

# Ruḥamā' Baynahum

**VOLUME 2**  
**FARŪQĪ SECTION**

By:

Shaykh Muḥammad Nāfi

[WWW.MAHAJJAH.COM](http://WWW.MAHAJJAH.COM)

## Transliteration key

أ- 'ā	ض - ḍ
آ - ā	ط - ṭ
ب - b	ظ - ṣ
ت - t	ع - 'c
ث - th	غ - gh
ج - j	ف - f
ح - ḥ	ق - q
خ - kh	ك - k
د - d	ل - l
ذ - dh	م - m
ر - r	ن - n
ز - z	و - w, ū
س - s	ه - h
ش - sh	ي - y, ī
ص - ṣ	

## Contents

<b>Chapter One</b>	<b>13</b>
Section One - ‘Alī Pledging Allegiance to ‘Umar	13
The Situation prior to the Demise of Abū Bakr	13
1. Ṭabaqāt Ibn Sa‘d	14
2. Usd al-Ghābah	14
‘Alī’s sermons during his khilāfah	15
3. The narration of Muḥaddith Ibn Rāhwayh (d. 238 A.H)	15
4. The narration of Muḥaddith Abū ‘Awānah	16
5. Shaykh Ṭūsī’s narration in al-Amālī	17
Deductions	18
Section Two	19
<b>Theme One</b>	<b>19</b>
1. Rajul Mubārak (Blessed Man)	19
2. Najīb al-Ummah (Sincere Noble Companion of the Ummah)	20
3. Al-Fārūq (The Distinguisher between Truth and Falsehood)	20
4. Khalil (Bosom Friend), Ṣiddīq (True Friend), Nāṣiḥ (Sincere)	20
5. Al-Qawī al-Amīn (The Tough and Trustworthy)	21
6. Leader of guidance, Rightly Guided, Guide, Reformer, Saviour	22
<b>Theme Two</b>	<b>23</b>
Deductions	23
<b>Theme Three</b>	<b>24</b>
<b>Theme Four</b>	<b>24</b>
‘Alī’s sīrah was according to ‘Umar’s	25
Rashīd al-Amr (Guided to the Appropriate and Accurate in Judgement)	26
‘Alī’s arrival in Kūfah	28
Deductions	28
A Misconception	29
Answer	29
<b>Theme Five</b>	<b>32</b>
Deductions	34

<b>Theme Six</b>	<b>35</b>
First Narration	35
A Shīṭī Narration	35
Second Narration	36
Third Narration	37
Fourth Narration	37
Fifth Narration	38
Sixth Narration	38
Seventh Narration	39
Ninth Narration	40
Tenth Narration	40
Eleventh Narration	41
Twelfth Narration	41
Clarification	42
Deductions of the Twelve Narrations	43
Important Caution	43
<b>Theme Seven</b>	<b>45</b>
<b>Theme Eight</b>	<b>47</b>
First Narration	47
Second Narration	48
Third Narration	48
<b>Theme Nine</b>	<b>51</b>
First Narration	51
Second Narration	52
Third Narration	52
Fourth Narration	53
Fifth Narration	53
Sixth Narration	54
Seventh Narration	54
Deductions and Conclusions	55
<b>Chapter Two</b>	<b>57</b>
Section One: The Station of Judge and Muftī	57
‘Alī is the Muftī	58

First Narration	59
Second Narration	59
Third Narration	59
Fourth Narration	60
Fifth Narration	60
Sixth Narration	60
<b>Summary</b>	<b>60</b>
<b>Taking Cases to the Fārūqī Judiciary</b>	<b>61</b>
Case 1	62
Case 2	62
<b>Deductions</b>	<b>64</b>
<b>Conclusions</b>	<b>65</b>
<b>Section Two: Consultation in Sharī Rulings</b>	<b>67</b>
<b>Academic Dialogue</b>	<b>68</b>
<b>Words of Benevolence</b>	<b>68</b>
<b>Consultation in Religious Issues</b>	<b>69</b>
1. Ṣadaqah	69
2. Dīyah (Blood money)	70
3. A Compelled Woman	71
4. Homosexuality	72
5. Punishment for Consuming Alcohol	73
6. Stealing	74
Deductions of this Section	74
Removing a Misconception and a Caution	75
First Report	76
Second Report	76
Third Report	77
Fourth Report	77
Caution	79
<b>Summary</b>	<b>81</b>
<b>Section Three</b>	<b>82</b>
<b>Consultation regarding Administrative Matters</b>	<b>82</b>

1. Fārūqī Allowance	82
2. Islamic Calendar	83
3. The Jizyah of al-Jazīrah	85
4. The Conquered Land of Iraq	85
5. The Land of Nahāwand	86
The above consultation in the books of the Shī'ah	87
Benefits of the above	88
6. War with the Romans	89
The fruits of the above	90
7. Division of Wealth	91
8. Penalty for a Miscarried Foetus	92
<b>'Alī's Appointment as Deputy</b>	<b>93</b>
1. Gathering at the Ṣurār Pond	93
2. The Conquest of Bayt al-Maqdis	94
3. Journey towards Aylah	95
4. Najrān	96
<b>Incidents of Compassion</b>	<b>96</b>
1. Incident of Informality	97
2. 'Alī's supplication for Illuminating the Masjid	97
3. Sāriyah al-Jabal	99
4. Journey to meet Uways Qarnī	99
<b>Conclusion of Section Three</b>	<b>100</b>
<b>Section Four</b>	<b>102</b>
First Narration	107
Second Narration	107
Third Narration	108
Fourth Narration	109
Fifth Narration	109
Sixth Narration	109
Seventh Narration	109
Points Deduced	109

<b>Corroboration from Shīī Sources</b>	<b>111</b>
First Narration	111
Second Narration	111
Conclusions	112
<b>Further Corroboration of Their Warm Relations</b>	<b>113</b>
First Narration	113
Second Narration	113
Third Narration	114
<b>Chapter Three</b>	<b>117</b>
Section One - Aspects relating to Fāṭimah and ‘Alī’s participation in ‘Umar’s wedding	117
<b>Theme One</b>	<b>117</b>
<b>Theme Two</b>	<b>121</b>
<b>Theme Three</b>	<b>122</b>
<b>Theme Four</b>	<b>122</b>
The Report of Zayn al-‘Ābidīn ‘Alī ibn al-Ḥusayn	123
The Report of Muḥammad al-Bāqir	124
<b>Theme Five</b>	<b>124</b>
‘Alī’s participation in ‘Umar’s wedding	124
Summary	125
Removing a Misconception	126
‘Alī’s Declaration	130
Muḥammad al-Bāqir’s Statement	130
Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd’s Observation	134
Fāṭimah’s Pleasure	134
First Narration	134
Second Narration	135
Call to Conciliation	135
Section Two - Issues concerning the Marriage of ‘Umar to Umm Kulthūm bint ‘Alī	136
<b>Theme One</b>	<b>136</b>
First Narration	137
Second Narration	138

Third Narration	139
Removing a Misconception	141
Umm Kulthūm bint ‘Alī’s marriage to Fārūq A‘ẓam in the Eyes of the Genealogists	145
1. Nasab Quraysh	145
2. Kitāb al-Muḥabbar	146
3. Al-Ma‘ārif	146
4. Ansāb al-Ashraf	147
5. Jamharat Ansāb al-‘Arab	147
<b>Theme Two</b>	<b>148</b>
Report One: First Narration of <i>Al-Kāfi</i>	149
Report Two: Second Narration of <i>Al-Kāfi</i>	150
Report Three: Third Narration of <i>Al-Kāfi</i>	150
Report Four: Fourth Narration of <i>Al-Kāfi</i>	151
Report Five: First Narration of <i>al-Istibṣār</i>	151
Report Six: Second Narration of <i>al-Istibṣār</i>	152
Report Seven: First Narration of <i>Tahdhīb al-Aḥkām</i>	152
Report Eight: Second Narration of <i>Tahdhīb al-Aḥkām</i>	152
Report Nine: Third Narration of <i>Tahdhīb al-Aḥkām</i>	153
Report Ten	154
Report Eleven	154
Report Twelve	155
Deductions of this narration	156
Report Thirteen	156
Report Fourteen	158
Report Fifteen	159
Removing a Misconception	159
Answer	160
Report Sixteen	161
Report Seventeen	161
Necessary Clarifications	162
Point 1	162
Point 2	163
Point 3	166



<b>Theme 3</b>	<b>169</b>
<b>Theme 4</b>	<b>169</b>
<b>Theme 5</b>	<b>169</b>
Summary of the Discussion	171
<b>Section Three - The Relationship between ‘Umar and Ḥasan and Ḥusayn.</b>	<b>172</b>
<b>Theme One</b>	<b>172</b>
<b>Theme Two</b>	<b>172</b>
<b>Theme Three</b>	<b>173</b>
<b>Theme Four</b>	<b>174</b>
Report One	174
Report Two	175
Report Three	175
Report Four	176
Report Five	176
Clarification	179
<b>Summary of this Chapter</b>	<b>179</b>
<b>Section Four - Bequests and Extra Matters in ‘Umar’s Last Days and Matters After his Demise</b>	<b>181</b>
<b>1. The Prophecy of ‘Umar’s Death in a Dream</b>	<b>181</b>
<b>2. ‘Alī’s and Ibn ‘Abbās’s testimony to ‘Umar’s Islam, Hijrah, Khilāfah, and Trustworthiness</b>	<b>182</b>
<b>3. After the brutal attack, ‘Alī’s expression of complete compassion</b>	<b>183</b>
<b>4. ‘Alī sounds glad tidings of Jannah to ‘Umar and Ḥasan endorses</b>	<b>184</b>
<b>5. Nomination of the Assembly and ‘Alī’s Inclusion</b>	<b>185</b>
<i>Musnad Ḥumaydī</i>	185
<b>6. Corroboration from the Shī‘ah</b>	<b>186</b>
<b>7. A Special Bequest to ‘Alī and Arrangements for Ṣalāh</b>	<b>187</b>
<b>8. Words of Appreciation from ‘Alī for ‘Umar</b>	<b>187</b>
<b>9. ‘Alī Expresses His Envy over ‘Umar’s Book of Deeds</b>	<b>188</b>

a. Abū Yūsuf's <i>Kitāb al-Āthār</i>	189
b. Imām Muḥammad ibn al-Ḥasan's <i>Kitāb al-Āthār</i>	189
c. Testimony of Imām Muḥammad al-Bāqir	190
d. <i>Musnad Aḥmad</i>	190
e. <i>Musnad Aḥmad</i>	191
f. <i>Ṭabaqāt Ibn Sa'd</i>	191
Notification	192
g. <i>Al-Mustadrak</i>	192
The Musajjā Narration with the Shī'ah	193
Clarification	194
<b>10. 'Alī's Presence at 'Umar's Burial</b>	<b>194</b>
<b>Summary of Section Four</b>	<b>195</b>
<b>Chapter Four</b>	<b>199</b>
Section One	199
1. Tawassul in Allah's Court	199
2. The Gutter Incident between 'Abbās and 'Umar	200
3. 'Abbās's Exalted Position in 'Umar's Sight	201
4. 'Abbās's honour in 'Umar's and 'Uthmān's Eyes	202
5. Looking after the Monetary Rights of 'Abbās during the Fārūqī Khilāfah	203
Warning	204
Conclusions to this Section	205
Section Two	206
1. Ibn 'Abbās's Inclusion in 'Umar's Consultations	207
2. Al-Fārūq visits Ibn 'Abbās	208
3. Praise for 'Umar on the Tongue of Ibn 'Abbās	208
4. Ibn 'Abbās's reliance on Fārūqī Narrations	209
5. Fārūq's Truthfulness according to the Report of the Banū Hāshim	210
6. Ibn 'Abbās views Abū Bakr's and 'Umar's Statement as Shar'ī Proof	210

Summary of Points Highlighted in this Section	211
<b>Chapter Five</b>	<b>213</b>
Section One - The Statements of Sayyidunā Ḥasan, Muḥammad ibn al-Ḥanafīyyah, ‘Abd Allāh al-Maḥḍ ibn Ḥasan al-Muthannā, and others	214
1. Ḥasan’s Confirmation that there existed No Disagreement between ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb and ‘Alī al-Murtaḍā	214
2. Muḥammad ibn al-Ḥanafīyyah’s Question concerning ‘Umar and Abū Bakr and ‘Alī’s Answer	214
3. ‘Alī’s Children Use ‘Umar’s Action as Evidence in Fiqhī Rulings	215
4. ‘Aqīl’s Praise for ‘Umar	216
Section Two - The Statements of Imām Zayn al-‘Ābidīn and his son Zayd	217
1. ‘Umar and Abū Bakr Enjoyed that Proximity to Rasūlullāh ﷺ as they Enjoy Presently	217
2. Acknowledging ‘Umar’s Virtue and Rejecting those who Disrepute him	217
Section Three - The Statements of Imām Muḥammad al-Bāqir	221
1. The Person who does not Recognise Abū Bakr’s and ‘Umar’s Virtue is Ignorant of the Prophetic Sunnah	221
2. Muḥammad al-Bāqir loved and befriended Abū Bakr and ‘Umar and sought Forgiveness for them	221
3. Imām al-Bāqir Dissociates Himself from those who Dissociate from Abū Bakr and ‘Umar	222
First Narration	222
Second Narration	222
Third Narration	223
Fourth Narration	223
4. The Ruling of Leasing Lands for Farming in Lieu of a Third or Fourth of the Produce	224
5. The Declaration of Imām Muḥammad al-Bāqir	224

<b>Section Four - The Statements of Imām Ja‘far al-Ṣādiq</b>	<b>226</b>
1. Those who do not Befriend Abū Bakr and ‘Umar will Not Receive Rasūlullāh’s ﷺ Intercession	226
2. Abū Bakr and ‘Umar were just leaders and steadfast on the truth, and Allah’s mercy upon them on the Day of Qiyāmah	226
3. Ja‘far befriended Abū Bakr and ‘Umar and greeted them with the masnūn salām at their graves	227
<b>Section Five - ‘Alī’s offspring with the Name ‘Umar</b>	<b>228</b>
1. ‘Umar’s Blessed Name among the Offspring of ‘Alī	228
The summary of these narrations:	231
2. ‘Umar’s Name among the Children of Ḥasan	231
Summary	233
3. ‘Umar’s Name in the Progeny of Zayn al-‘abidin	233
<b>Concluding Words</b>	<b>235</b>
<b>Bibliography</b>	<b>236</b>
Shī‘ī books	242

## Chapter One

### Section One

#### 'Alī Pledging Allegiance to 'Umar

The immediate bay'ah of Sayyidunā 'Alī to Sayyidunā Abū Bakr رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ was mentioned in the Şiddīqī section coupled with an exposition of substantiations and corroborations. In the Fārūqī section of *Ruḥamā' Baynahum*, Sayyidunā Alī's bay'ah to Sayyidunā 'Umar رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ will be discussed with Allah's help and assistance.

#### The Situation prior to the Demise of Abū Bakr

The Muslims should be aware that when the last moments of Sayyidunā Abū Bakr رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ drew closer, he made various bequests and rendered various advices to all. At this crucial time, he paid special attention to the issue of khilāfah of the Muslims. Having the welfare of Islam and the Muslims at heart, he planned to appoint Sayyidunā 'Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ his successor. He presented a document to the Muslims at the hands of Sayyidunā 'Uthmān رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ who announced, "The name of your leader has been decided in this document, are you happy?" All the people expressed their approval. In fact, Sayyidunā 'Alī رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ exclaimed that if Sayyidunā 'Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ has been appointed as leader therein, then that is best. Otherwise, they will not accept anyone besides him as khalīfah and leader. Accordingly, it became manifest at that time that Sayyidunā 'Umar رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ was chosen as the khalīfah and leader of the Muslims. All the Muslims approved of this and expressed their pleasure over it. Sayyidunā 'Alī رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ together with the people pledged allegiance to Sayyidunā 'Umar رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ.

This incident has been documented by a number of scholars. Ibn Sa'd mentioned it briefly in *al-Ṭabaqāt* (discussion on Abū Bakr), Ibn Athīr al-Jazarī included it in

*Usd al-Ghābah* (discussion on ‘Umar) through one chain, and Muḥibb al-Ṭabarī related it in *al-Riyāḍ al-Naḍīrah*. ‘Allāmah al-Suyūṭī documented this incident in *Tārīkh al-Khulafā’* (the section of the fatal sickness of Sayyidunā Abū Bakr al-Ṣiddīq رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ) with reference to Ibn ‘Asākir and so did Ibn Ḥajar al-Haytamī al-Makkī in *al-Ṣawā‘iq al-Muḥriqah* (second section regarding Abū Bakr appointing ‘Umar during his final sickness). Forthcoming, the text of the incident coupled with the translation will be presented for the benefit of the readers.

## 1. Ṭabaqāt Ibn Sa‘d

ثم أمره فخرج بالكتاب مختوماً و معه عمر بن الخطاب و أسيد بن سعيد القرظي فقال عثمان للناس أتبايعون لمن في هذا الكتاب فقالوا نعم و قال بعضهم (قال ابن سعد علي القائل) و هو عمر فأقروا بذلك جميعاً و رضوا و بايعوا إلخ

He (Abū Bakr) then commanded him (‘Uthmān). Accordingly, he left with the sealed document accompanied by ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb and Usayd ibn Sa‘īd al-Quraḏī. ‘Uthmān said to the people, “Will you pledge allegiance to the man in this document?”

They replied in the affirmative. One of them said, (‘Alī was the speaker) “It is ‘Umar.”

They all agreed to this and were pleased and subsequently pledged allegiance.<sup>1</sup>

This incident has been documented with the same wording by the forthcoming authors:

## 2. Usd al-Ghābah

عن يسار بن حمزة قال لما ثقل أبو بكر أشرف على الناس من كوة فقال يأيتها الناس إني قد عهدت عهداً أفترضون به فقال الناس قد رضينا يا خليفة رسول الله فقال علي لا نرضى إلا أن يكون عمر بن الخطاب

---

1 *Ṭabaqāt Ibn Sa‘d*, vol. 3 pg. 142, discussion on Abū Bakr, Leiden print.

On the authority of Yasār ibn Ḥamzah:

When Abū Bakr fell ill, he gazed at the people from a small window. He then announced, “O people, I have made a decision (regarding the khilāfah). Will you be pleased with it?”

The people replied, “We are definitely happy, O successor of Rasūlullāh ﷺ.”

‘Alī then exclaimed, “We will not be pleased except that it be ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb.”<sup>1</sup>

### ‘Alī’s sermons during his khilāfah

In both of the above narrations, Sayyidunā ‘Alī ﷺ expressed his view regarding the issue of khilāfah during the last moments of Sayyidunā Abū Bakr’s ﷺ life. We now wish to present the sermons he delivered during his khilāfah on the same theme. After studying them, the readers will be able to easily reach a satisfying conclusion and will be alleviated of the need of farfetched interpretations. The tales of coercion and despotism will carry no more weight than fabricated tales. If a little impartiality is observed, the issue will become evident.

To meet the above purpose, three narrations will be brought; two from the books of the Ahl al-Sunnah and one from the books of the Shī‘ah which will appear at the end to bring this discussion to a close.

### 3. The narration of Muḥaddith Ibn Rāhwayh (d. 238 A.H)

The author of *Kanz al-‘Ummāl* mentioned this narration in the chapter of *fitan* (trials) under the incident of Jamal. We documented it in the *Ṣiddīqī* section

---

1 *Uṣd al-Ghābah*, vol. 4 pg. 70, discussion on ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb; *al-Riyāḍ al-Naḍīrah fī Manāqib al-‘Asharah*, vol. 2 pg. 88, section 10 regarding his khilāfah; *Tārīkh al-Khulafā’*, pg. 61, section on his sickness, demise, and bequests, Delhi print; *al-Ṣawā’iq al-Muḥriqah*, pg. 54, section 2 regarding Abū Bakr’s appointments of ‘Umar as successor, Egypt print.

in detail and we will quote it here briefly. This is actually Sayyidunā ‘Alī’s رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ response to the questions of ‘Abd Allah ibn al-Kawwā’ and Ibn ‘Abbād. He says:

فلما قبض رسول الله صلي الله عليه وسلم نظر المسلمون في أمرهم فإذا رسول الله صلي الله عليه وسلم قد ولي أبا بكر أمر دينهم فولوه أمر دنياهم فبايعه المسلمون وبايعته معهم وكنت أغزو إذا أغزاني وإذا أخذ إذا أعطاني ... فأشار لعمر ولم يأل فبايعه المسلمون وبايعته معهم وكنت أغزو إذا أغزاني وإذا أخذ إذا أعطاني ... فأخذ (عبد الرحمن بن عوف) بيد عثمان فبايعه ولقد عرض في نفسي عن ذلك فلما نظرت في أمري فإذا عهدي قد سبق بيعتي فبايعته وسلمت وكنت أغزو إذا أغزاني وإذا أخذ إذا أعطاني

Thereafter when Rasūlullāh صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ passed on, the Muslims deliberated their affairs; they thus saw that Rasūlullāh صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ made Abū Bakr in charge of their religious affairs (i.e. Ṣalāh) so they gave him charge over their worldly affairs. Hence, the Muslims pledged allegiance to him and so did I. I would thereafter join military expeditions when he demanded and would accept whatever bonuses and allowances he granted me.

He appointed ‘Umar and he did not compromise (the well-being of the Muslims in his decision). The Muslims pledged allegiance to him and so did I. I would thereafter join military expeditions when he demanded and would accept whatever allowances and booty he granted me.

He (‘Abd al-Raḥmān ibn ‘Awf), thereafter, held the hand of ‘Uthmān and pledged allegiance to him. I was a little disturbed by this but when I deliberated, I realised that my agreement took precedence over being given the bay‘ah. Therefore, I pledged allegiance to him and submitted. I would thereafter join military expeditions when he demanded and would accept whatever bonuses he gave me.<sup>1</sup>

#### 4. The narration of Muḥaddith Abū ‘Awānah

Abū Ṭālib al-‘Ushārī wrote *Faḍā’il Abī Bakr* (The Virtues of Abū Bakr رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ) wherein he quoted this narration from the famous muḥaddith Abū ‘Awānah via his sanad. This narration appeared previously in the Ṣiddīqī section, number five of the substantiating narrations. It will be repeated here for the benefit of the readers.

---

1 *Kanz al-Ummāl*, vol. 6 pg. 82, Kitāb al-Fitan, under the incident of al-Jamal, first edition, Dakkan.



حدثنا أبو عوانة عن خالد الحذاء عن عبد الرحمن بن أبي بكرة قال أتاني علي بن أبي طالب عاندا فقال توفي رسول الله صلي الله عليه وسلم فبايع الناس أبا بكر فبايعت ورضيت ثم توفي أبو بكر فاستخلف عمر فبايعت ورضيت ثم توفي عمر فجعلها شورى فبايعوا عثمان فبايعت ورضيت

Abū ‘Awānah narrated to us — from Khālid al-Ḥadhā’ — from ‘Abd al-Raḥmān Ibn Abī Bakrah:

‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib came to visit me when I had taken ill. He said, “Rasūlullāh ﷺ passed away and Abū Bakr was nominated as the khalīfah. I pledged allegiance at his hands and was satisfied. Then Abū Bakr passed on and ‘Umar was appointed as the khalīfah. I pledged allegiance to him as well and was pleased. Thereafter he passed on and left the issue of khalīfah pending upon the decision of the shūrā after which ‘Uthmān was appointed as the khalīfah. Hence, I pledged my allegiance to him and was pleased.”<sup>1</sup>

Let the readers be rest assured that Sayyidunā ‘Umar’s ﷺ first pick for the shūrā prior to his demise was Sayyidunā ‘Alī ﷺ. Scores of muḥaddithīn and historians have mentioned this in their respective works. It is documented in volume 5 page 477 and 480 of *Muṣannaf ‘Abd al-Razzāq*. We will quote it later in this book, if Allah wills, in chapter three, section four, number five.

After presenting the above, a narration of Sayyidunā ‘Alī ﷺ from the books considered reliable by the Shī‘ah will be presented for further corroboration. Hopefully, after perusing this narration, there will be no need for further references.

## 5. Shaykh Ṭūsī’s narration in *al-Amālī*

The background to this statement is that after the Battle of Jamal, the defeated group approached Sayyidunā ‘Alī ﷺ and began to apologise. Sayyidunā ‘Alī ﷺ stopped their spokesperson and began his address, which is self-explanatory:

---

1 *Faḍā’il Abī Bakr al-Ṣiddīq*, pg. 5; *Thulāthiyyāt al-Bukhārī*, etc., Egypt publication, Maktabat al-Salafīyyah, Multan.

قال (علي) فبايعتم أبا بكر و عدلتم عني فبايعت أبا بكر كما بايعتموه ... فبايعت عمر كما بايعتموه ... فوفيت له ببيعته حتى لما قتل جعلني سادس ستة فدخلت حيث أدخلني ... فبايعتم عثمان فبايعته إلخ

He said, “You pledged allegiance to Abū Bakr and abandoned me, so I pledged allegiance to Abū Bakr just as you did. I pledged allegiance to ‘Umar just as you did. I was loyal to him owing to the pledge. When he was killed, he appointed me as one of the six so I entered where he entered me. You then pledged allegiance to ‘Uthmān and I followed suit.<sup>1</sup>

## Deductions

1. Sayyidunā ‘Alī was present at Sayyidunā Abū Bakr’s ﷺ selection of the new khalīfah and was pleased with his decision.
2. After contemplating over Sayyidunā ‘Uthmān’s khilāfah, Sayyidunā ‘Alī ﷺ became pleased and pledged allegiance.
3. After Sayyidunā ‘Alī pledged allegiance to Sayyidunā ‘Umar ﷺ, the former participated in the expeditions the latter sent out and took his share from the booty, etc.
4. Just as the other Muslims pledged allegiance willingly and happily, similarly Sayyidunā ‘Alī happily pledged allegiance to Sayyidunā ‘Umar ﷺ without compulsion or constraint.
5. Sayyidunā ‘Umar considered Sayyidunā ‘Alī ﷺ reliable and worthy of the post of khilāfah. Accordingly, he selected him first for the six men committee. Moreover, the former in the latter’s eyes was upon guidance, had correct practices, was a seeker of the truth, and a just khalīfah, hence he joined the selected committee with happiness and wholeheartedly accepted their decision thus fulfilling his oath and commitment.

These narrations are pronouncing that these luminaries were united in belief and practice, and compassionate and merciful among themselves. There was absolutely no hatred or enmity between them. The tales of disputes and disagreements between them that people have cooked up, are all unfounded and untrue.

---

1 Al-Amālī, vol. 2 pg. 121, part 18, Najaf Ashraf print, Iraq.

## Section Two

We will now present the various virtues and excellences of Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه which have been reported by Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه under miscellaneous themes. Before bringing this section to a close, the virtues of Sayyidunā ‘Alī reported by Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه will be quoted.

A separate chapter needs to be dedicated to each and every virtue and merit. However, to avoid prolongation, all these have been gathered in one section. Moreover, by adopting this method, the virtues they have reported of each other may appear together before the readers in one section. Contemplating on them will make it extremely easy for the prudent reader to realise their mutual unity and harmony and be able to answer the fables of disunity and discord between these luminaries.

### Theme One

This theme deals with Sayyidunā ‘Alī’s expression of Sayyidunā ‘Umar al-Fārūq’s رضي الله عنه excellence in the form of glorious titles and names. Some of the ways he referred to Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه will be mentioned here.

#### 1. Rajul Mubārak (Blessed Man)

Fāḍil al-Sha‘bī relates that after the martyrdom of Sayyidunā ‘Uthmān ibn ‘Affān, people hastened to Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه to pledge allegiance. He said:

لا تعجلوا فإن عمر كان رجلا مباركا و قد أوصى بها شورى فأمهلوا يجتمع الناس و يتشاورون

Do not hasten (this matter) because ‘Umar was a very blessed man and he bequeathed that a council be held in its regard (i.e. he did not hasten in deciding the matter of khilāfah). Therefore, give some time. Allow the people to gather and discuss.<sup>1</sup>

---

1 *Tārīkh al-Ṭabarī*, vol. 5 pg. 156, under the year 35 A.H., old Egypt print.

## 2. Najīb al-Ummah (Sincere Noble Companion of the Ummah)

عن عبد الله بن مليل قال سمعت عليا يقول أعطي كل نبي سبعة نجباء من أمته وأعطى النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم أربعة عشر نجيبا من أمته منهم أبو بكر وعمر رضي الله عنهم

‘Abd Allah ibn Malīl reports that he heard ‘Alī saying:

Every nabī was given seven sincere noble companions from his ummah and the Nabī ﷺ was given fourteen. Among them are Abū Bakr and ‘Umar رضي الله عنه.<sup>1</sup>

## 3. Al-Fārūq (The Distinguisher between Truth and Falsehood)

عن نزال بن السيرة الهلالي قال وافقتنا من علي بن أبي طالب ذات يوم طيب نفس فقلنا يا أمير المؤمنين حدثنا عن عمر بن الخطاب قال ذلك امرؤ سماه الله الفاروق فرق بين الحق والباطل سمعت رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم يقول اللهم أعز الإسلام بعمر

Nazāl ibn al-Saburah al-Hilālī reports:

One day we met ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib who was in a very good mood so we requested, “O Amīr al-Mu’minīn, relate to us about ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb.”

He said, “That is a man who Allah named al-Fārūq, who differentiated between truth and falsehood. I heard Rasūlullāh ﷺ supplicate, ‘O Allah, strengthen Islam with ‘Umar.’”<sup>2</sup>

## 4. Khalil (Bosom Friend), Ṣiddīq (True Friend), Nāsiḥ (Sincere)

حدثنا أبو معاوية عن خلف بن حوشب عن أبي السفر قال رأي علي بن أبي طالب كان يكثر لبسه فقيل له إنك لتكثر لبس هذا البرد فقال إنه كسانيه خليلي وصفيتي وصدوقي وخاصتي عمر إن عمر ناصح الله فنصحه ثم بكى

1 *Musnad Aḥmad*, vol. 1 pg. 142, musnadāt of ‘Alī, Egypt print with selections from *Kanz; Jāmi’ al-Tirmidhī*, pg. 541, chapter on the virtues of the Ahl al-Bayt, Aṣaḥ al-Maṭābī, Lucknow, India; *Ḥilyat al-Awliyā’*, vol. 1 pg. 128.

2 Shaykh Abū al-Farj ‘Abd al-Raḥmān ibn ‘Alī ibn Muḥammad ibn al-Jawzī (d. 597 A.H.): *Sīrat ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb*, Egypt print; *al-Riyāḍ al-Naḍīrah*, vol. 1 pg. 246; chapter 2, section 2, referenced to Ibn al-Sammān, Egypt print.

Abū Mu‘āwiyah narrated to us from—Khalaf ibn Ḥawshab from—Abū al-Safar who relates:

‘Alī was seen wearing a garment he frequently wore so he was asked, “You wear this garment very often?”

He responded, “My bosom, chosen, true, and special friend ‘Umar gifted it to me. Indeed, ‘Umar was a sincere well-wisher to Allah’s Dīn, so Allah dealt with him in a like manner.”

He then began to cry.<sup>1</sup>

## 5. Al-Qawī al-Amīn (The Tough and Trustworthy)

It is documented in *Tārīkh al-Ṭabarī*:

عن أبي بكر العبسي قال دخلت حير الصدقة مع عمر بن الخطاب و علي بن أبي طالب قال فجلس عثمان في الظل يكتب فقام علي على رأسه يملي عليه ما يقول عمر و عمر في الشمس قائم في يوم حار شديد الحر عليه بردان أسودان متزرا بواحد و قد لف على رأسه آخر يعد إبل الصدقة يكتب ألوانها و أسنانها فقال علي لعثمان و سمعته يقول نعت بنت شعيب عليه السلام في كتاب الله يَا أَبَتِ اسْتَأْجِرْهُ إِنَّ خَيْرَ مَنِ اسْتَأْجَرْتَ الْقَوِيُّ الْأَمِينُ ثم أشار علي بيده إلى عمر فقال هذا القوي الأمين

Abū Bakr al-‘Abasī reports:

I entered the enclosure of the ṣadaqah camels with ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb and ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib. ‘Uthmān (arrived and) sat in the shade to write. ‘Alī stood at his headside and began dictating to him what ‘Umar was saying, while ‘Umar was standing in the sun on an extremely hot day. He had two black shawls on him. One he wrapped around his lower body and he tied the other around his head. He was counting the camels of ṣadaqah and dictating their colours and ages. I heard ‘Alī telling ‘Uthmān, “In the Book of Allah, the daughter of Shu‘ayb عَلَيْهَا السَّلَامُ said, ‘O my father, hire him. Indeed, the best one you can hire is the strong and the trustworthy.’”

---

1 *Muṣannaḥ Ibn Abī Shaybah*, vol. 4 pg. 179, chapter on the virtues of ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ, Qilmī, Pīr Chanda, Sindh.

‘Alī then pointed with his hand towards ‘Umar and declared, “This man is strong and trustworthy.”<sup>1</sup>

## 6. Leader of guidance, Rightly Guided, Guide, Reformer, Saviour

It is written in *Ṭabaqāt Ibn Sa‘d*:

سئل علي عن أبي بكر و عمر فقال كان إمامي هدى راشدين مرشدين مصلحين منجحين خرجا من الدنيا  
خميصين

‘Alī was questioned about Abū Bakr and ‘Umar to which he replied:

They were leaders of guidance, rightly guided, guides, reformers, and saviours who left this world hungry (i.e. they did not gather wealth out of greed),<sup>2</sup>

Ibn al-Jawzī has mentioned a narration very similar in meaning to the one in *Ṭabaqāt Ibn Sa‘d*. The above wording appears in *Ṭabaqāt Ibn Sa‘d*.

A couple of narrations of Sayyidunā ‘Alī عليه السلام are mentioned under the first theme. These type of narrations are easily available but only a few have been selected as samples. It is learnt from here that according to Sayyidunā ‘Alī, Sayyidunā ‘Umar al-Fārūq عليه السلام was:

- Worthy of countless virtues and merits
- Holder of various types of excellences
- Befitting of countless of praise
- Owner of numerous virtues

---

1 *Tārīkh al-Umam wa al-Mulūk*, vol. 5 pg. 18, under the year 23 A.H., old Egypt print; *al-Tārīkh al-Kāmil*, vol. 3 pg. 29, discussion on the life of ‘Umar, Egypt print; *al-Riyāq al-Naḍīrah fī Manāqib al-‘Asharah al-Mubasharah*, vol. 2 pg. 78, chapter on his safeguarding of the Muslims’ wealth.

2 *Ṭabaqāt Ibn Sa‘d*, vol. 3, pg. 149, division 1, discussion on Abū Bakr al-Ṣiddīq; *Sīrat ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb*, pg. 31.

- Possessor of an abundant of prowess
- Perfect in a number of praiseworthy qualities

These are clear signs of their unity and love, which will remain brilliant and shining in the pages of history forever.

## Theme Two

It is recorded under this theme that Sayyidunā ‘Alī encouraged Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه to observe perfect taqwā and directed him to emulate the previous khalīfah. This incident is recorded in the beginning of the famous and celebrated book of the Ḥanafī ‘Ulamā’ *Kitāb al-Kharāj* of Imām Abū Yūsuf. *Kanz al-Ummāl* references it to al-Bayhaqī on the authority of Yaḥyā ibn ‘Aqīl from Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه:

قال أبو يوسف سمعت أبا حنيفة رحمه الله تعالى يقول قال علي لعمر رضي الله عنهما حين استخلف إن أردت أن تلحق صاحبك فارقع القميص و نكس الإزار و اخصف النعل و ارفع الخف و قصر الأمل و كل دون الشيع

Abū Yūsuf said: I heard Abū Ḥanīfah رضي الله عنه saying:

‘Alī told ‘Umar رضي الله عنه when the latter was appointed as khalīfah, “If you wish to join your two companions, then patch your throbe, keep your lower garment above your ankles, and patch your socks and shoes. Have less hopes (of the world) and do not eat to your fill.”<sup>1</sup>

## Deductions

**Firstly**, it is established that Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه confirmed that Sayyidunā Abū Bakr رضي الله عنه abandoned the world and was muttaqī (righteous and religious).

**Secondly**, according to him, the first khalīfah is worth emulating.

**Thirdly**, Sayyidunā ‘Alī awarded Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه with these inspiring words which is a glaring sign of their harmonious relationship.

---

1 *Kitāb al-Kharāj*, pg. 15, Egypt print; *Kanz al-Ummāl*, vol. 8 pg. 219, Ḥadīth: 3536, with reference to Shu‘ab al-Īmān, first edition, Dakkan.

## Theme Three

Ibn al-Jawzī has reported an incident on the strength of Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ in *Sīrat ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb*, under the heading regarding his fear for Allah. The Arabic text follows:

عن أمير المؤمنين علي رضي الله عنه قال رأيت عمر بن الخطاب على قتب يعدو فقلت يا أمير المؤمنين أين تذهب فقال ند بعير من إبل الصدقة أطلبه فقلت لقد أذلت الخلفاء بعدك فقال يا أبا الحسن لا تلمني فوالذي بعث محمدا بالنبوة لو أن عناقا ذهبت بشاطئ الفرات لأخذ بها عمر يوم القيامة

On the authority of Amīr al-Mu‘minīn ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ who reports:

I saw ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb speeding with his ride so I shouted, “O Amīr al-Mu‘minīn, where are you off to?”

He replied, “One of the camels of ṣadaqah ran away, so I am going to look for it.”

I said, “You have subjugated the khulafā’ after you to difficulty.”

He answered, “O father of Ḥasan, do not rebuke me. By the Being who sent Muḥammad with Nubuwwah, if a young calf goes missing at the shore of the Furāt, ‘Umar will be taken to task for it on the Day of Qiyāmah.”<sup>1</sup>

Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ affirms that at times Sayyidunā ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ would himself keep a check on the animals of ṣadaqah of the *Bayt al-Māl* (Muslim Treasury) and he never allowed any deficiency in this regard.

Sayyidunā ‘Alī announced Sayyidunā ‘Umar’s رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ perfect trustworthiness in front of the people. He explained the level of the latter’s fear of matters concerning the Hereafter. This friendly and sincere dialogue depicts the bosom connection they shared.

## Theme Four

---

1 *Sīrat ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb*, pg. 140, chapter 50; *al-Bidāyah wa al-Nihāyah*, vol. 7 pg. 136.



According to Sayyidunā ‘Alī, Sayyidunā ‘Umar’s ﷺ behaviour, actions, and the administrative matters of his khilāfah were correct. His methodology was also spot-on. This theme is found in the narrations of reliable books of fiqh and history. We wish to present a few glimpses of such narrations to the readers.

### ‘Alī’s *sīrah*<sup>1</sup> was according to ‘Umar’s

The senior ‘Ulamā’ of the ummah have mentioned that the administrative issues of Sayyidunā ‘Alī’s ﷺ khilāfah ran according to the pattern set by Sayyidunā ‘Umar ﷺ. The biographies of both these personalities are similar. Yaḥyā ibn Ādam al-Qurashī (d. 203 A.H.) writes in *Kitāb al-Kharāj*:

قال حدثنا يحيى قال ثنا شريك عن زبيد كان علي يشبه بعمر يعني في السيرة

Yaḥyā narrated to us saying—Sharīk narrated to us from—Zubayd:

‘Alī resembled ‘Umar in *sīrah*.<sup>2</sup> (The administrative matters of his khilāfah concurred with those of Sayyidunā ‘Umar.)

It is also reported that when Sayyidunā ‘Alī ﷺ arrived in Kūfah, he announced that he will not make any alterations to the system Sayyidunā ‘Umar ﷺ implemented. Accordingly, al-Sha‘bī reports from Sayyidunā ‘Alī ﷺ:

ثنا أبو معاوية عن حجاج عن من أخبره عن الشعبي قال قال علي حين قدم الكوفة ما كنت لأحل عقدة شداها  
عمر

Abū Mu‘āwiyah narrated to us — from Ḥajjāj — from one who informed him — from al-Sha‘bī who reports that Sayyidunā ‘Alī announced when he arrived in Kūfah:

1 *Sīrah*: behaviour, conduct, actions, activities, manners, deeds, biography.

2 Yaḥyā ibn Ādam: *Kitāb al-Kharāj*, pg. 24, Egypt print.

I will not open any knot tied by ‘Umar.<sup>1</sup> (I will not change anything ‘Umar passed.)

We learnt from the above, that the management of these two noblemen were same. Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ did not move an inch away from the Fārūqī government system. This attests and strengthens the agreement of their thought and action.

### **Rashīd al-Amr (Guided to the Appropriate and Accurate in Judgement)**

Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ termed Sayyidunā ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ *rashīd al-amr* in his resoluteness in matters of the state and governmental issues. Imām al-Bukhārī mentioned it in *Al-Tārīkh al-Kabīr* and Yaḥyā ibn Ādam did in *Kitāb al-Kharāj*. The text is:

عن عبد خير سمع عليا يقول إن عمر كان موقفا رشيدا في الأمور والله لا أغير شيئا صنعه عمر

‘Abd Khayr heard ‘Alī affirming:

Certainly, ‘Umar was inspired and rightly guided in matters (of the state).

By Allah, I will not alter anything ‘Umar instated.<sup>2</sup>

Once, a delegation of Christians from Najrān came to Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ. During their conversation with him, he confirmed that Sayyidunā ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ was guided to correct and accurate judgement.

عن الأعمش عن سالم بن أبي الجعد قال كان أهل نجران بلغوا أربعين ألفا و كان عمر يخافهم أن يميلوا على المسلمين فتحاسدوا بينهم فأتوا عمر قالوا إنا قد تحاسدنا بيننا فأجلنا و كان رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم قد كتب لهم كتابا أن لا يجلوا فاعتنمها عمر فأجلهم فقدموا فأتوه فقالوا أفلنا فأبى أن يقبلهم فلما ولي علي أتوه فقالوا إنا نسئلك بخط يمينك و شفاعتك عند نبيك ألا أفلتنا فأبى و قال ويحكم إن عمر كان رشيدا الأمر فلا أغير شيئا صنعه عمر قال سالم فكانوا يرون أن عليا لو كان طاعنا على عمر في شيء من أمره طعن في أهل نجران

1 Ibid; Abū ‘Ubayd Qāsim ibn Salām (d. 224 A.H.): *Kitāb al-Amwāl*, pg. 232, Ḥadīth: 848, Egypt print; *Muṣannaf ibn Abī Shaybah*, vol. 12 pg. 33, Kitāb al-Faḍā’il, Karachi Print.

2 *Al-Tārīkh al-Kabīr*, vol. 4 pg. 145, Dakkan print; *Kitāb al-Kharāj*, pg. 23, Egypt print.

Al-A'mash relates – from Sālim ibn Abī al-Ja'd who reports:

The people of Najrān reached forty thousand in number. 'Umar feared that they will attack the Muslims. They began harbouring jealousy for one another so they approached 'Umar and submitted, "Jealousy has spread among us so move us away."

Meanwhile, Rasūlullāh ﷺ had written a document for them that they will not be exiled. 'Umar took advantage of the suggestion and moved them (to Najrān in Iraq from Najrān of Yemen). Later, they regretted so they came to him saying, "Annul the deal."

But he refused to cancel it. When 'Alī assumed authority, they approached him and submitted, "We beseech you through the letter you wrote with your right hand and your intercession by your Nabī to cancel this deal for us."

But he also refused and said, "Woe to you! Undoubtedly, 'Umar was correct in judgement. Therefore, I will not change anything 'Umar established."

Sālim explains, "They thought that if 'Alī would criticise 'Umar for anything, he would criticise him regarding the people of Najrān. (But instead of criticising him, he approved and praised him)."<sup>1</sup>

This incident took place in Jumādā al-Ukhrā 37 A.H. during his khilāfah.<sup>2</sup>

---

1 Abū Yūsuf (d. 182 A.H.): *Kitāb al-Kharāj*, pg. 74, Egypt print; *Kitāb al-Amwāl*, pg. 98, Ḥadīth: 273, Egypt print; Aḥmad ibn Yaḥyā ibn Jābir al-Baghdādī (d. 279 A.H.): *Futūḥ al-Buldān*, pg. 73 – 74, chapter on the treaty of Najrān, Egypt print; al-Bayhaqī: *al-Sunan al-Kubrā*, vol. 1 pg. 120, book on the etiquette of the judge, chapter on the judges who make ijtihād and their ijtihād changes; *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, vol. 2 pg. 303, book on Jihād from the sections of booty, section on the rulings of the produce of Jews; *al-Kāmil*, vol. 2 pg. 201, chapter regarding mention of the delegation of Najrān with the successor and leader, Egypt print; *Muṣannaf Ibn Abī Shaybah*, vol. 12 pg. 32, book on battles, book on virtues, Karachi print.

