children after them.

When we look at Sayyidunā 'Alī is in the light of these natural tendencies and inclinations, we come to learn that the blessed names of Sayyidunā Abū Bakr, Sayyidunā 'Umar, and Sayyidunā 'Uthmān is were prevalent among his offspring which clearly proves that Sayyidunā 'Alī is held no grudges and harboured no rancour in any corner of his heart for the three khulafā'. To the contrary, he revered and respected them and held them in high esteem. That is why he allowed the custom of these names being among his children.

In the first (Ṣiddīqī) and second (Fārūqī) section of this book, we quoted texts from famous reliable and authentic books of both the Shīʿah and Ahl al-Sunnah and established that the names Abū Bakr and ʿUmar were found in the progeny of Sayyidunā ʿAlī and other Hāshimīs. In the third (ʿUthmānī) section, we wish to highlight the presence of the name ʿUthmān among Sayyidunā ʿAlī's children. This will confirm beyond doubt that they had faith and reliance in Sayyidunā ʿUthmān and regarded his name blessed and sacred.

A few quotations will be reproduced below as evidence. Firstly, we will present from our books followed by corroboration from Shīʿī books.

1. Abū ʿAbd Allāh al-Muṣʿab ibn ʿAbd Allāh al-Zubayrī (d. 236 A.H.) enumerates the offspring of Sayyidunā ʿAlī in *Nasab Quraysh*. He says:

عمر بن علي و رقية و هما توأم أمهما الصهباء من سبي خالد بن الوليد و كان عمر آخر ولد علي بن أبي طالب ... العباس بن علي ... إخوته لأبيه و أمه بنو علي و هم عثمان و جعفر و عبد الله فقتل قبله

'Umar ibn 'Alī and Ruqayyah were twins. Their mother was al-Ṣahbā' from the captives of Khālid ibn al-Walīd. 'Umar was the last son of 'Alī bin Abī Ṭālib.

'Abbās ibn 'Alī: His full brothers are 'Uthmān, Ja'far, and 'Abd Allāh who was killed (on the plains of Karbalā') before him.¹

2. Abū Muḥammad ʿAlī ibn Aḥmad ibn Saʿīd ibn Ḥazm al-Andalusī (d. 456 A.H.) writes in his renowned book *Jamharat Ansāb al-ʿArab*:

و العباس و أبو بكر و عثمان و جعفر و قتل أبو بكر و جعفر و عثمان و العباس مع أخيهم الحسين

6. ʿAbbās 7. Abū Bakr 8. ʿUthmān 9. Jaʿfar.

Abū Bakr, Jaʿfar, ʿUthmān, and ʿAbbās were killed with their brother <code>Husayn.²</code>

3. It appears in *Ṭabaqāt Ibn Saʿd* in the biography of Sayyidunā ʿAlī 🏭:

و أبو بكر بن علي قتل مع الحسين ... و العباس الأكبر بن علي و عثمان و جعفر الأكبر و عبد الله قتلوا مع الحسين بن علي إلخ

Abū Bakr ibn ʿAlī: He was killed with Ḥusayn. ʿAbbās al-Akbar ibn ʿAlī, ʿUthmān, Jaʿfar al-Akbar, and ʿAbd Allāh—all of them were martyred with Ḥusayn ibn ʿAlī.³

4. It is written in *Tārīkh Khalīfah ibn Khayyāț* in the events of the year 61 A.H. while discussing the martyrs of Karbalā':

¹ Nasab Quraysh, pg. 43, list of the children of ʿAlī ibn Abī Ṭālib, Egypt print.

² Jamharat Ansāb al-ʿArab, vol. 1 pg. 37, 38, list of the children of Amīr al-Mu'minīn, new Egypt print.

³ *Țabaqāt Ibn Saʿd*, vol. 3 pg. 11, 12, biography of ʿAlī ibn Abī Ṭālib, Leiden print.

Abū al-Ḥasan said: 'Uthmān ibn 'Alī was killed with him. His mother is Umm al-Banīn as well.¹

'Uthmān's name in 'Alī's Offspring From Shī'ī books

5. Aḥmad ibn Yaʿqūb in his famous *Tārīkh Yaʿqūbī* lists 24 of Sayyidunā ʿAlī's

ʿAbbās and Jaʿfar—who were killed at Ṭaff (Karbalā')—as well as ʿUthmān and ʿAbd Allāh. Their mother is Umm al-Banīn bint Ḥizām al-Kilābiyyah. ʿUthmān al-Aṣghar and Yaḥyā. Their mother is Asmā' bint ʿUmays al-Khathʿamiyyah.²

6. Abū al-Farj al-Aṣbahānī in Maqātil al-Ṭālibiyīn has listed the names of Sayyidunā Husayn's above brothers martyred at Karbalā' separately. 'Uthmān ibn 'Alī's name features there. Here is the text:

'Uthmān ibn 'Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib 55%. His mother is Umm al-Banīn. 'Uthmān ibn 'Alī was killed at the age of 21. 3

7. Al-Masʿūdī while discussing the khilāfah of Sayyidunā ʿAlī ﷺ lists his children in al-Tanbīh wa al-Ashrāf. He names 11 of his sons and ʿUthmān features at number 8.⁴

¹ *Tārīkh Khalīfah ibn Khayyā*ṭ, pg. 224, year 61 A.H. the martyrdom of Ḥusayn and his partisans, Najaf Ashraf print, Iraq.

² *Tārīkh Yaʿqūbī*, vol. 2 pg. 213, ʿAlī's children, Beirut print.

³ Maqātil al-Ṭālibiyīn, pg. 33, list of the martyrs of Karbalā', old Iran print.

⁴ Al-Tanbīh wa al-Ashrāf, pg. 258, the khilāfah of ʿAlī ibn Abī Ṭālib, 1357 A.H., 1938 edition.