2 The incident of the Christians of Najrān is mentioned with different wording in the above books. We only quoted the wording from *Kanz al-'Ummāl*.

## ‘Alī’s arrival in Kūfah

Abū Ḥanīfah Aḥmad ibn Dāwūd Dīnawarī— a Shī‘ī—(d. 282 A.H.) author of *al-Akhbār al-Ṭiwāl*, records an incident of Sayyidunā ‘Alī’s رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ arrival in Kūfah:

قالوا و كان مقدمه الكوفة يوم الإثنين لإثنتي عشرة ليلة خلت من رجب سنة ٣٦ و قيل له يا أمير المؤمنين أتزل القصر قال لا حاجة لي في نزوله لأن عمر بن الخطاب رضي الله عنه كان يبغضه و لكني نازل الرحبة ثم أقبل حتى دخل المسجد الأعظم فصلى ركعتين ثم نزل الرحبة

They explain: He arrived in Kūfah on Monday, the 12th of Rajab 36 A.H. He was asked, “O Amīr al-Mu‘minīn, will you reside at The Royal Palace?”

He said, “I have no need to since ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ despised it. Instead, I will reside at the public square.”

He then moved forward and entered the Grand Maṣjid and prayed two rak‘āt. Thereafter, he stopped at the public square.<sup>1</sup>

## Deductions

1. Sayyidunā ‘Alī’s رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ behaviour and conduct resembles Sayyidunā ‘Umar’s رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ. Both were harmonious in their actions and practices.
2. Sayyidunā ‘Alī maintained the practices and systems implemented by Sayyidunā ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ. He understood him to be worthy. Hence, he did not alter or change anything.
3. Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ would refer to Sayyidunā ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ as *rashīd al-amr* during his khilāfah which means that he was rightly guided to the correct decision, accurate in judgement, and not deviated or misled in any matter.

The gist of the above is that Sayyidunā ‘Alī considered Sayyidunā ‘Umar’s رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ methodology, government, administration, and system correct and worthy of emulation. This brilliantly highlights the level of their brotherhood and unity which is apparent for every person in every era.

---

1 *Al-Akhbār al-Ṭiwāl*, pg. 152, under the incident of Jamal, new print.

## A Misconception

The opposition object by saying that after Sayyidunā ‘Umar’s ﷺ martyrdom during the discussion regarding the khilāfah, Sayyidunā ‘Alī ﷺ refused to act according to the sīrah of Sayyidunā Abū Bakr and Sayyidunā ‘Umar when Sayyidunā ‘Abd al-Raḥmān ibn ‘Awf ﷺ advised him of the same. We learn from here that their sīrah was not reliable, nor was their government worthy of emulation.

## Answer

1. Firstly, the narration which records Sayyidunā ‘Alī’s refusal to act in accordance to the sīrah of Sayyidunā Abū Bakr and Sayyidunā ‘Umar ﷺ has other similar distasteful statements; e.g. Sayyidunā ‘Alī telling Sayyidunā ‘Abd al-Raḥmān ibn ‘Awf ﷺ that the latter deceived him, etc. The highest source of those who narrate it with a sanad is *Tārīkh al-Umam wa l-Mulūk* of Ibn Jarīr al-Ṭabarī. Al-Ṭabarī and others have included offensive and foul material of that incident. Kindly refer to *Tārīkh al-Ṭabarī*<sup>1</sup>.

There is a very lengthy narration reported in *Tārīkh al-Umam wa l-Mulūk* in this regard which gives rise to these accusations. For research purposes, the isnād of this narration was examined. Some of the narrators in the chain are the likes of Abū Mikhnaf, etc., who are liars and deceits—although feigning pious—while others like Sālim ibn Junādah, Sulaymān ibn ‘Abd al-‘Azīz ibn Abī Thābit, etc., were found to be *majhūl* (unknown), in both their personalities and attributes. They could not be traced in reliable books of rijāl even after a concerted effort.

Let the unbiased and fair-minded judge for themselves. How can it ever be permissible to accept these narrations which contain concocted accusations from such men? Acceptance of concocted allegations is synonymous to creating harmony between truth and falsehood, and fact and fiction.

---

1 *Tārīkh al-Umam wa al-Mulūk*, vol. 5 pg. 38 – 40, chapter on the incident of shūrā, end of the year 23 A.H.

2. Secondly, the research of Ḥāfiẓ Ibn Kathīr رَحِمَهُ اللهُ is worthy of consideration, which will support our proposition, by Allah’s will. Ḥāfiẓ Ibn Kathīr analyses the narrations of this period in *al-Bidāyah wa al-Nihāyah* under the year 24 A.H. He concludes:

وما يذكره كثير من المؤرخين كابن جرير الطبري وغيره عن رجال لا يعرفون أن عليا قال لعبد الرحمن بن عوف خدعتني إلخ... إلى غير ذلك من الأخبار المخالفة لما ثبت في الصحاح فهي مردودة على قائلها وناقليها والمظنون بالصحابة خلاف ما يتوهم كثير من الرافضة وأغبياء القصاص الذين لا تميز عندهم بين صحيح الأخبار وضعيفها ومستقيمها وسقيمها ومبادهها وقويمها والله الموفق للصواب

What many historians have mentioned like Ibn Jarīr al-Ṭabarī and others from men who are unknown that ‘Alī said to ‘Abd al-Raḥmān ibn ‘Awf, “You deceived me,” ... etc., as well as other reports which contradict that which is established in the authentic ḥadīth compilations are all rejected and thrown back at their narrators and reporters. What is believed about the Ṣaḥābah is contrary to what majority of the Rawāfiḍ and foolish story-tellers suppose, who have no expertise in differentiating authentic narrations from weak ones, the flawless from the flawed, and the destroyed from the established. And Allah guides towards the truth.<sup>1</sup>

3. Thirdly, at this juncture of *Tārīkh al-Ṭabarī*, the narration of Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ wherein he expresses his willingness to emulate the sīrah and methodology of Sayyidunā Abū Bakr and Sayyidunā ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُمَا has been documented. The words of the narration are:

دعا عليا فقال عليك عهد الله و ميثاقه لتعملن بكتاب الله و سنة رسوله و سيرة الخليفتين من بعده قال أرجو أن أفعل و أعمل بمبلغ علمي و طاقتي

‘Abd al-Raḥmān ibn ‘Awf summoned ‘Alī and said, “I give you the oath of Allah’s covenant and pact that you will certainly act upon the Book of Allah, the Sunnah of His Messenger, and the sīrah of the two khulafā’ after him.”

‘Alī submitted, “I aspire to act to the best of my knowledge and capability.”<sup>2</sup>

1 *Al-Bidāyah wa al-Nihāyah*, vol. 7 pg. 147, the year 24 A.H.

2 *Tārīkh al-Ṭabarī*, vol. 5 pg. 37, the year 23 A.H., the conditions at the demise of al-Fārūq al-A’ẓam and the incident of the shūrā, Egypt print.

4. Fourthly, Sayyidunā ‘Alī’s رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ student ‘Abd Khayr reports that the former acknowledged that the methodology and sīrah of these two Khulafā’ were exactly according to the sīrah of Rasūlullāh صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ. His transmission is reproduced hereunder:

عن عبد خير قال قام علي بن أبي طالب رضي الله عنه على المنبر فذكر رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم فقال قبض رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم و استخلف أبو بكر فعمل بعمله و سار بسيرته حتى قبضه الله على ذلك ثم استخلف عمر فعمل بعملهما و سار بسيرتهما حتى قبضه الله على ذلك

‘Abd Khayr transmits:

‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib stood on the pulpit. He spoke about Rasūlullāh صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ and then declared: “Rasūlullāh صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ passed on and Abū Bakr was appointed khalīfah. He practiced in accordance to Rasūlullāh’s صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ practice and emulated his sīrah until Allah took him away in this condition. Thereafter, ‘Umar was appointed khalīfah. He practiced in accordance to their practice and followed their sīrah until Allah took him away in this condition.”<sup>1</sup>

It is evident that when Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ regards their sīrah and methodology to be in accordance to the sīrah of Rasūlullāh صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ, then how could he reject emulating them?

5. Fifthly, you have read the narrations under theme four. In particular, the narration wherein Sayyidunā ‘Alī termed Sayyidunā ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ rashīd al-amr is strong indication that according to the former, all the administrative and governmental issues of the latter’s khilāfah were correct. All these aspects clarify that Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ never refused to follow the sīrah of Sayyidunā Abū Bakr and Sayyidunā ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ.

This objection is utterly baseless and its proof is unfounded. Finally, I submit that if further satisfaction is sought to remove this objection from shīrī references, then kindly refer to the Ṣiddīqī section of the book, chapter four, theme one where references from shīrī books are listed. We have not repeated them here for brevity.

---

1 *Musnad Aḥmad*, vol. 1 pg. 128, musnadāt of ‘Alī, Egypt print; *Majma’ al-Zawā’id*, book on the khilāfah, chapter on the four khulafā’, vol. 5 pg. 176.

## Theme Five

One of the outstanding qualities of Sayyidunā ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ is that Allah سُبْحَانَهُ وَتَعَالَى favoured him with a perfect degree of enthusiasm and drive to support the truth and truthfulness. Speaking and supporting the truth was part of his temperament. Rasūlullāh صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ says accordingly:

إن الله جعل الحق على لسان عمر و قلبه

Undoubtedly, Allah has placed the truth on ‘Umar’s tongue and heart.<sup>1</sup>

After presenting these words, we return to our previous discussion. Sayyidunā ‘Alī would say in favour of Sayyidunā ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُمَا that we never doubted at all that *sakīnah* (truth and wisdom) descended on ‘Umar’s tongue and calmness was inspired in his heart. Owing to this, he supported the truth in all instances and never tolerated anything besides the truth.

This statement of Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ is captured by the senior ‘Ulamā’ with the following wording:

ما كنا نبعد أن السكينة تنطق على لسان عمر

We never doubted that ‘Umar was the voice of wisdom.<sup>2,3</sup>

عن عمرو بن ميمون عن علي بن أبي طالب كره الله وجهه قال إذا ذكر الصالحون فحي هلا بعمر ما كنا ننكر و نحن أصحاب رسول الله متوافرون أن السكينة تنطق على لسان عمر

‘Amr ibn Maymūn reports from ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ:

---

1 *Mishkāt al-Maṣābīh*, pg. 557, chapter on the virtues of ‘Umar, section 2, with reference to *Jāmi‘ al-Tirmidhī* and *Sunan Abī Dāwūd*, Nūr Muḥammadī print, Delhi.

2 Al-Sakīnah: Something soothing to the souls and comforting to the hearts.

3 *Muṣannaf‘ Abd al-Razzāq*, vol. 11 pg. 222; *Kitāb al-Amwāl*, pg. 543, Egypt print; *Muṣannaf Ibn Abī Shaybah*, book on virtues, under the virtues of ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb.



When the pious are mentioned, then begin with ‘Umar. We never rejected—and we are all the companions of Rasūlullāh ﷺ—that the truth flowed on ‘Umar’s tongue.<sup>1</sup>

عن زهير عن إسماعيل بن أبي خالد عن الشعبي عن علي بن أبي طالب كرم الله وجهه قال ما كنا نشك إلا أن السكينة تنطق على لسان عمر رضي الله تعالى عنهما رواه الثوري وابن عيينة وشريك وهريم وأسباط وابن السماك وسعيد بن الصلت في آخرين عن إسماعيل مثله

From Zuhayr — from Ismā‘īl ibn Abī Khālīd — from al-Sha‘bī — from ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib رضي الله عنه who declared:

We had no doubt that wisdom flowed on ‘Umar’s tongue رضي الله عنه.

Al-Thawrī, Ibn ‘Uyaynah, Sharīk, Huraym, Asbāṭ, Ibn al-Sammāk, and Sa‘īd ibn al-Ṣalt among other reported it from Ismā‘īl with the same wording.<sup>2</sup>

عن علي قال إن ذكر الصالحون فحي هلا بعمر ما كنا نبعد أصحاب محمد أن السكينة تنطق على لسان عمر

‘Alī stated:

If the righteous are mentioned, then start with ‘Umar. We the companions of Muḥammad had no doubt that ‘Umar was the voice of wisdom.<sup>3</sup>

أخرج ابن منيع في مسنده عن علي قال كنا أصحاب محمد صلى الله عليه وسلم لا نشك أن السكينة تنطق على لسان عمر

Ibn Manī documents in his *Musnad* that ‘Alī announced: We the companions of Muḥammad ﷺ had no doubt that wisdom descended on ‘Umar’s tongue.<sup>4</sup>

---

1 *Ḥilyat al-Awliyā*, vol. 4 pg. 152, discussion on ‘Amr ibn Maymūn al-Awadī.

2 Ibid, vol. 4 pg. 328, discussion on ‘Amir al-Sha‘bī.

3 *Majma‘ al-Zawā‘id*, vol. 9 pg. 67, chapter on the virtues of ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb, with reference to al-Ṭabarānī: *al-Awsaṭ* whose isnād is ḥasan, Egypt print; *Mishkāt al-Maṣābīḥ*, chapter on the virtues of ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb, section 2, with reference to al-Bayhaqī: *Dalā‘il al-Nubuwwah*, pg. 557.

4 Jalāl al-Dīn al-Suyūṭī: *Tārīkh al-Khulafā’*, pg. 84, section on the aḥādīth transmitted in his favour besides those past regarding al-Ṣiddīq, Delhi print; *al-Riyāḍ al-Naḍīrah fī Manāqib al-Asharah*, vol. 1 pg. 270, chapter on the virtues and merits of ‘Umar; *Kanz al-Ummāl*, vol. 6 pg. 340, with reference to al-Ṭabarānī, vol. 6 pg. 337, 370 and to Ibn ‘Asākir, first edition, Hyderabad, Dakkan.

عن وهب السوائي قال خطب علي الناس فقال من خير هذه الأمة بعد نبيها قالوا أنت يا أمير المؤمنين قال لا بل أبو بكر ثم عمر إنا كنا نظن أن السكينة لتنتطق على لسان عمر

Wahb al-Sawāī reports:

‘Alī delivered a sermon to the people and asked, “Who is the best of this ummah after its Nabī?”

They replied, “You are, O Amīr al-Mu’minīn.”

He retorted, “No, rather Abū Bakr is then ‘Umar. We believed that ‘Umar was the voice of wisdom.”<sup>1</sup>

This is further supported by Sayyidunā ‘Alī’s رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ transmission of the declaration of Rasūlullāh صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ in favour of Sayyidunā ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ:

رحم الله عمر يقول الحق وإن كان مرا تركه الحق وما له من صديق

May Allah shower mercy upon ‘Umar. He speaks the truth even though it is bitter (to people). Speaking the truth has left him without any friend.<sup>2</sup>

## Deductions

1. Sayyidunā ‘Umar’s رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ truthfulness and honesty has been attested to on the tongue of Rasūlullāh صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ and Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ.
2. Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ coupled with all the Ṣaḥābah رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُمْ acknowledge his truthful speech and believed him.
3. We learn from Sayyidunā ‘Alī’s رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ statements that Sayyidunā ‘Umar’s رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ heart was divinely inspired, which he termed *sakīnah*.
4. This proves that they appreciated, respected, and admired each other.

---

1 *Kanz al-Ummāl*, vol. 6 pg. 340, with reference to Ibn ‘Asākir, first edition, Hyderabad, Dakkan.

2 *Ud al-Ghābah*, vol. 4 pg. 65, discussion on ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb.

## Theme Six

According to Sayyidunā ‘Alī, Sayyidunā ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُمَا was the rightful successor of Rasūlullāh صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ and held a position just after Sayyidunā Abū Bakr رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ. After the Nabī صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ and the Ṣiddīq, he occupies the loftiest position of the ummah. To substantiate this fact, although approximately 50 narrations from 27 individuals, majority backed by strong references, have been included in the Ṣiddīqī section of *Ruḥamā’ Baynahum* under section 11 and 12 of chapter 4, we will quote 12 of Sayyidunā ‘Alī’s رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ statements here so that those who did not read the Ṣiddīqī section are not deprived of these priceless testimonials and may fully benefit from them.

### First Narration

Muḥammad ibn al-Ḥanafiyah once asked his father Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ:

أي الناس خير بعد النبي صلى الله عليه و سلم قال أبو بكر قال ثم من قال عمر و خشيت أن يقول عثمان قلت ثم أنت قال ما أنا إلا رجل من المسلمين

“Who is the best person after the Nabī صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ?”

‘Alī replied, “Abū Bakr.”

“Then who?”

‘Alī answered, “‘Umar.”

I feared that he would say ‘Uthmān so I said, “Then you.”

He submitted, “I am only an ordinary Muslim man.”<sup>1</sup>

### A Shī‘ī Narration

The readers should know that this narration of Muḥammad ibn al-Ḥanafiyah was quoted from books of the Ahl al-Sunnah and it proves that Sayyidunā ‘Umar

---

1 *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī*, vol. 1 pg. 518, chapter on the virtues of Abū Bakr, Delhi print; *Sunan Abī Dāwūd*, vol. 2 pg. 288, Kitāb al-Sunnah, chapter on superiority, Delhi print.

ﷺ was from the cream of this ummah. I will now reproduce a Shīī narration from the books of the Shīah. In this narration, Sayyidunā ‘Alī ﷺ advised his son Muḥammad ibn al-Ḥanafiyyah to speak favourably of Sayyidunā ‘Umar ﷺ, and not to speak anything else besides that.

The circumstance surrounding this statement according to the Shīī narration is that it was the fourth day of the Battle of Ṣiffīn and ‘Ubayd Allah ibn ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb came out to face Muḥammad ibn al-Ḥanafiyyah who began using nasty words against ‘Ubayd Allah and Sayyidunā ‘Umar ﷺ. Hearing this, Sayyidunā ‘Alī ﷺ addressed Muḥammad saying:

لا تذكر أباه و لا تقل فيه إلا خيرا رحم الله أباه

Do not mention anything negative about his father and only speak positively of him. May Allah have mercy on his father.<sup>1</sup>

This shows that Sayyidunā ‘Alī considered Sayyidunā ‘Umar ﷺ worthy of favourable words and prayers of mercy and compassion and not worthy of unpleasant comments. He was of the elite of the nation. Words of prayer are befitting for him.

## Second Narration

Imām al-Bukhārī documents the narration of Rāfi‘ in his *Al-Tārīkh al-Kabīr*:

فقال لرافع بعض القوم يا أبا الجعد بما قام أمير المؤمنين يعني عليا قال سمعته ألا أخبركم بخير الناس بعد رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم أبو بكر ثم عمر

Someone asked Rāfi‘, “O Abū al-Ja’d, what did Amīr al-Mu’minīn i.e. ‘Alī declare?”

---

1 Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd: *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*, vol. 1 pg. 644, Beirut print on the authority of Naṣr ibn Muzāḥim, under the heading: some of his characteristics and supplications during war.

He said, “I heard him saying, ‘should I not inform you of the best people after Rasūlullāh ﷺ: Abū Bakr then ‘Umar.’”<sup>1</sup>

### Third Narration

عبد الملك بن سلع عن عبد خير قال سمعت عليا يقول قبض النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم على خير ما قبض عليه نبي من الأنبياء وأثنى عليه صلى الله عليه وسلم ثم استخلف أبو بكر فعلم بعمل رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم و سنته ثم قبض أبو بكر على خير ما قبض عليه أحد كان خير هذه الأمة بعد نبيها ثم استخلف عمر فعلم بعملهما و سنتهما ثم قبض على خير ما قبض عليه أحد فكان خير هذه الأمة بعد نبيها و بعد أبي بكر

From ‘Abd al-Malik ibn Sila’—from ‘Abd Khayr, who reports that he heard ‘Alī stating:

“The Nabī ﷺ was taken away in the best way any Nabī from the Ambiyā’ was taken away.” He then praised Rasūlullāh ﷺ.

“Thereafter, Abū Bakr was appointed khalīfah and he acted according to the practice and methodology of Rasūlullāh ﷺ. Then Abū Bakr passed away in the choicest way anyone can pass away. He was the most superior of this ummah after its Nabī. Then ‘Umar became khalīfah and he acted in accordance to their practice and methodology until he was taken away in the finest way anyone could be taken away. He was the choicest of this ummah after its Nabī and after Abū Bakr.”<sup>2</sup>

### Fourth Narration

It is reported in *Musnad Aḥmad*:

---

1 *Al-Tārīkh al-Kabīr*, vol. 2 pg. 280, part 2, section 1, under Rāfi’ ibn Salamah, Dakkan print; *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, pg. 11, chapter on the virtues of ‘Umar, from ‘Abd Allah ibn Salamah, Delhi print.

2 *Muṣannaf Ibn Abī Shaybah*, vol. 4 pg. 887, chapter regarding the narrations on Abū Bakr’s khilāfah, Qilmī Pīr Jhandā, Sindh; *Musnad Aḥmad*, vol. 1 pg. 128, musnadāt of ‘Alī, with selections of *Kanz*, Egypt print; *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, vol. 6 pg. 369, chapter on the virtue of Abū Bakr and ‘Umar, with reference to Ibn Abī Shaybah and Ibn ‘Asākir, old print.

عن المسيب بن عبد خير عن أبيه قال قام علي رضي الله عنه فقال خير هذه الأمة بعد نبيها أبو بكر و عمر  
وإن قد أحدثنا بعدهم أحداثا يقضى الله تعالى فيها ما شاء

Al-Musayyab ibn ‘Abd Khayr reports from his father:

‘Alī stood up and announced, “The best of this ummah after its Nabī is Abū Bakr and ‘Umar. Verily, things appeared after them; Allah ﷻ will judge regarding them as He desires.<sup>1</sup>

## Fifth Narration

It appears in *Musnad Ahmad*:

عن الشعبي حدثني أبو جحيفة الذي كان علي يسميه وهب الخير قال قال علي يا أبا جحيفة ألا أخبرك  
بأفضل هذه الأمة بعد نبيها قال قلت بلى قال و لم أكن أرى أن أحدا أفضل منه قال أفضل هذه الأمة بعد  
نبيها أبو بكر و بعد أبي بكر عمر و بعدهما ثالث لم يسمه

From al-Sha‘bī—Abū Juḥayfah, who ‘Alī would call Wahb al-Khayr narrated to me saying that—‘Alī said:

“O Abū Juḥayfah, should I not tell you of the most superior of this ummah after its Nabī?”

I submitted, “Definitely.” I never thought that anyone was superior to him.

He said, “The most superior of this ummah after its Nabī is Abū Bakr and after Abū Bakr it is ‘Umar and after them is a third whom he did not name.”<sup>2</sup>

## Sixth Narration

Abū Nu‘aym al-Aṣbahānī (d. 430 A.H.) mentioned in *Ḥilyat al-Awliyā’*:

---

1 *Musnad Ahmad*, vol. 1 pg. 128, musnadāt of ‘Alī, with selections of *Kanz*.

2 *Musnad Ahmad*, vol. 1 pg. 106, musnadāt of ‘Alī, Egypt print.

ثنا شعبة عن الحكم عن عبد خير قال قام علي على المنبر فقال ألا أخبركم بخير هذه الأمة بعد نبيها قالوا بلى قال أبو بكر ثم سكت سكتة ثم قال ألا أخبركم بخير هذه الأمة بعد أبي بكر عمر

Shu‘bah narrated to us—from al-Ḥakam—from ‘Abd Khayr who reports:

‘Alī stood on the pulpit and declared, “Should I not inform you of the best of this ummah after its Nabī?”

They replied in the affirmative.

He said, “Abū Bakr.”

He then remained silent for a short while and said, “Should I not inform you of the best of this ummah after Abū Bakr? ‘Umar.”<sup>1</sup>

## Seventh Narration

عن حبيب بن أبي ثابت قال سمعت حديثنا عن عبد خير فلقبته فسألته فحدثني أنه سمع عليا يقول خير الناس بعد رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم أبو بكر ثم عمر

Ḥabīb ibn Abī Thābit reports:

I heard a ḥadīth indirectly from ‘Abd Khayr. When we him, I asked him to narrate it to me directly. Accordingly, he narrated to me that he heard ‘Alī saying, “The best person after Rasūlullāh ﷺ is Abū Bakr, then ‘Umar.”<sup>2</sup>

## Eighth Narration

عن الحكم قال سمعت أبا جحيفة يقول سمعت عليا يقول خير هذه الأمة بعد نبيها أبو بكر وخيرهم بعد أبي بكر عمر و لو شئت أن أسمي الثالث لسميت صحيح مشهور من حديث شعبة عن الحكم

Ḥakam reports that he heard—Abū Juḥayfah saying:

---

1 *Ḥilyat al-Awliyā’*, vol. 7 pg. 199, the discussion of Shu‘bah ibn Ḥajjāj, Egypt print.

2 *Ibid*; *al-Istī‘āb*, vol. 2 pg. 456, discussion on ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb, with Ibn Ḥajar’s *al-Iṣābah*, Egypt print.

I heard ‘Alī declaring, “The best of this ummah after its Nabī is Abū Bakr and the best after Abū Bakr is ‘Umar. Had I desired to name the third best, I would have.”

This is a ṣaḥīḥ and famous ḥadīth of Shu‘bah from al-Ḥakam.<sup>1</sup>

### Ninth Narration

It is reported in *Tadhkirat al-Ḥuffāz* of al-Dhahabī:

ثنا سفیان عن أبي إسحاق عن عبد خير عن علي قال خير هذه الأمة بعد نبيها صلى الله عليه و سلم أبو بكر و عمر

Sufyān narrated to us—from Abū Ishāq—from ‘Abd Khayr—from ‘Alī:

The cream of this ummah after its Nabī ﷺ is Abū Bakr and ‘Umar.<sup>2</sup>

**NB:** In the following lines, the stern warning and vehement reproach sounded by Sayyidunā ‘Alī’s رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ for not accepting this belief will be quoted.

### Tenth Narration

Ibn ‘Abd al-Barr has reported with a sanad from Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ in *al-Istī‘āb*:

عن الحكم بن الحجل قال قال علي لا يفضلني أحد على أبي بكر و عمر إلا جلده حد المفتري

Ḥakam ibn al-Ḥajal reports that ‘Alī announced:

No one should dare give me superiority over Abū Bakr and ‘Umar, otherwise I will implement the punishment of a slanderer upon him (which is 80 lashes).<sup>3</sup>

---

1 Ibid.

2 *Tadhkirat al-Ḥuffāz*, vol. 3 pg. 301, under the discussion on al-Sammān al-Ḥāfiẓ al-Kabīr, Dakkan print, vol. 3 pg. 1123, Beirut print, fourth edition.

3 *Al-Istī‘āb*, vol. 2 pg. 244, the discussion on al-Ṣiddīq al-Akbar, with *al-Iṣābah*; *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, vol. 6 pg. 371, with reference to Ibn Abī al-‘Āṣim and Khaythamah in *Faḍā’il al-Ṣaḥābah*, first edition, Dakkan.



## Eleventh Narration

The prominent figure of the Ḥanafī ‘Ulamā’ Imām Abū Yusuf reports in his book *Kitāb al-Āthār* from his teacher Imām Abū Ḥanīfah with a complete chain to Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه the following:

قال حدثنا يوسف عن أبيه عن أبي حنيفة أن رجلا أتى عليا رضي الله عنه فقال ما رأيت أحدا خيرا منك فقال له هل رأيت النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم قال لا قال هل رأيت أبا بكر وعمر قال لا قال لو أخبرتني أنك رأيت النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم ضربت عنقك ولو أخبرتني أنك رأيت أبا بكر وعمر لأوجعتك عقوبة

A man approached ‘Alī رضي الله عنه and said, “I have not seen anyone better than you.”

He asked him, “Have you seen the Nabī صلى الله عليه وسلم?”

“No,” he replied.

“Have you seen Abū Bakr and ‘Umar?”

“No.”

‘Alī then said, “Had you told me that you saw the Nabī صلى الله عليه وسلم, I would have severed your head. And had you told me that you saw Abū Bakr and ‘Umar, I would have severely punished you.”<sup>1</sup>

## Twelfth Narration

Ḥāfiẓ Ibn Ḥajar al-‘Asqalānī has reported the following narration of Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه via a reliable sanad in *Lisān al-Mīzān*:

عن زيد بن وثب أن سويد بن غفلة دخل على علي في إمارته فقال إن مررت بنفر يذكرون أبا بكر وعمر يرون أنك تضمم لهما مثل ذلك منهم عبد الله بن سبأ وكان عبد الله أول من أظهر ذلك فقال علي مالي

---

1 *Kitāb al-Āthār*, pg. 207, Ḥadīth: 924, Lajnat Ih̄yā’ Ma’ārif al-Nu’māniyyah print, Hyderabad, Dakkan; Abū Ṭālib al-‘Ashārī: *Faḍā’il Abī Bakr al-Ṣiddīq*, pg. 8, with Sharḥ *Thulāthiyyāt al-Bukhārī*; *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, vol. 6 pg. 37, under the virtue of al-Shaykhayn Abū Bakr and ‘Umar رضي الله عنهما, with reference to al-‘Ashārī, first edition, Dakkan.

ولهذا الخبيث الأسود ثم قال معاذ الله أن أضمر لهما إلا الحسن الجميل ثم أرسل إلى عبد الله بن سبأ فسيّره إلى المدائن و قال لا يساكنني في بلدة أبدا ثم نهض إلى المنبر حتى اجتمع الناس فذكر القصة في ثنائه عليهما بطوله و في آخره ألا لا يبلغني عن أحد يفضلني عليهما إلا جلدته حد المفتري

Zayd ibn Wahb recalls:

Suwayd ibn Ghafalah entered the presence of ‘Alī during his khilāfah and said, “I passed by a group who were speaking negatively about Abū Bakr and ‘Umar. They feel that you harbour similar feelings for Abū Bakr and ‘Umar. Among them is ‘Abd Allah ibn Saba.’” ‘Abd Allah ibn Saba’ was the first to voice this ideology.

Hearing this ‘Alī said, “I have no connection with this black devil.”

He continued, “I seek Allah’s protection from entertaining anything towards them besides good and beautiful thoughts.”

He then sent for ‘Abd Allah ibn Saba’ and banished him to Madā’in and declared, “He will never ever reside with me in the same city.”

He then ascended the pulpit and the people gathered. He spoke favourably of both of them for a long time. At the end he warned, “Harken! It should not reach me that anyone is declaring me better than them, otherwise I will mete out the punishment of a slanderer upon him.”<sup>1</sup>

## Clarification

It appears in the above narration that Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه banished the Jew ‘Abd Allah ibn Saba’ from Kūfah to Madā’in. This was the beginning stages of the shenanigans of this wicked being. When his corrupt propaganda increased and his erroneous movement began gaining momentum, under the guise of love for the Ahl al-Bayt, Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه made a severe crackdown on them. At the end, he set him and his ilk on fire, those who portrayed themselves as lovers of the Ahl al-Bayt, and showed no consideration to such extremists.<sup>2</sup>

---

1 *Lisān al-Mīzān*, vol. 3, discussion on ‘Abd Allah ibn Saba’.

2 *Lisān al-Mīzān*, vol. 3, discussion on ‘Abd Allah ibn Saba’; Rijāl Kashī, discussion on ‘Abd Allah ibn Saba’; Shaykh ‘Abbās Qummī: *Tuḥfat al-Aḥbāb*, discussion on ‘Abd Allah ibn Saba’.

## Deductions of the Twelve Narrations

1. In the sight of Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه, the most superior of the ummah after Rasūlullāh صلى الله عليه وسلم are Shaykhayn, Sayyidunā Abū Bakr and Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنهما.
2. Those whose belief is not in accordance to this declaration of Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه are criminals worthy of punishment, which is 80 lashes.
3. In both Sunnī and Shī‘ī books, Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه is announcing that Sayyidunā Abū Bakr and Sayyidunā ‘Umar and noblemen and should be spoken about favourably.
4. All these narrations prove that there existed love, harmony, friendship, and closeness between these personalities (Abū Bakr, ‘Umar, ‘Uthmān, and ‘Alī رضي الله عنهم).

## Important Caution

The forefather and founder of the movement to create dissension between Muslims is ‘Abd Allah ibn Saba’, the Jew. His detailed biography is documented in both Sunnī and Shī‘ī books. Scores of Shī‘ī scholars and mujtahidīn have written his biography throughout the ages, e.g. *Rijāl al-Kashī* from the fourth century to *Tuḥfat al-Aḥbāb* by Shaykh ‘Abbās Qummī of the fourteenth century. There is no need to dispute this fact. Their research scholars have included him in their books. The scholars may refer to their books for further peace of mind.

Towards the end of this century [20th century], the supporters of ‘Abd Allah ibn Saba’ have started the scheme of denying his existence and claiming that it is all fiction, to save themselves from these accusations. They deny that there existed a Jew by that name, who become Muslim and caused dissension between the Muslims under the garb of love for the Ahl al-Bayt, etc. as the proverb goes:

نه رہے بانس نہ بچے بانسری

*When the bamboo does not remain, the flute cannot sound.*

Among the famous books on rijāl of the Shī'ah is *Rijāl al-Kashī*. The latest publication of this book has just arrived from Tehran. Where 'Abd Allah ibn Saba' has been mentioned, there are footnotes added on the topic of criticising his existence. The names of those who made this discovery and dug out this unique research have also been listed. First is Sayyid Murtaḍā al-'Askarī, second is Shaykh 'Abd Allah al-Sabīṭī, and third is Doctor Ṭāhā Ḥusayn, a senior blind man.

The movement to deny the existence of this man will gain momentum rapidly. The 'well-wishers' of the religion and nation will begin disseminating this latest discovery using the most efficient ways.

This issue is similar to the theory they cooked up of Rasūlullāh ﷺ having only one biological daughter and denying the other three daughters. This theory spread like wild fire among their circles whereas it is in polarity with reality. The fact that Rasūlullāh ﷺ had four biological daughters is accepted and recognised by the Ahl al-Sunnah and all the historians, and has no scope for disagreement or doubt. The most accurate, preferred, and accepted view in the books of the Shī'ah is that Rasūlullāh ﷺ had four daughters. Their very own mujtahidīn like Mullā Bāqir Majlisī etc., have rejected the one daughter theory. This matter has been settled centuries ago. Study the discussion of Rasūlullāh's ﷺ children in volume two of *Ḥayāt al-Qulūb* of Mullā Bāqir Majlisī.

Now the issue of denying the existence of Ibn Saba' is being propagated in a like manner. Most probably no one has ever denied this fact prior to this century.

At the end, we would like to make a suggestion which should not be distasteful. Why don't these 'well-wishers' of the religion deny the existence of all those individuals who might be the cause of objection. For example they should deny the existence of Muḥammad ibn al-Ḥanafīyyah, the son of Sayyidunā 'Alī رضي الله عنه from a slave girl gifted to him by Sayyidunā Abū Bakr al-Ṣiddīq رضي الله عنه. Similarly, 'Umar ibn 'Alī رضي الله عنه because firstly he was named after the second Khilāfah and secondly his mother al-Ṣahbā' was gifted to Sayyidunā 'Alī رضي الله عنه in the reign of Sayyidunā Abū Bakr رضي الله عنه. They should also do away with Sayyidunā Umm

Kulthūm bint ‘Alī رضي الله عنها, the daughter of Sayyidah Fatimah رضي الله عنها since she got married to Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه. Let them declare that all these individuals are fictitious and hypothetical. Many similar fictitious individuals can be concocted.

If these things are termed research, then the signs of the religion will be obliterated very quickly and the difference between truth and falsehood, right and wrong, guidance and misguidance will be eliminated. May Allah سُبْحَانَهُ وَتَعَالَى guide the Muslims and give them the ability to discern between justice and injustice. We end this note on these words of prayer.

## Theme Seven

Two virtues of Shaykhayn رضي الله عنهما will be included in this theme which are reported by Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه. The first is that Sayyidunā Abū Bakr and Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنهما will enter Jannah before the entire ummah. Have a look at the following narration:

عن عبد خيبر صاحب لواء علي رضي الله عنه عن علي قال إن أول من يدخل الجنة من هذه الأمة أبو بكر  
و عمر قال فقال رجل يا أمير المؤمنين يدخلانها قبلك قال إي والذي خلق العجة و برأ النسمة ليدخلانها  
قبلي

‘Abd Khayr, the flag bearer of Sayyidunā ‘Alī, reports that he said:

“The first to enter Jannah from this ummah will be Abū Bakr and ‘Umar.”

A man enquired, “O Amīr al-Mu‘minīn, will they enter before you?”

“By the oath of the Being who created the seed and the soul,” he replied,  
“they will definitely enter it before me.”<sup>1</sup>

---

1 Shaykh Abū Bishr Muḥammad ibn Aḥmad ibn Ḥammād al-Dūlābī (d. 310 A.H.): *Kitāb al-Kunā wa al-Asmā*, vol. 1 pg. 120, under the agnomen Abū Bakr from the Tābī‘īn and those after them, Hyderabad Dakkan print; *Sīrat ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb*, pg. 34, chapter 21, Egypt print; Shāh Walī Allah Muḥaddith Dahlawī: *Izālat al-Khafā ‘an Khilāfat al-Khulafā’*, vol. 1 pg. 68, 317, first edition, old print, Bareli.

The second virtue is that these two eminent men will be the leaders of the middle-aged class in Jannah. This has been transmitted by Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ from Rasūlullāh صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ. Kindly peruse the following transmission:

عن علي بن الحسين عن علي بن أبي طالب قال كنت مع رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم إذ طلع أبو بكر وعمر فقال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم هذان سيدا كهول أهل الجنة من الأولين والآخرين إلا النبيين والمرسلين يا علي لا تخبرهما

‘Alī ibn al-Ḥusayn reports from ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib:

I was with Rasūlullāh صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ when suddenly Abū Bakr and ‘Umar approached. So Rasūlullāh صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ declared, “These two are the leaders of the middle-aged class of Jannah from the former and later generations besides the prophets and messengers. O ‘Alī, do not inform them.”<sup>1</sup>

The following ‘Ulamā’ have transmitted this marfū’ narration of Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ through their respective sanads. We will suffice on presenting the references for purposes of brevity. The scholars may refer to the sources themselves. More detail has appeared in the fourth chapter of the Ṣiddīqī section.

1. *Musnad Aḥmad*, vol. 1 pg. 80; musnadāt ‘Alī (Ḥasan from ‘Alī)
2. *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, pg. 10, chapter on the virtue of Abū Bakr رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ (Ḥārith from ‘Alī)
3. *Kitāb al-Kunā*, vol. 2 pg. 99, chapter ‘ayn (from Zirr from ‘Alī)
4. *Musnad Abī Ya‘lā*, vol. 1 pg. 17, musnadāt of ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ, Qilmī print, Dargāh Sharīf, Pīrgūth, Sindh (al-Sha‘bī from ‘Alī)

### **We learn from the above that**

Sayyidunā Abū Bakr and Sayyidunā ‘Umar will be the leaders of the dwellers of Jannah besides the Messengers and their entry will be before all others. These are the reports of Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ. Truth and justice demands that they be appreciated and accepted wholeheartedly.

---

1 *Jāmi‘ al-Tirmidhī*, vol. 2 pg. 526, chapter on the merits of Abū Bakr, Lucknow print.

## Theme Eight

In this theme, we will quote the statements and declarations of Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه approving the correctness and appropriateness of Sayyidunā ‘Umar’s رضي الله عنه khilāfah recorded in the speeches of *Nahj al-Balāghah* coupled with their commentaries from the commentaries of *Nahj al-Balāghah* and other books. To achieve this goal, we will present only the statements of Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه from Shī‘ī books. Kindly study them properly.

The forthcoming clearly establishes the fact that both these distinguished souls entertained positive thoughts and good intentions for each other, expressed their reliance on one another, and acknowledged the correctness and truthfulness of each other. Impartiality needs to be maintained.

### First Narration

The following statement of Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه appears in *Nahj al-Balāghah*, in the chapter of his selected verdicts and sermons:

و وليهم وال فأقام و استقام حتى ضرب الدين بجرانه إلخ

المنقول أن الوالي عمر بن الخطاب و ضربه بجرانه كناية بالوصف المستعار عن استقراره و تمكنه كتمكن  
البعير البارک من الأرض إلخ

A governor then governed over them. He established the religion and remained firm upon the same until it become firmly rooted.

The governor referred to is ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb. The term *ḍarabahū bi jirrānihī* is an allusion with the demonstrative metaphor to depict its establishment and firmness as the firmness of a camel lying on the ground (to rest).<sup>1</sup>

---

1 Kamāl al-Dīn Maytham ibn ‘Alī ibn Maytham al-Baḥrānī (d. 679 A.H.): *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*, vol. 4 pg. 632, old Iran print, vol. 5 pg. 463, new Tehran print; Shaykh Ibrāhīm ibn Ḥājī Ḥusayn al-Dunbulī: al-Durrah al-Najfiyyah *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*, pg. 393, old Iran print, 1291 A.H.

## Second Narration

Sayyidunā Amīr Mu‘āwiyah رضي الله عنه wrote a letter to Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه which Abū Muslim al-Khawlanī brought to Kūfah. This is the reply Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه gave wherein he acknowledged the virtue and merit of Sayyidunā Abū Bakr and Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنهما in brilliant terms. Kindly study the text which will be followed by deductions and benefits:

فكان أفضلهم في الإسلام كما زعمت و انصحهم لله و لرسوله الخليفة الصديق ثم خليفة الخليفة الفاروق  
و لعمرى أن مكانهما في الإسلام لعظيم و أن المصاب بهما لجرح في الإسلام شديد فرحمهما الله و  
جزاهما بأحسن ما عملا

The most superior of them in Islam as you have suggested and the most sincere to Allah and His Messenger was the Khalīfah al-Şiddīq then the successor of the Khalīfah al-Fārūq. By my life, their status in Islam is indeed lofty and their loss is a deep injury to Islam. May Allah shower mercy on them and reward them for the best of their actions.<sup>1</sup>

## Third Narration

In the forthcoming declaration documented in *Nahj al-Balāghah*, Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه has enumerated many of the excellences and achievements of Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه. A priceless declaration indeed. Read it repeatedly and refresh your imān:

لله بلاد فلان فقد قوم الأود و داوى العمى و خلف الفتنة و أقام السنة ذهب نقي الثوب قليل العيب أصاب  
خيرها و سبق شرها أدى إلى الله طاعته و اتقاه بحق إلخ

May Allah سبحانه وتعالى favour that man (i.e. Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه) who straightened crookedness, doctored spiritual maladies, eradicated

---

1 Kamāl al-Dīn: *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*, vol. 3 pg. 486, old Iran print, regarding the letter he wrote to Mu‘āwiyah ibn Abī Sufyān, vol. 4 pg. 362, new Tehran print, under khuṭbah 9; Mirzā Muḥammad Taqī Lisān al-Mulk Siphir Kāshānī (d. 1297 A.H.): *Nāsikh al-Tawārīkh*, vol. 3 pg. 161, second letter known as letter of Şiffīn from the letters of Amīr al-Mu‘minīn رضي الله عنه.



innovations, and established the Sunnah. He left this world with a clean slate and little defects. He attained the goodness of khilāfah and left before its evil. He fulfilled the obedience of Allah in a beautiful way and met the demands of piety.<sup>1</sup>

The Shīṭī Mu‘tazilī Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd (d. 656 A.H.) has commentated on the above. He writes:

هذا الصفات إذا تأملها المتصف و أماط عن نفسه الهوى علم أن أمير المؤمنين عليه السلام لم يعن بها إلا عمر

When an unbiased person ponders over these qualities and does away with carnal passion, he will realise that Amīr al-Mu‘minīn عليه السلام intends no one besides ‘Umar by this.<sup>2</sup>

Ibn Maytham al-Baḥrānī (d. 679 A.H.) has commentated in a similar manner in his commentary on *Nahj al-Balāghah*:

المنقول أن المراد بفلان عمر الخ

It is reported that ‘Umar is intended by that man.

The same explanation appears in *al-Durrah al-Najfiyyah Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah* by Shaykh Ibrahim ibn Ḥājī Ḥusayn Shīṭī and has been passed through the ages. Although, Shīṭī scholars and commentators have also taken Sayyidunā Abū Bakr عليه السلام as the referred.

I will now quote the commentary of Sayyidunā ‘Alī’s عليه السلام priceless declaration in Persian from Shīṭī commentators which will be followed by the summary of translation in Urdu.

---

1 *Nahj al-Balāghah*, vol. 1 pg. 457, Egypt print, vol. 2 pg. 249, other print, address 223.

2 *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*, vol. 12 pg. 49, old Iran print, vol. 3 pg. 135, Beirut print.

The Shī'ī mujtahid, Fayḍ al-Islām Sayyid 'Alī Naqī pens its commentary in the following words in his Persian commentary:

خدا شہرپائے فلان (عمر بن الخطاب) را برکت دہد و نگاہد ارد کہ کجی را راست نمود و بیماری را معالجہ کرد و سنت را برپا داشت (احکام بیغمہر را اجرا نمود) و تباہ کاری را پشت سرانداخت (در زمان اوفتنہ رونداد) پاک جامہ و کم عیب از دنیا رفت نیکوئی خلافت را دریافت و از شران پیشی گرفت طاعت خدا را بجا آورده از نا فرمانی اوپر بیز کرده حقیق را ادا نمود

May Allah ﷻ favour that man (i.e. 'Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb) who straightened crookedness, doctored spiritual maladies, eradicated innovations and established the Sunnah. He left this world with a clean slate and little defects. He attained the goodness of khilāfah and left before its evil. He fulfilled the obedience of Allah in a beautiful way and met the demands of piety.<sup>1</sup>

Hereunder are the deductions and conclusions of the above declarations and statements of Sayyidunā 'Alī ﷺ, which are ten in number.

1. Sayyidunā 'Umar ﷺ was a man of righteousness in religious matters. There was no deviance in him.
2. He cured spiritual ailments.
3. He maintained the Sunnah with all its characteristics (which is testimony to his taqwā and trustworthiness).
4. He never fell into corruptions and fitnah due to his excellent management. He left the world prior to this.
5. He remained unblemished by the filth of criticism (which indicates to his truthfulness and correctness).

---

1 *Tarjamah wa Sharḥ Fārisī Nahj al-Balāghah*, vol. 4 pg. 712, Tehran print.

Urdu translation: Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd: *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*, vol. 12 pg. 49, old Iran print, vol. 3 pg. 134, Beirut print; Ibn Maytham al-Baḥrānī: *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*, vol. 26 pg. 413, old Iran print, vol. 4 pg. 96 – 97, new Tehran print, sermon 219; al-Durrah al-Najfiyyah, pg. 257, old Iran print; Fayḍ al-Islām 'Alī Naqī: *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah Fārisī*, vol. 4 pg. 712, Iran print.

6. He possessed very few defects.
7. He attained the goodness of khilāfah (i.e. justice and equality) and was saved from its evil and trials.
8. He worshipped Allah as He ought to be worshipped.
9. He possessed extreme fear for Allah’s reprimand.
10. He began the journey to the Hereafter when people were afflicted with various trials.

The readers are beckoned to observe truth and honesty and ponder deeply. These words should be read over and over again which support and affirm the accuracy of this book.

## Theme Nine

Chapter one had two sections. The second section had diverse themes whereunder the virtues and excellences of Sayyidunā Fārūq رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ were listed. This is the final theme which will encompass all the praises and compliments Sayyidunā ‘Umar and Sayyidunā Ibn ‘Umar articulated in favour of Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ.

I plan to list seven virtues of Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ in this theme followed by deductions and conclusions, and bring these themes to a close. The readers should be aware that in this theme, narrations from both Sunnī and Shī‘ī sources have been taken without distinction. Hence, take cognisance of the references.

### First Narration

حدثنا خلف بن خليفة عن أبي هريرة قال قال كنت مع ابن عمر جالسا إذ جاءه نافع بن أزرع فقام على رأسه فقال إني والله لأبغض عليا قال فرفع إليه ابن عمر رأسه فقال أبغضك الله تبغض رجلا سابقته من سوابقه خیر من الدنيا وما فيها

Khalaf ibn Khalīfah narrated to us—from Abū Hārūn who recalls:

I was sitting in the company of Ibn ‘Umar when Nāfi‘ ibn Azraq came to him. He stood above his head and said, “By Allah, I certainly hate ‘Alī.”

Ibn ‘Umar lifted his head (and gazed) towards him and shouted, “May Allah hate you. You hate a man—just one of his achievements is better than the world and what it contains.”<sup>1</sup>

## Second Narration

و عن عمر بن الخطاب و قد ذكر عنده علي قال ذلك صهر رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم نزل جبريل عليه السلام فقال إن الله يأمرك أن تزوج فاطمة ابنتك من علي أخرجه ابن السمان

It is reported that ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb stated after ‘Alī was mentioned to him, “That is the son-in-law of Rasūlullāh ﷺ. Jibrīl ﷺ descended and said, ‘Certainly, Allah commands you to marry your daughter Fatimah to ‘Alī.’”

Ibn al-Sammān documented it.<sup>2</sup>

## Third Narration

Shaykh al-Ṭā’ifah Abū Ja‘far al-Ṭūsī al-Shī‘ī (d. 460 A.H.) writes in *Al-Amālī*:

عن علي بن الحسين عن أبيه عليهم السلام قال قال عمر بن الخطاب عيادة بني هاشم سنة و زيارتهم نافلة

From ‘Alī ibn al-Ḥusayn—from his father ﷺ who reports:

‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb stated, “Visiting the ill of the Banū Hāshim is Sunnah and paying a casual visit to them is an act of virtue.”<sup>3</sup>

---

1 *Muṣannaf Ibn Abī Shaybah*, vol. 4 pg. 203, Qilmī, chapter on the virtues of Imām ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib, Pīr Jhandā, Sindh.

2 *Al-Riyāḍ al-Naḍīrah*, vol. 2 pg. 242, with reference to Ibn al-Sammān in *al-Muwāfaqaḥ*, chapter on the discussion on his speciality of marrying Fāṭimah.

3 *Al-Amālī*, vol. 2 pg. 345, Najaf Ashraf print, Iraq.

## Fourth Narration

The incident of Sayyidunā ‘Umar congratulating Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه is recorded in *Al-Amālī* of Shaykh Ṣadūq, Abū Ja‘far Muḥammad ibn ‘Alī ibn Bābawayh al-Qummī (d. 381 A.H.):

لما أخذ رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله بيد علي بن أبي طالب و قال أأنت أولى بالمؤمنين قالوا نعم يا رسول الله قال من كنت مولاه فعلي مولاه فقال له عمر بن الخطاب يا ابن أبي طالب أصبحت مولاي و مولا كل مسلم

Rasūlullāh صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم took hold of ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib’s hand and announced, “Do I not possess more right over the believers?”

They replied, “Yes, O Messenger of Allah.”

Rasūlullāh صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم re-joined, “Whoever’s *mawlā* (friend, beloved) I am, ‘Alī is his *mawlā*.”

Upon this ‘Umar said to him, “Congratulations O Ibn Abī Ṭālib, you have become my beloved and the beloved of every Muslim.”<sup>1</sup>

The purpose here was to answer the objections by establishing his virtue. This narration has absolutely no connection with *khilāfah* or undisputed succession. Nevertheless, this ḥadīth undoubtedly contains a special virtue for Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه. It should be noted this theme appears in our narrations as well, e.g. in *Mishkāṭ*, chapter on the merits of ‘Alī, third section, with reference to Aḥmad. There is, however, slight variations in wording.

## Fifth Narration

Here is an incident of the manner Sayyidunā ‘Umar defended the honour of Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه, reported in both books of the Ahl al-Sunnah and Shī‘ah:

إن رجلا وقع في علي بمحضر من عمر فقال تعرف صاحب هذا القبر محمد بن عبد الله بن عبد المطلب و علي بن أبي طالب بن عبد المطلب لا تذكر عليا إلا بخير فإنك إن آذيته آذيت هذا في قبره

1 *Al-Amālī*, pg. 3, first majlis, in first ḥadīth, old Iran print.

A man began insulting ‘Alī in the presence of ‘Umar, hearing which he warned, “Do you know the inmate of this grave? Muḥammad the son of ‘Abd Allah the son of ‘Abd al-Muṭṭalib and ‘Alī is the son of Abū Ṭālib the son of ‘Abd al-Muṭṭalib. Only speak favourably of ‘Alī because if you harm him, you are harming this man in his grave.”<sup>1</sup>

## Sixth Narration

Sayyidunā ‘Umar pronounces the status and rank of Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُمَا:

قال ابن عمر سأل رجلا عمر بن الخطاب عن علي فقال هذا منزل رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله و هذا منزل علي بن أبي طالب و هذا المنزل فيه صاحبه

Ibn ‘Umar reports, “A man questioned ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb about ‘Alī, so he explained, ‘This is the house of Rasūlullāh صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ, this is the house of ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib, and in this house was his friend (Abū Bakr).’”

Meaning that their closeness in rank can be gauged from their closeness in residence.<sup>2</sup>

## Seventh Narration

This excellence of Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ appears in the books of both sects and is accepted by both. Yes, it is found with various wording. Look at the manner of expression.

كان عمر يتعوذ بالله من معضلة ليس فيها أبو الحسن

‘Umar would seek Allah’s protection from a problematic situation for which Abū al-Ḥasan was not present.<sup>3</sup>

1 *Kanz al-Ummāl*, vol. 6 pg. 395, Ḥadīth: 6031, with reference to Ibn ‘Asākir, Hyderabad print, Dakkan; Shaykh al-Ṣadūq: *Al-Amālī*, pg. 234, majlis 61, old Iran print; Shaykh Abū Ja’far: *Al-Amālī*, vol. 2 pg. 46.

2 *Manāqib Ibn Shaharāshūb*, vol. 2 pg. 154, section on Amīr al-Mu’minīn’s proximity to Rasūlullāh صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ, with reference to Khaṣā’iṣ al-Nazanfarī, India print.

3 *Ṭabaqāt Ibn Sa’d*, vol. 2 pg. 103, discussion on ‘Alī, who would pass verdicts in Madīnah and who would be followed from the Companions of Rasūlullāh صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ; *al-Istī’āb*, vol. 3 pg. 39, discussion on ‘Alī, with *al-Iṣābah*.

قال عمر لا عشت في أمة لست فيها يا أبا الحسن

‘Umar declared, “I would not desire to live among a people you were not part of, O Abu al-Ḥasan.”<sup>1</sup>

إن عمر قال لا أبقاني الله بعدك يا علي

Indeed ‘Umar said, “May Allah not keep me alive after your demise O ‘Alī.”<sup>2</sup>

These are the statements Sayyidunā ‘Umar made to congratulate and show gratitude to Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ for the outstanding verdicts he passed at various instances. Once, Sayyidunā ‘Umar appreciated the verdict of Sayyidunā Mu‘ādh ibn Jabal رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ and congratulated him saying:

عجزت النساء أن تلد مثل معاذ لولا معاذ هلك عمر

Women are incapable of giving birth to the like of Mu‘ādh. Had it not been for Mu‘ādh, ‘Umar would be destroyed.”<sup>3</sup>

## Deductions and Conclusions

In light of the statements of Sayyidunā ‘Umar and his son Ibn ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُمَا, the following virtues of Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ have been revealed:

1. Each virtue of his is better than the world and what it contains.
2. His marriage was contracted by divine command.
3. There is plenty of reward for visiting the Banū Hāshim.
4. He is the friend and beloved of all the Muslims.

---

1 Shaykh al-Ṭūsī: *Al-Amālī*, vol. 2 pg. 92, new print, Iraq.

2 *Manāqib Ibn Shahrāshūb*, vol. 3 pg. 7, chapter on ‘Alī’s verdicts, India print.

3 *Al-Iṣābah*, discussion on Mu‘ādh ibn Jabal.

5. Criticising him is harming Rasūlullāh ﷺ.
6. Just as his house was close to Rasūlullāh ﷺ, he enjoyed a rank very close to Rasūlullāh ﷺ.
7. They appreciated and congratulated each other.

The crux is that all these points are signs of their unity, mutual understanding, friendship, and brotherhood. Eyes of understanding are needed to appreciate these incidents.

تم ہو ایس میں غضب ناک وہ ایس میں رحیم

تم خطاکار و خطابیں ہو خطاپوش و کریم

*You harbour anger for one another while they were merciful to each other.*

*You are criminals and disclose faults, while they conceal faults and are generous.*

This brings section two to a close. And with Allah's tawfīq, this concludes chapter one.



## Chapter Two

We now begin chapter two, and all praise belongs to Allah. This chapter will be divided into four sections.

- **Section One:** The Station of judge and muftī
- **Section Two:** Consultation in shar‘ī masā’il
- **Section Three:** Consultations regarding issues of the state and incidents of compassion
- **Section four:** Consideration for monetary rights, inclusion in distribution of booty, participation in collecting allowance and gifts.

### Section One: The Station of Judge and Muftī

It is necessary to delegate the various governmental tasks to competent individuals for the smooth running of the state. There are a number of administrative departments of the state, e.g. education, law and order, defence, finance, etc. Accordingly, there were many departments during the eras of the Khulafā’ Rāshidīn on the strength of which the khilāfah was run. This issue of departments is mentioned in many narrations.

1. Sayyidunā ‘Umar’s رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ one sermon which he delivered at Jābiyah (in the land of Shām) is recorded in *Sunan Sa‘īd ibn Manṣūr* and al-Bayhaqī’s *al-Sunan al-Kubrā*. The report is:

خطب الناس بالجابية فقال في خطبته من جاء يسأل عن القرآن فليأت أبي بن كعب و من جاء يسأل عن الحلال و الحرام فليأت معاذ بن جبل و من جاء يسأل عن الفرائض فليأت زيد بن ثابت و من جاء يسأل عن المال فليأتني فإن الله جعلني خازنا فإني باد بأزواج النبي صلى الله عليه و سلم فمعطيهم ثم بالمهاجرين الذين أخرجوا من ديارهم و أموالهم ثم بالأنصار

‘Umar addressed the people at Jābiyah and said during his address, “Whoever comes to ask concerning the Qur’ān should approach Ubay ibn Ka‘b. Whoever wants to ask about permissible and impermissible should go

to Mu‘ādh ibn Jabal. Whoever’s question is regarding inheritance should approach Zayd ibn Thābit. And whoever is seeking money should come to me because Allah has made me the treasurer. I am going to begin giving stipends to the wives of Rasūlullāh ﷺ, then the Muhājirīn who were expelled from their houses and wealth, and then the Anṣār.”<sup>1</sup>

In this narration, the division of the education department has been elucidated upon coupled with clarification that the financial department will be directly under the control of the khalīfah of the time.

2. The report of *Ṭabaqāt Ibn Sa’d* makes mention of the iftā and judicial department. This narration has been quoted in the Ṣiddīqī section with more detail. A portion of the narration is quoted hereunder:

ثم ولي عمر فكان يدعو هؤلاء النفر

Then ‘Umar became khalīfah (after Abū Bakr al-Ṣiddīq ﷺ). He would call these men (viz. ‘Uthmān ibn ‘Affān, ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib, ‘Abd al-Raḥmān ibn ‘Awf, Mu‘ādh ibn Jabal, Ubay ibn Ka‘b, and Zayd ibn Thābit ﷺ) to pass verdicts.<sup>2</sup>

This shows that some of the Muhājirīn as well as some of the senior Anṣār were muftīs and judges. There was no distinction between these two parties, nor preferential treatment. These departments ran with unity and agreement.

### ‘Alī is the Muftī

Sayyidunā ‘Umar al-Fārūq ﷺ clarified this matter during his reign and made many emphatic declarations in this regard. This will be reproduced for the benefit

---

1 *Sunan Sa‘īd ibn Manṣūr*, vol. 2 pg. 132, 133, Majlis ‘Ilmī publication, Dabhel and Karachi; *Kitāb al-Amwāl*, pg. 223 – 224, chapter on allocation of the stipends from the Fay; *al-Sunan al-Kubrā*, vol. 6 pg. 210, chapter on the book of inheritance; *Kanz al-Ummāl*, vol. 2 pg. 314, Ḥadīth: 6487, book of jihād, discussion on sustenance and stipends, first edition, Dakkan.

2 *Ṭabaqāt Ibn Sa’d*, vol. 2 pg. 109, chapter on the scholars and muftīs from the Ṣaḥābah of the Nabī ﷺ, second part, old Leiden print.

of the readers. Wherever the *iftā* or judicial issue comes up, it throws light upon the strong connection and harmonious relationship between those distinguished men.

Six narrations will be transmitted for substantiation:

### First Narration

عن سعيد بن جبیر عن ابن عباس قال خطبنا عمر فقال علي أقضانا و أبي أقرأنا

Saʿīd ibn Jubayr reports that—Ibn ʿAbbās related:

ʿUmar addressed us and stated, “Alī is our best judge and Ubay is our best qāri’.”<sup>1</sup>

### Second Narration

عن عبد الرحمن بن هرمز الأعرج عن أبي هريرة قال قال عمر بن الخطاب علي أقضانا

From ʿAbd al-Raḥmān ibn Hurmuz al-Aʿraj—from Abū Hurayrah who relates that—ʿUmar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb stated:

ʿAlī is the best judge among us.<sup>2</sup>

### Third Narration

عن أبي مليكة عن ابن عباس عن عمر قال أقضانا علي و أقرأنا أبي

From Abū Mulaḥkah—from Ibn ʿAbbās—from ʿUmar who announced:

ʿAlī is our best judge and Ubay is our best qāri’.<sup>3</sup>

---

1 *Ṭabaqāt Ibn Saʿd*, vol. 2 pg. 109, second part, under ʿAlī al-Murtaḍā; *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī*, vol. 2 pg. 644, book on tafsīr, the verse: We do not abrogate any verse ...; Shaykh al-Ṭūsī: *Al-Amālī*, vol. 1 pg. 256, new print, Najaf Ashraf.

2 Ibid.

3 *Al-Istīʿāb*, vol. 3 pg. 41, discussion on ʿAlī al-Murtaḍā, with *al-Iṣābah*.

## Fourth Narration

عن عطاء قال كان عمر يقول علي أفضلنا للقضاء و أبي أقرأنا للقرآن

‘Aṭā’ reports:

‘Umar would declare, “‘Alī is the best judge and Ubay is the best reciter of Qur’ān from us.”<sup>1</sup>

## Fifth Narration

عن شعيب عن إبراهيم النخعي قال لما ولي عمر قال لعلي رضي الله عنهما اقض بين الناس و نجرد للحرب

From Shu‘ayb—from Ibrāhīm al-Nakhaī who reports:

When ‘Umar assumed the post of khalīfah, he told ‘Alī, “Judge between the people and remain detached from matters of war.”<sup>2</sup>

## Sixth Narration

فيها ولي عمر بن الخطاب يوم الثلاثاء لثمان بقين من جمادى الآخرة منها فولى قضاء المدينة علي بن أبي طالب و استناب على الشام أبا عبيدة عامر بن عبد الله بن الجراح الفهري إلخ

In that year (13 A.H.), ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb became khalīfah on Tuesday, with 8 days left of Jumādā al-Ākhirah. He handed over the judicial affairs of Madīnah to ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib and appointed Abū ‘Ubaydah ‘Āmir ibn ‘Abd Allah ibn al-Jarrāh al-Fihri his representative in Shām.<sup>3</sup>

## Summary

1. In the Fārūqī government, there were many Muftīs and judges but according to Sayyidunā ‘Umar, Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ was the best judge

---

1 *Ṭabaqāt Ibn Sa’d*, vol. 2 pg. 102, second part, old print.

2 *Sīrat ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb*, pg. 63, chapter 33, Egypt print.

3 *Al-Bidāyah wa al-Nihāyah*, vol. 7 pg. 31, year 13 A.H.

and had a special rank in the field of iftā and judiciary. In a like manner, Sayyidunā Ubay ibn Ka'b رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ enjoyed a lofty pedestal in the science of qirā'ah.

2. Sayyidunā 'Alī رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ had a special connection to the iftā and judiciary department. Rasūlullāh صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ supplicated in his favour when he despatched him to Yemen

اللهم ثبت لسانه واهد قلبه

O Allah, make his tongue steadfast and inspire his heart with guidance.<sup>1</sup>

3. It has become vividly clear that there existed absolutely no hatred, enmity, animosity, malice, or rancour between Sayyidunā 'Umar and Sayyidunā 'Alī رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ, neither prior to nor after the Fārūqī reign. Otherwise, those whose hearts conceal hatred and whose chests are filled with rancour cannot bear to see each other and do not want to be close to one another. Sitting together becomes difficult for them. The progress and joy of the other is distasteful to them. Here, the relationship is totally opposite. All the tales the Shī'ah and haters of the Ṣaḥābah رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُمْ narrate of enmity and dissension are in total polarity with the above.

Finally, we implore those with sound and fair temperaments to read the above and contemplate deeply, maintaining truth and impartiality, and support what they regard as true. Hopefully, the truth will not be concealed.

### Taking Cases to the Fārūqī Judiciary

We have mentioned above that judiciary matters were taken to Sayyidunā 'Alī رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ and settled by him during the Fārūqī khilāfah. It is as if he acted as the chief judge. When Sayyidunā 'Alī رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ needed to settle a dispute, he would approach Sayyidunā 'Umar رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ and seek judgement from him. Incidents of such a nature are found in the books of ḥadīth. We will present a few of them here.

---

1 *Al-Bidāyah wa al-Nihāyah*, vol. 5 pg. 107, with reference to *Musnad Aḥmad*.

## Case 1

This report is recorded in the *Ṣiḥāḥ Sittah*. (It will be briefly quoted here).

Sayyidunā ‘Abbās ibn ‘Abd al-Muṭṭalib and Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُمَا took their dispute over the wealth of the Banū Naḍīr and the Fay’ to the court of Sayyidunā ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ. (Their dispute was over authority, administration, and supervision.) Sayyidunā ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ told them that he will not divide the properties among them, giving them ownership rights over them. However, the produce will be distributed among them in the manner it was distributed during the lifetime of Rasūlullāh صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ and this will continue. He said to them, “If you are disputing over supervision of those lands, then return them to me, I will supervise and administer them myself. You will continue receiving the produce as per rule.”<sup>1</sup>

## Case 2

This case is documented in *Kitāb al-Āthār* of both Imām Abū Yūsuf and Imām Muḥammad:

عن أبي يوسف عن أبي حنيفة عن حماد عن إبراهيم أن علي بن أبي طالب والزبير بن العوام رضي الله عنهما اختصما إلى عمر رضي الله عنه في مولى لصفية بنت عبد المطلب رضي الله عنها فقال علي أنا عصبة عمتي وأنا أعقل عن مولاها وأرثه ثم قال الزبير أُمِّي وأنا أرث مولاها فقضى عمر رضي الله عنه للزبير بالميراث وقضى بالعقل على علي بن أبي طالب

From Abū Yūsuf—from Abū Ḥanīfah—from Ḥammād—from Ibrāhīm:

‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib and Zubayr ibn al-‘Awwām رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُمَا took their case to ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ regarding (the estate of) the freed-slave of Ṣafīyyah bint ‘Abd al-Muṭṭalib رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ. ‘Alī said, “I am the ‘aṣabah (heir) of my paternal aunt and I am responsible to settle his debts and blood money, hence I will inherit from him.”

---

1 *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī*, vol. 1 pg. 435 – 436; chapter on the share of the khums; *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī*, vol. 2 pg. 806 – 807, chapter on a man keeping sustenance of a year for his family; *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, vol. 2 pg. 81, chapter on the ruling of Fay’.

Zubayr then said, “(Şafiyah is) my mother and I will inherit from her freed slave.”

‘Umar رضي الله عنه passed judgement of the inheritance in favour of Zubayr and decided that ‘Alī will not inherit.”<sup>1</sup>

This incident is documented in *Muṣannaf ‘Abd al-Razzāq* and *Sunan Sa‘īd ibn Maṣṣūr* as follows:

سعيد قال نا أبو معاوية قال نا عبدة الضبي عن إبراهيم قال اختصم علي والزبير إلى عمر في مولى صفة فقال علي مولى عمتي و أنا أعتق عنه و قال الزبير مولى أمي و أنا أرثه فقتضى عمر للزبير بالميراث و قضى على علي بالميراث

Sa‘īd says—Abū Mu‘āwiyah narrated to us saying—Abū ‘Ubaydah al-Ḍabbī narrated to us—from Ibrahim who reports:

‘Alī and Zubayr took their dispute to ‘Umar over Şafiyah’s freed slave. ‘Alī said, “He is the freed slave of my paternal aunt and I am responsible to pay his blood money.”

Zubayr said, “He is the freed slave of my mother and I will inherit from him.”

‘Umar passed judgement of the inheritance in favour of Zubayr and against ‘Alī.<sup>2</sup>

(A ruling is learnt from here that a close heir is given precedence over a distant heir.)

---

1 Imām Abū Yūsuf: *Kitāb al-Āthār*, pg. 170, Ḥadīth: 775, chapter on inheritance, Hyderabad Dakkan print; Imām Muḥammad: *Kitāb al-Āthār*, pg. 120, chapter on the inheritance of freed slaves, Anwār Muḥammadī print, Lucknow.

2 *Muṣannaf ‘Abd al-Razzāq*, vol. 9 pg. 35 – 45, chapter on a woman’s inheritance; *Sunan Sa‘īd ibn Maṣṣūr*, vol. 3 pg. 74, Ḥadīth: 274, section one, chapter on a man being freed and subsequently passing away leaving behind inheritance, Majlis ‘Ilmī Karachi, Dabhel, *Kanz al-Ummāl*, vol. 6 pg. 7, book on inheritance from the section on booty.

## Deductions

1. Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه was the judge and muftī of the people but Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه was his judge. He was the judge of the judges. He assigned passing verdicts of the public to Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه but would himself pass judgment on the disputes of Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه. In this manner, he had established a beautiful system.
2. It is established that Sayyidunā ‘Umar’s رضي الله عنه court was based on justice. That is why Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه would refer to him in times of dispute. Otherwise, he could not refer to a false court when he is practicing on the Qur’ān and Sunnah, nor could he seek judgement from an oppressor and tyrant. (Just as explained in *al-Furū’ min Al-Kāfi*, vol. 3 pg. 225, book on judgements and laws, chapter on the reprehensibility of taking a dispute to tyrannical judges, Lucknow print.)
3. When Sayyidunā ‘Umar’s رضي الله عنه judiciary system was correct, then there remains no doubt in the correctness of his khilāfah.
4. All these narrations and incidents are pronouncing that there existed love, not animosity; compassion, not hatred; and friendship, not enmity between these two righteous men. They enjoyed a pleasant relationship and there existed no unpleasant feelings between them.
5. The ‘narrations’ of mutual enmity and dispute are nothing more than unfounded fabrications. Let the readers make a mental note of this fact.

**NB:** at the end of this section, we would like to mention Sayyidunā ‘Alī’s رضي الله عنه methodology during his khilāfah, which will bring this section to a close.

Let the readers be aware that the buying and selling of an *umm al-walad* (that slave girl who bears children for her master) was considered unlawful by both Sayyidunā ‘Umar and Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه. However, Sayyidunā ‘Alī’s رضي الله عنه view changed afterwards and he then considered it permissible. When he assumed the position of khilāfah, one of his judges ‘Ubaydah al-Salmānī approached him when this case arose and enquired for him what verdict should be passed in such a case.



It was at this time that Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ made the following declaration. This narration appears in *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī*:

عن أيوب عن ابن سيرين عن عبيدة السلماني عن علي قال أقضوا كما تقضون فإني أكره الاختلاف حتى يكون الناس جماعة أو أموت كما مات أصحابي

Ayyūb—from Ibn Sīrīn—from ‘Ubaydah al-Salmānī—from ‘Alī who declared:

Continue passing judgement as you were for I dislike dissent, so that either the people will be united or I will pass away just as my companions passed away (without dissent).

This declaration of Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ is recorded in *Muṣannaf ‘Abd al-Razzāq*<sup>1</sup> as well via his sanad.

## Conclusions

- This declaration is concerning buying and selling of an umm al-walad, not any other issue (as the Shī‘ah are claiming).
- This declaration cannot be the product of Taqiyyah since he is the khalīfah and it is his reign and this is his judge.
- These men had pure souls, clean hearts, and sound temperaments. They were exonerated from dissent, fanaticism, and doggedness.
- Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ was not ashamed from retracting any of his verdicts. He did not take it as distasteful.
- Those men maintained unity to the best of their ability at every juncture. They loathed discord and despised the spread of conflict.
- Just as my companions (Abū Bakr, ‘Umar, and ‘Uthmān رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُمْ) passed away. These words are a strong support to back the theme under discussion. These

---

<sup>1</sup> *Muṣannaf ‘Abd al-Razzāq*, vol. 11 pg. 329.

religious seniors appreciated and respected the verdicts and judgements of each other. They understood it reprehensible to pass contradictory verdicts. They were compassionate and loving to each other. They were not enemies and opposition to each other.

- In the face of such glaring realities, the claim that Sayyidunā ‘Alī عليه السلام responded in this manner only to avoid clashes and anarchy is incorrect. Sayyidunā ‘Alī’s عليه السلام external and internal were not different. His tongue and heart could not be in conflict. He was not two faced and hypocritical. The truth is that the lion of Allah, Sayyidunā ‘Alī’s bravery, truthfulness, and honesty are in contrast with this. His statements and actions are totally correct. They are not the product of two-facedness.

## Section Two: Consultation in Sharī Rulings

Academic discussions were regularly held between Sayyidunā ‘Umar and Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه wherein they would enquire about various religious rulings from each other. Since Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه was the judge during the khilāfah, many rulings were referred to him for verdict. Moreover, Sayyidunā ‘Umar al-Fārūq رضي الله عنه would consult with the senior Ṣaḥābah رضي الله عنهم when faced with new laws. On many occasions, he deemed Sayyidunā ‘Alī’s رضي الله عنه opinion correct and ruled that it should be implemented. We will now present some reports from ḥadīth compilations to have a glimpse at this.

Our goal is not to encompass all the academic discussions they had. Rather, we wish to present a few of them from which it will be easy realised that these religious leaders were like honey and sugar. We will also come to learn of the level of their mutual respect and how they ran the khilāfah with unity in religious matters. It will also be understood that there was no ill feelings between them. They were living examples of the verse:

إِنَّمَا الْمُؤْمِنُونَ إِخْوَةٌ

*The believers are but brothers.*<sup>1</sup>

And the following verse aptly applied to them:

وَأَمْرُهُمْ شُورَىٰ بَيْنَهُمْ

*And whose affair is [determined by] consultation among themselves.*<sup>2</sup>

Before commencing with the incidents, I will like to mention that during these dialogues, we will find words of benevolence and goodwill from Sayyidunā

---

1 Sūrah al-Ḥujurāt: 10.

2 Sūrah al-Shūrā: 38.

‘Alī’s side for Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه. The Shī‘ī scholars have recorded this. This demonstrates their academic connections coupled with compassion and well-wishing.

## Academic Dialogue

Abū Nu‘aym al-Aṣḥbahānī reports the following discussion in *Ḥilyat al-Awliyā’*:

عن سالم بن عبد الله بن عمر عن أبيه قال قال عمر بن الخطاب لعلي بن أبي طالب رضي الله عنهما ربما شهدت وغبنا وربما غبت وشهدنا فهل عندك علم بالرجل يحدث بالحديث إذا نسيه استذكره فقال علي سمعت رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم يقول ما من القلوب قلب إلا وله سحابة كسحابة القمر بينما القمر مضيئ إذ علتة سحابة فأظلم إذ تجلت عنه فأضاء وبينما الرجل يحدث إذ علتة سحابة فنسي إذ تجلت عنه فذكره

From Sālim ibn ‘Abd Allah ibn ‘Umar—from his father who reports that—‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb said to ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib رضي الله عنه:

“Sometimes you were present (in the gathering of Rasūlullāh صلى الله عليه وسلم) and we were absent and you were absent and we were present. So do you have any knowledge of a man who possessed some knowledge but subsequently forgot it only to remember it later?”

‘Alī said, “I heard Rasūlullāh صلى الله عليه وسلم saying, ‘Every heart has a cloud, like the cloud covering the moon. The moon is shining bright when suddenly a cloud covers it and darkness spreads. But when it moves away, it illuminates (the sky) again. Sometimes a person speaks and forgets when his mind is clouded. But when it disappears, he remembers.’”<sup>1</sup>

## Words of Benevolence

Shī‘ī scholars have reported the following narration wherein Sayyidunā ‘Alī gives three pieces of advice to Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه:

---

1 *Ḥilyat al-Awliyā’*, vol. 2 pg. 196, discussion on Sālim ibn ‘Abd Allah.

قال أبو عبد الله عليه السلام قال أمير المؤمنين عليه السلام لعمر بن الخطاب ثلاث إن حفظتهن وعملت  
بهن كفتك ما سواهن فإن تركتهن لم ينفعك شيء سواهن قال وما هن يا أبا الحسن قال إقامة الحدود على  
القريب والبعيد والحكم بكتاب الله في الرضا والسخط والتقسيم بالعدل بين الأسود والأحمر فقال له  
عمر لعمرى لقد أوجزت وأبلغت

Abū ‘Abd Allah ﷺ narrated:

Amīr al-Mu‘minīn ﷺ said to ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb, “If you remember three pieces of advice and practice upon them, it will suffice you from all others. However, if you abandon them, nothing besides them will benefit you.”

“And what are they, ‘Umar enquired eagerly, “O Abū al-Ḥasan?”

‘Alī said, “Implementation of prescribed punishments on the close and distant (in relation); judging according to the Book of Allah in happiness and anger; and distributing equally between the dark-skinned and fair-skinned.”

‘Umar congratulated him thus, “By my life, you have summed it up in a nutshell most eloquently.”<sup>1</sup>

## Consultation in Religious Issues

Some rulings will be listed below over which Sayyidunā ‘Umar and Sayyidunā ‘Alī ﷺ held mutual consultation at different junctures and the former practiced upon the latter’s opinion. These incidents attest to the mutual love, friendship, and benevolence these pious giants shared and are clear confirmations of our core discussion. Eyes of insight are needed.

### 1. Ṣadaqah

Imām Aḥmad records this incident of the people of Shām in his *al-Musnad*:

---

1 *Tārīkh Ya‘qūbī*, vol. 2 pg. 208, discussion on the times of ‘Umar, new Beirut print; Shaykh al-Ṭūsī: *Tahdhīb al-Aḥkām*, vol. 2 pg. 71, book on judiciary, chapter on the etiquette of the governors, old Iran print; Ibn Shahaṛāshūb: *al-Manāqib*, vol. 2 pg. 120, section regarding his success in resoluteness and abandonment of hypocrisy, dissimulation.

عن سفیان عن أبي إسحاق عن حارثة قال جاء ناس من أهل الشام إلى عمر فقالوا إنا قد أصبنا أموالا و خيلا و رقيقا نحب أن يكون لنا فيها زكوة و طهور قال ما فعله صاحبنا قبلي فأفعله و استشار أصحاب محمد صلى الله عليه و سلم و فيهم علي (ابن أبي طالب) فقال علي هو حسن إن لم يكن جزية راتبه يؤخذون بها من بعدك

From Sufyān—from Abū Ishāq—from Ḥārithah who reports:

Some people from Shām came to ‘Umar and submitted, “We have obtained much wealth, horses, and slaves. We desire to fulfil our zakāh from there, which will be a means of purification.”

‘Umar said, “I will do just as my two friends (Rasūlullāh ﷺ and Sayyidunā Abū Bakr (رضي الله عنه)) did before me.”

Subsequently, he consulted with the Ṣaḥābah of Rasūlullāh ﷺ, and ‘Alī was among them. ‘Alī said, “It is alright on condition that it is not a recurring tax that will be taken from them after you.”<sup>1</sup>

## 2. Dīyah (Blood money)

This narration appears in *Kanz al-‘Ummāl* and is referenced to *Muṣannaḥ ‘Abd al-Razzāq*:

عن حبي بن يعلى بن يعلى يخبر أن رجلا أتى يعلى فقال هذا قاتل أخي فدفعه إليه فجدعه بالسيف حتى رأى أنه قتله و به رمق فأخذه أهله فداووه حتى برئ فجاء يعلى فقال قاتل أخي فقال أو ليس فد دفعته إليك فأخبره خبره فدعاه يعلى فإذا هو قد شلل فحسب جروحه فوجد فيه الدية فقال له يعلى إن شئت فادفع إليه ديتيه و اقتله و إلا فدعه فليحقه بعمر فاستعدى على يعلى فكتب عمر إلى يعلى أن أقدم علي فقدم عليه فأخبره الخبر فاستشار عمر علي ابن أبي طالب فأشار عليه بما قضى به يعلى فاتفق علي و عمر على قضاء يعلى أن يدفع إليه الدية و يقتله أو يدعه فلا يقتله و قال عمر ليعلى إنك لقاض و رده على عمله

Ḥibbī ibn Ya’lā updates that a man approached Ya’lā and said, “This is my brother’s murderer.”

1 *Musnad Ahmad*, vol. 1 pg. 14, masānid ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb, with selections of *Kanz*, Egypt print; al-Dāraquṭnī: *al-Sunan*, vol. 1 pg. 219, chapter on encouragement to take out charity, Anṣārī print, Delhi; *Sharḥ Ma’ānī al-Āthār*, vol. 1 pg. 310, book on zakāh, chapter on horses.

Consequently, Ya'ālā handed the criminal over to the bereaved who amputated his limb with a sword and thought that he had killed him. Meanwhile there were still sparks of life in him so his family took him and treated him until he recovered. The person came back to Ya'ālā and said, "This is my brother's murderer."

Ya'ālā told him, "But did I not hand him over to you?"

The person explained what had happened. Subsequently, Ya'ālā summoned the man. His limb had become paralysed. So his wound was examined and evaluated and it was realised that it amounted to a penalty of blood money. So Ya'ālā said to the man, "If you wish, give him his blood money and kill him. Otherwise, leave him."

The man went to 'Umar and appealed for assistance against Ya'ālā so 'Umar wrote to Ya'ālā to come to him. Accordingly, he came and related the entire incident. 'Umar then consulted 'Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib who gave him the same verdict Ya'ālā gave. So 'Alī and 'Umar were unanimous on Ya'ālā's decision to give him blood money and kill him or spare his life.

'Umar then commended Ya'ālā, "You are definitely a worthy judge," and restored him to his post.<sup>1</sup>

### 3. A Compelled Woman

عن الأعمش عن سعد بن عبادة عن أبي عبد الرحمن السلمي قال أتني عمر بن الخطاب بامرأة جهدها العطش فمرت على راع فاستسقت فأبى أن يسقيها إلا أن تمكنه من نفسها ففعلت فشاور الناس في رجمها فقال علي رضي الله عنه هذه مضطرة أرى أن تخلي سبيلها ففعل

Al-A'mash—from Sa'd ibn 'Ubādah—from Abū 'Abd al-Raḥmān al-Sulamī who said:

A woman's case was brought before 'Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb. She was extremely thirsty and passed by a shepherd and begged him for water. He refused to give her water except if she allows him access to herself. Due to desperation, she acceded. People consulted regarding whether she should

---

1 *Muṣannaf 'Abd al-Razzāq*, vol. 9 pg. 432; *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, vol. 7 pg. 300, Ḥadīth: 3481, first edition.

be stoned or not. ‘Alī said, “She is *muḍṭarrah* (compelled). I feel that she should be released.” And ‘Umar did just that.<sup>1</sup>

This incident is also recorded by Sa‘īd ibn Manṣūr al-Makkī al-Khurāsānī<sup>2</sup> and ‘Abd al-Razzāq<sup>3</sup>.

#### 4. Homosexuality

The Shī‘ī scholars have documented this incident in the book of punishments in the chapter of punishment for homosexuality. The following wording is taken from *al-Furū‘ min Al-Kāfī* of Muḥammad ibn Ya‘qūb al-Kulaynī al-Rāzī:

قال سمعت أبا عبد الله عليه السلام يقول وجد رجل مع رجل في إمارة عمر فهرب أحدهما وأخذ الآخر فجيء به إلى عمر فقال للناس ما ترون قال فقال هذا اصنع كذا وقال هذا اصنع كذا قال فقال ما تقول يا أبا الحسن قال اضرب عنقه فضرب عنقه قال ثم أراده أن يحمله فقال مه أنه قد بقي من حدوده شيء قال أي شيء بقي قال ادع بحطب قال فدعا عمر بحطب فأمر به أمير المؤمنين عليه السلام فأحرقه به

I heard Abū ‘Abd Allah عليه السلام reporting:

A man was found (committing immorality) with another man during the reign of ‘Umar. One of them fled while the other was seized and brought to ‘Umar. ‘Umar asked the Ṣaḥābah, “What are your views?”

Some said do this and others said do that. ‘Umar then said, “What do you say O Abū al-Ḥasan?”

‘Alī responded, “Execute him.”

Accordingly, he was executed. They wanted to carry him away (to bury him) but ‘Alī interrupted saying, “Wait, one segment of his punishment is outstanding?”

“And what remains,” ‘Umar enquired.

---

1 Al-Bayhaqī: *al-Sunan al-Kubrā*, vol. 8 pg. 236, book on punishments, chapter on one who fornicates with a coerced woman.

2 *Sunan Sa‘īd ibn Manṣūr*, vol. 2 pg. 72.

3 *Muṣannaf ‘Abd al-Razzāq*, vol. 4 pg. 108.



He explained, “Call for firewood.”

Accordingly ‘Umar called for firewood. Amīr al-Mu‘minīn ordered that he be incinerated and so he was.<sup>1</sup>

## 5. Punishment for Consuming Alcohol

عن ابن وبرة قال أرسلني خالد بن الوليد إلى عمر فأتيته و معه عثمان بن عفان و عبد الرحمن بن عوف و علي و طلحة و الزبير و هم معه متكئون في المسجد فقلت أن خالد بن الوليد أرسلني إليك و هو يقرأ عليك السلام و يقول إن الناس قد انهمكوا في الخمر و تحاقروا العقوبة فيه فقال عمر هم هؤلاء عندك فسلهم فقال علي نراه إذا سكر هذى و إذا هذى افترى و علي المفترى ثمانين فقال أبلغ صاحبك ما قال قال فجلد خالد ثمانين جلدة و جلد عمر ثمانين

Ibn Wabarah reports:

Khālīd ibn al-Walīd sent me to ‘Umar. I came to him while ‘Uthmān ibn ‘Affān, ‘Abd al-Raḥmān ibn ‘Awf, ‘Alī, Ṭalḥah, and Zubayr were in his company, reclining in the Masjid. I submitted, “Khālīd ibn al-Walīd sent me to you. He conveyed his salām to you and said that people are entrapped in consuming wine and are trivialising its penalty.”

‘Umar said, “Ask these men around you.”

‘Alī suggested, “I feel that when a person is intoxicated he blabbers, and when he blabbers he slanders. And a slanderer is given eighty lashes.”

‘Umar said, “Relay what he said to your leader.”

The narrator says, “So Khalid gave eighty lashes and so did ‘Umar.”<sup>2</sup>

---

1 *Al-Furū‘ min Al-Kāfi*, vol. 3 pg. 109, book on ḥudūd, chapter on the ḥadd of homosexuality, Lucknow print; Shaykh al-Ṭūsī: *al-Istibṣār*, vol. 2 pg. 306, book on ḥudūd, chapter on the ḥadd of homosexuality, Lucknow print.

2 *Sunan al-Dāraqūṭnī*, vol. 2 pg. 354 – 358, with al-Mughnī’s footnotes, under the discussion on ḥudūd, Delhi print; *al-Mustadrak*, vol. 4 pg. 375, book on ḥudūd, Hyderabad print, Dakkan; *Muwaṭṭa’ Mālik*, pg. 357, the narrations concerning the ḥadd of consuming alcohol, Delhi print; *Sharḥ Ma’ānī al-Āthār*, vol. 2 pg. 88, book on ḥudūd, Delhi print; *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, vol. 3 pg. 100, 101, 104, book on ḥudūd, ḥadd of alcohol, with reference to Ibn Jarīr, al-Bayhaqī, ‘Abd al-Razzāq, etc., first edition, *Dā‘irat al-Ma‘ārif*, Hyderabad Dakkan; *Muṣannaf ‘Abd al-Razzāq*, vol. 7 pg. 378, ḥadd of alcohol, Beirut print.

## 6. Stealing

A thief stole for a third time, so Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه consulted with the Ṣaḥābah رضي الله عنهم. He agreed with Sayyidunā ‘Alī’s رضي الله عنه view, i.e. the thief should be imprisoned for life. A portion of the text is quoted here from ‘Alā’ al-Dīn ibn Turkamānī’s *al-Jawhar al-Naqī ‘alā Sunan al-Bayhaqī*:

إن عمر استشارهم في سارق فأجمعوا على مثل قول علي

‘Umar consulted them regarding a thief and they unanimously agreed on ‘Alī’s view.<sup>1</sup>

### Note:

The Shī‘ī scholars have also mentioned that initially the punishment for consuming alcohol was minor but ...