 Al-Masʿūdī enumerates the names of the martyrs of Karbalā' under the heading: the days of Yazīd ibn Muʿāwiyah. 'Uthmān ibn ʿAlī's name features at number 3 on the list:

و قتل معه من ولد أبيه ستة و هم العباس و جعفر و عثمان و محمد الأصغر و عبد الله و أبو بكر

Six of his consanguine brothers were killed with him, viz. 'Abbās, Ja'far, 'Uthmān, Muḥammad al-Aṣghar, 'Abd Allāh, and Abū Bakr.¹

9. Al-Mufīd writes the names of Sayyidunā ʿAlī's 🕮 children in al-Irshād:

و عثمان و عبد الله الشهداء مع أخيهم حسين بطف أمهم أم البنين

'Uthmān and 'Abd Allāh were martyred with their brother Ḥusayn at Ṭaff (Karbalā'). Their mother is Umm al-Banīn.²

- 10. ʿAlī bin ʿIsā al-Arbilī lists 14 of Sayyidunā ʿAlī's ali ʿS male issue. ʿUthmān ibn ʿAlī comes number 7 on the list.³
- 11. Jamāl al-Dīn Aḥmad ibn ʿAlī, more commonly known as Ibn ʿInabah, speaks of the sons of Sayyidunā ʿAlī ﷺ in section four and five of his book ʿUmdat al-Ṭālib fī Ansāb Āl Abī Ṭālib:

أمه (أم عباس) و أم أخوته عثمان و جعفر و عبد الله أم البنين فاطمة بنت حزام ابن خالد

His (ʿAbbās's) mother and the mother of his brothers, ʿUthmān, Ja'far, and ʿAbd Allāh, is Umm al-Banīn Fāțimah bint Ḥizām ibn Khālid.⁴

¹ Al-Tanbīh wa al-Ashrāf, pg. 263, the martyrs of Karbalā'.

² Al-Irshād, pg. 167, 168, the children of Amīr al-Mu'minīn, new Tehran print.

³ Kashf al-Ghummah fī Maʻrifat al-A'immah, vol. 1 pg. 590, the children of Amīr al-Mu'minīn, new Iran print.

⁴ *'Umdat al-Ṭālib fī Ansāb Āl Abī Ṭālib*, pg. 356, section four: mention of the offspring of 'Abbās ibn Amīr al-Mu'minīn, Najaf Ashraf print, Iraq.

12. Mullā Bāqir Majlisī—the Shīʻī mujtahid of the eleventh century—lists the names of the Ahl al-Bayt martyred on the Day of 'Āshūrā' in his book Jalā' al-'Uyūn:

نو نفر از فرزندان امير المومنين عليه السلام حضرت سيد الشهداء و عباس و پسر او محمد و عمر و عثمان و جعفر و ابرابيم و عبد الله الاصغر و محمد الاصفر إلخ

Nine of the offspring of Amīr al-Mu'minīn (, viz. Sayyid al-Shuhadā' (Ḥusayn), ʿAbbās, and his son Muḥammad, ʿUmar, ʿUthmān, Jaʿfar, Ibrāhīm, ʿAbd Allāh al-Aṣghar, and Muḥammad al-Aṣghar.¹

In short, Sayyidah 'Uthmān's www blessed name features in the children of Sayyidunā 'Alī www and is recorded by Sunnī and Shīʿī scholars and historians in many books, some of which we have quoted above. The quotations are verbatim. Those who are interested may refer to the original books.

Scores of authors have mentioned this point in their books. To quote from all the books is difficult. We felt it sufficient to suffice on 12 quotations from Sunnī and Shīʿī sources. The number 12 is also very blessed to the Shīʿah, hence they will also be delighted with this. It was one of the accepted facts that Sayyidunā ʿAlī also hamed one of his sons ʿUthmān. Just as he named two of his sons Abū Bakr and ʿUmar respectively, he chose the name ʿUthmān for his offspring.

Sayyidunā 'Alī choosing these names for his children is a manifest evidence for the love and respect he had for the three khulafā' and the harmonious relationship they shared. To reject all of these clear proofs and still to have false conviction that there existed enmity and hatred between them coupled with tribalism and family distinction, and they just kept these names like that, is an injustice to justice and synonymous to denial of the sun in broad daylight. In fact, it is denial of facts which is unbecoming of a man with intelligence.

¹ Jalā' al-'Uyūn, pg. 464, list of the martyrs of Karbalā' from 'Alī's offspring, Tehran print.

Conclusion

Now we come to the end of the third section ('Uthmānī) of *Ruḥamā' Baynahum*, and all praise belongs to Allah سُبْحَانَاتُوَقَعَالَ, after the Ṣiddīqī and Fārūqī sections.

After studying all the three sections of the book, it becomes apparent that between the three khulafā' and Sayyidunā ʿAlī ﷺ and his family, there survived religious brotherhood and Islamic love. There was no form of enmity or rancour between them, neither in the aspects of khilāfah nor anything besides it.

Moreover, the prime object of their lives was to establish and maintain Islam. Family distinction, family feuds, tribal prejudice, and authority, etc., such base ideologies, were never their aims and objectives.

The Book of Allah is sufficient testimony to this and every portion of each section of this book is adequate substantiation.

Those who strive to create a picture of tribal conflict in the best era of Islam have distorted the facts with the misuse of their pens and have fabricated history to suite their fancy, and desire to make everyone believe them. May Allah سُبْحَكَمُوْتَكَ guide them and cure them of their disease.

Innumerable volumes of thanks and gratitude belong to Allah المنحكة the Benevolent Master who bestowed upon His worthless servant the ability to gather aspects on the lives of the Khulafā' Rāshidīn highlighting their interactions and relationships in an amazing sequence. May Allah منحكة allow the Muslims to benefit tremendously from this book. May Allah grant all the Muslims the ability to love and obey Rasūlullāh منحكة ومن الما الما Bayt, and his noble Ṣaḥābah ومن ; and have good thoughts about them. May he grant us beautiful deaths with īmān and favour us with their intercession and company in the Hereafter and Jannah. Āmīn. We hope that our friends who benefit from this book will not forget to supplicate for our forgiveness. بر کریماں کارہا دشوار نیست

The fulfilment of a request by the benevolent is a piece of cake.

و آخر دعوانا أن الحمد لله رب العالمين و صلى الله تعالى على خير خلقه و حبيبه و خليله و على آله و أصحابه و أتباعه بإحسان إلى يوم الدين بر حمتك يا أرحم الراحمين

Our final call is that all praise belongs solely to Allah, the Sustainer of the worlds. May Allah عنه send His choicest salutations upon the cream of His creation, His beloved and His close friend, and upon his family, companions, and followers with goodness until the Day of Recompense. By Your mercy, O the Most Merciful of those who show mercy.

Rabī al-Awwal 1398 A.H.