ثم لم يزل الناس يزيدون حتى وقف على ثمانين أشار بذلك علي على عمر فرضي بها

The people continued increasing until he stopped at eighty. ‘Alī forwarded this opinion to ‘Umar and the latter was happy with it.<sup>2</sup>

This narration is found in other Shī‘ī books besides *al-Furū‘ min Al-Kāfī*. We thought this reference would be sufficient for corroboration.

### Deductions of this Section

1. Academic discussions were held between Amīr al-Mu‘minīn Sayyidunā ‘Umar and Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه. They awarded one another words of advice and benevolence.

---

1 *Al-Jawhar al-Naqī ‘alā Sunan al-Bayhaqī*, vol. 8 pg. 275.

2 *Al-Furū‘ min Al-Kāfī*, vol. 3 pg. 117, chapter the mandatory ḥadd of drinking, Nawl Kashawr print, Lucknow.

2. Consultations were held at times to decide rulings and the unanimous view was implemented. Just as the believers' quality is mentioned in the Qur'ān:

وَأَمْرُهُمْ شُورَىٰ بَيْنَهُمْ

*And whose affair is [determined by] consultation among themselves<sup>1</sup>*

They are the full focus of this verse.

All these narrations are evidence that there existed compassion, love, and affection between these religious seniors and elders of the ummah. Disputes, hatred, and enmity were totally non-existent.

### Removing a Misconception and a Caution

When incidents of the academic discussion between Sayyidunā 'Umar and Sayyidunā 'Alī رضي الله عنه wherein they would share ideas and discuss rulings are mentioned, those who oppose the Ṣaḥābah رضي الله عنهم attribute all this to Sayyidunā 'Umar's رضي الله عنه ignorance and propagates the false ideology that he was unaware and unqualified in the academic field. All this is in contrast to reality and is the product of wayward understanding.

Those who happened to read their books are fully aware of this methodology of theirs. They have dedicated chapters and sections for the criticism against al-Fārūq رضي الله عنه. They establish Sayyidunā 'Alī's academic prowess over Sayyidunā 'Umar رضي الله عنه and begin this discussion.

Study *Falak al-Najāt* (vol. 1 chapter 4) and *Ā'īnah Madh-hab Sunnī*, etc. and then hopefully these assertions will be attested to. These books are authored by the Shī'ah of Jhang district.

---

1 Sūrah al-Shūrā: 38.

To remove doubts and misgivings from the objectors and to give them solace and comfort, some rulings and incidents will be cited wherein Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه himself expresses his unawareness at some junctures, at some instances other Ṣaḥābah’s رضي الله عنهم stance besides his was correct and his action was incorrect as established by his own acknowledgement, and sometimes he had a view and practiced upon it deeming it accurate but later changed his view and retracted from his initial view and followed the opinion of other Ṣaḥābah رضي الله عنهم, yet never felt any restriction or complication. Snippets from various references will be cited now. Kindly study them carefully:

### First Report

This is the statement of Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه recorded in *Nahj al-Balāghah*:

فلا تكفوا عن مقالة بحق أو مشورة بعدل فإني لست في نفسي بفوق أن أخطئ ولا آمن ذلك من فعلي إلا أن يكفي الله من نفسي ما هو أملك به مني

Do not desist from speaking the truth or advising justice because I do not consider myself above error nor do I feel safe from committing mistakes except that Allah protects me from myself, which He has greater ownership over than myself.<sup>1</sup>

### Second Report

It is reported from Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه in *Kanz al-‘Ummāl* with reference to Ibn Jarīr and Ibn ‘Abd al-Barr:

عن محمد بن كعب قال سألت رجلاً علياً عن مسألة فقال فيها فقال الرجل ليس هكذا ولكن كذا وكذا قال أصبت وأخطأت وفوق كل ذي علم عليم

Muḥammad ibn Ka‘b reports:

A man asked ‘Alī about a ruling and he answered.

---

<sup>1</sup> *Nahj al-Balāghah*, vol. 1 pg. 436, his sermon at Ṣiffīn.

So the man said, “It is not like this. Rather it is like this.”

‘Alī confessed, “You are right and I was wrong. And above every person of knowledge is one more knowledgeable.”<sup>1</sup>

### Third Report

عن ربيعة بن دراج أن عليا صلى بعد العصر ركعتين فتغيظ عليه عمر و قال أما علمت أن رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم كان ينهانا عنها

Rabī‘ah ibn Darrāj narrates that ‘Alī performed two units of ṣalāh after ‘Aṣr (en route to Makkah). ‘Umar got upset with him and shouted, “Are you not aware that Rasūlullāh ﷺ would forbid us from this?”<sup>2</sup>

### Fourth Report

عن عكرمة أن عليا حرق قوما ارتدوا من الإسلام فبلغ ذلك ابن عباس فقال لو كنت أنا لقتلتهم بقول رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم من بدل دينه فاقتلوه و لم أكن لأحرقهم لأن رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم قال لا تعذبوا بعذاب الله فبلغ ذلك عليا فقال صدق ابن عباس هذا حديث حسن صحيح

‘Ikrimah recalls:

‘Alī burnt a tribe that apostatised from Islam. When news of this reached Ibn ‘Abbās, he commented, “Had I been in authority, I would have executed them as per the command of Rasūlullāh ﷺ, he ordered, ‘Whoever changes his religion, kill him.’ I would not have burnt them since Rasūlullāh ﷺ forbade, ‘Do not punish with Allah’s punishment.’”

This reached ‘Alī who acknowledged, “Ibn ‘Abbās spoke the truth.”

This ḥadīth is ḥasan ṣaḥīḥ.<sup>3</sup>

---

1 *Kanz al-Ummāl*, vol. 5 pg. 241, regarding the etiquette of knowledge and the ‘Ulamā’, first edition.

2 *Muṣannaf ‘Abd al-Razzāq*, vol. 2 pg. 430; *Musnad Aḥmad*, vol. 1 pg. 17, musnadāt ‘Umar, with selection of *Kanz*.

3 *Jāmi‘ al-Tirmidhī*, pg. 230, 176, chapters on ḥudūd, the narrations concerning the ḥadd for a murtad, *Mujtabā’ī* print, Delhi; *Musnad Ḥumaydī*, vol. 1 pg. 244 – 245, Ḥadīth: 533.

There are many such rulings concerning which Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه changed his opinion, e.g.

- Selling *ummahāt al-awlād* (slave girls who bear children for their masters). Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه would prohibit their sale while on the other hand Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه would allow the same. The latter’s judge ‘Ubaydah al-Salmānī submitted that we prefer the unanimous view (which is the view of Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه) over your individual view. Accordingly, the judge continued passing judgement according to Sayyidunā ‘Umar’s view in the khilāfah of Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه and ‘Alī abandoned his own view telling the judge, “Continue passing judgement as you were.”<sup>1</sup>
- In inheritance, in the case when the deceased is survived by the paternal grandfather and brothers, Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه would give a third to the grandfather. He later retracted from this view and opted for the view of other Ṣaḥābah رضي الله عنهم of a sixth.<sup>2</sup>
- During the lifetime of Rasūlullāh صلى الله عليه وسلم, Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه thought about marrying Abū Jahl’s daughter. Rasūlullāh صلى الله عليه وسلم became extremely angry at this, so he discarded this thought.<sup>3</sup>

There are numerous stories of such a nature recorded in the books. These few incidents have been presented for the sound-minded to ponder over. After an unbiased study of the above it will become manifest that expressing one’s unawareness of a certain issue, erring, abandoning one’s research and opting for another’s, etc., is not a defect or shortcoming nor befitting of censure. If it is, then it is found on both sides. And if it is not a defect and cause of objection, then too it is on both sides. If only a little impartiality is observed, the issue will become clear and there will be no need for any questions or answers.

---

1 *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī*, vol. 1 pg. 526, chapter on ‘Alī’s virtues; Qāḍī ‘Abd al-Jabbār al-Mu’tazilī: *Kitāb al-Mughnī*, pg. 18; Ibn Taymiyyah al-Ḥarrānī: *Minhāj al-Sunnah*, vol. 3 pg. 156.

2 *Kitāb al-Mughnī*, pg. 18; *Minhāj al-Sunnah*, vol. 3 pg. 156.

3 *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī*, vol. 1 pg. 438, book on jihād, the chapter concerning the armour, staff, and sword of Rasūlullāh صلى الله عليه وسلم, Nūr Muḥammadī print, Delhi; *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī*, vol. 1 pg. 528, book on virtues, chapter on mention of the son-in-laws of the Nabī صلى الله عليه وسلم, Nūr Muḥammadī print, Delhi.

## Caution

It is befitting to clarify that Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه maintained the rulings determined in the khilāfah of Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه in his own reign. He did not follow another path. He neither invented new rules of governance, nor did he begin a new methodology, nor did he alter the administrative affairs. Rather, he continued following the Fārūqī pattern and judgements and established his state in the light of these regulations and laws. The senior ‘Ulamā’ of the ummah have clearly documented this in their books.

‘Allāmah Zayn al-Dīn Abū al-Farj ‘Abd al-Raḥmān ibn Shihāb al-Dīn Ibn Rajab al-Ḥambalī al-Baghdādī (from the eighth century) writes in his book *Jāmi‘ al-‘Ulūm wa al-Ḥikam fī Sharḥ Khamsīn Ḥadīthan*:

و كان علي رضي الله عنه يتبع قضاياه و أحكامه و يقول أن عمر كان رشيد الأمر

‘Alī رضي الله عنه would follow his (‘Umar’s) judgments and verdicts and would say, “Certainly, ‘Umar was *rashīd al-amr* (guided in his verdicts).”<sup>1</sup>

A few aḥādīth were mentioned before in this volume in chapter one, section two, under theme four which support and substantiate the above. They will be briefly quoted here to refresh the memory.

1. Sharīk reports from Zubayd—and this is the statement of Sayyidunā Zayd رضي الله عنه as well:

إن عليا كان يشبه بعمر في السيرة

‘Alī resembled ‘Umar in *sīrah* (administration of state).<sup>2</sup>

2. Abū Ja‘far Muḥammad Bāqir رحمه الله emphatically states:

---

1 *Jāmi‘ al-‘Ulūm wa al-Ḥikam*, pg. 250, fourth edition.

2 Yaḥyā ibn Ādam: *Kitāb al-Kharāj*, pg. 24, Egypt print; *al-Riyāḍ al-Naḍīrah*, vol. 2 pg. 85, section on the reports of ‘Alī on ‘Umar’s virtues.

سلك علي بالخمس طريقيهما

‘Alī followed their (Abū Bakr and ‘Umar) methodology in the *khums*.<sup>1</sup>

سلك به والله سبيل أبي بكر و عمر

By Allah, he followed the path of Abū Bakr and ‘Umar in its regard.”<sup>2</sup>

3. Sayyidunā Ḥasan ibn ‘Alī declared:

لا أعلم عليا خالف عمر و لا غير شيئا مما صنع حين قدم الكوفة

I do not know of ‘Alī opposing ‘Umar or changing anything he did from the time he arrived in Kūfah.<sup>3</sup>

4. It is reported from Sayyidunā ‘Alī’s رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ reliable student ‘Abd Khayr:

عن عبد خير سمع عليا يقول إن عمر كان موقفا رشيدا في الأمور والله لا أغير شيئا صنعه عمر

‘Abd Khayr heard ‘Alī affirming:

Certainly, ‘Umar was inspired and rightly guided in matters (of the state).  
By Allah, I will not alter anything ‘Umar instated.<sup>4</sup>

5. The statement of ‘Allāmah Sha‘bī:

قال علي حين قدم الكوفة ما كنت لأحل عقدة شدها عمر

‘Alī announced when he arrived in Kūfah:

I will not open any knot tied by ‘Umar.<sup>5</sup> (I will not change anything ‘Umar passed.)

1 *Muṣannaf ‘Abd al-Razzāq*, vol. 5 pg. 237, chapter on *khums*.

2 *Sharḥ Ma‘ānī al-Āthār*, vol. 2 pg. 135, chapter on the share of the Dhawī al-Qurbā, Delhi print.

3 *Al-Riyāḍ al-Naḍīrah*, vol. 2 pg. 85, section on the reports of ‘Alī on ‘Umar’s virtues.

4 *Al-Tārīkh al-Kabīr*, vol. 4 pg. 145, Dakkan print; *Kitāb al-Kharāj*, pg. 23, Egypt print.

5 *Kitāb al-Kharāj*, pg. 24, Egypt print; *Kitāb al-Amwāl*, pg. 232, Ḥadīth: 848, Egypt print; *Muṣannaf Ibn Abī Shaybah*, vol. 12 pg. 33, book of virtues, the virtues of ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ, Karachi Print.



## Summary

This is just a glimpse at some of the narrations and incidents for the benefit of those who love the truth. There are many such incidents and transmissions of this nature found in the books. These reports have proved beyond doubt that:

- Sayyidunā ‘Alī ibn Ṭālib رضي الله عنه established the Fārūqī governmental system in his khilāfah and took great care to follow the verdicts and judgements passed in the Fārūqī era.
- There was complete harmony between the sīrah of Sayyidunā ‘Alī and Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنهما.
- The matters that were founded in the Fārūqī state, Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه maintained them to the tee and never made the slightest change in them. This by itself proves the correctness of the Fārūqī khilāfah and also depicts the love and unity these illustrious seniors shared.

## Section Three

Incidents will be mentioned here which speak about the mutual consultation between Sayyidunā ‘Umar and Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه regarding administrative affairs of the state and the former’s approval of the latter’s views and their subsequent implementation. Moreover, those narrations will be reproduced which prove that Sayyidunā ‘Umar appointed Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه as his representative on many occasions. Instances of compassion will also be relayed. Incidents of such a nature are numerous, but we present a few here as samples. Every man with sense will realise the relationship these two men shared after studying these incidents.

### Consultation regarding Administrative Matters

#### 1. Fārūqī Allowance

When Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه was appointed Amīr al-Mu’minīn, his previous business came to an end. The Ṣaḥābah held a consultation regarding his allowance. This incident is documented in *Ṭabaqāt Ibn Sa’d* and *Tārīkh al-Ṭabarī*:

عن أبي أمامة بن سهل قال ... وأرسل إلى أصحاب رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم فاستشارهم فقال قد شغلت نفسي في هذا الأمر فما يصلح لي منه فقال عثمان بن عفان كل وأطعم قال وقال ذلك سعيد بن زيد بن عمرو بن نفيل وقال لعلي ما تقول أنت في ذلك قال غداء وعشاء قال فأخذ عمر بذلك

Abū Umāmah ibn Sahl reported:

He sent for the Companions of Rasūlullāh صلى الله عليه وسلم and consulted with them. He said, “I am occupied in this matter (of khilāfah). So what is permissible for me from the treasury?”

‘Uthmān ibn ‘Affān said, “Eat and feed.” Sa’īd ibn Zayd ibn ‘Amr ibn Nufayl gave the same opinion.

He said to ‘Alī, “What do you feel about this matter?”

He replied, “Breakfast and supper.”

‘Umar practiced upon this.<sup>1</sup>

عن ابن عمر فقال إن كنت امرأ تاجرا يغني الله عيالي بتجارتني و قد شغلتموني بأمركم فما ذا ترون أنه يحل لي من هذا المال فأكثر القوم و علي ساكت فقال ما تقول يا علي فقال ما أصلحك و أصلح عيالك بالمعروف ليس لك من هذا المال غيره فقال القوم القول قول علي بن أبي طالب

Ibn ‘Umar reports:

‘Umar said, “I was a businessman. Allah made my dependents independent by means of my business. Now, you have occupied me with your affair (of khilāfah). What do you feel is permissible for me from this wealth?”

People began submitting many opinions but ‘Alī remained silent. ‘Umar asked, “What do you say, O ‘Alī?”

He replied, “What is sufficient for you and your dependents, with moderation. Nothing else besides this wealth is permissible for you.”

The people agreed, “‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib’s view is correct.”<sup>2</sup>

The ‘Ulamā’ elucidate that Sayyidunā ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ would get allowance for food from the public treasury and two garments to wear, one in summer and one in winter. For travel purposes, a camel would be arranged for him and he would be given a servant. This was all the benefits the Khalīfah of Islam received from the Muslims.

## 2. Islamic Calendar

The Gregorian calendar is calculated from the birth of Sayyidunā ‘Isā عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ. During the reign of Sayyidunā ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ, he consulted the Muhājirīn and others regarding from when should the Islamic calendar commence. Different people

---

1 *Ṭabaqāt Ibn Sa’d*, vol. 3 pg. 221, chapter on ‘Umar, Leiden print, Europe.

2 *Tārīkh al-Umam wa al-Mulūk*, vol. 4 pg. 164, year 15, old Egypt print; *Sīrat ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb*, pg. 89 – 90, Egypt print.

gave various ideas. Imām al-Bukhārī has documented this occurrence in *al-Tārīkh al-Ṣaghīr* and *Al-Tārīkh al-Kabīr*:

عن عثمان بن رافع قال سمعت سعيد بن المسيب يقول قال عمر رضي الله عنه متى نكتب التاريخ فجمع المهاجرين فقال له علي من يوم هاجر النبي صلى الله عليه و سلم إلى المدينة فكتب التاريخ

‘Uthmān ibn Rāfi‘ reports that he heard Sa‘īd ibn al-Musayyab saying:

‘Umar enquired, “From when should we start the calendar.”

He gathered the Muhājirīn for this purpose. ‘Alī said to him, “From the day the Nabī ﷺ emigrated to Madīnah.”

Accordingly, he began the calendar from then.<sup>1</sup>

Ḥāfiẓ Ibn Kathīr included more detail to the incident:

قال قائلون أرخوا من مولد رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم و قال آخرون من مبعثه عليه السلام و أشار علي رضي الله عنه و آخرون أن يورخ من هجرته من مكة إلى المدينة لظهوره لكل أحد فإنه أظهر من المولد و المبعث فاستحسن ذلك عمر و الصحابة فأمر عمر أن يورخ من هجرة رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم و أرخوا من أول تلك السنة من محرما

Some people said, “Start the calendar from the birth of Rasūlullāh ﷺ.”

Others suggested, “From his appointment (as Nabī).”

‘Alī ﷺ and others proposed that it commence from his hijrah from Makkah to Madīnah due to everyone’s familiarity with it and that it is more famous than the birth and appointment.

‘Umar and the Ṣaḥābah favoured this view. Accordingly, ‘Umar commanded that the calendar be launched from Rasūlullāh’s ﷺ hijrah and they began from Muḥarram the starting of that year.<sup>2</sup>

---

1 *Al-Tārīkh al-Ṣaghīr*, pg. 9, Anwār Muḥammadī print, Ilahabad, India; *Al-Tārīkh al-Kabīr*, vol. 1 pg. 9, Hyderabad print, Dakkan; *al-Mustadrak*, vol. 3 pg. 14, book on hijrah, Hyderabad print, Dakkan; *Sīrat ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb*, pg. 51, Egypt print.

2 *Al-Bidāyah*, vol. 7 pg. 74, Egypt print.

The ‘Ulamā have written that the Islamic calendar was introduced just two and a half years into the Fārūqī khilāfah in the month of Muḥarram.<sup>1</sup>

### 3. The Jizyah of al-Jazīrah

A conquest dubbed the Conquest of al-Jazīrah took place in the year 17 A.H. The residents of that area were ethnically Christian. Sayyidunā Sa’d ibn Abī Waqqāṣ رضي الله عنه sent a delegation of their leaders to Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه in Madīnah Munawwarah so they may come to a decision regarding their Jizyah, etc. The delegation arrived in Madīnah and spoke to Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه. They suggested:

فخذ منا شيئاً ولا تسميه جزية فقال إنا نحن فنسميه جزية و أما أنتم فسموه ما شئتم فقال له علي بن أبي طالب ألم يضعف عليهم سعد الصدقة قال بلى و أصغى إليه و رضي به منهم جزء (جزية)

“Take something from us but do not call it *Jizyah* (tax).”

‘Umar said, “We will call it *Jizyah* and you may call it what you want to.”

‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib said to him, “Did Sa’d not double the ṣadaqah upon them already.”

He said, “Definitely.”

He considered what ‘Alī said and became pleased with it as a substitute (term) for the *Jizyah*.<sup>2</sup>

### 4. The Conquered Land of Iraq

When the Muslims conquered Iraq, a special consultation was held to discuss what to do with the lush and fertile lands of the area and the farmers. This consultation has been documented by the muḥaddithīn and Fuqahā’:

---

1 *Sīrat ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb*, pg. 51.

2 *Tārīkh al-Ṭabarī*, vol. 4 pg. 198, conquest of al-Jazīrah, 17 A.H.; *al-Bidāyah*, vol. 7 pg. 76, discussion on the conquest of al-Jazīrah, 17 A.H.

حدثنا إسرائيل عن أبي إسحاق عن حارثة بن مضرب عن عمر رضي الله عنه إذا أراد أن يقسم السواد بين المسلمين فأمر بهم أن يحصوا فوجد الرجل المسلم يصيبه ثلاثة من الفلاحين يعني العلوذج فشاور أصحاب النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم في ذلك فقال له علي بن أبي طالب دعهم يكونون مادة للمسلمين فتركهم فبعث عثمان بن حنيف فوضع عليهم ثمانية وأربعين وأربعة وعشرين واثني عشر

Isrā'īl narrated to us—from Abū Ishāq—from Ḥārithah ibn Muḍrib—from 'Umar رضي الله عنه that he intended to divide the land (of Iraq) between the Muslims. He first commanded them to estimate. It turned out that each Muslim will receive a piece of land equivalent to three farmers' lands. He then consulted the Ṣaḥābah of the Nabī صلى الله عليه وسلم in this regard. 'Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib told him, “Leave them (and take tax from them) so that it will be capital for the Muslims.” He implemented this suggestion.

He then sent 'Uthmān ibn Ḥunayf who stipulated for the rich 48, for the middle-class 24, and for the lower class 12 dirhams as tax.<sup>1</sup>

## 5. The Land of Nahāwand

In 21 A.H., when news of the mobilisation of the forces of Persian reached Madīnah, Sayyidunā 'Umar رضي الله عنه held a meeting with the Ṣaḥābah رضي الله عنهم. Various Ṣaḥābah delivered pertinent advices. Ibn Kathīr records the incident:

فقام عثمان وطلحة والزبير و عبد الرحمن بن عوف في رجال من أهل الرأي فتكلم كل منهم بانفراده فأحسن وأجود واتفق رأيهم على أن لا يسير من المدينة ولكن يبعث البعوث و يحصرهم برأيه و دعائه و كان من كلام علي أن قال يا أمير المؤمنين إن هذا الأمر لم يكن نصره و لا خذلانه بكثرة و لا قلة هو دينه الذي أظهره و جنده الذي أعزه و أمده بالملائكة حتى بلغ ما بلغ فنحن على موعود من الله و الله منجز وعده و ناصر جنده و مكاتك فيهم يا أمير المؤمنين مكان النظام من الحرز بجمعه و يمسكه فإذا انحل تفرق ما فيه و ذهب ثم لم يجتمع بحذافيره أبدا و العرب اليوم و إن كانوا قليلا فهم كثير عزيز بالاسلام فأقم مكانك فأعجب عمر قول علي و سر به و كان عمر إذا استشار أحدا لا يبرم أمرا حتى يشاور العباس فلما أعجبه كلام الصحابة في هذا المقام عرضه على العباس إلخ

1 Yaḥyā ibn Ādam: *Kitāb al-Kharāj*, pg. 42, Egypt print; *Kitāb al-Amwāl*, pg. 59, Egypt print; al-Bayhaqī: *al-Sunan al-Kubrā*, vol. 9 pg. 134, book on expeditions, chapter on land, Dakkan print; *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, vol. 2 pg. 301, book on jihād from the section on booty, discussion on Jizyah, with reference to Ibn Zanjawiyyah and al-Kharā'itī, first edition, Hyderabad Dakkan print.

‘Uthmān, Ṭalḥah, Zubayr, and ‘Abd al-Raḥmān ibn ‘Awf stood up from the influential men. Each of them spoke individually, and conveyed what was in their hearts most eloquently and expressively. They agreed that ‘Umar should not travel from Madīnah but he should rather mobilise and send forces who will be bound to his instructions and commands.

The address of ‘Alī was as follows, “O Amīr al-Mu’minīn! This religion is not assisted or deserted by abundance or scarcity of numbers. It is His religion which He gave supremacy to and His army whom He honoured and assisted with the angels until it reached this lofty level. We have full conviction on the promise of Allah and Allah will definitely deliver on His promise and assist His army. Your position among them, O Amīr al-Mu’minīn, is like the string of an amulet, keeping it together and holding it. If it breaks, the beads on it will fall and scatter, and all will never again be collected together. Today, although the Arabs are few in number, they are plenty and revered due to Islam. So remain where you are.”

‘Umar was amazed and delighted at ‘Alī’s advice. ‘Umar’s habit was that when he would consult anyone, he would not finalise a decision until he consulted with ‘Abbās. Now when the speeches of the Ṣaḥābah pleased him in this matter, he presented them to ‘Abbās (who approved and the orders were carried out).<sup>1</sup>

### **The above consultation in the books of the Shī‘ah**

The consultation that was held regarding Nahāwand has been documented by the Shī‘ah in books considered reliable by them like *Nahj al-Balāghah*, etc. Sayyidunā ‘Alī’s رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ unique address is documented in great detail in *Nahj al-Balāghah* wherein he presents benevolent and considerate views to Sayyidunā ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ with regards the battle with the Persians. Its subject matter is nearly the same as the quotation from *al-Bidāyah*. Both Sunnī and Shī‘ī historians have recorded this incident and have openly publicised Sayyidunā ‘Alī’s heartfelt address to Sayyidunā ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ. He says:

---

1 *Al-Bidāyah*, vol. 7 pg. 107, year 21 A.H.; *Tārīkh al-Ṭabarī*, vol. 4 pg. 237, conquest of Nahāwand 21 A.H., *Kitāb al-Amwāl*, pg. 252; *Tārīkh Khalīfah ibn Khayyāt*, vol. 1 pg. 120.

من كلام له عليه السلام وقد استشار عمر بن الخطاب في الشحوص لقتال الفرس بنفسه إن هذا الأمر لم يكن نصره ولا خذلانه بكثرة ولا قلة وهو دين الله الذي أظهره وجنده الذي أعده وأمه حتى بلغ ما بلغ وطلع حيث طلع ونحن على موعود من الله والله منجز وعده وناصر جنده ومكان القيم بالأمر مكان النظام من الخرز يجمعه ويضمه فإن انقطع النظام تفرق وذهب ثم لم يجتمع بحذافيه أبدا والعرب اليوم وإن كانوا قليلا فهم كثيرون بالإسلام وعزيزون بالاجتماع فكن قطبا واستدر الرحي بالعرب وأصلهم دونك نار الحرب فإنك إن شخصت من هذه الأرض انتقضت عليك العرب من أطرافها وأقطارها إلخ

Part of his address after `Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb consulted them regarding him travelling to fight the Persians himself:

This matter is neither assisted nor deserted by abundance or scarcity of numbers. It is the religion of Allah which He made dominant and His army whom He prepared and assisted until it reached this lofty level and spread far and wide. We have full conviction on the promise of Allah and Allah will definitely fulfil His promise and assist His army. The position of the administrator of the state is like the string of a pearl necklace, which keeps and holds the beads together. If the string breaks, the beads on it will fall and scatter, and all will never again be collected together. Today, although the Arabs are few in number, they are plenty due to Islam and privileged due to unanimity. So be the pivot and let the Arabs surround you like the stone of the mill and let them face the heat of war to your exclusion. Because if you move from this land, the Arabs will pounce on you from every niche and corner of the peninsula.<sup>1</sup>

## Benefits of the above

1. Sayyidunā `Umar included Sayyidunā `Alī رضي الله عنه in important consultations. This is a clear sign of sincerity and conviction.
2. The divine promise of governance on earth recorded in the Qur`ān, Sayyidunā `Alī رضي الله عنه stated its manifestation in the Fārūqī era. He included himself in Sayyidunā `Umar's رضي الله عنه group. This is an example of his unity and agreement.

<sup>1</sup> *Nahj al-Balāghah*, vol. 1 pg. 264, `Alī's address concerning fighting the Persians, Egypt print; *Kitāb Akhbār al-Ṭiwāl*, pg. 134, new Egypt print.



3. He asserted that Sayyidunā ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ is the administrator of the affairs of all the Muslims, their caretaker and protector. He named ‘Umar’s religion Allah’s religion and ‘Umar’s army Allah’s army. This is evidence for the correctness of the Fārūqī khilāfah.
4. He likened Sayyidunā ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ to the string of a necklace affirming that the unity and system of the ummah is dependent on his blessed existence.
5. He finally equated him to the pivot of the mill of Islam before sincerely advising him to remain behind at the base, Madīnah Munawwarah and not to venture out explaining to him that his venturing out is dangerous for the Muslims.

It has become more manifest than the sun in broad daylight to the readers that there existed conviction, reliance, and love between these two personalities. There is no need to ponder deeply to realise the baselessness and falseness of the tales of their disagreement and disunity. Allah’s Speech is true. And these incidents are glaring testimony to the fact that the tales of enmity and hatred are nothing more than concoctions.

## 6. War with the Romans

Shī‘ī scholars have written in the books they take pride in like *Nahj al-Balāghah*, amongst others, that when Sayyidunā ‘Umar al-Fārūq رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ made preparations for the war against the Romans, Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ presented to him his sincere counsel. The senior commentators of *Nahj al-Balāghah* (Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd and Ibn Maytham al-Baḥrānī) have quoted details attached to this counsel. They have not criticised it in any way, which proves its authenticity in their eyes. The text is as follows:

من كلام له عليه السلام قد شاوره عمر بن الخطاب في الخروج إلى غزوة الروم بنفسه... إنك متى تسير إلى العدو بنفسك فتقلهم فتنبك لا تكن للمسلمين كافة دون أقصى بلادهم وليس بعدك مرجع يرجعون إليه فابعث إليهم رجلا مجربا واحفز معه أهل البلاء والنصيحة فإن أظهره الله فذاك ما تحب وإن تكن الأخرى كنت ردا للناس ومثابة للمسلمين

His address when ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb sought his opinion regarding leaving to fight the Romans himself.

When you will go out to the enemy and face them yourself, then—Allah forbid—if you are killed, the Muslims will have no sanctuary in any of the cities. There is no one after you to whom they can return to after your demise. So rather send them an experienced man and combine him with people who have resoluteness, experience, and goodwill. If Allah grants them victory then this is what you aspire. However, if the opposite happens, you will be the support for the people and the sanctuary for the Muslims.<sup>1</sup>

Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd al-Mu‘tazilī comments under this address:

و اعلم أن هذه الغزاة هي غزاة فلسطين التي فتح فيها بيت المقدس و قد ذكرها أبو جعفر الطبري (محمد بن جرير) في التاريخ و قال إن عليا عليه السلام هو كان المستخلف على المدينة لما شخص عمر إلى الشام و إن عليا عليه السلام قال له لا تخرج بنفسك إنك تريد عدوا كلبا

Remember that this battle was the Battle of Palestine in which Bayt al-Maqdis was conquered. Abū Ja‘far al-Ṭabarī (Muḥammad ibn Jarīr) mentioned it in his *Tārīkh* and added that ‘Alī was appointed over Madīnah when ‘Umar left for Shām and that he said to ‘Umar, “Do not leave yourself. Do you want a dog race?”<sup>2</sup>

## The fruits of the above

1. Sayyidunā ‘Alī regards Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه the support structure of the Muslims.
2. He called him the sanctuary of the Muslims.
3. This sincere advice reveals the goodwill and benevolence he entertains for Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه.

---

1 *Nahj al-Balāghah*, vol. 1 pg. 253, Egypt print with footnotes of Shaykh ‘Abduhū.

2 *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*, vol. 2 pg. 584 – 585, Beirut print; Ibn Maytham: *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*, vol.

3 pg. 161 – 162, new Tehran print; *al-Durrah al-Najfiyyah Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*, pg. 176, Iran print;

Sayyid ‘Alī Naqī: *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah* (Persian commentary), vol. 2 pg. 406 – 407, Tehran print.

4. These words indicate to the correctness of the Fārūqī khilāfah. Had this khilāfah been oppressive and tyrannical (like some assume) then how could Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ approach him with sincerity and love at every juncture? How could he award him with advices of goodwill and caring?

If he had no power to oppose Sayyidunā ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ and regarding clashing with him contrary to goodness, he would not have mingled with those oppressive khulafā’, but would have remained aloof from them and cut ties with them. He would practice upon the divine directive:

وَلَا تَرْكَبُوا إِلَى الَّذِينَ ظَلَمُوا فَمَا تَمَسُّكُمُ النَّارُ

*And do not incline toward those who do wrong, lest you be touched by the Fire.*<sup>1</sup>

People of reason and sound temperament will be able to ponder over these aspects and reach the correct conclusions.

## 7. Division of Wealth

Wealth came pouring into Sayyidunā ‘Umar’s رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ hands after the conquests. After distributing the wealth (among the needy), a meeting was held to discuss what to do with the remainder. Hāfiẓ Nūr al-Dīn al-Haythamī has narrated this incident in *Majma‘ al-Zawā’id* with reference to Muḥaddith al-Bazzār which contains Sayyidunā ‘Alī’s رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ opinion:

عن طلحة بن عبيد الله قال أتى عمر بمال قسمه بين المسلمين ففضلت منه فضلة فاستشار فيها فقالوا لو تركته لنايبة إن كانت قال و علي ساكت لا يتكلم فقال ما لك يا أبا الحسن لا تتكلم قال قد أخبر القوم فقال عمر لتكلمني فقال إن الله قد فرغ من قسمة هذا المال و ذكر مال البحرين حين جاء إلى النبي صلى الله عليه و سلم و حال بينه و بين أن يقسمه الليل فصلى الصلوات في المسجد فلقد رأيت ذلك في وجه رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم حتى فرغ منه فقال لا جرم لتقسمه فقسمة علي فأصابني منه ثمان مائة درهم

Ṭalḥah ibn ‘Ubayd Allah reports:

---

1 Sūrah Hūd: 113.

Wealth was brought to ‘Umar who distributed it among the Muslims. Some wealth remained so he consulted them with regards to it. They said, “Maybe you should keep it for a rainy day (and not distribute it immediately).”

This whole time ‘Alī remained silent, speaking not a word. So ‘Umar asked, “What is the matter, O Abū al-Ḥasan? You are not speaking?”

He said, “The people have already spoken.”

‘Umar said, “You also express your opinion to me.”

He said, “Firstly, Allah listed the recipients of this wealth. Secondly, when the wealth of Bahrain came to Rasūlullāh ﷺ, night fell and he was unable to distribute it promptly. He performed all the ṣalāh in the Masjid (and did not go home). I saw clear signs of worry on his blessed face. Until the wealth was not distributed, he felt no peace. (So we should also feel no peace until it is promptly distributed.)”

‘Umar said, “You should definitely distribute this wealth.”

Accordingly, ‘Alī distributed it and I received 800 dirhams.<sup>1</sup>

## 8. Penalty for a Miscarried Foetus

Fakhr al-Islām ‘Alī ibn Muḥammad al-Bazdawī al-Ḥanafī (d. 482 A.H.) briefly wrote about this incident. The background of the incident is that Sayyidunā ‘Umar al-Fārūq رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ summoned a pregnant woman (regarding some complaint of hers). Due to his awe and fear, she miscarried and lost her child. He continues:

و شاورهم (الصحابة) في إِمْلَاصِ الْمَرْأَةِ فَأَشَارُوا بِأَنْ لَا غَرَمَ عَلَيْهِ وَ عَلَيَّ سَاكَتْ فَلَمَّا سَأَلَهُ قَالَ أَرَى أُرَى عَلِيَّكَ  
الغرة

---

1 *Majma‘ al-Zawā’id*, vol. 10 pg. 238, chapter regarding spending and withholding, Egypt print; *Uṣūl Fakhr al-Islām al-Bazdawī*, pg. 239 – 240, new edition, Nūr Muḥammad print, Karachi with the takhrīj of al-Qāsim ibn Qaṭlūbaghā al-Ḥanafī; ‘Abd al-‘Azīz al-Bukhārī: *Kashf al-Asrār Sharḥ Uṣūl Bazdawī*, vol. 3 pg. 949, old print.

He consulted the Ṣaḥābah regarding the miscarriage of a woman. They indicated that there is no penalty (for the child). ‘Alī was silent all this time. When ‘Umar asked him, he said, “I feel that paying the penalty (blood money) for the child is compulsory upon you.”<sup>1</sup>

## ‘Alī’s Appointment as Deputy

We have mentioned some incidents regarding consultations. We will now mention a second aspect regarding their relationship. When Sayyidunā ‘Umar al-Fārūq رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ needed to leave Madīnah Munawwarah on few occasions, he appointed Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ as his deputy on many of these occasions. The books of history have recorded such incidents and we will report some of them in the following pages. Hopefully, the readers will ponder over them and realise the level of their unity and reliance on one another. These incidents also prove beyond doubt that there existed no hatred, animosity, and bitterness between them. Otherwise, the former would not have appointed the latter his deputy, nor would the latter consent to such a request. When there is rancour, people do not wish to even see the other’s face. Appointing that person to a position of honour and as a successor is unfathomable. Have a look at some of these historic anecdotes.

### 1. Gathering at the Ṣurār Pond

This incident of the year 14 A.H. is documented by Ibn Jarīr al-Ṭabarī and Ibn Kathīr:

و ركب عمر رضي الله عنه في أول يوم من محرم هذه السنة (١٤) في الجيوش من المدينة فنزل على ماء يقال له صرار فعسكر به عازما على غزو العراق بنفسه و استخلف على المدينة علي بن أبي طالب

---

1 *Uṣūl Fakhṛ al-Islām al-Bazdawī*, pg. 239, chapter on consensus, new print, Nūr Muḥammadī, Karachi; Abū Bakr ibn Aḥmad ibn Abī Sahl Shams al-A‘immah (d. 483.490 A.H.): *Uṣūl al-Sarakhsī*, vol. 1 pg. 304, Hyderabad Dakkan print; *Kashf al-Asrār Sharḥi Uṣūl Bazdawī*, vol. 3 pg. 949, chapter on consensus, old Egypt print; *Kanz al-Ummāl*, vol. 7 pg. 300, Ḥadīth: 3485, with reference to ‘Abd al-Razzāq and al-Bayhaqī, first edition; *Muṣannaf ‘Abd al-Razzāq*, vol. 9 pg. 458, chapter regarding one the sultan frighens, Beirut print.

و استصحب معه عثمان بن عفان و سادات الصحابة ثم عقد مجلسا لاستشارة الصحابة فيما عزم عليه و نودي إن الصلوة جامعة و قد أرسل إلى علي فقدم من المدينة ثم استشارهم فكلهم وافقوه على الذهاب إلى العراق إلا عبد الرحمن بن عوف الخ

‘Umar journeyed on the first day of Muḥarram of this year (14 A.H.) with the armies from Madīnah and halted at a pond called Ṣurār. He mobilised the army with a determination to fight the Iraqis himself. He appointed ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib his deputy over Madīnah and took ‘Uthmān ibn ‘Affān and the noble Ṣaḥābah along with him. He then set up a meeting to consult the Ṣaḥābah regarding his determination. It was called out that ṣalāh has gathered. A message had already been sent to ‘Alī so he came from Madīnah. He then consulted them and they all agreed with him on going to Iraq besides ‘Abd al-Raḥmān ibn ‘Awf.<sup>1</sup>

‘Abd al-Raḥmān ibn ‘Awf opposed this decision and said, “If perchance you are harmed, there is fear of weakness and feebleness seizing the Muslims of the entire globe. Send someone else in your place and return to Madīnah.”

This opinion was passed. Subsequently, ‘Umar رضي الله عنه returned to Madīnah and sent Sa’d ibn Mālik (Sa’d ibn Abī Waqqās) on his behalf.<sup>2</sup>

## 2. The Conquest of Bayt al-Maqdis

The second instance was at the conquest of Bayt al-Maqdis in 15 A.H. Ibn Kathīr’s text follows:

ثم حاصر (أبو عبيدة) بيت المقدس و ضيق عليهم حتى أجابوا إلى الصلح بشرط أن يقدم إليهم أمير المؤمنين عمر بن الخطاب فكتب إليه أبو عبيدة بذلك فاستشار عمر الناس في ذلك فأشار عثمان بن عفان بأن لا يركب إليه ليكون أحقر لهم و أرغم لأنوفهم و أشار علي بن أبي طالب بالمسير إليهم ليكون أخف و طاعة على المسلمين في حصارهم بينهم فهوى ما قال علي و لم يهو ما قال عثمان و سار بالجيش نحوهم و استخلف على المدينة علي بن أبي طالب و سار العباس بن عبد المطلب على مقدمته

1 *Tārīkh al-Ṭabarī*, vol. 4 pg. 83, old Egypt print; *al-Bidāyah*, vol. 7 pg. 35, Egypt print.

2 *Tārīkh al-Ṭabarī*, vol. 4 pg. 83, old Egypt print; *al-Bidāyah*, vol. 7 pg. 35, under the year 14 A.H., Egypt print.

Abū ‘Ubaydah then besieged Bayt al-Maqdis and made things difficult for them until finally they agreed to settle for a compromise on condition that Amīr al-Mu’minīn ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb comes to them. Abū ‘Ubaydah wrote to him concerning this. ‘Umar consulted with the people about this. ‘Uthmān ibn ‘Affān indicated that he should not travel there so that it be more disgraceful and humiliating for them (the Christians). On the other hand, ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib proposed that he should journey to them so that it eases matters upon the Muslims in their siege. ‘Umar opted for ‘Alī’s proposal, and not ‘Uthmān’s, and travelled with the armies in their direction. He appointed ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib his successor over Madīnah and ‘Abbās ibn ‘Abd al-Muṭṭalib travelled in the advance guard of his army.<sup>1</sup>

Ibn Jarīr al-Ṭabarī has recorded this incident in his famous book *Tārīkh al-Umam wa al-Mulūk*, in the events of the year 15 A.H., in the chapter regarding the conquest of al-Maqdis.

عن عدي بن سهل قال لما استمد أهل الشام عمر على أهل فلسطين اسختلف عليا و خرج ممدا لهم إلخ

‘Adī ibn Sahl reports:

When the people of Shām requested assistance from ‘Umar against the people of Palestine, he appointed ‘Alī his deputy and left to help them.<sup>2</sup>

### 3. Journey towards Aylah

Al-Ṭabarī recorded this incident of the year 17 A.H. regarding his journey to Aylah:

خرج عمر و خلف عليا على المدينة و خرج معه بالصحابة و أغذوا السير و اتخذ أيلة طريقا حتى دنا منها تنجى عن الطريق إلخ

‘Umar left and appointed ‘Alī his replacement over Madīnah. Many Ṣaḥābah left with him. They travelled swiftly on the road towards Aylah and as they drew close, they moved off that road.

1 *Al-Bidāyah*, vol. 7 pg. 55, the year 15 A.H.

2 *Tārīkh al-Ṭabarī*.

#### 4. Najrān

It is reported from Ibn Sīrīn in *Kanz al-'Ummāl* that Sayyidunā 'Umar appointed Sayyidunā 'Alī رضي الله عنه governor over Najrān:

عن ابن سيرين قال كتب عمر بن الخطاب إلى أهل نجران إني قد استوصيت بعلي بمن أسلم منكم خيرا و أمرته أن يعطيه نصف ما عمل من الأرض و لست أريد إخراجكم منها ما أصلحتم و رضيت عملكم

Ibn Sīrīn reports:

'Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb wrote to the people of Najrān, "I have despatched 'Alī to you with special instructions to treat those who embrace Islam with kindness and compassion. I commanded him to give the farmer half of the produce of the land he worked on. I do not intended banishing you from here as long as you do things properly and I am pleased with your actions."<sup>1</sup>

The above narrations are pronouncing:

- Sayyidunā 'Alī رضي الله عنه joined Sayyidunā 'Umar رضي الله عنه in matters of the state and in important meetings.
- The former spoke words of goodwill for the latter and presented opinions of compassion and sincerity.
- The latter appointed Sayyidunā 'Alī رضي الله عنه as his deputy on many occasions and sent him as his governor to some localities.
- All of the above are evidence for the good conduct, mutual sincerity, and love between these two seniors.