March 1978

Muḥammad Nāfiʿ (May Allah forgive him)

Jāmiʿah Muḥammadī

Jhang District

Pakistan

Bibliography

			Year of
#	Name of Book	Name of Author	Demise
			(A.H.)
1	Muwațța'	Imām Malik	179
2	Al-Muṣannaf	ʿAbd al-Razzāq Ṣanʿānī	211
3	Al-Sunan	Saʿīd ibn Manṣūr	227
4	Al-Ṭabaqāt	Muḥammad Ibn Saʿd	230/235
5	Al-Mușannaf	Abū Bakr ʿAbd Allāh ibn Muḥammad ibn Abī Shaybah	235
6	Nasab Quraysh	Abū ʿAbd Allāh al-Muṣʿab ibn ʿAbd Allāh ibn Muṣʿab al-Zubayrī	236
7	Tārīkh Khalīfah ibn Khayyāț	Khalīfah ibn Khayyāţ, Abū ʿAmr	240
8	Al-Musnad with selections from Kanz al-ʿUmmāl	Imām Aḥmad ibn Ḥambal	241
9	Kitāb al- Muhabbar	Abū Jaʿfar Muḥammad ibn Ḥabīb ibn Umayyah al-Baghdādī	245
10	Al-Ṣaḥīḥ	Imām Muḥammad ibn Ismāʿīl al-Bukhārī	256
11	Al-Tārīkh al- Kabīr	Imām Muḥammad ibn Ismāʿīl al-Bukhārī	256
12	Sunan Abī Dāwūd	Abū Dāwūd Sulaymān ibn Ashʿath al- Sijistānī	275
13	Al-Maʿārif	Ibn Qutaybah, Abū Muḥammad ʿAbd Allāh ibn Muslim ibn Qutaybah al-Kātib al-Dīnawarī	276
14	Ansāb al-Ashrāf	Al-Balādhurī (from Aḥmad ibn Yaḥyā)	277/279
15	Futūḥ al-Buldān	Ibn Qutaybah, Abū Muḥammad ʿAbd Allāh ibn Muslim ibn Qutaybah al-Kātib al-Dīnawarī	276/277