#### Incidents of Compassion

In this section, we discussed mutual consultations followed by appointment as deputy. We now wish to present a few more incidents which prove the informality,

---

1 *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, vol. 2 pg. 313, old print, book on jihad, section on booty, discussion on kharāj.



compassion, and friendship that existed between Sayyidunā ‘Umar al-Fārūq and Sayyidunā ‘Alī al-Murtaḍā رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُمَا and they verified and supported each other’s dealings. This again is proof for their harmonious relationship, mutual reliance, and intense love.

## 1. Incident of Informality

Al-Dhahabī writes:

عن قيس بن عباد قال دخلت المدينة ألتمس العلم و الشرف فرأيت رجلا عليه بردان له صفيرتان واضعا يده على عاتق عمر فقلت من هذا فقالوا علي بن أبي طالب رضي الله عنه

Qays ibn ‘Ubādah recalls, “I entered Madīnah in search of knowledge and good character. I saw someone wrapped in two shawls, with long hair, with his hand placed on ‘Umar’s shoulder. I asked, ‘Who is this?’ ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ,’ they replied.”<sup>1</sup>

## 2. ‘Alī’s supplication for illuminating the Masjid

‘Ulama have written that in the year 14 A.H., Sayyidunā ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ organised Tarāwīḥ to be performed in congregation during Ramadan. It is recorded in *Tārīkh Khalīfah ibn Khayyāt* in the 14 A.H:

و فيها أمر عمر بن الخطاب باجتماع الناس في القيام في شهر رمضان

In this year, ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb commanded people to gather to perform ṣalāh in the month of Ramadan.<sup>2</sup>

After the passing away of Sayyidunā ‘Umar, during the reign of Sayyidunā ‘Uthmān ibn ‘Affān رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُمَا, once Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ entered the Masjid at the time of ‘Ishā’

1 *Tadhkirat al-Ḥuffāz*, vol. 1 pg. 12, mention of ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib, Hyderabad print, Dakkan.

2 *Tārīkh Khalīfah ibn Khayyāt*, vol. 1 pg. 98; *Tatimmat al-Muntahā*, pg. 5, mention of the khilāfah of ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb, Tehran print.

and noticed that lighting arrangements were made in the Masjid. People were collectively engaged in Ṣalāt al-Tarāwīḥ and the Qur’ān was been recited. Seeing this amazing sight, he supplicated in favour of Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه:

نور الله على عمر قبره كما نور علينا مساجدنا

May Allah illuminate ‘Umar’s grave just as he illuminated our Masjids  
(with Qur’ān).<sup>1</sup>

Let the readers know that Ṣalāt al-Tarāwīḥ in congregation was started in the year 14 A.H. The Muslims continued this practice in every subsequent year. This congregational Ṣalāt al-Tarāwīḥ continued during the Fārūqī and ‘Uthmānī reign. Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه approved of it and did not discontinue it so it continued during his khilāfah. This means that the aspect of dīn which Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه initiated for perpetuity was part of dīn and not an innovation. It was correct, not incorrect. Owing to this, Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه sanctioned it and supplicated in favour of Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه after feeling happiness at its sight. Moreover, he did not stop here but maintained this practice during his khilāfah. To call something that was established and continued to be practiced—unanimously and congregationally—during the khilāfah of the three (Sayyidunā ‘Umar, Sayyidunā ‘Uthmān, and Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه) an innovation and against dīn is in itself contrary to dīn and is an accusation against these seniors, including Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه, of inventing innovations. May Allah سبحانه وتعالى protect all the Muslims from such false ideologies and grant us the ability to have the correct perception of these seniors coupled with obedience to them. May He allow us to stay united like them.

---

1 Shaykh Abū ‘Abd Allah Muḥammad ibn Naṣr al-Marwazī: *Kitāb Qiyām al-Layl wa Qiyām Ramadan wa Kitāb al-Witr*, pg. 156; *Sīrat ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb*, pg. 55, 56, Egypt print; *al-Riyāḍ al-Naḍīrah fī Manāqib al-‘Asharah*, vol. 1 pg. 270; *Tārīkh al-Khulafā’*, pg. 97, section on the initiations of ‘Umar, with reference to Ibn ‘Asākir, Mujtabā’ī print, Delhi; *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, vol. 6 pg. 334, with reference to Ibn ‘Asākir, khāṭā narrated it in his *Al-Amālī*, Ḥadīth: 5421, book of virtues, virtues of ‘Umar al-Fārūq; *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, vol. 4 pg. 284, with reference to Ibn Shāhīn, first edition; Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd: *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*, vol. 12 pg. 98, old Iran print, vol. 3 pg. 266, Beirut print, criticism 10 of ‘Umar.

### 3. Sāriyah al-Jabal

عن نافع عن ابن عمر خطب عمر يوما بالمدينة فقال يا سارية الجبل من استرعى الذئب ظلم قال فقيل له تذكر سارية و سارية بالعراق فقال الناس لعلي أما سمعت قول عمر يقول يا سارية و هو يخطب على المنبر فقال ويحكم دعوا عمر فإنه ما دخل في شيء إلا خرج منه فلم يلبث إلا يسيرا حتى قدم سارية فقال سمعت صوت عمر فصعدت الجبل

Nāfi' reports from ibn 'Umar:

Once 'Umar delivered a sermon in Madīnah and suddenly shouted, "O Sāriyah, the mountain! Whoever shepherds wolves, commits oppression." People began asking him, "You speaking about Sāriyah whereas he is in Iraq."

People asked 'Alī, "Did you not hear 'Umar saying O Sāriyah while delivering a khuṭbah on the pulpit?"

'Alī replied, "Woe to you! Leave 'Umar (i.e. do not object to him) because he does not enter anything except by coming out from the same. (i.e. He would not have done so for no reason.)"

Not very long thereafter, Sāriyah returned and confirmed, "I heard 'Umar's voice so I ascended the mountain (and Allah gave us victory)."<sup>1</sup>

### 4. Journey to meet Uways Qarnī

Abū Nu'aym al-Aṣbahānī reports:

In his last year in which he passed away, Sayyidunā 'Umar رضي الله عنه mounted with Sayyidunā 'Alī رضي الله عنه in the plains of 'Arafāt during the days of Ḥajj in search of Uways Qarnī. On their way, they saw a man who was standing in ṣalāh in front of a tree and camels were grazing around him. They hastened their pace and reached him and greeted him with salām. Uways shortened his ṣalāh and then replied to their salām. They asked him, "Who are you?"

---

1 *Sīrat 'Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb*, pg. 150, Egypt print; *Usd al-Ghābah*, vol. 4 pg. 65, discussion on 'Umar al-Fārūq; *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, vol. 6 pg. 333, book on virtues, virtues of al-Fārūq, with reference to al-Sulamī in Arba'īn and Ibn Mardawayh, old print.

He replied, “I am the shepherd of my people’s camels and their servant.”

He asked them, “Why have you come? What work do you have?”

They explained, “Our Nabī ﷺ listed few qualities of a man named Uways which we discern in you. We testify that you are the very same Uways. Seek Allah’s forgiveness for us, may Allah forgive you.”

Uways then asked them their names.

قال علي رضي الله عنه أما هذا فعمر أمير المؤمنين و أما أنا فعلي بن أبي طالب فاستوى أويس قائما و قال السلام عليك يا أمير المؤمنين و رحمة الله و بركاته و أنت يا ابن أبي طالب فجزاكما الله عن هذه الأمة خيرا

‘Alī رضي الله عنه said, “This is Amīr al-Mu’minīn and I am ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib.”

Uways stood up straight and said, “Peace upon you, O Amīr al-Mu’minīn, and Allah’s mercy and His blessings and to you, O Ibn Abī Ṭālib. May Allah reward you abundantly on behalf of this ummah.”<sup>1</sup>

### Conclusion of Section Three

We discussed the following in this section:

1. Mutual consultation between Sayyidunā ‘Umar and Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنهما regarding administrative and state affairs.
2. The former appointing the latter his successor and deputy on many occasions.
3. Incidents of mutual compassion and good character.

After pondering over these aspects, a man with a sound unbiased temperament and with an unprejudiced mind, will reach this conclusion that the relationship between these two men was amicable. They had reliance and trust upon one another. They had sincerity and kept good intentions for each other. Their affairs

---

1 *Hilyat al-Awliyā*, vol. 2 pg. 81 – 82, discussion Uways Qarnī, Egypt print.

were run with love and affection. If hypothetically, this is not the correct picture of their relationship, but there existed enmity and animosity, hatred and conflict, evil thoughts and suspicion (just as some erroneously suppose) then how could Sayyidunā ‘Alī’s ﷺ practice be in accordance to the dictates of the Qur’ān?

Allah ﷻ instructs:

وَتَعَاوَنُوا عَلَى الْبِرِّ وَالتَّقْوَىٰ وَلَا تَعَاوَنُوا عَلَى الْإِثْمِ وَالْعُدْوَانِ وَاتَّقُوا اللَّهَ إِنَّ اللَّهَ شَدِيدُ الْعِقَابِ

*And cooperate in righteousness and piety, but do not cooperate in sin and aggression. And fear Allah; indeed, Allah is severe in penalty.*<sup>1</sup>

Respected friends! Allah’s speech is hundred percent true and Sayyidunā ‘Alī ﷺ observes the commands of the Qur’ān and is obedient to them. So how can his behaviour and practices be in contrary to the commands of the Sovereign Owner?

The summary is that Sayyidunā ‘Alī’s ﷺ behaviour towards Sayyidunā ‘Umar ﷺ which is encapsulated in the incidents and anecdotes we present is totally in harmony and correct. It is a reflection of his observance of the Qur’ān. Just as he was a bearer of Qur’ān, he was an observer of the same. He did not have a two-faced attitude. And Allah is Witness over what we state.

---

1 Surah al-Mā'idah: 2.

## Section Four

This is the last section of chapter two. In this section we will discuss how Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه took care of the monetary rights of Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه. We will also quote narrations which prove that the latter would take his share from the spoils of war and his stipend. After reading these incidents, one will be convinced that these seniors enjoyed a harmonious relationship and fulfilled each other’s rights.

We will firstly like to mention that Sayyidunā ‘Umar al-Fārūq رضي الله عنه had such honour and respect for the family of Rasūlullāh صلى الله عليه وسلم and considered their rights to such an extent that when Muslims began conquering land after land during his khilāfah, he consulted with the Ṣaḥābah رضي الله عنهم as to how to distribute the conquered wealth. Some were of the opinion that the wealth should be distributed in the same year that it was conquered and others gave different opinions. Walīd ibn Hishām ibn al-Mughīrah then spoke and explained that in the kingdom of Shām, they have this practice of the State preparing a separate register for those they have earmarked to receive stipends and allowances. All the names of those who are eligible for the stipend are recorded in this register. Then whenever the need arises, it is easy for the army to identify those people.

Sayyidunā ‘Umar al-Fārūq رضي الله عنه approved of this view and issued instructions that the names of those eligible for stipends should be compiled in sequence of merit, i.e. those whose services for Islam are more should be given precedence and the family and relatives of Rasūlullāh صلى الله عليه وسلم should be put first. This incident is mentioned in detail in the following books.

This text is from *Ṭabaqāt Ibn Sa‘d* and *Tārīkh al-Ṭabarī*:

إن عمر بن الخطاب استشار المسلمين في تدوين الديوان فقال له علي بن أبي طالب تقسم كل سنة ما اجتمع إليك من مال ولا تمسك منه شيئا وقال عثمان بن عفان أرى مالا كثيرا يسع الناس وإن لم يحصوا حتى تعرف من أخذ ممن لم يأخذ خشيت أن ينتشر الأمر فقال له الوليد من هشام بن المغيرة يا أمير المؤمنين قد جئت الشام فرأيت ملوكها قد دونوا ديوانا وجندوا جنودا فدونا ديوانا وجند جنودا فأخذ

بقوله فدعا عقيل بن أبي طالب و مخزومة بن نوفل و جبير بن مطعم و كانوا من نساب قريش فقال اكتبوا الناس على منازلهم ... لكن ابدؤا بقراءة النبي صلى الله عليه و سلم الأقرب فالأقرب حتى تضعوا عمر حيث وضعه الله

‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb consulted the Muslims regarding preparing a register for stipends.

‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib said to him, “Distribute annually what wealth comes to you and do not withhold anything.”

‘Uthmān ibn ‘Affān said, “I see abundant of wealth. Even if the people are not counted, it will encompass them all. Those unable to receive a share will also come to know of it. I fear that the matter will spiral out of hand.”

Walīd ibn Hishām ibn al-Mughīrah said, “O Amīr al-Mu‘minīn! I have gone to Shām and I saw their kings have prepared a register and enlisted the names of the warriors of the army. So you also prepare and register and enlist the warriors of the armies.”

‘Umar opted for his view and called ‘Aqīl ibn Abī Ṭālib, Makhramah ibn Nawfal, and Jubayr ibn Muṭ‘im who were from the genealogists of the Quraysh. He commanded, “Write the names of the people in order of excellence.”

(‘Abd al-Raḥmān ibn ‘Awf and others suggested that ‘Umar’s name and his family’s name be inserted first. Hearing this ‘Umar said) “Begin with the relatives of the Nabī ﷺ, in order of closeness, until you put ‘Umar where Allah has put him.”<sup>1</sup>

It is recorded in *Ṭabaqāt Ibn Sa‘d* and Abū Yūsuf’s *Kitāb al-Kharāj*:

و فرض لأبناء البدرين ألفين ألفين إلا حسنا و حسينا فإنه ألحقهما بفريضة أبيهما لقرابتهما برسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم ففرض لكل واحد منهما خمسة آلاف درهم و فرض للعباس بن عبد المطلب

---

1 *Ṭabaqāt Ibn Sa‘d*, vol. 3 pg. 212 – 213, section one, chapter on ‘Umar, first edition; *Tārīkh al-Ṭabarī*, vol. 5 pg. 22 – 23, the year 23 A.H, discussion on the register; Abū ‘Ubayd al-Qāsim ibn Salām: *Kitāb al-Amwāl*, pg. 224, chapter on stipulating stipends from the Fay’; *Kanz al-Ummāl*, vol. 2 pg. 316, Ḥadīth: 6507; *al-Sunan al-Kubrā*, vol. 6 pg. 364.

خمسة آلاف درهم لقرابته برسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم و في رواية ففرض للعباس ثم لعلي رضي الله عنهما و فرض للنساء المهاجرات ففرض لصفية بنت عبد المطلب ستة آلاف درهم و لأسماء بنت عميس ألف درهم الخ

(5000 was stipulated for each of the participants of Badr.) He allotted 2000 for the sons of the participants of Badr except for Ḥasan and Ḥusayn for whom he allotted the same stipend of their father due to their relation to Rasūlullāh ﷺ. Thus, he allocated 5000 dirhams for each of them. He allocated for ‘Abbās ibn ‘Abd al-Muṭṭalib 5000 dirhams as well due to his connection to Rasūlullāh ﷺ.

In another narration:

He stipulated for the Muhājirāt women. He stipulated for Ṣafīyyah bint ‘Abd al-Muṭṭalib (Rasūlullāh’s ﷺ paternal aunt) 6000 dirhams and for Asmā’ bint ‘Umays (who was in the wedlock of Sayyidunā ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib ﷺ at the time) 1000 dirhams.<sup>1</sup>

Let the scholars be rest assured that the commentator of *Nahj al-Balāghah*, the Shī‘ī Mu‘tazilī Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd and the Shī‘ī author of *Tārīkh Ya‘qūbī* have recorded the incident of stipulation of stipends from various historians in the following words. This shows that these are not fictitious tales but are historical Islamic anecdotes.

فأخذ بقول وليد بن هشام فدعا عقيل بن أبي طالب و مخزومة بن نوفل و جبيرة بن مطعم و كانوا نساب قريش و قال اكتبوا الناس على منازلهم فكتبوا فبدأوا ببني هاشم ثم اتبعوهم أبا بكر و قومه ثم عمر و قومه على ترتيب الخلافة فلما نظر إليه قال وددت إنه كان هكذا و لكن أرى بقرابة النبي صلى الله عليه و آله الأقرب فالأقرب حتى تضعوا عمر حيث وضعه الله

---

1 *Ṭabaqāt Ibn Sa‘d*, vol. 3 pg. 213 – 214, section one, chapter on ‘Umar; *Kitāb al-Kharāj*, pg. 43 – 44, section on ‘Umar’s allocation for the Ṣaḥābah of Rasūlullāh ﷺ, under the heading: distribution of wealth between the Ṣaḥābah, Egypt print; *Futūḥ al-Buldān*, pg. 454 0 455, chapter on stipends during the khilāfah of ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb, Egypt print; *Kitāb al-Amwāl*, pg. 224 – 226, chapter on allocation of stipends



He opted for Walīd ibn Hishām’s view. Subsequently, he called ‘Aqīl ibn Abī Ṭālib, Makhramah ibn Nawfal, and Jubayr ibn Muṭ‘im who were genealogists of the Quraysh. He ordered, “Write the names of the people according to their status.” Accordingly, they wrote and began with the Banū Hāshim followed by Abū Bakr and his tribe, and then ‘Umar and his tribe in the sequence of khilāfah. When ‘Umar looked at it he remarked, “I wished that it had been just like this. Moreover, I feel that the family of the Nabī ﷺ should be given precedence, in order of closeness to him until you place ‘Umar where Allah placed him.”<sup>1</sup>

He writes at one place before this:

قال لا بل أبدأ برسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله و بأهله ثم الأقرب فالأقرب فبدأ ببني هاشم ثم ببني عبد  
المطلب ثم بعبد شمس و نوفل ثم بسائر بطون قريش إلخ

He said, “No. I will rather begin with Rasūlullāh ﷺ and his family and then those who are closest to them in sequence.” Accordingly, he began with the Banū Hāshim then the Banū ‘Abd al-Muṭṭalib, then ‘Abd Shams and Nawfal, and finally the rest of the tribes of the Quraysh.<sup>2</sup>

The readers have read through the above narrations. Remember that this stipend system was implemented in Muharram 20 A.H. Through these incidents, the status that the children and family of Rasūlullāh ﷺ had in the eyes of Sayyidunā ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ is vividly clear. Look at the amount of love he had for them and respect he awarded them. Sayyidunā ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ gave precedence to Rasūlullāh’s ﷺ Ahl al-Bayt, his tribe, and family, when allocating stipends and placed himself after the tribe of Banū Hāshim saying, “Place me where Allah placed me i.e. place me at the end.”

Respected readers, just as Sayyidunā ‘Umar al-Fārūq رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ expressed his humility and worthlessness in this statement, he highlighted the worth and lofty position

1 *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*, vol. 3 pg. 176, Beirut print; *Tārīkh Ya‘qūbī*, vol. 2 pg. 153, distribution of wealth and stipends, Beirut print.

2 *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*, vol. 3 pg. 166, Beirut print.

of the Banū Hāshim in a classic manner. The khalīfah who cannot tolerate their names being put at the end of a register, how can he destroy their monetary rights? How could he possibly terminate their benefits? It is unfathomable for him to put them through any kind of difficulty.

The plain truth is that all of these are the manifest effects of the true sincere love Sayyidunā ‘Umar al-Fārūq رضي الله عنه possessed for Rasūlullāh صلى الله عليه وسلم and his household.

Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه made a wonderful statement at the juncture of distribution of wealth which ought to be written in gold. Kindly read it carefully and salute his faith. He declares:

والله ما أدركنا الفضل في الدنيا و لا ما نرجو من الآخرة من ثواب الله على ما عملنا إلا بمحمد صلى الله عليه وسلم فهو شرفنا و قومه أشرف العرب ثم الأقرب فالأقرب

By Allah, we have not attained position in the world nor do we aspire for Allah’s reward in the Hereafter for what we have done except by the blessings of Muḥammad صلى الله عليه وسلم for he is our honour and his tribe is the most noble of the Arabs, then those who are closest to them in sequence.<sup>1</sup>

Secondly, according to the principles of Sharī’ah, the share allocated for Rasūlullāh’s صلى الله عليه وسلم family from the booty is called the share of the *dhawī al-qurbā* and is also referred to as *khums al-khums*. The first khalīfah Sayyidunā Abū Bakr رضي الله عنه would distribute this portion among the relatives of Rasūlullāh صلى الله عليه وسلم and Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه did the same. The agent for distribution of this khums was none other than Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه. The upcoming narrations are sufficient proof for this. These are Sayyidunā ‘Alī’s رضي الله عنه declarations which the muḥaddithīn have transmitted via their respective chains. They are not the words of anyone else.

---

1 *Ṭabaqāt Ibn Sa’d*, vol. 3 pg. 212, section one, mention and life of ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb, Leiden print; *Tārīkh al-Ṭabarī*, vol. 5 pg. 23, discussion on ‘Umar, writing the registers; *Futūḥ al-Buldān*, pg. 455, chapter on stipends during the khilāfah of ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb.

## First Narration

Imām Abū Yūsuf writes:

قال سمعت عليا يقول قلت يا رسول الله إن رأيت أن توليني حقنا من الخمس فأقسمه في حياتك كي لا ينازعنا أحد بعدك فافعل قال ففعل قال فولانيه رسول الله فقسمته في حياته ثم ولانيه أبو بكر فقسمته في حياته ثم ولانيه عمر فقسمته في حياته حتى إذا كان آخر سنة من سني عمر فأتاه مال كثير فعزل حقنا ثم أرسل إلي فقال خذه فأقسمه فقلت يا أمير المؤمنين بنا عنه العام غنى و بالمسلمين حاجة فرده عليهم الخ

The narrator says that he heard ‘Alī saying:

I submitted, “O Messenger of Allah, if you feel it appropriate to give me authority over our share from the khums in order that I may distribute it during your lifetime so that no one disputes with us over it after you, then do so.”

Rasūlullāh ﷺ acceded and appointed me administrator over it. Thus, I distributed it during his lifetime. Then Abū Bakr appointed me administrator over it so I distribute it during his lifetime and then ‘Umar appointed me over it so I distributed it during his lifetime until the final year of his life. In this year, an abundance of wealth came to him and he kept aside our share. He then sent for me and said, “Take it and distribute it.”

I said, “O Amīr al-Mu’minīn, we are not in need of it this year and the Muslims are in need.”

So he gave it to them.<sup>1</sup>

## Second Narration

Abū Dāwūd al-Sijistānī in his *al-Sunan* records a detailed narration from Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه. He says:

اجتمعت أنا و العباس و فاطمة و زيد بن حارثة عند النبي صلى الله عليه و سلم فقلت يا رسول الله إن رأيت أن توليني حقنا من هذا الخمس في كتاب الله عز و جل فأقسمه حياتك كي لا ينازعني أحد بعدك

<sup>1</sup> *Kitāb al-Kharāj*, pg. 20, chapter regarding the distribution of the booty, Egypt print.

ففاعل قال ففعل ذلك قال فقسمته حياة رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم ثم ولانيه أبو بكر حتى إذا كانت آخر سنة من سني عمر فإنه أتاه مال كثير فعزل حقنا ثم أرسل إلي فقلت بنا عنه العام غنى و بالمسلمين حاجة فاردوه عليهم فرده عليهم إلخ

‘Abbās, Fāṭimah, Zayd ibn Hārithah, and I gathered before the Nabī ﷺ. I submitted, “O Messenger of Allah, if you feel that you should appoint me to administer our share from the khums in the Book of Allah ﷻ and distribute it during your lifetime so that no one disputes with us after you, then do so.”

Rasūlullāh ﷺ acceded to the request. So I distributed it during Rasūlullāh’s ﷺ lifetime. Thereafter, Abū Bakr appointed me over it. This continued until the last year of ‘Umar’s life. In that year, plenty of wealth came to ‘Umar so he kept aside our share. He then summoned me so I said, “This year, we (the Banū Hāshim) have no need for it and the Muslims are in dire need of the same so give it to them.” Accordingly, he gave it to them.<sup>1</sup>

### Third Narration

Imām al-Bukhārī documented the narration in *Al-Tārīkh al-Kabīr* with the following words:

عن ابن أبي ليلى قال سمعت عليا قال سألت النبي صلى الله عليه و سلم أن يوليني الخمس فأعطاني ثم أبو بكر فأعطاني ثم عمر

Ibn Abī Laylā reports that he heard ‘Alī saying:

I asked the Nabī ﷺ to allow me to administer the khums, and he allowed me. Then Abū Bakr allowed me followed by ‘Umar.<sup>2</sup>

---

1 *Sunan Abī Dāwūd*, vol. 2 pg. 61, book on kharāj, chapter regarding the recipients of the khums, Mujtabā’ī print, Delhi.

2 *Al-Tārīkh al-Kabīr*, vol. 1 pg. 381, qāf 2.

## Fourth Narration

Imām Aḥmad reports this narration of Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ in *Musnad Aḥmad*<sup>1</sup>.

## Fifth Narration

Al-Bayhaqī reports it in *al-Sunan al-Kubrā*<sup>2</sup>.

## Sixth Narration

Muḥaddith Abū Ya‘lā reports it in his *Musnad*<sup>3</sup>.

## Seventh Narration

Fāḍil Muttaqī Hindī reported it in *Kanz al-‘Ummāl* with reference to *Muṣannaf Ibn Abī Shaybah*<sup>4</sup>.

The muḥaddithīn have transmitted these reports with their respective words and through their respective isnāds. We have not quoted all the narrations to avoid prolongation.

## Points Deduced

1. It is established from these reports of Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ that in the Ṣiddīqī and Fārūqī eras, the Banū Hāshim’s monetary rights i.e. khums, etc., were duly fulfilled. Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ was in charge of distributing wealth to the relatives of Rasūlullāh صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ so that each may receive his allotted share without any deficiency. In other words, no one usurped, snatched, or destroyed their rights. Sayyidunā Abū Bakr and Sayyidunā ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُمَا looked after their monetary rights.

---

1 *Musnad Aḥmad*, vol. 1 pg. 84, musnadāt ‘Alī.

2 *Al-Sunan al-Kubrā*, vol. 6 pg. 343, chapter on the share of the relatives from the khums.

3 *Musnad Abī Ya‘lā*, pg. 43, musnadāt ‘Alī, Pīr Jhandā Sharīf, Sindh.

4 *Muṣannaf Ibn Abī Shaybah*, vol. 2 pg. 305, Ḥadīth: 6380.

2. The recipients' want and poverty is taken into consideration before distributing the khums. This is established by Sayyidunā 'Alī's رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ statement. The Fuqahā' have used this very statement of his as proof for this ruling.
3. Just as Sayyidunā 'Umar رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ had concern to fulfil the monetary rights of the Banū Hāshim as a token of appreciation, Sayyidunā 'Alī رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ had the goodwill of the Muslims at heart. Out of compassion for the poor Muslims and with a concern to address their poverty, he abandoned taking benefit for himself. If he did not take his share from the booty in times of prosperity, this should be attributed to his taqwā and abstinence. And when he did take this monetary right of his, which happened most of the time—as established in books of both sects—then this is due to his need for the same.
4. There existed no dispute or ill-feelings between Sayyidunā 'Umar and Sayyidunā 'Alī رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ. No hatred, no enmity, no rancour, and no animosity. Rather, they considered each other's rights and cherished love and compassion for one another at every juncture. There were unanimous in action and united in affairs.

The senior 'Ulamā' have reported from Imām Muḥammad al-Bāqir that Sayyidunā 'Alī رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ during his khilāfah followed the same pattern adopted by Sayyidunā Abū Bakr and Sayyidunā 'Umar رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُمَا:

عن أبي جعفر قال سلك علي بالخمس طريقتهما

Abū Ja'far states, "Alī followed their path with regards the khums."<sup>1</sup>

قال سلك به والله سبيل أبي بكر و عمر

He stated, "By Allah, he treaded the path of Abū Bakr and 'Umar with regards to it."<sup>2</sup>

1 *Muṣannaf 'Abd al-Razzāq*, vol. 5 pg. 237, chapter on khums and the share of the relatives.

2 *Sharḥ Ma'ānī al-Āthār*, vol. 2 pg. 135, chapter on the share of the relatives.

## Corroboration from Shīī Sources

The Shīī mujtahidīn have documented narrations supporting the issue under discussion, i.e. Sayyidunā Abū Bakr and Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنهما fulfilled the monetary rights of the relatives of Rasūlullāh صلى الله عليه وسلم.

### First Narration

Mullā Bāqir Majlisī reports in *Ḥaqq al-Yaqīn*, via Ḥadīdī Shīī from ‘Allāmah Abū Bakr al-Jawharī from his *Kitāb al-Saqīfah* with a sanad. Mention is made therein that Sayyidah Fāṭimah, Sayyidunā ‘Alī, and other relatives رضي الله عنهم demanded their share from Sayyidunā Abū Bakr رضي الله عنه. Abū Bakr declared:

من ازین ایت (ایت خمس) نجی فہم کہ ہمہ را بشمارد ہم و لیکن ایں قدر کہ شمارا بس باشد میدہم و عمر نیز در ایں باب تصدیق او کرد

“I do not understand from this verse (of khums) that the entire khums should be given to you. However, that amount will be given to you which meets your needs.”

‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb agreed with him in this matter. (i.e. ‘Umar supported him in giving the khums and did not prevent him from the same.)<sup>1</sup>

### Second Narration

Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd narrates a lengthy narration in *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah* with a complete sanad leading upto Abū Bakr al-Jawharī. Mention is made therein of Sayyidah Fāṭimah asking Sayyidunā Abū Bakr رضي الله عنهما for the produce of Fadak. Upon this Sayyidunā Abū Bakr رضي الله عنه declared that just as Rasūlullāh صلى الله عليه وسلم fulfilled her expenses from the produce of Fadak and gave the remainder for other demands of the path of Allah, he will definitely do the same. Sayyidah Fāṭimah رضي الله عنها asked him to swear on oath that he will carry this out and Sayyidunā Abū

---

1 *Ḥaqq al-Yaqīn*, pg. 129, chapter on the criticism against Abū Bakr, discussion on the ḥadīth: We the group of Ambiyā’, old print, Lucknow, pg. 210, Tehran print.

Bakr رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ complied. Sayyidah Fāṭimah رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهَا then said, “O Allah, remain witness over this.” It is mentioned thereafter:

و كان أبو بكر يأخذ غلتها و يدفع إليهم منها ما يكفيهم و يقسم الباقي و كان عمر كذلك و كان عثمان كذلك ثم كان علي كذلك و في رواية ثم فعلت الخلفاء بعده كذلك

Abū Bakr would take its produce and give them (the Banū Hāshim) what was sufficient for their needs and would distribute the rest (to other people). ‘Umar did the same and so did ‘Uthmān and ‘Alī.

Another narration mentions, “The Khulafā’ after him did the very same.”<sup>1</sup>

## Conclusions

1. These Shīṭī narrations establish that Sayyidunā Abū Bakr and Sayyidunā ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُمَا would fulfil the monetary rights (khums, produce of Fadak, etc.) of Rasūlullāh’s صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ relatives. They did not usurp their rights in any way, nor destroyed them. Rather, they continued fulfilling them in a proper way according to the Islamic manner. And Sayyidunā ‘Uthmān رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ followed suite.
2. The three Khulafā’ fulfilled the monetary rights of Rasūlullāh’s صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ relatives according to the prophetic tradition. They did not contradict Rasūlullāh’s صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ method.
3. It is apparent from this that Sayyidah Fāṭimah was pleased with Sayyidunā Abū Bakr رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ in this matter. When she was pleased, then Sayyidunā ‘Alī, and the rest of them would also be pleased.

---

1 *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*, vol. 36 pg. 296, old Iran print, vol. 4 pg. 111, Beirut print, chapter regarding what Abū Bakr did with Fadak and what he stated regarding it; Ibn Maytham: *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah (Miṣbāḥ al-Sālikīn)*, vol. 35 pg. 543, old Iran print, vol. 5 pg. 107, new Tehran print, objective 8, commentary of his letter to ‘Uthmān ibn Ḥanīf; *al-Durrah al-Najfiyyah*, under his statement: definitely, Fadak was in our possession from all under the canopy of the sky, old Iran print.



## Further Corroboration of Their Warm Relations

We have briefly presented the narrations of fulfilling the khums. There are other transmission in our books which highlight the goodwill, benevolence, and concern of Sayyidunā ‘Umar al-Fārūq رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ for the Ahl al-Bayt, the Banū Hāshim. We wish to enlighten and delight the readers with some of these transmissions.

### First Narration

عن حماد بن زيد عن النعمان بن راشد عن الزهري أن عمر بن الخطاب قال إن جاء في خمس العراق لا أدع هاشميا إلا زوجته و لا من لا جارية له إلا أخذته قال و كان يعطي الحسن و الحسين

From Ḥammād ibn Zayd—from Nu‘mān ibn Rāshid—from al-Zuhrī:

‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb declared, “When the khums of Iraq comes (after conquering it), I will get every unmarried Hāshimī married and provide a slave for those who do not possess a slave girl.”

He would give Ḥasan and Ḥusayn hand-outs.<sup>1</sup>

### Second Narration

Ḥāfiẓ Ibn Kathīr records the following anecdote:

إن عمر لما نظر إلى ذلك قال إن قوما أدوا هذا لأمناء فقال له علي بن أبي طالب إنك عفتت عفت رعيته و لو رعت لرتعت ثم قسم عمر ذلك في المسلمين فأصاب عليا قطعة من البساط فباعها بعشرين ألفا

(After Madā’in—the capital of Kisrā—was conquered in 16 A.H., Sayyidunā Sa’d ibn Abī Waqqāṣ sent plenty items including fabric, jewellery, and items of pomp and glory to Sayyidunā ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ. He handed over to the warriors their respective shares and sent the rest to Madīnah.)

---

1 *Kitāb al-Amwāl*, pg. 335, chapter on the share of the dhawī al-qurbā from the khums, Egypt print; *al-Riyāḍ al-Naḍīrah*, vol. 2 pg. 28, with reference to Ibn al-Bakhtarī al-Razzāz, chapter of his maintaining ties with the relatives of Rasūlullāh صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ; *Kanz al-Ummāl*, vol. 2 pg. 305, Ḥadīth: 6378, old print.

When ‘Umar saw this he exclaimed, “Indeed, the people have handed over this wealth to honest men.”

Hearing this ‘Alī commented, “You exercised decency and restraint so the populace observed the same. Had you drowned in luxury and negligence, they would have followed suite.”

‘Umar thereafter distributed that between the Muslims and ‘Alī received a piece of expensive carpet which he sold for 20 000 dirhams.<sup>1</sup>

There is more detail in *Muṣannaf ‘Abd al-Razzāq*:

ثم قال أنكيل لهم بالصاع أم نحثو فقال علي بل احثوا لهم ثم دعا حسن بن علي أول الناس فحثا له ثم دعا حسينا ثم أعطى الناس و دون الديوان و فرض للمهاجرين لكل رجل منهم خمسة آلاف درهم في كل سنة و للأنصار لكل رجل منهم أربعة آلاف درهم و فرض لأزواج النبي صلى الله عليه و سلم لكل امرأة منهن اثني عشر ألف درهم إلخ

He asked, “Should I give them by measurement or in handfuls?”

‘Alī said, “Rather, give them handfuls.”

He then called Ḥasan ibn ‘Alī and gave him a handful of wealth followed by Ḥusayn. Thereafter, he gave the people and prepared the register. He allocated for every Muhājirī male 5000 dirhams every year and for every Ansari male 4000 dirhams and for every wife of the Nabī ﷺ 12 000 dirhams.<sup>2</sup>

### Third Narration

At times, Sayyidunā ‘Alī would receive special stipends from Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه. An incident of this nature will be reproduced here.

1. Yaḥyā ibn Ādam reports via his sanad:

---

1 *Sīrat ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb*, pg. 96; *al-Bidāyah*, vol. 7 pg. 67.

2 *Muṣannaf ‘Abd al-Razzāq*, vol. 11 pg. 100, chapter on the register, regarding the treasures of Kisrā.

سمعت عبد الله بن الحسن يقول إن عليا سأل عمر بن الخطاب فأقطعته ينبع

I heard ‘Abd Allah ibn al-Ḥasan saying, “Alī asked ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb for some land. So he gave him Yanbu’.”<sup>1</sup>

2. It is reported via a full sanad in *Futūḥ al-Buldān* of al-Balādhurī from Imām Ja‘far al-Ṣādiq:

عن جعفر بن محمد عن أبيه إنه قال أقطع عمر بن الخطاب عليا ينبع فأضاف إليها غيرها

From Ja‘far ibn Muḥammad—from his father who said:

‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb allotted Yanbu’ for ‘Alī and added another to it.<sup>2</sup>

3. Burhān al-Dīn Ibrahim ibn Mūsā al-Ṭarābilī al-Ḥanafī writes in *al-Is‘āf fi Aḥkām al-Awqāf*:

عن عبد العزيز بن محمد عن أبيه عن علي بن أبي طالب رضي الله عنه إن عمر بن الخطاب قطع لعلي ينبع ثم اشترى علي إلى قطيعته التي قطع له عمر أشياء فحفر فيهما عينا فبيناهم يعملون إذ تفجر عليهم مثل العنق الجوز من الماء فأتى عليا فبشره بذلك ... وبلغ جداده في زمن علي ألف وسق

From ‘Abd al-‘Azīz ibn Muḥammad—from his father—from ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib رضي الله عنه:

‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb allotted Yanbu’ for ‘Alī. Thereafter ‘Alī purchased some land adjacent to the land ‘Umar allotted for him. He then had a spring dug in them. While they were busy, suddenly water gushed forth like a huge camel over them. He approached ‘Alī and gave him glad tidings of the same. Its produce in ‘Alī’s time reached 1000 wasaq<sup>3,4</sup>

---

1 *Kitāb al-Kharāj*, pg. 78, Egypt print 1347; *al-Sunan al-Kubrā*, vol. 6 pg. 144, chapter on allotting uncultivated land.

2 *Futūḥ al-Buldān*, pg. 20, first edition, Egypt; *Muṣannaḥ Ibn Abī Shaybah*, vol. 12 pg. 355, book on jihād, Karachi print.

3 *Wasaq* is a unit of measurement equal to approximately 191 kg, accordingly 1000 wasaq is equal to 191 000 kg.

4 *Kitāb al-Is‘āf fi Aḥkām al-Awqāf*, pg. 7, 8, 905 edition.; *Wafā’ al-Wafā’*, vol. 4 pg. 1334, under the word Yanbu’; *Mu‘jam al-Buldān*, vol. 20 pg. 450, under Yanbu’.

Beloved readers! These incidents prove beyond doubt that the relationship between Sayyidunā ‘Umar and Sayyidunā ‘Alī عليه السلام was sweet and that the latter would accept gifts from the former. These are evident signs of their cordial friendship which is not in need of any commentary. Every man with sound temperament can reach suitable deductions.

## Chapter Three

Through Allah's سُبْحَانَكَ وَبِحَمْدِكَ يَا أَرْحَمَ الرَّاحِمِينَ grace, we now begin chapter three which will be subdivided into four sections.

- **Section One:** Aspects relating to Fāṭimah and 'Alī's participation in 'Umar's wedding
- **Section Two:** Issues concerning the Marriage of 'Umar to Umm Kulthūm bint 'Alī and additional Issues
- **Section Three:** The Relationship between 'Umar and Ḥasan and Ḥusayn.
- **Section Four:** Bequests and Extra Matters in 'Umar's Last Days and Matters after his Demise which manifest the amicable relationship 'Umar and 'Alī enjoyed.

### Section One

#### Aspects relating to Fāṭimah and 'Alī's participation in 'Umar's wedding

Sayyidunā 'Umar al-Fārūq رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ had strong faith in Rasūlullāh صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ and believed him to be more noble and honoured than his own life and wealth. He always displayed utmost respect, honour, and veneration for Rasūlullāh's صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ offspring. His life bears testimony to this fact.

#### Theme One

At the period around the proposal of Sayyidah Fāṭimah رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهَا, Sayyidunā 'Umar and Sayyidunā Abū Bakr both supported Sayyidunā 'Alī رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ and encouraged him to ask for her hand in marriage. Many quotations were reproduced verbatim in full in the Ṣiddīqī section of this book in this regard. Here they will be reproduced briefly.

## 1. Abū Ja'far al-Ṭūsī reports Sayyidunā 'Alī's رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ statement in *Al-Amālī*:

يقول أتاني أبو بكر و عمر فقالوا لو أتيت رسول الله صلى الله عليه و آله فذكرت له فاطمة قال فأتيته

Abū Bakr and 'Umar came to me and suggested, "Why do you not approach Rasūlullāh صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ and propose for Fāṭimah." Thus, I came to him.<sup>1</sup>

## 2. Mullā Al-Bāqir Majlisī mentions in *Jalā' al-'Uyūn*:

ابوبکر و عمر و سعد بن معاذ در مسجد حضرت رسول نشستند و سخن مزاجه فاطمه در میان آوردند - پس ابو بکر گفت که اشرف قریش خواستگاری او از ان نمودند - حضرت در جواب ایشان فرمود که امر او بسوء پروردگار اوست اگر خواهد که او را تزویج نماید خواهد نمود و علی بن ابی طالب درین باب با حضرت سخن نه گفت و کسی نیز برائے این حضرت سخن نه گفت و گمان نه دارم که چیزے مانع شده باشد او را مگر تنگدستی و آنچه میدانم اینست که خدا و رسول نداشته اند مگر از برائے او پس ابو بکر با عمر و سعد بن معاذ گفت که بر خیزید بنزد علی برویم و او را تکلیف نمائیم که خواستگاری فاطمه بکند و اگر تنگدستی او را مانع شده باشد ما او را درین باب مدد کنیم - سعد بن معاذ گفت که بسیار درست دیده و برخاستند بخانه امیر المومنین رفتند - اجناب را در خانه نیافتند - در این وقت حضرت شتر خود را برده بود در باغ یکے از انصار ایب میکشید با جرت پس متوجه این باغ شدند چون بخدمت این حضرت رسیدند فرمود که برائے چه حاجت آمده اید - ابوبکر گفت (اے علی) بیچ خصلتے از خصلت خیر نیست مگر اینکه تو بر دیگران در این خصلت سبق گرفته و رابطه میان تو و حضرت رسول از جهت خویشی و مصاحبت دائمی ----- پس چه مانع است ترا؟ که خواستگاری نمی نمائی او را زیرا که مرا گمان ست که خدا و رسول او را برائے تو نگاذاشته اند و از دیگران منع میکنند - چون حضرت امیر المومنین این سخنان را از ابوبکر شنید ایب از دیده بائے مبارکش فروریخت و فرموده که اندوه مرا تازه کردی و از رویے که در سینتھ من پنهان بود بیجان آوردی - که باشد که فاطمه را نخواهد؟ ولیکن من باعتبار تنگدستی شرم میکنم از اینکه این معنی را نمائیم - پس ایشان بهر نحویکه بود این حضرت را راضی کردند که بخدمت حضرت رسول رود و فاطمه را از ان حضرت خواستگاری نماید - حضرت شتر خود را کشود و بخانه خود آورد و بست و نعلین خود را پوشید و متوجه خانه حضرت رسالت شد -

On one occasion Abū Bakr, 'Umar and Sa'd ibn Mu'adh were sitting in Masjid Nabawī and a discussion about the marriage of Fāṭimah ensued. Abū Bakr said: "Eminent people of the Quraysh tribe have spoken to Rasūlullāh صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ regarding Fāṭimah and he responded by saying that her matter is in the hands of her Rabb and He will give her in marriage to whomsoever He wishes. 'Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib has not spoken to Rasūlullāh صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ regarding her nor has anyone put a word in for him, and according to me the only

1 *Al-Amālī*, vol. 1 pg. 38, Najaf Ashraf print, Iraq.

predicament because of which he is hesitant in proposing for her is his poverty, but Rasūlullāh ﷺ has reserved her marriage to him.”

Abū Bakr then said to ‘Umar and Sa’d ibn Mu’ādh: “Come let us go to ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib and prepare him for the proposal and grant him monetary assistance if poverty is proving to be a hindrance for him.”

Sa’d replied that this was an excellent suggestion. They stood up immediately and headed to the residence of Amir al-Mu’minīn, ‘Alī was not home at that time. Instead he was at an orchard belonging to an Anṣārī Ṣaḥābī drawing out water from a well for him in lieu of a specific wage. These three gentlemen headed towards that orchard to meet him. ‘Alī enquired about the reason for their visit and Abū Bakr answered, “You have surpassed many people with your outstanding traits and you are a close relative of Rasūlullāh ﷺ and have had the good fortune of accompanying him at all times, so what is it that prevents you from proposing for Fāṭimah? I believe that Allah ﷻ and His Rasūlullāh ﷺ have secured this relation for you and have kept it out of the reach of others.”