Kitab QiyamShaykh Munammad ion Naşr al-Marwazi16al-Layl wa Qiyam294RamadanAbü Ja'far Muhammad ibn Jarīr al-Ţabarī31017Tārīkh al-Umam wa l-MulūkAbū Bakr 'Abd Allāh ibn Abī Dāwūd Sijistānī31918Al-MaşāhifAbū Bakr 'Abd Allāh ibn Abī Dāwūd Sijistānī31919Kitāb al-Jarh wa al-Ta'dīlAbū Muhammad 'Abd al-Raḥmān ibn Abī Hātim al-Rāzī32020Al-MustadrakAbū 'Abd Allāh Muḥammad ibn 'Abd Allāh al-Hākim Nīshāpūrī40521Tārīkh JurjānAbū al-Qāsim Hamzah ibn Abī Yūsuf al- Sahmī42722Kitāb AşbahānAbū Nu'aym Aḥmad ibn 'Abd Allāh al- Aşbahānī43023Hilyat al-AwliyāAbū Nu'aym Aḥmad ibn 'Abd Allāh al- Aşbahānī43024Kashf al-Mahjūb Shaykh 'Alī bin 'Uthmān ibn 'Alī al- Hajwīrī Lahorī45625Jamharat Ansāb al-'ArabAbū Bakr Aḥmad ibn Husayn al-Bayhaqī Al-Kifāyah fī 'Ilm al-Riwāyah45827Al-Kifāyah fī 'Ilm al-RiwāyahKhaṭīb al-Baghdādī Al-Istī āb with46328Tārīkh Baghdād HagarKhaṭīb al-Baghdādī Al-Istī āb with46329Al-Istī āb with HajarIbn 'Abd al-Barr Abī 'Amr Yūsuf ibn 'Abd Al-Barr al-Namarī46329Al-Istābah fi Ibn HajarAbū al-Qāsim 'Alī ibn Hasan ibn Hibat 'Asākir Allah known as Ibn 'Asākir57131Usd al-GhābahIbn al-Athīr 'Izz al-Dīn630		w:-1 o: -			
RamadanAbū Ja'far Muḥammad ibn Jarīr al-Tabarī wa l-MulūkAbū Ja'far Muḥammad ibn Jarīr al-Tabarī al-MaṣāḥifAbū Bakr 'Abd Allāh ibn Abī Dāwūd Sijistānī31018Al-MaṣāḥifAbū Bakr 'Abd Allāh ibn Abī Dāwūd Sijistānī31919Kitāb al-Jarḥ wa al-Ta'dīlAbū Muḥammad 'Abd al-Raḥmān ibn Abī Hātim al-Rāzī32020Al-MustadrakAbū 'Abd Allāh Muḥammad ibn 'Abd Allāh al-Hākim Nīshāpūrī40521Tārīkh JurjānAbū 'Abd Allāh Muḥammad ibn 'Abd Allāh al-Hākim Nīshāpūrī42722Kitāb Aşbahān Abū Nu'aym Aḥmad ibn 'Abd Allāh al- Aşbahānī43023Hilyat al-Awliyā Abū Nu'aym Aḥmad ibn 'Abd Allāh al- Aşbahānī43024Kashf al-Maḥjūb Shaykh 'Alī bin 'Uthmān ibn 'Alī al- Hajwīrī Lahorī45625Jamharat Ansāb al-YaabAbū Bakr Aḥmad ibn Husayn al-Bayhaqī Kubrā45826Al-Kifāyah fī 'llm al-RiwāyahKhaṭīb al-Baghdādī46328Tārīkh Baghdād HagarKhaṭīb al-Baghdādī46329Al-Istī āb with HajarIbn 'Abd al-Barr Abī 'Amr Yūsuf ibn 'Abd Al-Isābah of Ibn Hajar46330Tārīkh Ibn 'Abā al-Qāsim 'Alī ibn Hasan ibn Hibat 'Ajākir571		Kitāb Qiyām	Shaykh Muḥammad ibn Naṣr al-Marwazī		
17Tärīkh al-Umam wa l-MulūkAbū Ja'far Muḥammad ibn Jarīr al-Ṭabarī mal-Mulūk31018Al-MaṣāḥifAbū Bakr 'Abd Allāh ibn Abī Dāwūd Sijistānī31919Kitāb al-Jarḥ wa al-Ta'dīlAbū Muḥammad 'Abd al-Raḥmān ibn Abī Hātim al-Rāzī32020Al-MustadrakAbū 'Abd Allāh Muḥammad ibn 'Abd Allāh al-Ḥākim Nīshāpūrī40521Tārīkh JurjānAbū Abū al-Qāsim Hamzah ibn Abī Yūsuf al- Sahmī42722Kitāb AṣbahānAbū Nu'aym Aḥmad ibn 'Abd Allāh al- Aṣbahānī43023Hilyat al-AwliyāAbū Nu'aym Aḥmad ibn 'Abd Allāh al- Aṣbahānī43024Kashf al-MahjūbShaykh 'Alī bin 'Uthmān ibn 'Alī al- Hajwīrī Lahorī45625Jamharat Ansāb al-'ArabAbū Bakr Aḥmad ibn Ḥusayn al-Bayhaqī Abū Bakr Aḥmad ibn Ḥusayn al-Bayhaqī45826Al-Sunan al- KubrāAbū Bakr Aḥmad ibn Ḥusayn al-Bayhaqī al-'Arab46327Al-Kifāyah fī 'llm al-RiwāyahKhaṭīb al-Baghdādī al-Barr Abū 'Amr Yūsuf ibn 'Abd Al-Istīāb with46329Al-Istīāb mith HajarIbn 'Abd al-Barr Abū 'Amr Yūsuf ibn 'Abd al-Barr al-Namarī46329Tārīkh Ibn HajarAbū al-Qāsim 'Alī ibn Hasan ibn Hibat Al-Istāb with57130Tārīkh Ibn Abū al-Qāsim 'Alī ibn Jhasan ibn Hibat Hajar571	16			294	
17 wa l-Mulūk 310 18 Al-Maṣāḥif Abū Bakr 'Abd Allāh ibn Abī Dāwūd Sijistānī 319 19 Kitāb al-Jarḥ wa al-Ta'dīl Abū Muḥammad 'Abd al-Raḥmān ibn Abī Hātim al-Rāzī 320 20 Al-Mustadrak Abū 'Abd Allāh Muḥammad ibn 'Abd Allāh al-Hākim Nīshāpūrī 405 21 Tārīkh Jurjān Abū al-Qāsim Hamzah ibn Abī Yūsuf al-Sahmī 427 22 Kitāb Aṣbahān Abū Nu'aym Aḥmad ibn 'Abd Allāh al- Aṣbahānī 430 23 Hilyat al-Awliyā Abū Nu'aym Aḥmad ibn 'Abd Allāh al- Aṣbahānī 430 24 Kashf al-Maḥjūb Shaykh 'Alī bin 'Uthmān ibn 'Alī al- Hajwīrī Lahorī 456 25 Jamharat Ansāb al-'Arab Abū Bakr Aḥmad ibn Ḥusayn al-Bayhaqī 458 26 Al-Sunan al- Kubrā Abū Bakr Aḥmad ibn Ḥusayn al-Bayhaqī 458 27 Al-Kifāyah fī 'llm al-Riwāyah Khaṭīb al-Baghdādī 463 28 Tārīkh Baghdād Khaṭīb al-Baghdādī 463 29 Al-Istī āb with Ibn 'Abd al-Barr Abī 'Amr Yūsuf ibn 'Abd al-Barr al-Namarī 463 29 Al-Istābah of Ibn Hajar Abū al-Qāsim 'Alī ibn Ḥasan ibn Hibat Hajar 571 30 Tārīkh Ibn Abū al-Qāsim 'Alī ibn Hasan ibn Hibat Hajar 571	Щ	Ramadan			
wa l-MulūkAl-MaṣāḥifAbū Bakr 'Abd Allāh ibn Abī Dāwūd Sijistānī31918Al-MaṣāḥifAbū Bakr 'Abd Allāh ibn Abī Dāwūd Sijistānī31919Kitāb al-Jarḥ wa al-Ta'dīlAbū Muḥammad 'Abd al-Raḥmān ibn Abī Hātim al-Rāzī32020Al-MustadrakAbū 'Abd Allāh Muḥammad ibn 'Abd Allāh al-Hākim Nīshāpūrī40521Tārīkh JurjānAbū al-Qāsim Hamzah ibn Abī Yūsuf al- Sahmī42722Kitāb AṣbahānAbū Nu'aym Aḥmad ibn 'Abd Allāh al- Aṣbahānī43023Hilyat al-AwliyāAbū Nu'aym Aḥmad ibn 'Abd Allāh al- Aṣbahānī43024Kashf al-MaḥjūbShaykh 'Alī bin 'Uthmān ibn 'Alī al- Hajwīrī Lahorī45625Jamharat Ansāb al-'ArabAbū Muḥammad 'Alī ibn Aḥmad ibn Saʿīd, al-'Arab45626Al-Sunan al- KubrāAbū Bakr Aḥmad ibn Ḥusayn al-Bayhaqī Al-Kifāyah fī 'Ilm al-Riwāyah46328Tārīkh BaghdādKhaṭīb al-Baghdādī46329Al-Istīāb withIbn 'Abd al-Barr Abī 'Amr Yūsuf ibn 'Abd al-Barr al-Namarī46329Al-Istābah of Ibn HājarAbū al-Qāsim 'Alī ibn Ḥasan ibn Hibat Hājar57130Tārīkh Ibn Abū al-Qāsim 'Alī ibn Yašan ibn Hibat Hājar571	17	Tārīkh al-Umam	Abū Jaʿfar Muḥammad ibn Jarīr al-Ṭabarī	210	