Upon hearing this ‘Alī began weeping and said: “O Abū Bakr you have refreshed my grief and have rekindled the passionate desire of my heart, who would ever step back from such a proposal but I feel timid to ask for her on account of my poverty.”

Hence they motivated him to proceed to the Rasūlullāh ﷺ and propose. He untied his camel, came home adorned himself and headed towards the house of Rasūlullāh ﷺ.<sup>1</sup>

3. Mirzā Rafī Bādhil al-Shīrī composes few couplets in *Ḥamlah Ḥaydarī* while discussing the events of the second year hijrah. The manner Sayyidunā Abū Bakr and Sayyidunā ‘Umar encouraged Sayyidunā ‘Alī ﷺ has been composed in a most eloquent way in these Persian couplets:

---

1 *Jalā’ al-‘Uyūn*, pg. 121, 122, chapter regarding the marriage of Amīr al-Mu’minīn to Fāṭimah; *Biḥār al-Anwār*, vol. 10 pg. 37/38, under the same topic.

کہ دارم دو مانع بر اقدام این	ب پاسخ چنین گفت یعسوب دین
دوم خامشم کرده دست تہی	نخست اینکہ شرم ایدم از نبی
تو در خاطر خویش ازینہا مہار	بگفتند یار انش ای شہریار
بروز دگر رفت نزد نبی	بہ ترغیب یاران علی ولی
یکے روز رفتند نزد علی	چوں بگذشت چندے بدیں داوری
بگفتند اے شمع این انجمن	زیاران مخصوص او چند تن
سکوتت درین خطبہ چندی چراست	درین کار خیر اولیت تراست
بکن خواستگاری خیر النساء	رو از خدمت سید انبیاء
کہ دارم دو مانع بر اقدام این	بپاسخ چنین گفت یعسوب دین
دوم خامشم کرده دست تہی	نخست اینکہ شرم ایدم از نبی
بگفتند یارانش ای شہر یار	بگفتند یارانش ای شہر یار
ازو آنچه خوابی کنی درخورست	ترا با نبی نسبت دیگرست
نخواہد رسول کریم از تو بیچ	زدست تہی نیز بر خود مہیچ
بروز دگر رفت نزد نبی	بہ ترغیب یاران علی ولی

When a few days had passed to this affair, there came one day to ‘Alī رضی اللہ عنہ

A few friends of his who said to him: “O the illumination of our confraternity!

What is keeping you behind from proposing, you are the most suitable person of all.

Go to the master of all the Ambiyā’ and ask him to bestow upon you the most virtuous lady.”

Hence the master of our faith (‘Alī) said: “There are two predicaments that prevent me from going ahead:

Firstly I feel timid to ask him for her and secondly my poverty compels me to remain silent.”

They thus said: “O our dear friend do not think of any of these things!

Your relationship with the Nabī صلی اللہ علیہ وسلم is of a different nature. You can ask him for whatever you desire.



Do not worry about your poverty because he will demand nothing from you (he does not desire anything of yours).”

With the motivation of his friends, ‘Alī proceeded the next day to propose to the Nabi ﷺ.<sup>1</sup>

## Theme Two

Thereafter, when the nikāḥ ceremony was to be performed, Rasūlullāh ﷺ appointed Sayyidunā ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ as one of the witnesses to the marriage. We quoted many quotations in the Ṣiddiqī section to verify this point, some of which we will briefly quote here.

Akhṭab Khawārizm in *Manāqib Khawārizmī*, ‘Alī ibn ‘Īsā Arbilī in *Kashf al-Ghummah*, Mullā al-Bāqir Majlisī in *Biḥār al-Anwār* and *Jalā’ al-‘Uyūn* have reported this issue. All of these narrations are of the Shī‘ah quoting the statement of Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ. He declares:

When I headed for the Maṣjid from Rasūlullāh’s ﷺ home, Abū Bakr and ‘Umar welcomed me and escorted me to the Maṣjid. (The nikāḥ ceremony took place in the Maṣjid. Abū Bakr and ‘Umar were in the maṣjid from beforehand.) The rest of the Muhājirīn and Anṣār were called. While Rasūlullāh ﷺ was reciting the nikāḥ khuṭbah, he said:

و أمرني أن أزوجه في الأرض و أشهدكم على ذلك

Allah instructed me to marry Fāṭimah to him on earth and make you all witnesses to it.<sup>2</sup>

---

1 *Ḥamlah Ḥaydarī*, vol. 1 pg. 61, old edition, 1267 A.H.

2 *Manāqib Khawārizmī*, pg. 251 – 252, chapter on Rasūlullāh ﷺ marrying Fāṭimah off, Maktabah Ḥaydariyyah print, Najaf Ashraf, Iraq; *Kashf al-Ghummah*, vol. 1 pg. 483 – 484, chapter on giving the queen of the women in marriage, new print with Persian translation; *Biḥār al-Anwār*, vol. 1 pg. 38 – 39, same chapter.

Mullā Al-Bāqir Majlisī reports this incident in *Jalā' al-'Uyūn* in the chapter regarding Fāṭimah's marriage to 'Alī with extra details. He also mentioned the issue of Sayyidunā Abū Bakr and Sayyidunā 'Umar رضي الله عنهما being witnesses to the marriage.

The narration reads:

After Rasūlullāh صلى الله عليه وسلم made the angels witness to this nikāḥ, he addressed the participants of that gathering (among whom were Abū Bakr and 'Umar), “My Lord commands me to marry Fāṭimah to 'Alī on earth and make you witnesses to it.”<sup>1</sup>

### Theme Three

Let us present a third aspect. According to Sayyidunā 'Umar رضي الله عنه, honouring and respecting Sayyidah Fāṭimah رضي الله عنها due to her being the daughter of Rasūlullāh صلى الله عليه وسلم is necessary. This is a glaring evidence of passionate reverence for Rasūlullāh صلى الله عليه وسلم. Ḥākim al-Nīshāpūrī reports this narration in *al-Mustadrak*:

إن عمر بن الخطاب دخل على فاطمة بنت رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم فسلم فقال يا فاطمة والله ما رأيت أحد أحب إلى رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم منك والله ما كان أحد من الناس بعد أبيك صلى الله عليه وسلم أحب إلي منك

'Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb entered upon Fāṭimah bint Rasūlullāh صلى الله عليه وسلم and said, “O Fāṭimah, by Allah, I have never seen anyone more beloved to Rasūlullāh صلى الله عليه وسلم than you. By Allah, there is no one more beloved to me after your father صلى الله عليه وسلم than you.”<sup>2</sup>

### Theme Four

Fourthly, after the demise of Rasūlullāh صلى الله عليه وسلم Sayyidunā Fāṭimah رضي الله عنها was grief stricken and sorrowful. She passed away in the year 11 A.H. approximately 6

---

1 *Jalā' al-'Uyūn*, pg. 125, Tehran print.

2 *Al-Mustadrak*, vol. 3 pg. 155; *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, vol. 7 pg. 111, first edition.

months after her father’s demise. The Shīī scholars have reported that Sayyidunā Abū Bakr and Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنهما would visit her during her illness. However, they darken the narrations with concocted additions to transform it into a tale of hatred as is their habit. An incident of such a nature is recorded in *Kitāb Sulaym ibn Qays* which was painted with the colours of hatred. They have painted friendly incidents with colours of animosity.

We then wish to present the narration proving the participation of Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه in the janāzah of Sayyidah Fāṭimah رضي الله عنها. This has been reported from Zayn al-‘Ābidīn and Muḥammad al-Bāqir in various books. The forthcoming narrations will prove this point. This aspect has been dealt with in the Ṣiddīqī section where we proved Sayyidunā Abū Bakr’s رضي الله عنه participation. Here, we aspire to prove Sayyidunā ‘Umar’s رضي الله عنه participation.

### **The Report of Zayn al-‘Ābidīn ‘Alī ibn al-Ḥusayn**

Muḥibb al-Ṭabarī reports on the authority of Ibn al-Sammān:

عن مالك عن جعفر بن محمد عن أبيه عن جده علي بن الحسين قال ماتت فاطمة بين المغرب والعشاء فحضرها أبو بكر وعمر وعثمان والزبير وعبد الرحمن بن عوف فلما وضعت ليصلي عليها قال علي تقدم يا أبا بكر قال وأنت شاهد يا أبا الحسن قال نعم تقدم فوالله لا يصلي عليها غيرك فصلى عليها أبو بكر رضي الله عنهم أجمعين ودفنت ليلا خرجة البصري وخرجه السمان في الموافقة

From Mālik ibn Ja’far Muḥammad—from his father—from his grandfather ‘Alī ibn al-Ḥusayn who reports:

Fāṭimah passed away between Maghrib and ‘Ishā’. Abū Bakr, ‘Umar, ‘Uthmān, Zubayr, and ‘Abd al-Raḥmān ibn ‘Awf attended her burial. When her bier was placed for Ṣalāt al-Janāzah, ‘Alī said, “Step ahead (and lead the ṣalāh), O Abū Bakr.”

“In your presence, O Abū al-Ḥasan?” objected Abū Bakr.

“Yes,” re-joined ‘Alī, “Step ahead because by Allah, no one besides you will perform ṣalāh over her.”

Hence, Abū Bakr performed her Ṣalāt al-Janāzah. May Allah be pleased with them all. And she was buried at night.

Al-Baṣrī documented it and al-Sammān in *al-Muwāfaqah*.<sup>1</sup>

## The Report of Muḥammad al-Bāqir

عن جعفر بن محمد عن أبيه قال ماتت فاطمة بنت رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم فجاء أبو بكر و عمر ليصلوا فقال أبو بكر لعلي بن أبي طالب تقدم فقال ما كنت لأتقدم و أنت خليفة رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم فتقدم أبو بكر و صلى عليها

From Ja‘far ibn Muḥammad—from his father who said:

Fāṭimah, the daughter of Rasūlullāh ﷺ passed away. Abū Bakr and ‘Umar came to attend her Ṣalāt al-Janāzah. Abū Bakr told ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālīb, “Go ahead.”

He said, “It is not befitting for me to go ahead when you are the khalīfah of Rasūlullāh ﷺ.”

Thus, Abū Bakr went forward and led her Ṣalāt al-Janāzah.<sup>2</sup>

## Theme Five

### ‘Alī’s participation in ‘Umar’s wedding

The general custom throughout the ages is that friends and family share in the joyous and sad occasions of one another. Following this, Sayyidunā ‘Umar invited Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ with others for his nikāḥ and walīmah and the latter accepted the invitation wholeheartedly and attended. An incident also occurred in which Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ had an informal moment. Although the incident appears in many books, we will suffice on the report of *al-Istī‘āb* for purposes of

---

1 *Al-Riyāḍ al-Naḍīrah*, vol. 1 pg. 156, chapter on Fāṭimah’s demise.

2 *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, vol. 6 pg. 318, chapter on the virtues of the Ṣaḥābah, section on them giving superiority, the virtue of Ṣiddīq, with reference to al-Khaṭīb among Mālik’s narrators.

brevity since it is a well-known and easy accessible book. The references of other books will be provided.

فتزوجها (عاتكة بنت زيد بن عمرو بن نفيل) عمر بن الخطاب سنة اثنتي عشر فأولم عليها فدعا جمعاً فيهم علي بن أبي طالب فقال يا أمير المؤمنين دعني أكلم عاتكة قال افعلي فأخذ بجانبني الباب و قال يا عدية نفسها أين قولك فأليت لا تنفك عيني حزينة عليك و لا ينفك جلدي أغبراً فبكت فقال عمر ما دعاك إلى هذا يا أبا الحسن كل نساء يفعلن هذا إلخ

‘Umar ibn al-Khattāb married ‘Ātikah bint Zayd ibn ‘Amr ibn Nufayl in the year 12 A.H. He prepared a walīmah feast after consummating the marriage and invited many people including ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib. During the ceremony, ‘Alī said, “Amīr al-Mu‘minīn, allow me to have a word with ‘Ātikah.”

“Go ahead,” he consented.

‘Alī held the sides of the door and said, “O enemy of yourself, what happened to your couplet (which she read at the death of her previous husband ‘Abd Allāh ibn Abī Bakr): ‘I have sworn that my eyes shall remain grief stricken over you and my skin shall wear dust?’”

Hearing this, she began to cry. ‘Umar said, “What made you do this, Abū al-Ḥasan? All women are such (they forget the past and get involved in new things).”<sup>1</sup>

## Summary

From the narrations of this section it becomes manifest that Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه held the children of Rasūlullāh صلى الله عليه وسلم in high esteem. He also considered their status and respected them. He maintained an amiable relationship with them and continued fulfilling the rights of companionship. He also sustained his friendly relationship with Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه. They shared in each other’s times

---

1 *Al-Istī‘āb*, vol. 4 pg. 355, with *al-Iṣābah*, discussion on ‘Ātikah; *Nasab Quraysh*, vol. 1 pg. 365, discussion on the children of ‘Adī ibn Ka‘b; Ibn ‘Abd al-Barr: *Kitāb al-Tamhīd*, vol. 6 pg. 252, the narrations of Yaḥyā ibn Sa‘īd Ḥadīth: 46, Qilmī Pīr Jhandā, Sindh; *Usd al-Ghābah*, vol. 5 pg. 498, mention of ‘Ātikah bint Zayd.

of happiness and sadness. They invited each other and accepted such invitations. There existed no ill-feelings for each other. All these stories are testimonials to this.

### Removing a Misconception

In the first section of the third chapter, we shed some light on the relationship between Sayyidunā ‘Umar and Sayyidah Fāṭimah رضي الله عنها. Some level nasty accusations in contradiction of this fact which need to be removed. The objection will be mentioned briefly followed by its answer. This discussion is quite academic and will be enjoyed by the scholarly fraternity. We hope that the laymen do not get bored reading it.

Some people narrate an incident from Ibn Qutaybah al-Dīnawarī’s *al-Imāmah wa al-Siyāsah*, Ibn ‘Abd Rabīhī’s *al-‘Iqd al-Farīd*, and Ibn Jarīr al-Ṭabarī’s *Tārīkh al-Umam wa al-Mulūk* that when Sayyidunā Abū Bakr رضي الله عنه was taking bay‘ah from the people, he sent Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه to the house of Sayyidah Fāṭimah and Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه. Sayyidunā ‘Umar allegedly threatened to burn the house down with them in it if they do not give bay‘ah to Sayyidunā Abū Bakr رضي الله عنه. Pressurised by this threat, Sayyidunā ‘Alī, Sayyidunā Zubayr, and others went and pledged allegiance to Sayyidunā Abū Bakr رضي الله عنه.

This is the gist of the tale. People relate this tale with numerous details coupled with all types of exaggerations bombastically with the sole object of establishing and spreading the belief that there existed enmity between Sayyidunā Abū Bakr and Sayyidunā ‘Umar on the one hand and Sayyidunā ‘Alī and Sayyidah Fāṭimah رضي الله عنها on the other. Nothing else is desired from this *act of goodness*. They have wasted their lives and their predecessors exhausted their efforts to reach this goal.

We have mentioned few points in the Ṣiddīqī section while discussing the bay‘ah to remove this misconception and to answer this objection. However, we will mention other aspects here as well. By Allah’s will, people with sound

temperaments and who are supporters of the truth will be pleased with this discussion and will reach the correct conclusion without much effort.

- a. Firstly, this incident has been reported mainly from books which contain no chain of narration (sanad). No sanad is attached to these tales, from which the authenticity of the narration can be examined. For example Ibn Qutaybah al-Dīnawarī's *al-Imāmah wa al-Siyāsah*, Ibn 'Abd Rabīh's *al-'Iqd al-Farīd*, etc. do not cite a chain of transmission. The existence of tales of such a nature in books of this kind (which have no sanad) is not proof or evidence and cannot be accepted as authentic. All sorts of narrations are found in these books, correct and incorrect, truths and lies. Hence, they cannot be relied upon.

Moreover, it is only Shī'ī narrators and Shī'ī authors who passionately disseminate tales depicting hatred and animosity between the Ṣaḥābah رضي الله عنهم. From here we learn that the authors of *al-Imāmah wa al-Siyāsah* and *al-'Iqd al-Farīd* have this mind-set. The Ibn Qutaybah who authored *Mukhtalaf al-Ḥadīth*, *al-Ma'ārif*, and other famous books is a Sunnī 'Ālim and other than the above. The author of *al-Imāmah wa al-Siyāsah* is another Taqīyyah observing phony. Shāh 'Abd al-'Azīz has listed a few of the schemes of this Ibn Qutaybah in the schemes of the Shī'ah in *Tuḥfat Ithnā 'Ashariyyah*. Have a look at scheme 19, 23, and 81 for further satisfaction.

Regarding *al-'Iqd al-Farīd*, 'Ulama have emphatically declared it dubious. For example, Ibn Khalikān said that it contains all sorts of narrations, both authentic and false. Ibn Kathīr asserts that its language points to the fact that the author is Shī'ī.<sup>1</sup> In addition, in the latest publication of the book, the publishers clarified the position of the author in the preface by saying:

و هو أميل إلى التشيع

He had Shī'ī inclinations.

Therefore, the narrations of these books are unreliable.

---

<sup>1</sup> *Kashf al-Zunūn*, vol. 2 pg. 1149, under *al-'Iqd al-Farīd*.

- b. Secondly, the tale of burning of the house although reported in some books with a chain, all of these chains have been proven *majrūḥ* (discredited) with narrators suffering from severe weakness. For example, this incident appears in *Tārīkh al-Ṭabarī* but contains narrators who are liars and fabricators. Ibn Ḥumayd from whom al-Ṭabarī reports is described as *aḥdhaq bi al-kidhb* (master of deception) and *muqallib al-mutūn wa al-asānīd* (alters the text and chain). Besides, the narration is *maqṭūʿ* (the chain is interrupted) since the narrator Ziyād ibn Kulayb was not present to witness the incident. Someone reported it to him, but it is not known who the person is and what kind of a person he is.
- c. Even those narrations that are not severely criticised have the flaw of interruption in the chain of transmission. *Inqīṭāʿ zamānī* between the last narrator and the one before him has been determined, in other words the narrator did not witness the incident and was informed by someone else who is not mentioned. The narrations of Ibn Abī Shaybah and Ibn ʿAbd al-Barr etc., are of such a nature; i.e. *maqṭūʿ*. Both Zayd ibn Aslam and his father could never ever have been in Madīnah when the supposed incident occurred. Additionally, the ʿUlamāʾ have clearly criticised Zayd ibn Aslam of being a *mudallis* (one who omits the narrator from who he heard the information).<sup>1</sup> He is responsible for narrating all this hearsay. What is more is that sometimes harsh and nasty language is used while at other times, sweet and polite words are quoted. Probably, the narrators concocted and exaggerated the incident they did not witness. The proverb is famous:

شنيده کے بود مانند دیده

How can hearsay be equal to the witnessed?

Furthermore, the scholars will be well aware of the fact that Ibn Abī Shaybah is in the third category of *muḥaddithīn*. *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī*, *Ṣaḥīḥ*

---

<sup>1</sup> *Muqaddamat Kitāb al-Tamhīd*, vol. 1 pg. 36, discussion on *tadlīs*, Marrakech print; *Tahdhīb al-Tahdhīb*, vol. 3 pg. 396, Zayd ibn Aslam.



*Muslim*, and *Muwatta' Mālik* top the first category. The rest of the *Ṣiḥāḥ Sittah* fall in the second category. The third category lists books like *Muṣannaf Ibn Abī Shaybah* and *Muṣannaf 'Abd al-Razzāq*.<sup>1</sup> These authors did not strictly adhere to authenticity and reliability. Due to this, the muḥaddithīn put them in the third category.

Although, *al-Istī'āb* is a wonderful book containing the biographies of the noble Ṣaḥābah رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُمْ, reports of the disputes among the Ṣaḥābah رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُمْ are found in it and have flawed it. Due to these factors, the 'ulamā' have praised the book but at the same time, they have criticised the incorrect segments in it.

Ibn Ṣalāḥ writes in *Muqaddamah Ibn Ṣalāḥ* or '*Ulūm al-Ḥadīth li Ibn Ṣalāḥ* regarding *al-Istī'āb*:

و من أجلها وأكثرها فوائد كتاب الإستيعاب لولا ما شأنه من إيراده كثيرا مما شجر بين الصحابة و حكاياته  
عن الأخباريين لا المحدثين و غالب على الأخباريين الإكثار و التخليط فيما يروونه

One of the finest and most detailed books on biography is *al-Istī'āb*, if not for the aspects that have blemished it, i.e. reporting much of the disputes between the Ṣaḥābah and relating from the historians and not the Muḥaddithīn. The Historians are generally in the habit of exaggerating and concocting their reports. (They have not considered authenticity).<sup>2</sup>

Ḥāfiẓ Ibn Kathīr expressed similar sentiments in *al-Bā'ith al-Ḥathīth* with reference to Ibn Ṣalāḥ in the following words:

و قد شان ابن عبد البر كتابه الإستيعاب بذكر ما شجر بين الصحابة مما تلقاه من كتب الأخباريين غيرهم

Ibn 'Abd al-Barr has spoilt his book *al-Istī'āb* by mentioning the disputes between the Ṣaḥābah which he picked up from the books of the historians and others.<sup>3</sup>

1 Shāh 'Abd al-'Azīz: '*Ujālah Nāfi'ah*, pg. 7.

2 *Muqaddamat Ibn Ṣalāḥ*, chapter on the 39th type, pg. 145, Mumbai print, pg. 262, new Madīnah print.

3 *Al-Bā'ith al-Ḥathīth*, pg. 179, type 39, Egypt print, edition three.

- d. Fourthly, no matter where the incident appears in whichever level book, in the light of the declarations of the great ‘Ulamā’ it is unworthy of acceptance. Sayyidunā ‘Alī al-Murtaḍā رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ and Muḥammad al-Bāqir gave the following advices and issued the upcoming commands.

### ‘Alī’s Declaration

Hāfiẓ al-Dhahabī writes while discussing Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ in *Tadhkirat al-Ḥuffāz*:

عن أبي الطفيل عن علي قال حدثوا الناس بما يعرفون و دعوا ما ينكرون أتحبون أن يكذب الله و رسوله قال الذهبي فقد زجر الإمام علي عن رواية المنكر و حث على التحديث بالمشهور و هذا أصل كبير في الكف عن بث الأشياء الواهية و المنكرة من الأحاديث في الفضائل و العقائد و الرقائق

From Abū al-Ṭufayl—from ‘Alī who said:

Relate to people what they are familiar with and avoid what they are unfamiliar with. Do you want Allah and His Messenger to be belied?

Al-Dhahabī said, “Imām ‘Alī has warned against strange reports and encouraged reporting well-known issues. This is a core essential in avoiding the spread of weak and munkar reports regarding virtues, beliefs, and heartfelt advices.”<sup>1</sup>

### Muḥammad al-Bāqir’s Statement

Shī‘ī books document that Imām Muḥammad al-Bāqir cited a portion of the prophetic final sermon and said:

فإذا أتاكم الحديث فأعرضوا على كتاب الله عز و جل و سنتي فما وافق كتاب الله و سنتي فخذوا به و ما خالف كتاب الله و سنتي فلا تأخذوا به

When a narration reaches you, then examine it in the light of the Book of Allah—the Mighty and Majestic—and my Sunnah. Take what is in harmony with Allah’s Book and my Sunnah and discard what contradicts them.<sup>2</sup>

1 *Tadhkirat al-Ḥuffāz*, vol. 1 pg. 12.

2 *Ihtijāj al-Ṭabarsī*, pg. 229, old print.

Let the readers be reassured that Allah’s *سُبْحَانَهُ وَتَعَالَى* Speech is testimony to the fact that the *Ṣaḥābah رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُمْ* were merciful and compassionate among themselves. Allah *سُبْحَانَهُ وَتَعَالَى* placed love and affection in their hearts. Due to their righteous actions, Allah *سُبْحَانَهُ وَتَعَالَى* is already pleased with them. The Sunnah of Rasūlullāh *صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ* is witness to the fact that all those who remained in his company were like sugar and honey, friends, and well-wishers of one another. They harboured no hatred nor ill-feelings for one another.

If we accept the burning tale as true, then it has painted a completely different picture of the *Ṣaḥābah رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُمْ* after Rasūlullāh’s *صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ* demise. It depicts them drawing swords and attacking each other, intending to burn the house of Rasūlullāh’s *صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ* daughter, and grabbing the collars of Sayyidunā ‘Alī and Sayyidunā Zubayr *رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُمَا*.

In the light of the statements of Sayyidunā ‘Alī and Muḥammad al-Bāqir *رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُمَا*, it is not at all permissible to accept such narrations. The contents of these narrations are in direct disagreement to the Book of Allah and are clashing with Rasūlullāh’s *صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ* Sunnah. To accept such munkar reports is to discard the instructions of the infallible A’immah.

Most importantly, the emphatic nuṣūṣ of the Glorious Qur’ān are rejecting these munkar reports. Allah’s Speech describes the Companions of Rasūlullāh *صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ* in the following glowing manner:

يَبْتَغُونَ فَضْلًا مِّنَ اللَّهِ وَرِضْوَانًا

*Seeking bounty from Allah and [His] approval<sup>1</sup>*

This remained their special attribute and unique characteristic throughout their lives, searching for Allah’s grace and pleasure.

If the reports of mutual rivalry, evil, and corruption are hypothetically taken as true, then the qualities of these noblemen should have been described as:

1 Sūrah al-Ḥaṣhr: 8.

يَسْتَعُونَ شَرًّا مِنَ اللَّهِ وَعَظْبَانًا

*Seeking evil from Allah and [His] wrath.*

Whereas this is not the case.

- e. Fifthly, there are narrations in ḥadīth and history books reporting this incident which contain absolutely no mention of these disputes and clashes. Neither do they contain harsh speech to Sayyidah Fāṭimah رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهَا, nor nasty treatment of Sayyidunā ‘Alī and Sayyidunā Zubayr رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُمَا. There is absolutely no sign of quarrelling and fighting. For now, I will present one such narration of al-Balādhurī from *Ansāb al-Ashrāf* so that different pictures of this incident appear before you and you may see it from another angle.

Aḥmad ibn Yaḥyā al-Balādhurī (d. 277/279 A.H.) reports:

لما بايع الناس أبا بكر اعتزل علي و الزبير فبعث إليهما عمر بن الخطاب و زيد بن ثابت فأتيا منزل علي ففرعا الباب فنظر الزبير من قتره ثم رجع إلى علي فقال هذان رجلان من أهل الجنة و ليس لنا أن نقاتاهم قال افتح لهما ثم خرجا معهما حتى أتيا أبا بكر فقال أبو بكر يا علي أنت ابن عم رسول الله و صهره فتقول إني أحق بهذا الأمر لاهما لاها الله لأنا أحق به منك قال لا تثريب يا خليفة رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم ابسط يدك أبايعك فبسط يده فبايعه

When the people gave bay‘ah to Abū Bakr, ‘Alī and Zubayr stayed away. So Abū Bakr sent ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb and Zayd ibn Thābit to them. They came to ‘Alī’s place and knocked on the door. Zubayr looked through the peephole and returned to ‘Alī explaining, “These two men are from the dwellers of Jannah and it is not befitting for us to clash with them.”

‘Alī said, “Open for them.”

The two then proceeded with them to the presence of Abū Bakr.

Abū Bakr said, “O ‘Alī, you are Rasūlullāh’s رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ cousin and son-in-law so you could say that you are most deserving of this post. No, by Allah, I am more deserving than you.”

‘Alī submitted, “There is no reproach upon you, O khalīfah of Rasūlullāh ﷺ. Stretch out your hand so I may pledge allegiance to you.”

Accordingly, he stretched his hand and ‘Alī gave him bay‘ah.<sup>1</sup>

This narration has been quoted previously in the Şiddīqī section under the discussion of the bay‘ah, narration 7, in detail. It has been briefly reproduced here.

The readers will now realise that narrations describing this incident are not of the same type. Some make no mention of any clash while others paint a picture of great drama. The ‘Ulamā’ have criticised and critiqued reports of dispute aforesaid. These statements will now be quoted.

1. Shāh ‘Abd al-‘Azīz Muḥaddith Dahlawī رحمه الله affirms in *Tuḥfat Ithnā ‘Ashariyyah*:

این قصه سراسر واهی و بیپتان و افتراست

This incident is totally false, a fabrication, and an accusation.<sup>2</sup>

2. Moulānā ‘Abd al-‘Azīz Parhārī writes in his book *Nabrās Sharḥ Sharḥ ‘Aqā‘id Nasafī*:

و سابعها أن أبا بكر أمر بإحراق بيت علي و فيه فاطمة و حسنان بتأخره عن البيعة قلنا كذب محض

The seventh allegation is that Abū Bakr commanded the burning of ‘Alī’s house while Fāṭimah, Ḥasan, and Ḥusayn were inside due to him delaying the bay‘ah. We declare: This is a blatant lie.<sup>3</sup>

In conclusion, those narrations which have no mention of any quarrels and fights will be accepted while the rest will be rejected.

---

1 *Ansāb al-Ashrāf*, pg. 585, new Egypt print, 1959 A.H. edition.

2 *Tuḥfat Ithnā ‘Ashariyyah*, chapter on accusations, Fārūqī accusation 2, under the incident of burning the house.

3 *Nabrās Sharḥ Sharḥ ‘Aqā‘id Nasafī*, pg. 529, under the text: it is not a condition for the imām to be infallible, Multan print.

## Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd's Observation

The readers should be aware of the fact that not only Sunnī 'Ulamā' have discarded the reports of the burning of Fāṭimah's house. Rather, some Shī'ī scholars have declared such narrations unacceptable and unreliable. Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd declares:

و أما ما ذكره من الهجوم على دار فاطمة و جمع الحطب لتحريقها فهو خبر واحد غير موثوق به و لا معمول عليه في حق الصحابة بل و لا في حق أحد من المسلمين ممن ظهرت عدالته

Concerning what he reported of raiding Fāṭimah's house and gathering firewood to burn it, it is a *khbar wāḥid* (a solitary narration) and is unreliable. It is also not relied upon in respect of the Ṣaḥābah nor any of the Muslims whose honesty is manifest.<sup>1</sup>

## Fāṭimah's Pleasure

If for argument's sake we take it that Sayyidah Fāṭimah رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهَا became angry with Sayyidunā 'Umar رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ, then we will like to point out that Shī'ī scholars have recorded in books deemed reliable by them that Sayyidah Fāṭimah became pleased with Sayyidunā 'Umar رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهَا afterwards.

## First Narration

Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd Shī'ī in *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah* with reference to Abū Bakr al-Jawharī first mentions Sayyidah Fāṭimah's رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهَا anger and her subsequent happiness in these words:

قال فمشى إليها أبو بكر بعد ذلك و شفع لعمر و طلب إليها فرضيت عنه

Abū Bakr walked to her after this and interceded on behalf of 'Umar and sought her pleasure. Finally, she became pleased with him.<sup>2</sup>

1 *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*, vol. 4 pg. 631, under the text: his statement to 'Ammār ibn Yāsir when he heard him answering back, "leave him O 'Ammār." Beirut print.

2 *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*, vol. 1 pg. 157, discussion on the Imām to Bay'ah, Beirut print.

## Second Narration

Mullā al-Bāqir Majlisī records the same thing in *Ḥaqq al-Yaqīn*:

چوں علی و زبیر بیعت کردند و این فتنه فرونشست ابو بکر امد و شفاعت کرد از برائے عمر و فاطمه ازو راضی شد

After 'Alī and Zubayr gave bay'ah and this fitnah was quelled, Abū Bakr came and interceded for 'Umar and Fāṭimah became happy.<sup>1</sup>

## Call to Conciliation

When our noble seniors became pleased with each other, then we as followers should follow suite and cease actions that spur violence and aggression and rather spread an atmosphere of harmony and compromise.

---

1 *Ḥaqq al-Yaqīn*, pg. 110, old print, Lucknow, pg. 180, new print, Tehran, discussion on 'Alī's bay'ah under duress.

## Section Two

### Issues concerning the Marriage of ‘Umar to Umm Kulthūm bint ‘Alī

We wish to include five themes in this section, just as was done in section one.

We present here historical reports from books of ḥadīth and history which bear witness to the friendly relationship Sayyidunā ‘Umar and Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه enjoyed.

#### Theme One

It is an undeniable fact that for a relationship to be established between two people by one handing over his daughter and the other accepting her in his wedlock, this is based on mutual reliance and confidence. After this link is established, their brotherly connection is strengthened considerably.

Following this social and natural principle, Sayyidunā ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb al-Fārūq proposed to Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه for his daughter Umm Kulthūm and the latter responded positively and optimistically and contracted the nikāḥ. This was done under no coercion or duress.

Sayyidunā ‘Umar al-Fārūq رضي الله عنه was extremely elated at this and expressed his boundless joy by quoting the sweet words which he heard directly from Rasūlullāh صلى الله عليه وسلم, “All ties of kinship and connection will be severed on the Day of Qiyāmah besides my ties of kinship and connection (which will prove beneficial).” Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه said that it was his cherished hope to have a connection to Rasūlullāh’s صلى الله عليه وسلم family.

This matter has been documented in books of ḥadīth and history by the muḥaddithīn and historians. Firstly, we will present some snippets for the benefits of the readers followed by the unequivocal statements of the masters of genealogy and biography which openly record the details of this marriage.



## First Narration

It appears in *al-Sunan* of Saʿīd ibn Manṣūr al-Khurāsānī al-Makkī (d. 227 A.H):

عن جعفر بن محمد عن أبيه إن عمر بن الخطاب خطب إلي علي بن أبي طالب ابنته أم كلثوم فقال علي إنما حبست بناتي علي بني جعفر فقال انكحنيها فوالله ما على الأرض رجل أرصد من حسن عشرتها ما أرصدت فقال علي قد أنكحتكها فجاء عمر إلي مجلس المهاجرين بين القبر والمنبر وكان المهاجرون يجلسون ثم وعلي و عبد الرحمن بن عوف و الزبير و عثمان و طلحة و سعد فإذا كان العشي يأتي عمر الأمر من الآفاق و يقضي فيه جاءهم و أخبرهم ذلك و استشارهم كلهم فقال رفثوني قالوا بم يا أمير المؤمنين قال بابنة علي بن أبي طالب ثم أنشأ يحدثهم أن رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم قال كل نسب و سبب منقطع يوم القيامة إلا نسبي و سببي كنت صحبتته فأحببت أن يكون هذا لي أيضا

From Jaʿfar ibn Muḥammad—from his father:

ʿUmar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb proposed to ʿAlī ibn Abī Ṭālib for his daughter Umm Kulthūm. ʿAlī said, “Indeed I kept my daughters only for Jaʿfar’s sons.”

ʿUmar submitted, “Please marry her to me for by Allah, there is no man on earth that has prepared the way I am prepared to live happily with her.”

ʿAlī then said, “I have given her to you in marriage.”

ʿUmar then came to the gathering of Muhājirīn between the grave and the pulpit. The Muhājirīn would sit there including ʿAlī, ʿAbd al-Raḥmān ibn ʿAwf, Zubayr, ʿUthmān, Ṭalḥah, and Saʿd. In the evening, affairs from the different lands would come to him and he would make decisions about them. He would come to them and inform them about the affairs seeking their counsel.

So he came to them and said, “Congratulate me.”

“For what, O Amīr al-Muʿminīn,” they enquired.

“On marrying ʿAlī ibn Abī Ṭālib’s daughter,” he explained.

He then began relating to them that Rasūlullāh ﷺ declared, “All ties of kinship and connection (relationship through marriage) will be severed

on the Day of Qiyāmah besides my ties of kinship and connection (which will prove beneficial).”

He continued, “I was his Companion and desired to have this link to him as well.”<sup>1</sup>

## Second Narration

Al-Ḥākim al-Nīshāpūrī (d. 405 A.H.) relates in *al-Mustadrak*:

عن جعفر بن محمد عن أبيه عن علي بن الحسين أن عمر بن الخطاب خطب إلى علي أم كلثوم فقال أنكحنيها فقال علي إني أرصدها لابن أخي عبد الله بن جعفر فقال عمر أنكحنيها فوالله ما من الناس أحد يرصد من أمرها ما أرصده فأنكحه علي فأتى عمر المهاجرين فقال ألا تهنتوني فقال بمن يا أمير المؤمنين فقال بأُم كلثوم بنت علي و ابنة فاطمة بنت رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم إني سمعت رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم يقول كل نسب و سبب ينقطع يوم القيامة إلا ما كان من سببي و نسبي فأحببت أن يكون بيني و بين رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم نسب و سبب هذا حديث صحيح الإسناد و لم يخرجاه

From Ja‘far ibn Muḥammad—from his father—from ‘Alī ibn al-Ḥusayn:

‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb proposed to ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib for Umm Kulthūm saying, “Give her in marriage to me.”

‘Alī said, “I have kept her for my nephew ‘Abd Allāh ibn Ja‘far.”

‘Umar submitted, “Please marry her to me for by Allah, there is no man on earth that has prepared the way I am prepared to marry her.”

As a result, ‘Alī got her married to him. ‘Umar then came to the Muḥājirīn and said, “Why do you not congratulate me?”

“With who, O Amīr al-Mu‘minīn,” they enquired.

“With Umm Kulthūm bint ‘Alī, the daughter of Fāṭimah bint Rasūlullāh ﷺ. I certainly heard Rasūlullāh ﷺ saying, ‘All ties of kinship and

---

1 *Al-Sunan*, vol. 3 pg. 130, section one, chapter on looking at a woman when desiring to marry her, Majlis ‘Ilmī publication, Karachi and Dabhel.

connection will be cut on the Day of Qiyāmah besides my ties of kinship and connection.’ Thus, I desired to have a connection to Rasūlullāh ﷺ.

This is a ḥadīth with a ṣaḥīḥ isnād, but they (al-Bukhārī and Muslim) have not recorded it.<sup>1</sup>

### Third Narration

‘Allāmah ‘Alī Muttaqī Hindī reports Umm Kulthūm’s nikāḥ in *Kanz al-Ummāl* in the following manner:

عن أبي جعفر إن عمر بن الخطاب خطب إلى علي بن أبي طالب ابنته أم كلثوم فقال علي إنما حبست بناتي على بني جعفر فقال عمر أنكحنيها يا علي فوالله ما علي ظهر الأرض رجل يرصد من حسن صحابتها ما أرصد فقال علي قد فعلت فجاء عمر إلى مجلس المهاجرين بين القبر والمنبر و كانوا يجلسون علي و عثمان و الزبير و طلحة و عبد الرحمن بن عوف فإذا كان الشيء يأتي عمر بن الخطاب من الأفاق جاءهم فأخبرهم بذلك فاستشارهم فيه فجاء عمر فقال زفوني و قالوا بمن يا أمير المؤمنين قال بابنة علي بن أبي طالب ثم أنشأ يخبرهم فقال إن النبي صلى الله عليه و سلم قال كل سبب و نسب منقطع يوم القيامة إلا سببي و نسبي و كنت قد صحبتته فأحببت أن يكون هذا أيضا

On the authority of Abū Ja‘far:

‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb proposed to ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib for his daughter Umm Kulthūm. ‘Alī said, “I kept my daughters only for Ja‘far’s sons.”

‘Umar submitted, “Kindly marry her to me for by Allah, there is no man on earth that has prepared the way I am prepared to look after her.”

‘Alī then said, “I have done so.”

‘Umar then came to the gathering of Muhājirīn between the grave and the pulpit. ‘Alī, ‘Uthmān, Zubayr, Ṭalḥah, and ‘Abd al-Raḥmān ibn ‘Awf would sit there. When any matter would come to ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb from the various parts of the world, he would come to them and inform them about the affairs seeking their counsel.

---

1 *Al-Mustadrak*, vol. 3 pg. 142, chapter on ‘Alī’s virtues.

So ‘Umar came to them and said, “Applaud me.”

“With who, O Amīr al-Mu‘minīn,” they enquired.

“With ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib’s daughter,” he explained.

He then began relating to them that Rasūlullāh ﷺ declared, “All ties of kinship and connection will be severed on the Day of Qiyāmah besides my ties of kinship and connection.”

He continued, “I was his Companion and desired to have this link to him as well.”<sup>1</sup>

The ḥadīth that Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه reports on this occasion has been quoted from Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه by the Shī‘ī scholars. Study *Kitāb al-Khiṣāl* by Ibn Bābawayh al-Qummī (d. 381 A.H.), pg. 183, under the heading: Amīr al-Mu‘minīn’s citation of proof on the day of Shūrā, old print, Iran 1302 A.H.

It was deemed appropriate to select a few narrations from the vast piles of narrations to prove this fact. These are the narrations of Imām Muḥammad al-Bāqir and Imām Zayn al-‘Ābidīn.

We can deduce from the above narrations after examining them that there always existed unity and sincerity between all these men, and they never harboured animosity for each other. Whenever any important matter came, they discussed it thoroughly and deliberated. This is a clear indication of their unity.

Secondly, the nikāḥ of Umm Kulthūm—who was born from Sayyidah Fāṭimah’s رضي الله عنها womb—was joyfully contracted by Sayyidunā ‘Alī to Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه. The latter understood this as a great fortune and wholeheartedly consented. This is a strong evidence for their congenial relationship and a glaring sign for Allah’s statement, “*Merciful among themselves.*” In the face of such absolute and distinct

---

1 *Kanz al-Ummāl*, vol. 7 pg. 98, Ḥadīth: 825, with reference to Ibn Sa’d, and Ibn Rāhwayh briefly, old print; *Majma‘ al-Zawā‘id*, vol. 9 pg. 173, virtues of the Ahl al-Bayt.

proofs, to deny them and to visualise enmity and hatred between them is a far cry from the truth and is synonymous to discarding the Qur’ān, ḥadīth, and history.

### Removing a Misconception

Some reports attributed to Muḥammad al-Bāqir contain a story of Umm Kulthūm going to Sayyidunā ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb’s ﷺ house. The person who wishes to blemish the image of Sayyidunā ‘Umar ﷺ levels another accusation on him (and at the same time taints the image of Sayyidunā ‘Alī ﷺ and his *infallible* daughter). He does not consider this but chooses to express his concealed hatred and rancour by disseminating it utilising nasty words.

A few points of clarification are presented regarding this:

Firstly, it is an accepted principle among the muḥaddithīn that after scrutinising one incident through the lenses of many narrations, the reality of the original incident is learnt. The addition or subtraction to the original incident is also realised in this way.

Following this, it has become apparent after adopting this style that there has been *idrāj* (addition) from the narrators in this narration. The hint for this is obvious from Ibn Sa’d’s report in *al-Ṭabaqāt* wherein he discuss Umm Kulthūm bint ‘Alī. One may refer to the source, for only the main segment of it will be reproduced here. The original incident becomes visible through this narration. Ibn Sa’d says:

فأمر بها علي فصنعت ثم أمر ببرد فطواه و قال انطلقي بهذا إلى أمير المؤمنين فتولي أرسلني أبي يقرأك السلام و يقول إن رضيت البرد فأمسكه و إن سخطه فرده فلما أتت عمر قال بارك فيك و في أبيك قد رضينا قال فرجعت إلى أبيها فقالت ما نشر البرد و لا نظر إلا إلي فزوجها إياه فولدت له غلاما يقال له زيد

‘Alī ordered that she be beautified, and this was carried out. He called for a garment and folded it. he then said, “Go with this to Amīr al-Mu’minīn and tell him that your father has sent you and he conveys salām and says that if you are happy with the garment then keep it, otherwise return it.”

When she came to ‘Umar, he said, “May Allah bless you and your father. We are happy.”

So she returned to her father and said, “He did not open the garment and did not look at anything besides me.”

So ‘Alī got her married to him and she gave birth to his son named Zayd.<sup>1</sup>

From this narration we learn what actually transpired, nothing more. The foul additions and obscenity found in some narrations are additions from the narrators.

Secondly, the narrations containing obscenity are *munqaṭi*<sup>2</sup> as far as isnād is concerning and *shādh*<sup>3</sup> as far as the text is concerned. These narrations are attributed to Muḥammad al-Bāqir رحمته الله and the narration we quoted above which contains the actual happening is also attributed to him and it does not contain any obscenity. So it is imperative to apply the ruling which the senior ‘ulamā’ have formulated for such situations.

Ibn Ḥajar al-Makkī al-Haythamī has made mention of this rule in his book *Kitāb al-Zawājir ‘an Iqtirāf al-Kabā’ir* and ‘Allāmah Ibn ‘Ābidīn al-Shāmī has done the same in *Radd al-Muḥtār* (footnotes of *Durr al-Mukhtār*). The rule is:

و إذا اختلف كلام الإمام فيؤخذ بما يوافق الأدلة الظاهرة و يعرض عما خالفها

When there is contradiction in the speech of the Imām, then that which is in harmony to evident proofs will be taken and that which contradicts them will be discarded.<sup>4</sup>

---

1 *Ṭabaqāt Ibn Sa’d*, vol. 8 pg. 340, discussion on Umm Kulthūm bint ‘Alī, Leiden print, Europe.

2 Interrupted chain of transmission.

3 A weak narration which contradicts an authentic narration.

4 *Kitāb al-Zawājir ‘an Iqtirāf al-Kabā’ir*, pg. 28, the first major sin, chapter one on the internal major sins; *Radd al-Muḥtār*, vol. 3 pg. 447, chapter on the murtad.

Thirdly, the ‘Ulamā’ of the principles of ḥadīth have laid down the blanket principle for a satiation when two narrations are inconsistent. They determine that the narration that is in agreement with logic and custom will be accepted and the one contrary to the same will be rejected. The upcoming text has been inserted by ‘Alī ibn Muḥammad ibn ‘Irāq al-Kinānī (d. 963 A.H.) in the book *Tanzīh al-Sharīah al-Marfū‘ah* in the list of signs of a baseless narration:

و منها قرينة في المروي كـمخالفته لمقتضى العقل بحيث لا يقبل التأويل و يلتحق به ما يدفعه الحس و المشاهدة أو العادة و كمنافاته لدلالة الكتاب القطعية أو السنة المتواترة أو الإجماع القطعي

From among them is a sign in the narration like its contradiction to logic in a way that it cannot be interpreted, and common sense and reality or the norm denies it, or it being inconsistent with the categorical Qur’ān, mutawātir Sunnah, or emphatic consensus.<sup>1</sup>

Fourthly, it is mentioned that the narrations attributed to Imām al-Bāqir which contain the obscene language, Shī‘ī mujtahidīn have proven through reports they regard as reliable and authentic that adulteration has taken place in these narrations. Statements he did not make were attributed to him and fabricated in his name. It appears in *Rijāl al-Kashī* and *al-Māmaqānī*:

عن الصادق عليه السلام إن لكل رجل منا رجل يكذب عليه و عنه إن المغيرة بن سعيد دس في كتب أصحاب أبي أحاديث لم يحدث بها أبي فاتقوا الله و لا تقبلوا علينا ما خالف قول ربنا و سنة نبينا

Al-Ṣādiq states: “For every man among us is a man who fabricates in his name.”

It is reported from him, “Mughīrah ibn Sa‘īd inserted numerous narrations in the books of my father’s students which my father did not say. So fear Allah and do not accept in our name anything that contradicts our Rabb’s Speech or our Nabī’s Sunnah.”<sup>2</sup>

1 *Tanzīh al-Sharīah al-Marfū‘ah*, pg. 6, Egypt print.

2 *Rijāl al-Kashī*, pg. 146, Mumbai print, pg. 195, new Tehran print, discussion on Mughīrah; Tanqīḥ al-Maqāl, pg. 174, third stance from the introduction.

A man of sound intellect and understanding and free from prejudice can ponder and think as to how a private matter got publicised? Either one of two. Either Umm Kulthūm divulged it or ‘Umar al-Fārūq رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ publicised it. Both these possibilities are out of the arena of understanding, logic, and norm. Due to its conflict to intellect and custom, it is baseless and unacceptable.

كم من قصة اخترعوها و كم من وقاحة نسبوها إليه و إنه بريء منها و القرآن يشهد بدينهم و ديانتهم و صلاحهم و أَلَزَمَهُمْ كَلِمَةَ التَّقْوَىٰ وَكَانُوا أَحَقَّ بِهَا وَأَهْلَهَا وَكَانَ اللَّهُ بِكُلِّ شَيْءٍ عَلِيمًا

How many stories they have concocted and how many insolence they attributed to him whereas he is totally innocent from the same. The Qurʾān testifies to their religiousness, integrity, and righteousness: *And He imposed upon them the word of righteousness, and they were more deserving of it and worthy of it. And ever is Allah, of all things, Knowing.*<sup>1</sup>

Fifthly, if we hypothetically agree to the correctness of this incident, then someone can object:

این گناهیست که در شهر شما نیز کند

This sin is also prevalent in your city.

The observance of such an action by Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ has been documented by your scholars in your books. The celebrated scholar of the Shīʿī world ‘Abd Allāh ibn Jaʿfar al-Ḥimyarī transmits via his sanad in his book *Qurb al-Isnād*:

عن جعفر عن أبيه عليه السلام عن علي عليه السلام إنه إذا أراد أن يبتاع الجارية يكشف عن ساقها فينظر إليها

From Jaʿfar—from his father—regarding ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ that when he intended to buy a slave-girl, he would expose her shin and look at it.<sup>2</sup>

1 Sūrah al-Fatḥ: 26.

2 *Qurb al-Isnād*, pg. 49, the narrations of Ḥusayn ibn ‘Alawān, Tehran print.



Now you have the leisure to formulate an explanation you like. According to us, neither of the two are correct. These are vain attempts to blemish the clean slates of their taqwā and self-discipline. May Allah allow us to practice on the saying:

خذ ما صفا و دع ما كدر

Take what is pure and discard the polluted.

## Umm Kulthūm bint ‘Alī’s marriage to Fārūq A‘zam in the Eyes of the Genealogists

The learned will be well acquainted with the fact that genealogy is a separate branch of the science of history and books on genealogy have been authored by masters of the field. They have listed therein the lineages of families, family trees, and other related aspects. They also describe the link one family has to another.

It is also an accepted fact that books on genealogy are not based on religious beliefs or tendencies. They are written considering the historical events and circumstances of various nations. Therefore, if all the famous genealogists mention an incident or establish a family link, then it proves the actuality of the event or link in that era. They are not fairy tales or fictitious fables.

We therefore would like to present the incident of Umm Kulthūm bint ‘Alī’s marriage from the books of the genealogists and quote relevant texts from their books without comments or remarks so that the general and elite realise the actuality and correctness of this marriage leaving no scope for any reservations. We will now exhibit this issue from the books of genealogy in a distinctive sequence. It will be quoted from 5 books of the science of genealogy.

### 1. *Nasab Quraysh*

Abū ‘Abd Allāh al-Muṣ‘ab ibn ‘Abd Allāh al-Zubayrī (d. 236 A.H.) writes in *Nasab Quraysh* while listing the children of Sayyidunā ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib رضي الله عنه:

و زينب ابنة علي الكبرى ولدت لعبد الله بن جعفر بن أبي طالب و أم كلثوم الكبرى ولدت لعمر بن الخطاب و أمهم فاطمة بنت النبي صلى الله عليه و سلم

Zaynab bint ‘Alī al-Kubrā who bore children for ‘Abd Allāh ibn Ja‘far ibn Abī Ṭālib. Umm Kulthūm al-Kubrā who bore children for ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb. Their mother is Fāṭimah bint al-Nabī صلى الله عليه وسلم<sup>1</sup>

## 2. Kitāb al-Muḥabbar

This marriage is documented in *Kitāb al-Muḥabbar* of Abū Ja‘far Muḥammad ibn Ḥabīb ibn Umayyah ibn ‘Amr al-Hāshimī al-Baghdādī (d. 245 A.H.) while recording the sons-in-law of Sayyidunā ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib صلى الله عليه وسلم:

و عمر بن الخطاب رحمه الله كانت عنده أم كلثوم بنت علي ثم خلف عليها عون ثم محمد ثم عبد الله بنو جعفر بن أبي طالب

‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb صلى الله عليه وسلم; Umm Kulthūm bint ‘Alī was married to him and then (after his demise) to ‘Awn, then to Muḥammad, and finally to ‘Abd Allāh—the sons of Ja‘far ibn Abī Ṭālib,<sup>2</sup>

He writes in the list of ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb’s صلى الله عليه وسلم son-in-laws:

إبراهيم بن نعيم النخام العدوي كانت عنده رقية بنت عمر و أمها أم كلثوم بنت علي

Ibrāhīm ibn Nu‘aym al-Nakhām al-‘Adawī: Ruqayyah bint ‘Umar was married to him. Her mother is Umm Kulthūm bint ‘Alī.<sup>3</sup>

## 3. Al-Ma‘ārif

Abū Muḥammad ibn ‘Abd Allāh ibn Muslim ibn Qutaybah al-Dīnawarī (d. 276 A.H.) while listing the daughters of Sayyidunā ‘Alī صلى الله عليه وسلم writes:

1 *Nasab Quraysh*, pg. 41, children of ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib, Egypt print.

2 *Kitāb al-Muḥabbar*, pg. 56, under ‘Alī’s son in laws, Dakkan print; *Kitāb al-Muḥabbar*, pg. 437, Hyderabad print, Dakkan.

3 *Kitāb al-Muḥabbar*, pg. 54, 101, Hyderabad print, Dakkan.

و أما أم كلثوم الكبرى و هي بنت فاطمة فكانت عند عمر بن الخطاب ولدت له ولدا قد ذكرناهم

Umm Kulthūm the eldest: She is the daughter of Fāṭimah and was the consort of ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb and bore children for him whom we have previously listed.<sup>1</sup>

He writes while recording Sayyidunā ‘Umar’s ﷺ children:

فاطمة و زيدا و أمهما أم كلثوم بنت علي بن أبي طالب من فاطمة بنت رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم

Fāṭimah and Zayd and their mother is Umm Kulthūm bint ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib from Fāṭimah bint Rasūlillāh ﷺ.<sup>2</sup>

Ibn Qutaybah also clarified that this Fāṭimah bint ‘Umar was also called Ruqayyah bint ‘Umar. Remember this point.

#### 4. *Ansāb al-Ashrāf*

Aḥmad ibn Yaḥyā al-Balādhurī (d. 277/279 A.H.) writes:

و إبراهيم بن نعيم النخام بن عبد الله العدوي ... كانت عنده رقية بنت عمر أخت حفصة لأبيها و أمها أم كلثوم بنت علي

Ibrāhīm ibn Nu‘aym al-Nakhām ibn ‘Abd Allāh al-‘Adawī: Ruqayyah bint ‘Umar, Ḥafṣah’s paternal half-sister. Her mother was Umm Kulthūm bint ‘Alī.<sup>3</sup>

#### 5. *Jamharat Ansāb al-‘Arab*

Abū Muḥammad ‘Alī ibn Aḥmad ibn Sa‘īd ibn Ḥazm al-Undulusī (d. 456 A.H.) records under ‘Alī’s children:

1 *Al-Ma‘ārif*, pg. 92, ‘Alī’s daughters, Egypt print.

2 *Al-Ma‘ārif*, pg. 79 – 80, ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb’s children, Egypt print.

3 *Ansāb al-Ashrāf*, vol. 1 pg. 428, Egypt print, 1959 edition; Ibn Ḥibbān: *Kitāb al-Thiqāt*, vol. 2 pg. 144, Rasūlullāh’s ﷺ daughters.

و تزوج أم كلثوم بنت علي المرتضى بنت بنت رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم عمر بن الخطاب فولدت له زيدا لم يعقب و رقية ثم خلف عليها بعد عمر رضي الله عنه عون بن جعفر بن أبي طالب ثم خلف عليها بعده محمد بن جعفر بن أبي طالب ثم خلف عليها بعده عبد الله بن جعفر بن أبي طالب بعد طلاقه لأختها زينب

Umm Kulthūm bint ‘Alī al-Murtaḍā, the granddaughter of Rasūlullāh ﷺ, married ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb and gave birth to his son Zayd—who had no issue—and Ruqayyah. After ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb, ‘Awn ibn Ja‘far ibn Abī Ṭālib married her, followed by Muḥammad ibn Ja‘far ibn Abī Ṭālib, and finally ‘Abd Allāh ibn Ja‘far ibn Abī Ṭālib after divorcing her sister Zaynab.<sup>1</sup>

## Theme Two

In the first theme, the issue of Umm Kulthūm bint ‘Alī al-Murtaḍā’s marriage was proven from the books of the Ahl al-Sunnah wa al-Jamā‘ah and the statements of the noble A‘immah. However, only a few quotations were presented. Otherwise, there is a number of references which are backed by reliable sanads to prove this point, inter alia, *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī*, book on jihad, chapter on women carrying waterskins to the people during battle. Thereafter, the writings of the genealogists were presented to prove this relationship so that the strong historical backing of this matter may be realised.

Now we wish to list some significant points in the second theme which will increase the knowledge of the readers and strengthen their conviction in this matter.

### First Point

The marriage of Sayyidunā ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb to Sayyidunā ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib’s daughter Umm Kulthūm—daughter of Fāṭimah al-Zahrā رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهَا—will be presented from Shī‘ī books deemed reliable by them. In this manner, the Shī‘ī readers may be

---

1 *Jamharat Ansāb al-‘Arab*, pg. 37 – 38, ‘Alī’s children, Egypt print, new edition.

assured of the authenticity of this matter just as the Ahl al-Sunnah were assured of the same in the first theme.

In the eyes of the Shī'ah, four books are regarded the most reliable, authentic, and genuine over all other books. These books are referred to as the four canonical books.

1. *Al-Kāfi* by Muḥammad ibn Ya'qūb al-Kulaynī al-Rāzī (d. 329 A.H.)
2. *Man Lā Yaḥḍuruhū al-Faqīh* by Shaykh al-Ṣadūq Abū Ja'far Muḥammad ibn 'Alī ibn Bābawayh al-Qummī (d. 381 A.H.)
3. *Al-Istibṣār* by Abū Ja'far Muḥammad ibn Ḥasan al-Ṭūsī, Shaykh al-Ṭā'ifāh, (d. 460 A.H.)
4. *Tahdhīb al-Aḥkām* by the above author.

In three of the above four, besides *Man Lā Yaḥḍuruhū al-Faqīh*, the nikāḥ of Umm Kulthūm bint 'Alī has been documented coupled with the statements—supported by isnāds—of the infallible A'imma. Firstly, we would like to present this topic from their canonical works in detail, followed by quoting the statements of their reliable scholars and mujtahidīn of every era. The readers should not take the abundance of references as distasteful. This manner has been adopted to authenticate this matter.

### Report One: First Narration of *Al-Kāfi*

عن هشام بن سالم عن أبي عبد الله عليه السلام قال لما خطب إليه قال له أمير المؤمنين إنها صبية قال  
فلقي العباس فقال له ألي بأس فقال وما ذلك قال خطبت إلى ابن أخيك فردني أما والله لأعودن زمزم ولا  
أدع لكم مكرمة إلا هدمتها ولأقيمن عليه شاهدين بأنه سرق ولأقطعن يمينه فأثاه العباس فأخبره وسأله  
أن يجعل الأمر إليه فجعله إليه

From Hishām ibn Sālim—from Abū 'Abd Allāh عليه السلام who reports:

When 'Umar proposed to him (for Umm Kulthūm), Amīr al-Mu'minīn told him, "She is still a child."

Then ‘Umar met ‘Abbās and said, “Is there anything wrong with me?”

‘Abbās asked, “What is the matter?”

He explained, “I proposed to your nephew (for his daughter) but he refused. Behold! By Allah, I will take back (the honour of providing) zam zam (to the ḥujjāj) and will destroy every honour of yours. I will definitely make two witnesses testify that he stole and cut off his right hand.”

Hearing this, ‘Abbās rushed to ‘Alī and informed him of the gravity of the situation. He asked him to hand over the matter to him and ‘Alī consented.<sup>1</sup>

### Report Two: Second Narration of *Al-Kāfi*

حماد عن زرارة عن أبي عبد الله عليه السلام في تزويج أم كلثوم فقال إن ذلك ...

Same as above.<sup>2</sup>

### Report Three: Third Narration of *Al-Kāfi*

عن عبد الله بن سنان و معاوية بن عمار عن أبي عبد الله عليه السلام قال سألته عن المرأة المتوفى عنها زوجها تعتد في بيتها أو حيث شاءت قال بل حيث شاءت إن عليا صلوات الله عليه لما توفي عمر أتى أم كلثوم فانتقلت بها إلى بيته

‘Abd Allāh ibn Sinān and Mu‘āwiyah ibn ‘Ammār report—from Abū ‘Abd Allāh:

I asked him about a woman whose husband has passed away, whether she should pass her ‘iddah in her home, or wherever she wants.

---

1 *Furū‘ min Al-Kāfi*, vol. 2 pg. 141, book on marriage, chapter on Umm Kulthūm’s marriage, Nawl Kashawr print, Lucknow; al-Ḥimyarī: *al-Ja‘fariyyāt wa al-As‘athiyyāt ma‘ Qurb al-Isnād*, pg. 109, Tehran print.

2 *Furū‘ min Al-Kāfi*, vol. 2 pg. 141, book on marriage, chapter on Umm Kulthūm’s marriage, Nawl Kashawr print, Lucknow.

He answered, “Rather, wherever she wishes. Surely, when ‘Umar passed away ‘Alī—may Allah’s salutations be upon him—came to Umm Kulthūm and took her back to his home (to pass her ‘iddah).”<sup>1</sup>

#### Report Four: Fourth Narration of *Al-Kāfi*

عن سليمان بن خالد قال سألت أبا عبد الله عليه السلام عن امرأة توفي عنها زوجها أين تعتد في بيت زوجها أو حيث شاءت قال بل حيث شاءت ثم قال إن عليا صلوات الله عليه لما مات عمر أتى أم كلثوم فأخذ بيدها فانطلق بها إلى بيته

Sulaymān ibn Khālid says:

I asked Abū ‘Abd Allāh عليه السلام about a woman who loses her husband, where should she pass her ‘iddah, in her husband’s home or where she wills?

He answered, “Where she wills.”

He continued, “Indeed when ‘Umar passed away, ‘Alī—may Allah’s salutations be upon him—came to Umm Kulthūm, took her hand, and walked with her to his home.”<sup>2</sup>

#### Report Five: First Narration of *al-Istibṣār*

عن أبي عبد الله عليه السلام قال سألته عن المرأة المتوفى عنها زوجها تعتد في بيتها أو حيث شاءت قال بل حيث شاءت إن عليا عليه السلام لما توفي عمر أتى أم كلثوم فانطلق بها إلى بيته

I asked Abū ‘Abd Allāh about a woman who survives her husband, should she pass her ‘iddah in her husband’s home or where she wants.

He replied, “Wherever she wants. When ‘Umar passed away, ‘Alī عليه السلام came to Umm Kulthūm and took her home.”<sup>3</sup>

---

1 *Furū’ min Al-Kāfi*, vol. 2 pg. 311, chapter on a widow, Nawl Kashawr print, Lucknow.

2 *Furū’ min Al-Kāfi*, vol. 2 pg. 311, chapter on a widow with whom the marriage has been consummated, where should she pass her ‘iddah and what is compulsory upon her, Nawl Kashawr print, Lucknow.

3 *Al-Istibṣār*, part 3, pg. 185, chapters on ‘iddah, Ja’fariyyah print, Nukhās print, Lucknow, old edition.

## Report Six: Second Narration of *al-Istibṣār*

عن سليمان بن خالد قال سألت أبا عبد الله عليه السلام عن امرأة توفي عنها زوجها ابن تعتد في بيت زوجها أو حيث شاءت قال بل حيث شاءت ثم قال إن عليا عليه السلام لما مات عمر أتى أم كلثوم فأخذ بيدها فانطلق بها إلى بيته

Sulaymān ibn Khālid reports:

I asked Abū ‘Abd Allāh about a woman who survives her husband, should she pass her ‘iddah in her husband’s home or where she wants.

He replied, “Wherever she wants. When ‘Umar passed away, ‘Alī عليه السلام came to Umm Kulthūm and took her home.”<sup>1</sup>

## Report Seven: First Narration of *Tahdhīb al-Aḥkām*

عن أبي عبد الله عليه السلام قال سألته عن المرأة المتوفى عنها زوجها تعتد في بيتها أو حيث شاءت قال بل حيث شاءت إن عليا لما توفي عمر أتى أم كلثوم فانطلق بها إلى بيته

I asked Abū ‘Abd Allāh about a woman whose husband has passed away, should she pass her ‘iddah in her husband’s home or where she wants.

He replied, “Wherever she wants. When ‘Umar passed away, ‘Alī came to Umm Kulthūm and took her home.”<sup>2</sup>

## Report Eight: Second Narration of *Tahdhīb al-Aḥkām*

سألت أبا عبد الله عليه السلام عن امرأة توفي عنها زوجها أين تعتد في بيت زوجها أو حيث شاءت قال بل حيث شاءت ثم قال إن عليا لما توفي عمر أتى أم كلثوم فأخذ بيدها فانطلق بها إلى بيته

I asked Abū ‘Abd Allāh عليه السلام about a woman whose husband has passed away, should she pass her ‘iddah in her husband’s home or where she desires.

---

1 Ibid, pg. 186.

2 *Tahdhīb al-Aḥkām*, pg. 238, book on divorce, chapter on the ‘iddah of women, old Iran print, 1316 A.H. print.



He replied, “Wherever she desires. When ‘Umar passed away, ‘Alī came to Umm Kulthūm, held her hand, and took her home.”<sup>1</sup>

### Report Nine: Third Narration of *Tahdhīb al-Aḥkām*

عن جعفر عن أبيه قال ماتت أم كلثوم بنت علي و ابنها زيد بن عمر بن الخطاب في ساعة واحد لا يدري أيهما هلك قبل فلم يورث أحدهما من الآخر و صلي عليهما جميعا

From Ja‘far—from his father who explained:

Umm Kulthūm bint ‘Alī and her son Zayd ibn ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb passed away at the same time. It was not known who died first. So neither of them inherited from the other and their Ṣalāt al-Janāzah was performed at the same time.<sup>2</sup>

These 9 reports from three of the four canonical works establish that:

1. Umm Kulthūm bint ‘Alī was married to ‘Umar al-Fārūq رضي الله عنه.
2. ‘Alī appointed ‘Abbās as the representative to contract this nikāḥ.
3. Umm Kulthūm gave birth to ‘Umar’s children.
4. When ‘Umar passed on, ‘Alī took his beloved daughter Umm Kulthūm to his home to pass her ‘iddah.
5. The day Umm Kulthūm passed away, on that very day her son Zayd ibn ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb passed away and both mother’s and son’s Ṣalāt al-Janāzah was performed at once.\

Now we will prove this fact from books regarded as reliable and authentic by the Shī‘ah from other Shī‘ī scholars and mujtahidīn. Shī‘ī scholars of each era have verified this marriage. However, they have coupled it with the interpretation of it occurring under coercion and duress.

---

1 Ibid.

2 *Tahdhīb al-Aḥkām*, last volume, pg. 380, book on inheritance, chapter on the inheritance of those who drown or are crushed at the same time, old Iran print.

The famous scholar and mujtahid of the fourth century, Sayyid Murtaḍā ‘Alam al-Hudā’s (d. 406 A.H.) writings will be presented. According to the Shī‘ī scholars, ‘Alam al-Hudā holds a position between the *mutaqaddimīn* (early) and *muta’akhkhirīn* (later) scholars. Have a look at his statements:

## Report Ten

Sayyid Murtaḍā ‘Alam al-Hudā wrote in *Kitāb al-Shāfi* (which was authored to answer al-Mughnī of Qāḍī ‘Abd al-Jabbār):

فأما تزويجه بنته فلم يكن ذلك عن اختيار و الخلاف فيه مشهور فإن الرواية وردت بأن عمر بن الخطاب خطبها إلى أمير المؤمنين فدافعه و ماطله فاستدعى عمر العباس فقال مالي أبي بأس فقال ما حملك على هذا الكلام فقال خطبت إلى ابن أخيك فمضعتني ... فقال العباس رد أمرها إلي ففعل فزوجه العباس إياها إلخ

Regarding marrying off his daughter, this did not happen with his consent. The debate here is common. The narration appears that ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb proposed for her to Amīr al-Mu’minīn but he postponed it and put him off. So ‘Umar approached ‘Abbās and said, “What is with me? Is there anything wrong with me?”

‘Abbās asked, “What makes you speak this?”

He explained, “I proposed to your nephew but he rejected me.” ...

‘Abbās said, “Hand over her matter to me.” And he consented. So ‘Abbās got her married to him (‘Umar).<sup>1</sup>

## Report Eleven

Sayyid Murtaḍā ‘Alam al-Hudā presents Umm Kulthūm’s nikāḥ with the following words in *Tanzīh al-Ambiyā’*:

فأما إنكاحه عليه السلام فقد ذكرنا في كتابنا الشافي الجواب عن هذا الباب مشروحا و بينا أنه عليه السلام ما أجاب عمر إلى إنكاح بنته عليها السلام إلا بعد تواعد و تهدد و مراجعة و منازعة

---

1 *Al-Shāfi*, pg. 1116, with *Talkhīṣ al-Shāfi*, old Iran print, 1301 A.H. edition.

With regards to marrying his daughter off, we have previously mentioned in our book *al-Shāfi* the detailed answer to this issue and elucidated that he did not consent to ‘Umar marrying his daughter except after threatening, intimidating, quarrelling, and disputing.<sup>1</sup>

## Report Twelve

Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd relates an incident in his commentary on *Nahj al-Balāghah* under the text:

نعم الطيب المسك خفيف محمله عطر ريعه

What a wonderful perfume is musk. It’s light in weight and pleasant in fragrance.

Wherein Sayyidunā ‘Alī’s daughter being in the wedlock of Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه is vividly evident. Have a look at the incident:

وجه عمر إلى ملك الروم بريدا فاشتريت أم كلثوم امرأة عمر طيبا بدنانير و جعلته في قارورتين و أهدتهما إلى امرأة ملك الروم فرجع البريد إليها و معه مالا القارورتين جواهر فدخل عليهما عمر و قد صبت الجواهر في حجرها فقال من أين لك هذا فأخبرته فقبض عليه و قال هذا للمسلمين قالت كيف و هو عوض هديتي قال بيني و بينك أبوك فقال علي عليه السلام لك منه بقيمة دينارك و الباقي للمسلمين جملة لأن بريد المسلمين حملة

‘Umar sent an envoy to the Roman King. Meanwhile, Umm Kulthūm his wife, purchased perfume for few gold coins and placed it in two long necked bottles and sent them as a gift for the wife of the Roman king. The envoy returned to her with two bottles filled with pearls. ‘Umar entered upon them after she had poured the pearls in her lap. He asked, “Where did you get this from?”

She informed him of the incident.

---

1 *Tanzih al-Ambiyā*, pg. 138 – 141, Iran print.

‘Umar grabbed it and said, “This belongs to the Muslims.”

“How?” she asked, “It is in lieu of my gift.”

He said, “Your father will decide this matter between us.”

‘Alī رضي الله عنه said, “You will receive pearls equal to the value of money you spent, and the rest is for the Muslims, since their envoy brought it.”<sup>1</sup>

### Deductions of this narration

- Firstly, it is established that Umm Kulthūm bint ‘Alī was married to Sayyidunā ‘Umar al-Fārūq رضي الله عنه.
- Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه was pleased with this union.
- He would visit his daughter often at Sayyidunā ‘Umar’s house.
- Sayyidunā ‘Alī was included in the home affairs of Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه.

This report is a glaring evidence of the pure dealings and amiable relationship they shared.

### Report Thirteen

The distinguished muḥaqqiq of the Shī‘ah al-Ḥillī (d. 676 A.H.) prepared a manuscript on the Ja‘farī Fiqh named *Sharā‘i‘ al-Islām*. He writes in the book of marriage of this manuscript about the issues related to the nikāḥ contract:

و يجوز نكاح الحرة العبد و العربية العجمي و الهاشمية غير الهاشمي

The marriage of a free woman to a slave man, an Arab woman to a non-Arab man, and a Hāshimī woman to a non-Hāshimī man is permissible.<sup>2</sup>

---

1 *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*, vol. 4 pg. 575 – 576, Beirut print, 1375/1956 edition.

2 *Sharā‘i‘ al-Islām*.

One of the senior Shī'ah, Shaykh Zayn al-Dīn Aḥmad al-‘Āmilī, referred to as the second martyr wrote a commentary regarded very reliable of *Sharā’i‘ al-Islām*, named *Masālik al-Afhām* in 964 A.H. Under the above text, he elucidates explicitly on the nikāḥ of Umm Kulthūm bint ‘Alī. This is an accepted and unanimous ruling of the Ja‘farī fiqh. It is not disputed. The text of the commentary with its translation will be presented to the readers. After reading both the text and commentary, one will realise the accurateness of the issue at hand. There will remain no need for any mujtahid’s interpretation or explanation.

Shahīd al-Thānī writes as evidence of al-Ḥillī’s above assertion:

و زوج النبي ابنته عثمان و زوج ابنته زينب بأبي العاص بن الربيع و ليسا من بني هاشم و كذلك زوج علي  
ابنته أم كلثوم من عمر و تزوج عبد الله بن عمرو بن عثمان فاطمة بنت الحسين و تزوج مصعب بن الزبير  
أختها سكينه و كلهم من غير بني هاشم

The Nabī ﷺ married his daughter to ‘Uthmān and his daughter Zaynab to Abū al-‘Āṣ ibn al-Rabī’ whereas they were not from the Banū Hāshim. Similarly, ‘Alī got his daughter Umm Kulthūm married to ‘Umar. ‘Abd Allāh ibn ‘Amr ibn ‘Uthmān married Fāṭimah bint al-Ḥusayn and Muṣ‘ab ibn al-Zubayr married her sister Sukaynah—whereas all of them are not from the Banū Hāshim.<sup>1</sup>

These are five unions which were mentioned as proof for the fiqhī mas’alah, one of them being Umm Kulthūm bint ‘Alī’s marriage. There remains no scope for any sensible person to reject the actuality of this union. And there is no treatment for doggedness.

May Allah allow the Muslims to live with unity and guide their hearts. Āmīn.

---

1 *Masālik al-Afhām*, vol. 1, book on marriage, chapter on issues related to the contract, Iran print, 1273 edition.

## Report Fourteen

Qāḍī Nūr Allah Shūstarī, a renowned Shīʿī mujtahid, al-Shahīd al-Thālith (d. 1019 A.H), has written on the issue of Umm Kulthūm's nikāḥ in many of his books. Have a look at his statements.

- a. He writes in *Majālis al-Mu'minīn* under the discussion on 'Abbās ibn 'Abd al-Muṭṭalib رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ:

چون عمر بن الخطاب جهت تزویج خلافت فاسده خود داعیه تزویج ام کلثوم دختر حضرت امیر نمود و این حضرت جهت اقامت حج مکررا اظهار ابا و امتناع نمود آخر عمر عباس را نزد خود طلبید و سوگند خورده گفت اگر علی را بدامادی من راضی نمی سازی آنچه در دفع او ممکن باشد خواهیم کرد ... چون مبالغه عباس در این باب از حد گذشت اینحضرت از رویه اکراه ساکت شد ند تا اینکه عباس از پیش خود ارتکاب تزویج او نمود

'Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb wished to promote his corrupt khilāfah by marrying 'Alī's daughter Umm Kulthūm, and 'Alī rejected over and over again due to the presence of proofs. Finally, 'Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb called 'Abbās and swore on oath, "If you do not make 'Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib pleased with me as his son-in-law, then I will exhaust all my efforts to counterattack." When 'Abbās's persistence in this matter crossed the limits, Sayyidunā 'Alī kept silent out of force until 'Abbās contracted this marriage on his own.<sup>1</sup>

- b. He writes in the biography of Muḥammad ibn Ja'far al-Ṭayyār:

محمد بن جعفر طیار بعد از فوت عمر بن الخطاب بشرت مصابرت حضرت امیر المؤمنین مشرف گشته ام کلثوم را که با عدم کفایت از رویه اکراه در جباله عمر بود تزویج نمود

Muḥammad ibn Ja'far al-Ṭayyār married Umm Kulthūm bint 'Alī after the death of 'Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb. Due to non-compatibility, Umm Kulthūm was forcefully married to 'Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb.<sup>2</sup>

- c. He then writes about the same topic in the biography of Miqdād ibn al-Aswad رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ:

---

1 *Majālis al-Mu'minīn*, pg. 76, biography of 'Abbās ibn 'Abd al-Muṭṭalib, old Iran print.

2 *Majālis al-Mu'minīn*, pg. 82, biography of Muḥammad ibn Ja'far, old Iran print.

اگر نبی دختر بعثمان داد ولی دختر بعمر فرستاد

If the Nabī ﷺ married his daughter to ‘Uthmān, then Walī (i.e. ‘Alī) sent his daughter to ‘Umar.<sup>1</sup>

Qāḍī Nūr Allah Shūstarī discussed the marriage of Umm Kulthūm bint ‘Alī in greater detail in his book *Maṣā’ib al-Nawāṣib*. He accepted the nikāḥ itself but presented a number of justifications for it. He writes there:

تزوج ام كلثوم با عمر در مقام ضرورت و ناچارى از راه رخصت است

Umm Kulthūm’s nikāḥ to ‘Umar was under coercion and duress and is a concession under these circumstances.<sup>2</sup>

## Report Fifteen

The Shīṭī mujtahid of the eleventh century, Mullā al-Bāqir Majlisī, has mentioned the issue under discussion in his books. Accordingly, he brings a lengthy discussion on the topic in *Mir’āt al-‘Uqūl*, the commentary of *Al-Kāfī* and answers the rejecters of this marriage. At the end, he acknowledges the veracity of this nikāḥ saying:

و الأصل في الجواب أن ذلك وقع على سبيل التقيّة و الاضطراب

The primary answer is that this happened under Taqiyyah and force.<sup>3</sup>

## Removing a Misconception

The readers must now have realised that although the Shīṭī scholars and mujtahidīn are acknowledging the nikāḥ, they are validating it under the pretext of force and coercion.

1 *Majālis al-Mu’minīn*, pg. 85, biography of Miqdād ibn al-Aswad, old Iran print.

2 Āqā Mirzā Muḥammad ‘Alī Mudarris Rashtī Chahār Dahī Najafī: *Tarjamah Maṣā’ib al-Nawāṣib* Fārisī, pg. 165 – 170, Tehran print, 1369 edition.

3 *Mir’āt al-‘Uqūl*, vol. 3 pg. 448 – 449, chapter on Umm Kulthūm’s marriage, old Iran print.

- As if the Lion of Allah ﷺ was compelled to allow this marriage.
- In fact, in some of their narrations it appears that she was forcibly taken from Ḥaydar Karrār (Allah forbid).
- Death threats were sounded, and he was constrained to consent to the marriage.
- The owner of the Dhū al-Fiqār was helpless.
- And Majlisī says that this union was formed on the basis of Taqiyyah.

### Answer

We respectfully say that the picture they are painting of Sayyidunā ‘Alī ﷺ is not the temperament or nature of the Conqueror of Khaybar, Sayyidunā ‘Alī al-Murtaḍā ﷺ, because:

- This is in polarity with his bravery
- In contrast to self-respect
- Is a dark blemish to family dignity
- Is a challenge of īmānī possessiveness and family honour
- Contradicts the family narrations of the Banū Hāshim

Finally, the elders would say:

بر چه بر خود میبندی بر دیگران میند

What we will not tolerate for our daughters, how can we tolerate that for the hero of Badr and Uḥud, the Conqueror of Khaybar, the overpowering Lion of Allah, ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib ﷺ? Allah forbid!

كَبُرَتْ كَلِمَةً تَخْرُجُ مِنْ أَفْوَاهِهِمْ إِنَّ يَقُولُونَ إِلَّا كَذِبًا



*Grave is the word that comes out of their mouths; they speak not except a lie.*<sup>1</sup>

For Allah's sake, think logically!

### Report Sixteen

The Shīī historian of the thirteenth century Mirzā 'Abbās 'Alī Qillī Khān (who was the Prime Minister of the Iranian King) dedicates a chapter on the marriage of Umm Kulthūm to 'Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb in his book *Tārīkh Ṭarāz Madh-hab Muẓaffarī*. He writes therein:

جناب ام کلثوم کبری دختر فاطمة الزهرا در سرای عمر بن الخطاب بود و ازوے فرزند بیاورد چنانکه مذکور گشت و  
چوں عمر مقتول شد محمد بن جعفر بن ابی طالب اورا در حباله نکاح در آورد

Fāṭimah al-Zahrā's daughter Umm Kulthūm was in 'Umar's house. She bore a son for him as was mentioned previously. After 'Umar was killed, Muḥammad ibn Ja'far ibn Abī Ṭālib married her.<sup>2</sup>

### Report Seventeen

Shaykh 'Abbās al-Qummī, the celebrated Shīī scholar and mujtahid of the fourteenth century records in his work *Muntahā al-Āmāl*:

و ام کلثوم حکایت تزویج او با عمر بن الخطاب در کتب مسطورست و بعد از وضیعیع عو بن جعفر و از پس او موجه  
محمد بن جعفر گشت

The union of 'Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb and Umm Kulthūm is recorded in the books. Thereafter, she came into the wedlock of 'Awn ibn Ja'far, and then in the wedlock of his brother Muḥammad ibn Ja'far.

---

1 Sūrah al-Kahf: 5.

2 *Tārīkh Ṭarāz Madh-hab Muẓaffarī*, chapter on the marriage of Umm Kulthūm to 'Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb, Iran print.

## Necessary Clarifications

### Point 1

We have presented a number of texts from Shīʿī scholars and mujtahidīn of every era to establish this relationship before the respected readers. Nine of these are from the canonical works of the Shīʿah and are the statements of the infallible Aʿimmah. There are countless other narrations which document this union, which rise to the level of mash-hūr. Despite the countless narrations and numerous statements of the mujtahidīn on this subject, some people present a handful of narrations and a few statements of some scholars to the masses which reject this nikāḥ. To remove this confusion, we would like to present before them one primary fundamental from their own scholars of uṣūl regarding giving preference of some aḥādīth over others which will clarify this contradiction.

There are many reasons one narration is given preference over another. One reason is that the first narration has been narrated by numerous narrators while the second narration has very few narrators. In such a case, the first narration will be given preference and accepted, since a large number of people are safer from falling into error than a small number of people, and the second narration will be discarded.

This fundamental has been quoted from the book *Maʿālim al-Uṣūl* authored by Shaykh Jamāl al-Dīn Abū Manṣūr Ḥasan ibn Zayn al-Dīn (d. 1011 A.H.), a reliable and authentic book in the eyes of the Shīʿah.

منها الترجيح بالسند و يحصل بأمور الأول كثرة الرواة كأن يكون رواية أحدها أكثر عددا من رواية الآخر فيرجح ما رواه أكثر بقوة الظن إذ العدد الأكثر أبعد عن الخطأ من الأقل

Preference owing to sanad: This is obtained in various ways. Firstly, the abundance of narrators, i.e. the narrators of the one are more in number than the narrators of the other. Preference will be given to the narration with more narrators on the basis of a strong perception since a large number is further from falling into error than a small number.<sup>1</sup>

---

1 *Maʿālim al-Uṣūl*, maṭlab 9, old Iran print, 1290 edition.

## Point 2

It would be prudent to clarify that Sayyidunā ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb was married to Sayyidunā ‘Alī’s daughter Umm Kulthūm, whose mother is Sayyidah Fāṭimah رضي الله عنها. He was not married to Umm Kulthūm bint Abī Bakr. This fact is verified in both Sunnī and Shī‘ī books.

To prove this, it is necessary to elucidate that:

1. Umm Kulthūm bint ‘Alī’s mother and Umm Kulthūm bint Abī Bakr’s mother are two different women.
2. ‘Umar al-Fārūq رضي الله عنه did propose to Umm Kulthūm bint Abī Bakr but she did not consent to the marriage.
3. Umm Kulthūm bint Abī Bakr got married to Ṭalḥah ibn ‘Ubayd Allah, and after him to ‘Abd al-Raḥmān al-Aḥwal ibn ‘Abd Allāh al-Makhzūmī.

We will now present substantiations from the books of the masters of genealogy.

Substantiations for the first point:

أم كلثوم بنت أبي بكر ... و أمها حبيبة بنت خارجة بن زيد بن أبي زهير من بني الحارث بن الخزرج و أم كلثوم ابنة أبي بكر هذه التي قال أبو بكر لعائشة بنته حين حضرته الوفاة إنما هو أخواك و أختناك قالت عائشة هذه أسماء قد عرفتها فمن الأخرى قال ذو بطن بنت خارجة قد ألقى في خلدي أنها جارية فكانت كما قال و ولدت بعد موته

Umm Kulthūm bint Abī Bakr: Her mother is Ḥabībah bint Khārijah ibn Zayd ibn Abī Zuhayr from the Banū al-Ḥārith ibn al-Khazraj. This Umm Kulthūm bint Abī Bakr is the same person Abū Bakr alluded to when he told ‘Ā’ishah his daughter on his deathbed, “It is only your two brothers and sisters.”

‘Ā’ishah enquired with surprise, “This is Asmā’ which I am aware of. So who is the other sister?”

He explained, “In the womb of Bint Khārijah. I have a strong feeling that it will be a girl!”

And it turned out as he had presumed. She was born after his demise.<sup>1</sup>

Her lineage appears in *Ṭabaqāt Ibn Sa‘d* as follows:

أم كلثوم بنت أبي بكر الصديق بن أبي قحافة بن عامر ... (التيمي) و أمها حبيبة بنت خارجه بن زيد بن أبي زهير ... (الخزرجي)

Umm Kulthūm bint Abī Bakr ibn Abī Quḥāfah ibn ‘Āmir (al-Taymī)... Her mother is Ḥabībah bint Khārījah ibn Zayd ibn Abī Zuhayr (al-Khazrajī).<sup>2</sup>

Substantiations for the second point:

Ibn Qutaybah Dīnawarī writes in *al-Ma‘ārif* while discussing the children of Sayyidunā Abū Bakr al-Ṣiddīq رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ:

و أما أم كلثوم بنت أبي بكر فخطبها عمر بن الخطاب إلى عائشة فأنعمت له و كرهت أم كلثوم فاحتالت له حتى أمسك عنها

As regards Umm Kulthūm bint Abī Bakr, ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb proposed to her via ‘Ā’ishah. She handed over the decision to Umm Kulthūm, who turned down the proposal. So ‘Umar backed down.<sup>3</sup>

Ibn Jarīr al-Ṭabarī while listing the children and wives of Sayyidunā ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ writes:

قال المدائني و خطب أم كلثوم بنت أبي بكر و هو صغيرة و أرسل فيها إلى عائشة ... فقالت الأمر إليها فقالت أم كلثوم لا حاجة لي فيه

Al-Madā’inī says: He sent ‘Ā’ishah with a proposal to Umm Kulthūm bint Abī Bakr while she was very young. ‘Ā’ishah said, “She will decide on the matter.” Umm Kulthūm said, “I do not wish to marry him.”<sup>4</sup>

1 *Nasab Quraysh*, pg. 278, under the offspring of Taym ibn Murrah, Egypt print.

2 *Ṭabaqāt Ibn Sa‘d*, vol. 8 pg. 338, biography of Umm Kulthūm, Leiden print, Europe.

3 *Al-Ma‘ārif*, pg. 76, the children of al-Ṣiddīq, Egypt print.

4 *Tārīkh al-Ṭabarī*, vol. 5 pg. 17.

Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd with reference to al-Ṭabarī states:

و روى الطبري في تاريخه أن عمر بن الخطاب خطب أم كلثوم بنت أبي بكر فأرسل فيها عائشة فقالت  
الأمر إليها فقالت أم كلثوم لا حاجة لي فيه إلخ

Al-Ṭabarī reports in his *Tārīkh* that ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb proposed to Umm Kulthūm bint Abī Bakr via the agency of ‘Ā’ishah. ‘Ā’ishah said, “She will decide on the matter.” Umm Kulthūm said, “I do not wish to marry him.”<sup>1</sup>

Substantiations for the third point:

Muṣ‘ab Zubayrī writes:

و أم كلثوم بنت أبي بكر ولدت لطلحة بن عبيد الله زكريا و عائشة ابني طلحة ثم خلف عليها عبد الرحمن  
بن عبد الله بن أبي ربيعة ... فولدت له عثمان و إبراهيم و موسى

Umm Kulthūm bint Abī Bakr gave birth to Zakariyyā and ‘Ā’ishah for Ṭalḥah ibn ‘Ubayd Allah. Thereafter, ‘Abd al-Raḥmān ibn ‘Abd Allāh ibn Abī Rabī‘ah married her and she bore for him ‘Uthmān, Ibrāhīm, and Mūsā.<sup>2</sup>

Ibn Sa’d writes in the biography of Umm Kulthūm bint Abī Bakr:

تزوجها طلحة بن عبيد الله بن عثمان بن عمرو بن كعب بن سعد بن تيم فولدت له زكريا و يوسف مات  
صغيرا و عائشة بنى طلحة فقتل عنها طلحة بن عبيد الله يوم الجمل ... ثم تزوجت أم كلثوم بعد طلحة  
بن عبيد الله عبد الرحمن بن عبد الله بن أبي ربيعة (المخزومي) فولدت له إبراهيم الأحول و موسى و أم  
حميد و أم عثمان ...