18 Sijistānī 319 19 Kitāb al-Jarḥ wa al-Ta'dīl Abū Muḥammad ʿAbd al-Raḥmān ibn Abī Hātim al-Rāzī 320 20 Al-Mustadrak Abū ʿAbd Allāh Muḥammad ibn ʿAbd Allāh al-Hākim Nīshāpūrī 405 21 Tārīkh Jurjān Abū ʿAbd Allāh Muḥammad ibn ʿAbd Allāh al-Hākim Nīshāpūrī 427 22 Kitāb Aşbahān Abū Nu'aym Aḥmad ibn ʿAbd Allāh al- Aşbahānī 430 23 Kitāb Aşbahān Abū Nu'aym Aḥmad ibn ʿAbd Allāh al- Aşbahānī 430 24 Kashf al-Mahjūb al-ʿArab Shaykh ʿAlī bin ʿUthmān ibn ʿAbī al- Hajwīrī Lahorī 456 25 Jamharat Ansāb al-ʿArab Abū Muḥammad ʿAlī ibn Aḥmad ibn Saʿīd, Ibn Ḥazm al-Zāhirī al-Andalusī 456 26 Al-Sunan al- Kubrā Abū Bakr Aḥmad ibn Ḥusayn al-Bayhaqī defa 458 27 Al-Kifāyah fī ʿllm al-Riwāyah Khaṭīb al-Baghdādī 463 28 Tārīkh Baghdād Khaṭīb al-Baghdādī 463 29 Al-Istī āb with Hajar Ibn ʿAbū al-Qāsim ʿAlī ibn Ḥasan ibn Hibat Hajar 463 30 Tārīkh Ibn ʿAsākir Abū al-Qāsim ʿAlī ibn Ḥasan ibn Hibat Aliah known as Ibn ʿAsākir 571		wa l-Mulūk		310	
Image: SijistānīSijistānī19Kitāb al-Jarḥ wa al-TaʿdīlAbū Muḥammad ʿAbd al-Raḥmān ibn Abī Ḫātim al-Rāzī32020Al-MustadrakAbū ʿAbd Allāh Muḥammad ibn ʿAbd Allāh al-Ḥākim Nīshāpūrī40521Tārīkh JurjānAbū al-Qāsim Ḥamzah ibn Abī Yūsuf al- Sahmī42722Kitāb AṣbahānAbū Nuʿaym Aḥmad ibn ʿAbd Allāh al- Aṣbahānī43023Hilyat al-AwliyāAbū Nuʿaym Aḥmad ibn ʿAbd Allāh al- Aṣbahānī43024Kashf al-Maḥjūb al-ʿArabShaykh ʿAlī bin ʿUthmān ibn ʿAlī al- Ḥajwīrī Lahorī45625Jamharat Ansāb al-ʿArabAbū Muḥammad ʿAlī ibn Aḥmad ibn Saīd, Ibn Ḥazm al-Zāhirī al-Andalusī45626Al-Sunan al- KubrāAbū Bakr Aḥmad ibn Ḥusayn al-Bayhaqī al-Kiŋāyah fī ʿIlm Al-Kifāyah fī ʿIlm Al-RiwāyahKhaṭīb al-Baghdādī46329Al-Istī āb with HajarIbn ʿAbd al-Barr Abī ʿAmr Yūsuf ibn ʿAbd Al-Barr al-Namarī46330Tārīkh Baghdād HajarAbū al-Qāsim ʿAlī ibn Ḥasan ibn Hibat Hajar571		Al-Maṣāḥif	Abū Bakr ʿAbd Allāh ibn Abī Dāwūd	010	
19al-Ta'dīlHātim al-Rāzī32020Al-MustadrakAbū 'Abd Allāh Muḥammad ibn 'Abd Allāh al-Hākim Nīshāpūrī40521Tārīkh JurjānAbū al-Qāsim Hamzah ibn Abī Yūsuf al- Sahmī42721Tārīkh JurjānAbū Nu'aym Aḥmad ibn 'Abd Allāh al- Aşbahānī43022Kitāb AşbahānAbū Nu'aym Aḥmad ibn 'Abd Allāh al- Aşbahānī43023Hilyat al-AwliyāAbū Nu'aym Aḥmad ibn 'Abd Allāh al- Aşbahānī43024Kashf al-MahjūbShaykh 'Alī bin 'Uthmān ibn 'Alī al- Hajwīrī Lahorī45625Jamharat Ansāb al-'ArabAbū Muḥammad 'Alī ibn Aḥmad ibn Saʿīd, Ibn Ḥazm al-Zāhirī al-Andalusī45626Al-Sunan al- KubrāKhatīb al-Baghdādī46327Al-Kifāyah fî 'Ilm al-RiwāyahKhatīb al-Baghdādī46328Tārīkh Baghdād HajarKhatīb al-Baghdādī46329Al-Istī āb with HajarIbn 'Abd al-Barr Abī 'Amr Yūsuf ibn 'Abd al-Barr al-Namarī46330Tārīkh Ibn 'AsākirAbū al-Qāsim 'Alī ibn Hasan ibn Hibat 'Asākir571	18		Sijistānī	319	
al-Ta'dīlHātim al-Rāzī20Al-MustadrakAbū 'Abd Allāh Muḥammad ibn 'Abd Allāh al-Hākim Nīshāpūrī40521Tārīkh JurjānAbū al-Qāsim Hamzah ibn Abī Yūsuf al- Sahmī42722Kitāb AşbahānAbū Nu'aym Aḥmad ibn 'Abd Allāh al- Aşbahānī43023Hilyat al-AwliyāAbū Nu'aym Aḥmad ibn 'Abd Allāh al- Aşbahānī43024Kashf al-MaḥjūbShaykh 'Alī bin 'Uthmān ibn 'Abd Allāh al- Hajwīrī Lahorī45625Jamharat AnsābAbū Muḥammad 'Alī ibn Aḥmad ibn Sa'īd, al-'Arab45626Al-Sunan al- KubrāAbū Bakr Aḥmad ibn Ḥusayn al-Bayhaqī dal-Riwāyah46327Al-Kifāyah fī 'Ilm al-RiwāyahKhaṭīb al-Baghdādī46328Tārīkh BaghdādKhaṭīb al-Baghdādī46329Al-Istī āb with HajarIbn 'Abd al-Barr Abī 'Amr Yūsuf ibn 'Abd al-Barr al-Namarī46330Tārīkh Ibn 'AjākirAbū al-Qāsim 'Alī ibn Ḥasan ibn Hibat 'Asākir571	10	Kitāb al-Jarḥ wa	Abū Muḥammad ʿAbd al-Raḥmān ibn Abī		
20Allāh al-Hākim Nīshāpūrī40521Tārīkh JurjānAbū al-Qāsim Hamzah ibn Abī Yūsuf al-Sahmī42722Kitāb AşbahānAbū Nu'aym Aḥmad ibn 'Abd Allāh al-Aşbahānī43023Hilyat al-AwliyāAbū Nu'aym Aḥmad ibn 'Abd Allāh al-Aşbahānī43023Hilyat al-AwliyāAbū Nu'aym Aḥmad ibn 'Abd Allāh al-Aşbahānī43024Kashf al-MahjūbShaykh 'Alī bin 'Uthmān ibn 'Alī al-Hajwīrī Lahorī45625Jamharat AnsābAbū Muḥammad 'Alī ibn Aḥmad ibn Saʿīd, Ibn Ḥazm al-Zāhirī al-Andalusī45626Al-Sunan al-KubrāAbū Bakr Aḥmad ibn Ḥusayn al-Bayhaqī al-Riwāyah46327Al-Kifāyah fī 'Ilm al-RivāyahKhatīb al-Baghdādī46328Tārīkh BaghdādKhatīb al-Baghdādī46329Al-Istī āb with HajarIbn 'Abd al-Barr Abī 'Amr Yūsuf ibn 'Abd al-Barr al-Namarī46330Tārīkh Ibn 'AsākirAbū al-Qāsim 'Alī ibn Ḥasan ibn Hibat 'Asākir571	19	al-Taʿdīl	Ḥātim al-Rāzī	320	
Allāh al-Hākim Nīshāpūrī21Tārīkh JurjānAbū al-Qāsim Hamzah ibn Abī Yūsuf al- Sahmī42722Kitāb AşbahānAbū Nuʿaym Aḥmad ibn ʿAbd Allāh al- Aşbahānī43023Hilyat al-AwliyāAbū Nuʿaym Aḥmad ibn ʿAbd Allāh al- Aşbahānī43024Kashf al-MaḥjūbShaykh ʿAlī bin ʿUthmān ibn ʿAbd Allāh al- Hajwīrī Lahorī45625Jamharat Ansāb al-ʿArabAbū Muḥammad ʿAlī ibn Aḥmad ibn Saʿīd, Ibn Ḥazm al-Zāhirī al-Andalusī45626Al-Sunan al- KubrāAbū Bakr Aḥmad ibn Ḥusayn al-Bayhaqī al-Riwāyah46327Al-Kifāyah fī ʿIlm al-RiwāyahKhaṭīb al-Baghdādī46328Tārīkh BaghdādKhaṭīb al-Baghdādī46329Al-Istī āb with HajarIbn ʿAbū al-Barr Abī ʿAmr Yūsuf ibn ʿAbd al-Barr al-Namarī46330Tārīkh Ibn ʿAsākirAbū al-Qāsim ʿAlī ibn Ḥasan ibn Hibat ʿAsākir571		Al-Mustadrak	Abū ʿAbd Allāh Muḥammad ibn ʿAbd		
21Sahmī42722Kitāb AşbahānAbū Nu'aym Aḥmad ibn 'Abd Allāh al- Aşbahānī43023Hilyat al-AwliyāAbū Nu'aym Aḥmad ibn 'Abd Allāh al- Aşbahānī43024Kashf al-MahjūbShaykh 'Alī bin 'Uthmān ibn 'Alī al- Hajwīrī Lahorī45625Jamharat Ansāb al-'ArabAbū Muḥammad 'Alī ibn Aḥmad ibn Saʿīd, Ibn Ḥazm al-Zāhirī al-Andalusī45626Al-Sunan al- KubrāAbū Bakr Aḥmad ibn Ḥusayn al-Bayhaqī Kubrā45827Al-Kifāyah fī 'Ilm al-RiwāyahKhatīb al-Baghdādī46328Tārīkh BaghdādKhatīb al-Baghdādī46329Al-Istī āb with HajarIbn 'Abd al-Barr Abī 'Amr Yūsuf ibn 'Abd al-Barr al-Namarī46330Tārīkh Ibn 'AsākirAbū al-Qāsim 'Alī ibn Ḥasan ibn Hibat 'Asākir571	20		Allāh al-Ḥākim Nīshāpūrī	405	
Image: Sahmi shimi s	01	Tārīkh Jurjān	Abū al-Qāsim Ḥamzah ibn Abī Yūsuf al-	107	
22Aşbahānī43023Hilyat al-AwliyāAbū Nu'aym Aḥmad ibn ʿAbd Allāh al- Aṣbahānī43024Kashf al-MaḥjūbShaykh ʿAlī bin ʿUthmān ibn ʿAlī al- Hajwīrī Lahorī45625Jamharat Ansāb al-ʿArabAbū Muḥammad ʿAlī ibn Aḥmad ibn Saʿīd, Ibn Ḥazm al-Ṣāhirī al-Andalusī45626Al-Sunan al- KubrāAbū Bakr Aḥmad ibn Ḥusayn al-Bayhaqī al-ʿArab45827Al-Kifāyah fī ʿIlm al-RiwāyahKhaṭīb al-Baghdādī46328Tārīkh BaghdādKhaṭīb al-Baghdādī46329Al-Istī āb with HajaarIbn ʿAbd al-Barr Abī ʿAmr Yūsuf ibn ʿAbd al-Barr al-Namarī46330Tārīkh Ibn ʿAsākirAbū al-Qāsim ʿAlī ibn Ḥasan ibn Hibat Allah known as Ibn ʿAsākir571	21		Sahmī	427	
AşbahānīAşbahānī23Hilyat al-AwliyāAbū Nu'aym Aḥmad ibn 'Abd Allāh al- Aṣbahānī43024Kashf al-MaḥjūbShaykh 'Alī bin 'Uthmān ibn 'Alī al- Hajwīrī Lahorī45625Jamharat Ansāb al-'ArabAbū Muḥammad 'Alī ibn Aḥmad ibn Saʿīd, Ibn Ḥazm al-Zāhirī al-Andalusī45626Al-Sunan al- KubrāAbū Bakr Aḥmad ibn Ḥusayn al-Bayhaqī al-Riwāyah45827Al-Kifāyah fī 'Ilm al-RiwāyahKhaṭīb al-Baghdādī46328Tārīkh BaghdādKhaṭīb al-Baghdādī46329Al-Istī āb with HajarIbn 'Abd al-Barr Abī 'Amr Yūsuf ibn 'Abd al-Barr al-Namarī46330Tārīkh Ibn 'AsākirAbū al-Qāsim 'Alī ibn Ḥasan ibn Hibat 'Asākir571	22	Kitāb Așbahān	Abū Nuʿaym Aḥmad ibn ʿAbd Allāh al-	42.0	
23Aşbahānī43024Kashf al-MaḥjūbShaykh 'Alī bin 'Uthmān ibn 'Alī al- Hajwīrī Lahorī45625Jamharat Ansāb al-'ArabAbū Muḥammad 'Alī ibn Aḥmad ibn Saʿīd, Ibn Ḥazm al-Zāhirī al-Andalusī45626Al-Sunan al- KubrāAbū Bakr Aḥmad ibn Ḥusayn al-Bayhaqī al-Riwāyah45827Al-Kifāyah fī 'Ilm al-RiwāyahKhaṭīb al-Baghdādī46328Tārīkh BaghdādKhaṭīb al-Baghdādī46329Al-Istī āb with HajarIbn 'Abd al-Barr Abī 'Amr Yūsuf ibn 'Abd al-Barr al-Namarī46330Tārīkh Ibn 'AsākirAbū al-Qāsim 'Alī ibn Ḥasan ibn Hibat Allah known as Ibn 'Asākir571			Așbahānī	430	
Aşbahānī24Kashf al-MahjūbShaykh ʿAlī bin ʿUthmān ibn ʿAlī al- Hajwīrī Lahorī45625Jamharat Ansāb al-ʿArabAbū Muḥammad ʿAlī ibn Aḥmad ibn Saʿīd, Ibn Ḥazm al-Ṣāhirī al-Andalusī45626Al-Sunan al- KubrāAbū Bakr Aḥmad ibn Ḥusayn al-Bayhaqī al-Riwāyah45827Al-Kifāyah fī ʿIlm al-RiwāyahKhaṭīb al-Baghdādī46328Tārīkh BaghdādKhaṭīb al-Baghdādī46329Al-Istī āb with HajarIbn ʿAbd al-Barr Abī ʿAmr Yūsuf ibn ʿAbd al-Barr al-Namarī46330Tārīkh Ibn ʿAsākirAbū al-Qāsim ʿAlī ibn Ḥasan ibn Hibat Allah known as Ibn ʿAsākir571		<u> </u> Hilyat al-Awliyā	Abū Nuʿaym Aḥmad ibn ʿAbd Allāh al-	40.0	
24Hajwīrī Lahorī45625Jamharat Ansāb al-ʿArabAbū Muḥammad ʿAlī ibn Aḥmad ibn Saʿīd, Ibn Ḥazm al-Ṣāḥirī al-Andalusī45626Al-Sunan al- KubrāAbū Bakr Aḥmad ibn Ḥusayn al-Bayhaqī Kubrā45827Al-Kifāyah fī ʿIlm al-RiwāyahKhaṭīb al-Baghdādī46328Tārīkh BaghdādKhaṭīb al-Baghdādī46329Al-Istī āb with HajarIbn ʿAbd al-Barr Abī ʿAmr Yūsuf ibn ʿAbd al-Barr al-Namarī46330Tārīkh Ibn ʿAsākirAbū al-Qāsim ʿAlī ibn Ḥasan ibn Hibat Allah known as Ibn ʿAsākir571	23		Așbahānī	430	
Image: Constraint of the second sec		Kashf al-Maḥjūb	Shaykh ʿAlī bin ʿUthmān ibn ʿAlī al-	45.4	
	24		Ḥajwīrī Lahorī	456	
al-ʿArabIbn Ḥazm al-Ṣāhirī al-Andalusī26Al-Sunan al- KubrāAbū Bakr Aḥmad ibn Ḥusayn al-Bayhaqī Husayn al-Bayhaqī27Al-Kifāyah fī ʿIlm al-RiwāyahKhaṭīb al-Baghdādī28Tārīkh BaghdādKhaṭīb al-Baghdādī29Al-Istī āb with HajarIbn ʿAbd al-Barr Abī ʿAmr Yūsuf ibn ʿAbd al-Barr al-Namarī30Tārīkh Ibn ʿAsākirAbū al-Qāsim ʿAlī ibn Ḥasan ibn Hibat Allah known as Ibn ʿAsākir	25	Jamharat Ansāb	Abū Muḥammad ʿAlī ibn Aḥmad ibn Saʿīd,	456	
$ \begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	25	al-ʿArab	Ibn Ḥazm al-Ṣāhirī al-Andalusī		
KubrāKorā27Al-Kifāyah fī 'Ilm al-RiwāyahKhaṭīb al-Baghdādī46328Tārīkh BaghdādKhaṭīb al-Baghdādī46329Al-Istī āb with HajarIbn 'Abd al-Barr Abī 'Amr Yūsuf ibn 'Abd al-Barr al-Namarī46330Tārīkh Ibn 'AsākirAbū al-Qāsim 'Alī ibn Ḥasan ibn Hibat Allah known as Ibn 'Asākir571		Al-Sunan al-	Abū Bakr Aḥmad ibn Ḥusayn al-Bayhaqī	45.0	
27al-Riwāyah46328Tārīkh BaghdādKhaṭīb al-Baghdādī46329Al-Istī āb withIbn ʿAbd al-Barr Abī ʿAmr Yūsuf ibn ʿAbd al-Barr al-Namarī46329Al-Iṣābah of Ibn Ḥajaral-Barr al-Namarī46330Tārīkh Ibn ʿAsākirAbū al-Qāsim ʿAlī ibn Ḥasan ibn Hibat Allah known as Ibn ʿAsākir571	26	Kubrā		458	
al-Riwāyah 1 28 Tārīkh Baghdād Khaṭīb al-Baghdādī 463 29 Al-Istī āb with Ibn ʿAbd al-Barr Abī ʿAmr Yūsuf ibn ʿAbd 463 29 Al-Iṣābah of Ibn al-Barr al-Namarī 463 30 Tārīkh Ibn Abū al-Qāsim ʿAlī ibn Ḥasan ibn Hibat 571 30 'Asākir Allah known as Ibn ʿAsākir 571	07	Al-Kifāyah fī ʻIlm	Khaṭīb al-Baghdādī	160	
Al-Istī āb with Ibn ʿAbd al-Barr Abī ʿAmr Yūsuf ibn ʿAbd 29 Al-Isābah of Ibn al-Barr al-Namarī 463 463 Jajar 463 30 Tārīkh Ibn Abū al-Qāsim ʿAlī ibn Ḥasan ibn Hibat 571 30 'Asākir Allah known as Ibn ʿAsākir 571	27	al-Riwāyah		463	
29Al-Iṣābah of Ibn Hajaral-Barr al-Namarī46330Tārīkh Ibn 'AsākirAbū al-Qāsim ʿAlī ibn Ḥasan ibn Hibat Allah known as Ibn ʿAsākir571	28	Tārīkh Baghdād	Khaṭīb al-Baghdādī	463	
HajarHajar30Tārīkh IbnAbū al-Qāsim ʿAlī ibn Ḥasan ibn Hibat ʿAsākir571571Allah known as Ibn ʿAsākir571		Al-Istī āb with	Ibn ʿAbd al-Barr Abī ʿAmr Yūsuf ibn ʿAbd		
30 Tārīkh Ibn Abū al-Qāsim ʿAlī ibn Ḥasan ibn Hibat 571 30 ʿAsākir Allah known as Ibn ʿAsākir 571	29	Al-Iṣābah of Ibn	al-Barr al-Namarī	463	
30 'Asākir Allah known as Ibn 'Asākir 571		<i>Ḥajar</i>			
'Asākir Allah known as Ibn 'Asākir		Tārīkh Ibn	Abū al-Qāsim ʿAlī ibn Ḥasan ibn Hibat		
31 Usd al-Ghābah Ibn al-Athīr ʿIzz al-Dīn 630	30	ʿAsākir		571	
	31	Usd al-Ghābah	Ibn al-Athīr ʿIzz al-Dīn	630	

32	Al-Kāmil	Ibn Athīr al-Jazarī	630
	Al-Riyāḍ	Abū Jaʿfar Aḥmad Muḥibb Ṭabarī	
	al-Naḍirah		
33	bi Manāqib		694
	al-ʿAsharah al-		
	Mubasharah		
	Minhāj al-	Ḥāfiẓ Ibn Taymiyyah Aḥmad ibn ʿAbd al-	700
34	Sunnah	Ḥalīm al-Ḥarrānī al-Dimashqī al-Ḥambalī	728
25	Kitāb al-Tamhīd	Muḥammad ibn Yaḥyā ibn Abī Bakr al-	741
35	wa al-Bayān	Andalusī	741
36	Tadhkirat al-	Shams al-Dīn Abū ʿAbd Allāh ibn ʿUthmān	749
30	<i></i> Huffāz	al-Dhahabī	748
37	Al-Bidāyah wa	Ibn Kathīr ʿImād al-Dīn Abū al-Fidā' al-	774/775
37	al-Nihāyah	Dimashqī	//4///5
38	Tārīkh Ibn	ʿAbd al-Raḥmān ibn Muḥammad ibn	776 year
30	Khaldūn	Khaldūn al-Ḥaḍramī	authored
39	Majmaʻ al-	Nūr al-Dīn al-Haythamī	807
39	Zawāʻid		807
	Al-Iṣābah fī	Ḥāfiẓ Ibn Ḥajar Abū al-Faḍl Aḥmad ibn	
40	Tamyīz al-	ʿAlī al-ʿAsqalānī	852
	Ṣaḥābah		
41	Tahdhīb al-	Ḥāfiẓ Ibn Ḥajar Abū al-Faḍl Aḥmad ibn	852
11	Tahdhīb	ʿAlī al-ʿAsqalānī	052
42	Tārīkh al-	Jalāl al-Dīn al-Suyūțī	911
12	Khulafā'		,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,
43	As-Ṣawāʿiq al-	Ibn Ḥajar al-Makkī Shihāb al-Dīn Aḥmad	973/5
15	Muḥriqah	ibn Ḥajar al-Haythamī	,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,
44	Kanz al-ʿUmmāl	ʿAlī Muttaqī al-Hindī	975
	Sharḥ Mawāhib	Muḥammad ibn ʿAbd al-Bāqī al-Zarqānī	
45	al-Ladunniyyah	al-Mālikī	1117 year
43			authored

	Lawā'iḥ	Shaykh Muḥammad ibn Aḥmad al-	
46	al-Anwār	Safārīnī al-Ḥambalī	
	al-Bahiyyah		1170
	commonly known		1173
	as ʿAqīdat al-		
	Safārīnī		
47	Izālat al-Khafā'	Shāh Walī Allah Muḥaddith al-Dahlawī	
	ʿan Khilāfat al-		1176
	Khulafā'		

Shīʿī Books

1	Tārīkh Yaʿqūbī	Aḥmad ibn Abī Yaʿqūb ibn Jaʿfar al-	256/258
		Kātib al-ʿAbbāsī	2307 230
2	Qurb al-Isnād	ʿAbd Allāh ibn Jaʿfar al-Ḥimyarī Abū	
		al-ʿAbbās al-Qummī	3rd century
	Maqātil al-Ṭālibiyīn	Abū al-Farj ʿAlī ibn Ḥusayn ibn	313 year
3		Muḥammad al-Aṣbahānī author of	authored
		al-Aghānī	autiloreu
4	Kitāb al-Rawḍah	Muḥammad ibn Yaʿqūb al-Kulaynī	2000
4	with Furūʿ al-Kāfī	al-Rāzī	329
_	Al-Tanbīh wa al-	Abū al-Ḥasan ʿAlī ibn Ḥusayn ibn	
5	Ashrāf	ʿAlī al-Masʿūdī	
6	Murūj al-Dhahab	Abū al-Ḥasan ʿAlī ibn Ḥusayn ibn	346
0		ʿAlī al-Masʿūdī	540
	Maʿānī al-Akhbār	Shaykh Ṣadūq Abū Jaʿfar	
7		Muḥammad ibn ʿAlī ibn Bābawayh	381
		al-Qummī	
8	Rijāl Kashshī	Abū ʿAmr Muḥammad ibn ʿUmar	4th century
0		ibn ʿAbd al-ʿAzīz al-Kashshī	4th century
	Nahj al-Balāghah	Sayyid Sharīf Raḍī ʿAbd al-Ḥasan	404
9		Muḥammad ibn Abī Aḥmad Ḥusayn	
10	Al- Irshād	Shaykh al-Mufīd (Muḥammad ibn	410
10		Nuʿmān)	413
	Al-Amālī	Abū Jaʿfar Muḥammad ibn Ḥasan	
11		Shaykh al-Ṭā'ifah Ṭūsī	460
12	Al-Iḥtijāj	Abū Manṣūr Aḥmad ibn ʿAlī at-	
		Ţabarsī	548
	Al-Manāqib	Akhțab Khawārizm al-Muwaffaq	
13		ibn Aḥmad ibn Muḥammad al-	568
		Bakrī al-Makkī	500

14	Al-Manāqib	Muḥammad ibn ʿAlī ibn	588
		Shaharāshūb Māzindarānī	
	Sharḥ Nahj al-	Abū Ḥāmid ʿAbd al-Handed Bahā'	
15	Balāghah (Ḥadīdī)	al-Dīn Muḥammad al-Madā'inī ibn	656
		Abī al-Ḥadīd	
	Sharḥ Nahj al-	Kamāl al-Dīn Maytham ibn ʿAlī ibn	
16	Balāghah (Ibn	Maytham al-Baḥrānī	679
	Maytham)		
	Kashf al-Ghummah	ʿAlī ibn ʿĪsā Arbilī	
	fī Maʿrifat al-		
17	A'immah with		
	Tarjamat al-		
	Manāqib Fārisī		
	Ḥawāshī ʿUmdat	Sayyid Jamāl al-Dīn Ibn ʿInabah	
18	al-Ṭālib fī Ansāb Āl		828
	Abī Ṭālib		
19	Biḥār al-Anwār	Mullā Al-Bāqir Majlisī	1111
20	Ḥayāt al-Qulūb	Mullā Al-Bāqir Majlisī	1111
21	Jalā' al-ʿUyūn	Mullā Al-Bāqir Majlisī	1111
	Al-Durrah al-	Shaykh Ibrāhīm ibn Ḥājī Ḥusayn	
22	Najfiyyah Sharḥ	al-Dunbulī	1291
	Nahj al-Balāghah		
	Nāsikh al-Tawārīkh	Mirzā Muḥammad Taqī Lisān al-	
23		Mulk Wazīr Aʻẓam Qāchār Shah	1297
		Iran	
24	Tanqīḥ al-Maqāl	ʿAbd Allāh Māmaqānī	1300
25	Tuḥfat al-Aḥbāb	Shaykh ʿAbbās al-Qummī	1359
26	Muntahā al-Āmāl	Shaykh ʿAbbās al-Qummī	1359
	Tarjamah wa Sharḥ	Fayḍ al-Islām Sayyid ʿAlī Naqī	
27	Fārisī Nahj al-		1362 date
2/	Balāghah Tarjamah		authored