Ṭalḥah ibn ‘Ubayd Allah ibn ‘Uthmān ibn ‘Amr ibn Ka’b ibn Sa’d ibn Taym married her. She gave birth to his children Zakariyyā, Yūsuf—who passed away in infancy, and ‘Ā’ishah. Ṭalḥah ibn ‘Ubayd Allah was killed on the day of Jamal. Thereafter, ‘Abd al-Raḥmān ibn ‘Abd Allāh ibn Abī Rabī‘ah

1 *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*, vol. 3 pg. 231, discussion on the Fārūqī demerits, demerit 5, Beirut print.

2 *Nasab Quraysh*, pg. 278, Abū Bakr al-Ṣiddīq’s children.

(al-Makhzūmī) married Umm Kulthūm after Ṭalḥah ibn ‘Ubayd Allah’s death. She gave birth for him to Ibrāhīm al-Aḥwal, Mūsā, Umm Ḥumayd, and Umm ‘Uthmān.<sup>1</sup>

Abū Ja‘far Muḥammad ibn Ḥabīb al-Baghdādī writes under the sons-in-law of Sayyidunā Abū Bakr al-Ṣiddīq رضي الله عنه:

و طلحة بن عبيد الله كانت تحته أم كلثوم بنت أبي بكر الصديق و عبد الرحمن الأحول بن عبد الله بن أبي ربيعة المخزومي خلف على أم كلثوم بعد طلحة

And Ṭalḥah ibn ‘Ubayd Allah: Umm Kulthūm bint Abī Bakr al-Ṣiddīq was in his wedlock. And ‘Abd al-Raḥmān al-Aḥwal ibn ‘Abd Allāh ibn Abī Rabī‘ah al-Makhzūmī married Umm Kulthūm after Ṭalḥah.<sup>2</sup>

All the above quotations from the masters of genealogy prove beyond doubt that Sayyidunā ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb رضي الله عنه was in fact married to Umm Kulthūm bint ‘Alī al-Murtaḍā, and not Umm Kulthūm bint Abī Bakr al-Ṣiddīq رضي الله عنه.

### Point 3

Hereunder, we wish to summarise this discussion.

Sayyidunā ‘Umar and Sayyidunā ‘Alī’s رضي الله عنه relationship was further strengthened with this connection. All praise belongs to Allah that this loving relationship was maintained and preserved.

The ‘Ulamā’ have recorded that this blessed union was formed in Dhū al-Qa‘dah 17 A.H and the stipulated dowry was 40 000 dirhams. Umm Kulthūm gave birth to Sayyidunā ‘Umar’s رضي الله عنه children, one son by the name of Zayd and one daughter by the name of Ruqayyah who got married to Ibrahim ibn Nu‘aym al-Nakhām al-

---

1 *Ṭabaqāt Ibn Sa‘d*, vol. 8 pg. 339, biography of Umm Kulthūm bint Abī Bakr al-Ṣiddīq, Leiden print, Europe.

2 *Kitāb al-Muḥabbar*, pg. 54, Hyderabad Dakkan print.

‘Adawī after coming of age. Some historians have recorded another daughter by the name of Fāṭimah, but this is disputed.

Zayd ibn ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb was in his youth. Once, a fight broke out at night within the Banū ‘Adī tribe. Zayd advanced in the midst of the fight to calm things down and reconcile. Due to the darkness that covered them, a person mistakenly injured Zayd. He was severely wounded on his head, which was incurable. He remained bed ridden for few days and his mother Umm Kulthūm bint ‘Alī also fell ill. Coincidentally, both mother and son passed away at the same time. It could not be ascertained as to who passed away first. ‘Ulamā’ state that this is one of the amazing rulings, where neither of the two inherited from the other.

Thereafter, both their biers were lifted at the same time. Some say that ‘Abd Allāh ibn ‘Umar al-Fārūq رضي الله عنه led their Ṣalāt al-Janāzah while other assert that it was Sa‘īd ibn al-‘Āṣ al-Umawī, the governor of Madīnah.

Sayyidunā Ḥasan and Sayyidunā Ḥusayn رضي الله عنهما were present at the time in the rows of worshippers. Zayd ibn ‘Umar’s bier was placed close to the Imām while Umm Kulthūm’s bier was placed at a little distance away from the Imām in the Qiblah direction. And this is how the Ṣalāt al-Janāzah was performed.

The Islamic historian ‘Allāmah al-Dhahabī writes at the end of the biography of Umm Kulthūm bint ‘Alī:

و ذلك في أوائل دولة معاوية

This took place in the initial stages of Mu‘āwiyah’s reign.<sup>1</sup>

There remains absolutely no doubt on the certainty of this marriage. It is accepted by the narrations of the Ahl al-Sunnah and attested to by the reports of the Shī‘ah. It is a historical fact backed by the corroborations of the masters of genealogy.

---

1 *Siyar A’lām al-Nubalā’*, vol. 3 pg. 330, biography of Umm Kulthūm bint ‘Alī; *Tārīkh Madīnat Dimashq*, vol. 2 pg. 80, conditions of the Masājīd.

Due to this blessed union, the following links between Sayyidunā ‘Umar and Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه were established:

1. ‘Umar was ‘Alī’s son-in-law.
2. ‘Alī was ‘Umar’s father-in-law.
3. Fāṭimah was ‘Umar’s mother-in-law.
4. Ḥasan and Ḥusayn were ‘Umar’s brothers-in-law.
5. ‘Umar was their brother-in-law.
6. Zaynab bint ‘Alī was ‘Umar’s sister-in-law.
7. Zayd and Ruqayyah were ‘Alī’s grandchildren.
8. Zayd and Ruqayyah were the nephew and niece of Ḥasan, Ḥusayn, and Muḥammad ibn al-Ḥanafiyah.
9. Ḥasan and Ḥusayn were the maternal uncles of Zayd and Ruqayyah.
10. Rasūlullāh’s صلى الله عليه وسلم granddaughter was in the wedlock of ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb (making him ‘Umar’s grandfather-in-law).

These are ten complete.

Beloved readers, adopt fairness and observe impartiality for Allah’s sake and decide whether these are anecdotes of friendship or tales of hatred? We have presented the reality before you. The ball is now in your court to apply your logic and reason.

وَيَهْدِي مَنْ يَشَاءُ إِلَى صِرَاطٍ مُسْتَقِيمٍ

*And He guides whom He wills to a straight path.<sup>1</sup>*

---

1 Sūrah Yūnus: 25.



### Theme 3

It is recorded in books of history and ḥadīth that after the formation of this blessed union between Sayyidunā ‘Umar al-Fārūq and Sayyidunā ‘Alī’s رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُمَا daughter, the latter’s sons would frequently visit their sister at the former’s home. There existed no reservations or ill-feelings. The author of *Kanz al-‘Ummāl* documents such an incident with reference to *Tārīkh Ibn ‘Asākir*. His words follow:

عن ابن الحنفية قال دخل عمر بن الخطاب و أنا عند أختي أم كلثوم بنت علي فضمني قال الطف به يا أم كلثوم

Ibn al-Ḥanafīyah recalls, “‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb entered while I was with my sister Umm Kulthūm bint ‘Alī. He embraced me and said (to her), ‘Pamper him, O Umm Kulthūm.’”<sup>1</sup>

### Theme 4

The muḥaddithīn have reported yet another incident which clarifies whether a person may look at the hair of his sister or daughter. Ibn Abī Shaybah notes down:

عن أبي البخترى عن أبي صالح أن الحسن و الحسين كانا يدخلان على أختهما أم كلثوم و هي تمشط

From Abū al-Bakhtarī—from Abū Ṣāliḥ:

Ḥasan and Ḥusayn would enter upon their sister Umm Kulthūm while she was combing her hair.<sup>2</sup>

### Theme 5

This incident relates to Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ himself. Both Shī‘ī and Sunnī have recorded this incident. We have quoted it in the past when proving the nikāḥ of

---

1 *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, vol. 7 pg. 88, first edition, Dakkan.

2 *Muṣannaf Ibn Abī Shaybah*, vol. 4 pg. 336, book on marriage, chapter on what they said regarding a man looking at his sister’s or daughter’s hair, new edition, Dakkan.

Umm Kulthūm from Shīr books, with reference to Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd. We reproduce here to highlight the amiable family relationship they enjoyed. ‘Allāmah al-Sarakhsī writes in *al-Siyar al-Kabīr* and it appears in *Kanz al-‘Ummāl* with reference to al-Dīnawarī’s *al-Mujālasah*:

عن مالك بن أوس بن الحدثان قال قدم بريد ملك الروم على عمر بن الخطاب فاستقرضت امرأة عمر بن الخطاب دينارا فاشتريت به عطرا فجعلته في قوارير و بعثت به مع البريد إلى امرأة ملك الروم فلما أتتها فرغتهن و ملأتهن جواهر و قالت اذهب إلى امرأة عمر بن الخطاب فلما أتتها فرغتهن على البساط فدخل عمر بن الخطاب فقتل ما هذا فأخبرته فأخذ عمر الجواهر فباعه و دفع إلى امرأته دينارا و جعل ما بقي من ذلك في بيت مال المسلمين

Mālik ibn Aws ibn al-Ḥadathān reports:

The envoy of the Roman King came to ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb. His wife borrowed a gold coin and purchased with it perfume and filled it in bottles and sent them with the envoy to the queen of the Roman King. When she received the gift, she poured out the contents of the bottles and filled them with pearls and issued orders, “Take this to ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb’s wife.”

When the gift came, she poured the pearls out onto the bed. Just then ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb came in and asked, “What is this?”

She told him the whole story. So ‘Umar took the pearls and sold them. He then gave his wife one gold coin and had the rest deposited into the Muslim treasury.”<sup>1</sup>

Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd Shīr adds a little more detail to the incident. Have a look at his words:

وجه عمر إلى ملك الروم بريدا فاشتريت أم كلثوم امرأة عمر طيبا بدنانير و جعلته في قارورتين و أهدتهما إلى امرأة ملك الروم فرجع البريد إليها و معه ملأ القارورتين جواهر فدخل عليهما عمر و قد صبت الجواهر في حجرها فقتل من أين لك هذا فأخبرته فقبض عليه و قال هذا للمسلمين قالت كيف و هو

---

1 *Sharḥ al-Siyar al-Kabīr*, vol. 3 pg. 74, Hyderabad Dakkan print; *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, vol. 6 pg. 356, Ḥadīth: 5640, first edition, Dakkan.

عوض هديتي قال بيني و بينك أبوك فقال علي عليه السلام لك منه بقيمة دينارك و الباقي للمسلمين جملة  
لإن بريد المسلمين حملة

‘Umar sent an envoy to the Roman King. Meanwhile, Umm Kulthūm his wife, purchased perfume for few gold coins and placed it in two long necked bottles and sent them as a gift for the wife of the Roman king. The envoy returned to her with two bottles filled with pearls. ‘Umar entered upon them after she had poured the pearls in her lap.

He asked, “Where did you get this from?”

She informed him of the incident.

‘Umar took it and said, “This belongs to the Muslims.”

“How?” she asked, “It is in lieu of my gift.”

He said, “Your father will decide this matter between us.”

‘Alī رضي الله عنه said, “You will receive pearls equal to the value of money you spent, and the rest is for the Muslims, since their envoy brought it.”<sup>1</sup>

## Summary of the Discussion

After reviewing these points, one will learn that:

- Due to this relationship, the second and fourth khalīfah enjoyed a congenial relationship.
- ‘Alī and his sons would visit their beloved Umm Kulthūm at ‘Umar’s place.
- If there were any disputes in the family, then ‘Alī would be the first one to settle the dispute.

All these indicate to the beautiful, amiable, and friendly relationship they shared. This brings the discussion of Umm Kulthūm’s nikāḥ to an end.

---

1 *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*, vol. 4 pg. 575 – 576, Beirut print, 1375/1956 edition.

## Section Three

### The Relationship between ‘Umar and Ḥasan and Ḥusayn.

We now like to paint before you a little picture of the relationship between Sayyidunā ‘Umar on one hand and Sayyidunā Ḥasan and Sayyidunā Ḥusayn رضي الله عنهما on the other. Every sensible and intelligent person will realise the beauty of the relationship they enjoyed through these narrations. Just as Sayyidunā ‘Alī and Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنهما shared an amicable relationship, similarly, there existed a harmonious bond between the latter and the former’s children.

#### Theme One

Sayyidunā ‘Abd Allāh ibn ‘Umar رضي الله عنهما relates the virtues of Sayyidunā Ḥasan and Sayyidunā Ḥusayn رضي الله عنهما. An incident of this nature is documented in *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī*, the book of virtues:

سأله رجل عن المحرم يقتل الذباب فقال أهل العراق يسألون عن قتل الذباب وقد قتلوا ابن بنت رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم وقال النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم هما ريحنتاي من الدنيا

A man (from Iraq) asked him about a person in iḥrām killing a fly. He commented, “The people of Iraq are asking about killing a fly, whereas they have killed the son of Rasūlullāh’s صلى الله عليه وسلم daughter (i.e. Ḥusayn) and the Nabī صلى الله عليه وسلم had declared, “They (Ḥasan and Ḥusayn) are my sweet smelling flowers of this world.”<sup>1</sup>

#### Theme Two

This incident speaks of how Sayyidunā ‘Umar requested Sayyidunā Ḥusayn رضي الله عنهما to visit him and the manner he appreciated and respected him. Ḥāfiẓ Ibn ‘Asākir writes in his *Tārīkh*:

---

1 *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī*, vol. 1 pg. 530, book on virtues, merits of Ḥasan and Ḥusayn.

عن سفیان عن یحیی بن سعید قال أمر عمر حسینا أن یأتیه فی بعض الحاجة فذهب فلقي عبد الله بن عمر فقال له حسین من أين جئت فقال استأذنت علی عمر فلم یؤذن لی فرجع الحسین فلقیه عمر فقال ما منعک یا حسین أن تأتینی فقال قد أتیتک و لكن أخبرنی عبد الله أنه لم یؤذن له علیک فرجعت فقال و أنت عندي مثله کررها و هل أنبتت الشعر علی الرأس غیرکم

From Sufyān—from Yaḥyā ibn Saʿīd who reports:

‘Umar requested Ḥusayn to come to him for some need of his. So he went but met ‘Abd Allāh ibn ‘Umar en route.

Ḥusayn asked him, “Where are you coming from?”

He explained, “I sought permission to see ‘Umar, but was not granted the same.”

Hearing this, Ḥusayn also returned.

Thereafter, ‘Umar met him and asked, “Ḥusayn, what stopped you from coming to me?”

He explained, “I did come but ‘Abd Allāh informed me that he was not given permission to see you, so I also returned.”

‘Umar sighed, “Does he hold the same position as you in my sight?” he repeated this few times and then continued, “All the bounties we enjoy is through your blessings.”<sup>1</sup>

### Theme Three

The senior historians have reported this incident which depicts the level of respect and veneration in Sayyidunā ‘Umar’s heart for Sayyidunā Ḥasan and Sayyidunā Ḥusayn رضي الله عنهما. Al-Dhahabī reports:

---

1 Ibn Badrān: *Talkhīṣ Ibn ‘Asākir*, vol. 4 pg. 321, biography of Ḥusayn; *Sīrat ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb*, pg. 164, Egypt print; *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*, vol. 3 pg. 161 – 162, below the statement: may Allah favour that man for straightening crookedness, Beirut print; *Tārīkh Baghdād*, vol. 1 pg. 141, Ḥusayn ibn ‘Alī; *Kitāb Tārīkh al-Thiqāt*, pg. 119 – 120, chapter on Ḥusayn, Beirut print; *al-Ṣawā’iq al-Muḥriqah*, pg. 177, maqṣad 5; *Tārīkh al-Madīnah al-Munawwarah*, vol. 3 pg. 799, Cairo print, Egypt.

حماد بن زيد عن معمر عن الزهري أن عمر كسا أبناء الصحابة و لم يكن في ذلك ما يصلح للحسن و الحسين فبعث إلى اليمن فأتي بكسوة لهما فقال الآن طابت نفسي

Ḥammād ibn Zayd reports—from Ma‘mar—from al-Zuhrī:

‘Umar gave garments to the sons of the Ṣaḥābah. However, there was no garment appropriate in size for Ḥasan and Ḥusayn. So he sent orders to Yemen (to tailor make garments to fit them) and consequently garments their size were brought. (After they wore the garments) he remarked, “Now I am happy.”<sup>1</sup>

## Theme Four

Sayyidunā ‘Umar attended to the monetary rights of Sayyidunā Ḥasan and Sayyidunā Ḥusayn رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُمَا. Previously, in chapter two of the Fārūqī section, the discussion relating to the fulfilment of Sayyidunā ‘Alī’s رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ rights was mentioned and Sayyidunā Ḥasan’s and Sayyidunā Ḥusayn’s رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُمَا stipends were also mentioned by the way. Now we wish to concentrate specifically on their monetary rights.

Sayyidunā ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ considered fulfilling the rights of Rasūlullāh’s صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ relatives his compulsory mission and duty and a religious obligation. Without fulfilling the rights of the deserving, his justice remained imperfect. The muḥaddithīn and impartial unprejudiced historians have recorded the amount Sayyidunā ‘Umar stipulated for Sayyidunā Ḥasan and Sayyidunā Ḥusayn رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُمَا. We would like to present a few of these quotations. The onus is upon the readers to draw conclusions.

## Report One

عن جعفر بن محمد عن أبيه أن عمر ألحق الحسن والحسين بأبيهما و فرض لهما في خمسة آلاف خمسة آلاف

---

1 *Siyar A‘lām al-Nubalā’*, vol. 3 pg. 191, biography of Ḥusayn; *Talkhīṣ Ibn ‘Asākir*, vol. 4 pg. 322, biography of Ḥusayn; *Sīrat ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb*, pg. 97, Egypt print; *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, vol. 7 pg. 106, with reference to Ibn Sa’d, first edition; *al-Bidāyah*, vol. 8 pg. 207; *al-Riyāḍ al-Naḍīrah*, vol. 2 pg. 28 – 29, Egypt print.

Imām Ja‘far al-Şādiq عليه السلام narrates from his father, Muḥammad al-Bāqir عليه السلام, “Umar stipulated for Ḥasan and Ḥusayn a stipend equal to the stipend received by their father, ‘Alī. They used to receive 5000 *dirhams* (silver coins) per annum (which was the amount stipulated for those Şaḥābah who participated in the Battle of Badr).<sup>1</sup>

## Report Two

Imām al-Ṭaḥāwī writes:

و فرض للحسن و الحسين رضي الله عنهما خمسة آلاف خمسة آلاف أحققهما بأبيهما لقرابتهما من رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم إلخ

He stipulated for Ḥasan and Ḥusayn عليه السلام five thousand dirhams each, and joined them with their father, due to their kinship to Rasūlullāh صلى الله عليه وسلم.<sup>2</sup>

## Report Three

The famous historian Ḥāfiẓ Ibn ‘Asākir records in his *Tārīkh*:

إن عمر بن الخطاب لما دون الديوان و فرض العطاء ألحق الحسن و الحسين بفريضة أبيهما مع أهل بدر لقرابتهما من رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم ففرض لكل واحد منهما خمسة آلاف درهم

Certainly, when ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb prepared the register and stipulated stipends, he linked Ḥasan and Ḥusayn with their father’s stipend with the participants of Badr due to their relationship with Rasūlullāh صلى الله عليه وسلم. Accordingly, he stipulated 5000 dirhams for each of them.<sup>3</sup>

---

1 Abū ‘Ubayd Qāsīm ibn Salām: *Kitāb al-Amwāl*, pg. 224, chapter on stipulation of stipends from the Fay’, Egypt print.

2 *Sharḥ Ma‘ānī al-Āthār*, vol. 2 pg. 181, book on the recipients of Fay’ and distribution of booty, Delhi print.

3 *Tahdhīb Ibn ‘Asākir*, vol. 4 pg. 321 – 322, discussion on Ḥusayn, vol. 4 pg. 212, discussion on Imām ‘Alī; *al-Sunan al-Kubrā* with al-Jawhar al-Naqī, vol. 6 pg. 350, book on distribution of Fay’ and booty.

## Report Four

The Shī'ah mention a miracle of Sayyidunā Ḥasan رضي الله عنه which we will quote verbatim from their books. We learn from this that Sayyidunā Ḥasan ibn Abī Ṭālib رضي الله عنه participated in the jihād expeditions during the era of Sayyidunā 'Umar رضي الله عنه. The Shī'ī scholar 'Abbās al-Qummī has recorded this in his book *Tatimmat al-Muntahā fī Waqā'i' Ayyām al-Khulafā'* in the incidents of Mu'taḍid bi Allah's khilāfah.

مسجدے ست در بلدة (اصهبان) معروف بلسان الارض در طرف شرقی مزار تخت فولاد نزدیک به قبر فاضل بندی اہل  
انجا میگویند کو موضع زمین با حضرت امام حسن مجتبیٰ علیہ السلام تکلم کرده در زمانیکہ انحضرت در ایام خلافت  
عمر بن الخطاب با لشکر اسلام بجہت فتوحات باین مکان تشریف آورده و ازیں جہت اورا لسان الارض میگویند

There is a masjid in Isfahan which is known as *Lisān al-Arḍ*. It is situated close to the grave of Fāḍil Hindī, on the eastern side. The people of that area narrate that during the era of 'Umar, Ḥasan reached this place with the Muslim army, conquering place after place. The spot where the masjid is conversed with Ḥasan. That is why the people call it *Lisān al-Arḍ* (the tongue of the earth).<sup>1</sup>

## Report Five

The senior Shī'ah narrate yet another 'amazing' incident. Remember, their books have testified to its authenticity. We are simply presenting it as a proof against them. This narrative proves that one of Sayyidunā Ḥusayn's رضي الله عنه wives was gifted to him during the khilāfah of Sayyidunā 'Umar رضي الله عنه. The lands of the non-Arabs were being conquered and this slave girl was gifted to Sayyidunā Ḥusayn on the consultaion of Sayyidunā 'Alī رضي الله عنه. She gave birth to Imām Zayn al-'Ābidīn ('Alī ibn al-Ḥusayn).

Imām Muḥammad al-Bāqir's narration regarding 'Alī ibn al-Ḥusayn's birth appears in *Uṣūl al-Kāfī*:

---

<sup>1</sup> *Tatimmat al-Muntahā*, pg. 272-390, under the khilāfah of Mu'taḍid bi Allah



عن أبي جعفر عليه السلام لما قدمت بنت يزديجرد على عمر أشرف لها عذارى المدينة و أشرق المسجد بضوئها لما دخلته فلما نظر إليها عمر غطت وجهها و قالت أفيزوج بادا هرمز فقال عمر أتشمتني هذه و هم بها فقال له أمير المؤمنين عليه السلام ليس ذلك لك خيرا رجلا من المسلمين و أحسبها بفتيته فخيرا فجاءت حتى وضعت يدها على رأس الحسين عليه السلام فقال أمير المؤمنين عليه السلام ما اسمك فقال جهان شاه فقال لها أمير المؤمنين بل شهربانويه ثم قال للحسين يا أبا عبد الله ليلدن لك منها خير أهل الأرض فولدت علي بن الحسين

On the authority of Abū Ja‘far عليه السلام:

When the daughter of Yazdegerd was brought to ‘Umar, the young girls of Madīnah came out to see her. The masjid lit up with her brilliance as she entered. When ‘Umar looked at her, she covered her face and said, “Woe to Hurmuz, due to him we are facing this humiliation.”

‘Umar shouted, “Is she swearing me?” And he wanted to get up and hit her, but Amīr al-Mu‘minīn عليه السلام stopped him saying, “You have no right to do this!”

He continued, “Give her the choice of selecting a man from the Muslims and let her be lieu of his share from the booty.”

Accordingly, he let her choose. She walked about until she placed her hand on Ḥusayn’s head عليه السلام.

Amīr al-Mu‘minīn asked, “What is your name?”

“Jahānshāh,” she replied.

“No, rather it is Shahrbānuyah,” he told her.

He then told Ḥusayn, “O Abū ‘Abd Allāh, the best of the inhabitants of the earth will be born to you from her.” And she gave birth to ‘Alī ibn al-Ḥusayn.<sup>1</sup>

---

1 *Uṣūl al-Kāfi*, pg. 296, chapter on proof, the birth of ‘Alī ibn al-Ḥusayn, Nawl Kashawr print, Lucknow.

Mullā Khalīl Qazwīnī has translated Imām Muḥammad al-Bāqir’s report in Persian in his book *al-Ṣāfi fi Sharḥ Uṣūl al-Kāfi* in the following words:

یعنی روایتیست از امام محمد باقر علیہ السلام کہ گفت چون اورده شد دختر یزدجرد نزد عمر بہ با مہا رفتند دختران مدینہ برائے تماشاے حسن و جمال او چون اوازہ ایں را شنیدہ بودند و روشن شد مسجد مدینہ بتابش روئے او چون داخل مسجد شد پس چون نظر کرد بسوئے او عمر پوشانید روئے خودرا و گفت بدروزگاربادا ہرمز کہ بہ بدی تدبیر او باعث ایں شد پس عمر گفت ایا دشنام می دید مرا ایں دختر؟ و قصد ازار کرد با او پس گفت اورا امیر المومنین علیہ السلام نیست ایں دشنام برائے تو بلکہ برائے دیگر ست مخیر کن اورا کہ برگزید مردے را از مسلمانان و حساب کن اورا بحصہ غنیمت ایں مرد باعتبار خمس پس مخیر کرد اورا عمر پس امد تا نہاد دست خودرا بر سر امام حسین پس گفت امیر المومنین چیست نام تو پس گفت جہان شاہ پس گفت اورا امیر المومنین علیہ السلام بلکہ نام تو شہر بانویہ ست بعد ازاں گفت امام حسین را ای ابو عبد اللہ ہر ائینہ خوابد زائید البتہ برائے تو ازاد پسرے کہ بہتر از اہل زمین است در زمان خود پس زائید امام زید العابدین را<sup>1</sup>

The famous scholar, master of the lineage of the Shī‘ah, Ibn ‘Inabah (Jamāl al-Dīn) has included this matter briefly in his book ‘*Umdat al-Ṭālib fi Ansāb Āl Abī Ṭālib*:

فالمشهور أنها شاه زنان بنت كسرى يزدجرد بن شهريار ... و قيل إن اسمها شهر بانو قيل نهبت في فتح المدائن فنفلها عمر بن الخطاب من الحسين عليه السلام

It is well-known that she is Shāh Zanān bint Kisrā Yazdegerd ibn Shahryār. It is said that her name is Shahrbānū. It is suggested that she was captured during the conquest of Madā’in and ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb gave her as a gift to Ḥusayn رضي الله عنه.<sup>2</sup>

It should be remembered that Zayn al-‘Ābidīn’s mother being captured during the conquest of the Persian lands in the Fārūqī khilāfah and gifting her to Sayyidunā Ḥusayn رضي الله عنه has been documented with all its detail by the celebrated Shī‘ī historian Muḥammad Taqī Sipīhr in his *Nāsikh al-Tawārīkh* (vol. 10 pg. 3, 4, section one, in the biography of Zayn al-‘Ābidīn). The scholars may refer to the book for further details. We have provided the reference.

1 *Al-Ṣāfi fi Sharḥ Uṣūl al-Kāfi*, vol. 3 pg. 204 – 205, section two, chapter on proof, Nawl Kashawr print, Lucknow.

2 ‘*Umdat al-Ṭālib fi Ansāb Āl Abī Ṭālib*, pg. 192, section two regarding the issue of Ḥusayn the martyr, new edition.

## Clarification

The scholars should be aware that the meaning of the sentence:

بد روزگار بادا برمز را

Has been elucidated upon in *al-Ṣāfi fī Sharḥ Uṣūl al-Kāfi* in the following words:

برمز پدر خسر و پرویز ست مراد این جا دشنام خسرو پرویز ست که مومن نشده و نامه رسول الله را پاره پاره کرده تا کار با ینجار سید

Hurmuz is Khusroe Parwez's father. Here Khusroe Parwez is being badmouthed who did not embrace Islam and faced a very evil end due to him tearing up the letter of Rasūlullāh ﷺ.<sup>1</sup>

## Summary of this Chapter

1. Sayyidunā 'Umar and his children held Sayyidunā Ḥasan and Sayyidunā Ḥusayn رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ in high esteem.
2. They visited each other and paid attention to each other's dignity and honour.
3. At times, Sayyidunā 'Umar would gift Sayyidunā Ḥasan and Sayyidunā Ḥusayn رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ garments.
4. During the Fārūqī khilāfah, they would receive stipends and allowances annually which they gladly accepted.
5. Sayyidunā Ḥasan رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ joined the Muslims armies mobilised by the Fārūqī khilāfah.
6. According to the research of the Shī'ī mujtahidīn and scholars, Sayyidunā Ḥusayn رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ was gifted a slave-girl by Sayyidunā 'Umar رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ from the

---

1 *Al-Ṣāfi fī Sharḥ Uṣūl al-Kāfi*, vol. 3 pg. 204 – 205, section two, book of proof, birth of 'Alī ibn al-Ḥusayn, Nawl Kashawr print, Lucknow.

spoils of war which he happily accepted. He married her and Zayn al-  
‘Ābidīn was born from her.

These points prove beyond doubt that:

The Fārūqī khilāfah was correct and was not usurped. All the military expeditions were acceptable and taking from the booty was permissible. Sayyidunā ‘Alī and his sons عليه السلام took their monetary dues from Sayyidunā ‘Umar al-Fārūq عليه السلام. There existed no religious or political dispute between them. These historical facts are substantiations to all these conclusions.

## Section Four

### Bequests and Extra Matters in ‘Umar’s Last Days and Matters After his Demise

This is the last section of chapter three. The incidents which discuss the final days of Sayyidunā ‘Umar and Sayyidunā ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib’s رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُمَا participation will be gathered here. These reports will be presented in a certain pattern under various headings. Rather than listing the conclusions and deductions after every heading, all these will be enumerated at the end. After viewing them, every sensible man will attest to the harmonious relationship enjoyed by these two luminaries and every just person will most definitely testify to the friendly bond they shared.

#### 1. The Prophecy of ‘Umar’s Death in a Dream

‘Allāmah Abū Bakr ‘Abd Allāh ibn al-Zubayr al-Ḥumaydī in his *Musnad Ḥumaydī* and Imām Aḥmad in his *Musnad Aḥmad* have related a story which describes a dream Sayyidunā ‘Umar had which was interpreted by Sayyidunā ‘Alī’s wife Sayyidah Asmā’ bint ‘Umays رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهَا as an indication to his imminent death and an attack on him by a non-Arab. The text reads:

إن عمر بن الخطاب قام على المنبر يوم الجمعة فحمد الله و أثنى عليه ثم ذكر رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم و سلم و ذكر أبا بكر رضي الله عنه ثم قال رأيت رؤيا لا أراها إلا لحضور أجلي رأيت كأن ديكا نقرني نقرتين قال و ذكر لي أنه ديك أحمر فقصصتها على أسماء بنت عميس ... فقالت يقتلك رجل من العجم ... قال فخطب الناس يوم الجمعة و أصيب يوم الأربعاء

‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb stood on the pulpit on the day of Jumū‘ah. He praised Allah and glorified Him and then spoke about Rasūlullāh ﷺ followed by Abū Bakr رضي الله عنه. He then said, “I saw a dream. I feel that my death is imminent. I saw as if a rooster pecked me twice. I remember it being a red rooster. So I related the dream to Asmā’ bint ‘Umays who told me that a non-Arab man will kill me.”

The narrator says: He addressed the people on Friday and was attacked the next Wednesday.<sup>1</sup>

## 2. ‘Alī’s and Ibn ‘Abbās’s testimony to ‘Umar’s Islam, Hijrah, Khilāfah, and Trustworthiness

Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه was leading the morning prayer when Sayyidunā Mughīrah ibn Shu‘bah’s رضي الله عنه *Majūsī* (Magian) non-Arab slave (Abū Lu‘lu’ Fayrūz) attacked him with an intent to kill him. This happened in the last days of Dhū al-Ḥijjah 23 A.H. Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه was immediately taken from the Masjid to his home. He lived for three days after the assault, and passed away on the 1st of Muḥarram 24 A.H.

During these three days, the noble Ṣaḥābah رضي الله عنهم came in to visit the khalīfah at different times. Once, Sayyidunā ‘Alī and ‘Abd Allāh ibn ‘Abbās رضي الله عنهما were in his presence, when Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه out of overwhelming concern for the Ākhirah, began to express worry for himself. To comfort him and bring relief to his heart, Sayyidunā ‘Abd Allāh ibn ‘Abbās spoke a few words of consolation which were endorsed by Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه. The narration reads:

قال حدثنا يوسف عن أبيه عن أبي حنيفة عن الهيثم قال دخل ابن عباس رضي الله تعالى عنهما على عمر حين أصيب فقال أبشر فوالله لقد كان إسلامك عزا و لقد كان هجرتك فتحا و ولايتك عدلا و لقد صحبت رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم حتى توفي و هو عنك راض و هو عنك راض و لقد وليت فما اختلف في ولايتك اثنان قال عمر أتشهد بذلك قال فكع ابن عباس فقال علي نعم نشهد بذلك

Yūsuf narrated to us—from his father—from Abū Ḥanīfah—from al-Haytham who said:

Ibn ‘Abbās رضي الله عنه entered the presence of ‘Umar after he had been attacked and announced, “Rejoice for by Allah your Islam was honour, your hijrah was a victory, and your khilāfah was justice. And indeed, you accompanied Rasūlullāh صلى الله عليه وسلم until he passed away while being pleased with you. You

---

1 *Musnad Aḥmad*, vol. 1 pg. 15, musnadāt ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb, Egypt print; *Musnad Ḥumaydī*, vol. 1 pg. 17, aḥādīth of ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb, Majlis ‘Ilmī print, Karachi and Dabhel.

then proved a loyal companion to Abū Bakr until he passed on while being happy with you. Then, you were appointed khilāfah. Not even two disputed over (the correctness of) your khilāfah.”

‘Umar said, “Will you bear witness to this?”

Ibn ‘Abbās kept silent so ‘Alī affirmed, “Definitely, we will testify to this!”<sup>1</sup>

The readers should also be aware that ‘Allāmah al-Zujājī has related this incident of Sayyidunā ‘Alī and Sayyidunā Ibn ‘Abbās coming to Sayyidunā ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ during his last moments and giving him the glad tidings of Jannah with different wording through his sanad from Maymūn ibn Mahrān from Sayyidunā ‘Abd Allāh ibn ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُمَا.<sup>2</sup>

Another amazing aspect is that just as Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ attested to Rasūlullāh’s صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ pleasure with Sayyidunā ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ, the latter testified to Rasūlullāh’s صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ pleasure with the former. It appears in *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī*:

قال عمر رضي الله عنه توفي رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم وهو عنه راض

‘Umar رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ stated, “Rasūlullāh صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ passed away while being pleased with him (‘Alī).”<sup>3</sup>

### 3. After the brutal attack, ‘Alī’s expression of complete compassion

عن أيوب السختياني عن جعفر بن محمد عن أبيه قال لما طعن عمر رضي الله عنه بعث إلى حلقة من أهل بدر كانوا يجلسون بين القبر والمنبر فقال يقول لكم عمر أنشدكم الله أكان ذلك عن رضا منكم فتلكم القوم فقال علي ابن أبي طالب فقال لا وددنا إنا زدنا في عمره من أعمارنا

From Ayyūb al-Sakhtiyānī—from Ja‘far ibn Muḥammad—from his father who narrates:

1 Imām Abū Yūsuf: *Kitāb al-Āthār*, pg. 207, Ḥadīth: 925, Hyderabad Dakkan; *Sīrat ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb*, pg. 193, Egypt print; *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*, vol. 3 pg. 215 – 216, discussion on the reports on ‘Umar’s death and the statements made at this time, Beirut print; *Adab al-Mufrad*, pg. 167, chapter on walking to the man of a gathering.

2 *Kitāb al-Amālī*, pg. 105, Egypt print, first edition.

3 *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī*, vol. 1 pg. 525, chapter on ‘Alī’s merits, Nūr Muḥammadī print, Delhi.

When ‘Umar رضي الله عنه was stabbed, he sent for the circle of the participants of Badr who would sit between the grave and pulpit. He said, “‘Umar asks you: I swear to you by Allah, are you pleased with this occurrence?”

The people hesitated, so ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib stood up promptly and announced, “No! We desired that we add to your life from our lives.”<sup>1</sup>

#### 4. ‘Alī sounds glad tidings of Jannah to ‘Umar and Ḥasan endorses

عن أبي مضر قال سمعت عليا يقول دخلت على عمر بن الخطاب حين طعن و جاءه أبو لؤلؤ و هو يبكي فقلت ما يبكيك يا أمير المؤمنين قال أبكاني خبر السماء أيذهب بي إلى الجنة أم إلى النار فقلت له أبشر بالجنة فإني سمعت رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم يقول ما لا أحصيه سيذا كهول أهل الجنة أبو بكر و عمر و أنعما فقال شاهد أنت لي يا علي بالجنة قلت نعم و أنت يا حسن فاشهد على أبيك أن رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم قال إن عمر من أهل الجنة

Abū Maṣar reports that he heard ‘Alī saying:

I entered upon ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb after he had been stabbed by Abū Lu’lu’. He was crying, so I asked, “What makes you weep, O Amīr al-Mu’minīn?”

He replied, “The news of the sky makes me weep. Will I be escorted to Jannah or Hell?”

I said to him, “Rejoice with glad tidings of Jannah! For I have indeed heard Rasūlullāh صلى الله عليه وسلم proclaim on numerous occasions which I cannot enumerate, “The leaders of the middle-aged class in Jannah will be Abū Bakr and ‘Umar, and the most favoured.”

‘Umar asked, “O ‘Alī, will you testify that I am going Jannah?”

“Yes,” I replied, “And you, O Ḥasan, bear witness over your father that Rasūlullāh صلى الله عليه وسلم guaranteed that ‘Umar is from the dwellers of Jannah.”<sup>2</sup>

---

1 *Ḥilyat al-Awliyā*, vol. 3 pg. 199, discussion on Ja’far al-Ṣādiq, Egypt print; *Muṣannaf ‘Abd al-Razzāq*, vol. 6 pg. 51 – 52 and vol. 10 pg. 357, Beirut print.

2 *Kanz al-Ummāl*, vol. 6 pg. 364, chapter on ‘Umar’s virtues, section on his demise, with reference to Ibn ‘Asākir, old print, Dakkan.



## 5. Nomination of the Assembly and ‘Alī’s Inclusion

When Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه was at the final stage of his life and realised that death was looming, he made many bequests and advised those close and distant. There is a very famous bequest he made at that time which both Sunnī and Shī‘ī scholars have documented. It deals with the Islamic khilāfah and the goodwill of Muslims.

He selected a six men committee from the senior Muslims and commanded that whichever individual is unanimously selected by all should be appointed as the khilāfah and Amīr al-Mu‘minīn. The decision was to be made in three days. The six men committee comprised of Sayyidunā ‘Uthmān ibn ‘Affān, Sayyidunā ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib, Sayyidunā Zubayr, Sayyidunā Ṭalḥah, Sayyidunā ‘Abd al-Raḥmān ibn ‘Awf, and Sayyidunā Sa‘d ibn Abī Waqqāṣ رضي الله عنه.

He also expounded on the reason and wisdom behind selecting these individuals; Rasūlullāh صلى الله عليه وسلم was pleased with them when he left this world. Owing to this, he favoured them over everyone besides them. Sayyidunā ‘Alī al-Murtaḍā رضي الله عنه was included in this selection as is explicitly mentioned in all sources.

We now wish to present a serving from the large platter of transmissions the muḥaddithīn and historians have prepared to satiate the tastebuds of the readers. At the end, a quotation will be brought from Shaykh al-Ṭūsī’s *Al-Amālī* for the benefit of the Shī‘ah. Although the texts have slight variations, the gist of all the narrations are the same.

### **Musnad Ḥumaydī**

Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه states:

وإني قد جعلت هذا الأمر بعدي إلى هؤلاء الستة الذين قبض رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم وهو عنهم راض وهم عثمان وعلي والزبير وطلحة وعبد الرحمن بن عوف وسعد بن أبي وقاص فمن استخلف فهو الخليفة

I have indeed handed over this matter after me to these six, with whom Rasūlullāh ﷺ was pleased when he passed away. And they are ‘Uthmān, ‘Alī, Zubayr, Ṭalḥah, ‘Abd al-Raḥmān ibn ‘Awf, and Sa’d ibn Abī Waqqāṣ. Whoever of them is chosen will be the khalīfah.<sup>1</sup>

## 6. Corroboration from the Shī‘ah

Let us quote from books regarded reliable and authentic by the Shī‘ah. It is hoped that the unprejudiced will find great satisfaction with this matter. Shaykh al-Ṭā’ifah al-Ṭūsī reports via his sanad in his *Al-Amālī* and Shaykh al-Ṣadūq ibn Bābawayh al-Qummī quotes it in his book *‘Ilal al-Sharā’i’*:

عن أبي الطفيل عامر بن وائلة الكناني قال احتضر عمر بن الخطاب جعلها شورى بين علي بن أبي طالب و عثمان بن عفان و طلحة و الزبير و سعد بن أبي وقاص و عبد الرحمن بن عوف رضي الله عنهم و عبد الله بن عمر فيمن يشاور و لا يولى

Abū al-Ṭufayl ‘Āmir ibn Wāthilah al-Kannānī reports:

When ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb was in his last moments, he assigned it to a council between ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālīb, ‘Uthmān ibn ‘Affān, Ṭalḥah, Zubayr, Sa’d ibn Abī Waqqāṣ, and ‘Abd al-Raḥmān ibn ‘Awf رضي الله عنه; and ‘Abd Allāh ibn ‘Umar was to present his opinion without being appointed as khalīfah.<sup>2</sup>

1 *Musnad Ḥumaydī*, vol. 1 pg. 17, under the aḥādīth of ‘Umar, Majlis ‘Ilmī print, Karachi; *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī*, vol. 1 pg. 524, chapter on the merits of ‘Uthmān and the incident of the bay‘ah and ‘Umar’s martyrdom, Nūr Muḥammadī print, Delhi; *Musnad Aḥmad*, vol. 1 pg. 20, Masānīd ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb; *Ṭabaqāt Ibn Sa’d*, vol. 3 pg. 246, chapter on ‘Umar, section one, Europe print; *Musnad Abī Ya’lā*, pg. 27, Masānīd ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb, quoted from Pīr Gūth (Sindh); *al-Sunan al-Kubrā*, vol. 8 pg. 150, book on the rebels, chapter on who assigns the matter to consultation; *Ansāb al-Ashrāf*, vol. 5 pg. 18, chapter on the matter of shūrā and bay‘ah to ‘Uthmān, new edition, Takhtī Kalān; *al-Bidāyah wa al-Nihāyah*, vol. 7 pg. 137, 138, Egypt print, first edition.

2 *Al-Amālī*, vol. 2 pg. 167 – 169, Najaf Ashraf print, Iraq; *‘Ilal al-Sharā’i’*, pg. 171, chapter 134, Najaf Ashraf print, Iraq; *Tārīkh Ya’qūbī*, vol. 2 pg. 160, the occurrences around ‘Umar’s death, Beirut print; *Murāj al-Dhahab*, vol. 2 pg. 312, discussion on the khilāfah of ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb.

## 7. A Special Bequest to ‘Alī and Arrangements for Ṣalāh

It is recorded among the bequests of Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه in *Ṭabaqāt Ibn Sa‘d*:

ثم دعا عليا فأوصاه ثم أمر صهيبا أن يصلي بالناس

He then called ‘Alī and made a special bequest to him. Thereafter, he ordered that Ṣuhayb lead the people in ṣalāh.<sup>1</sup>

Some narrations mention that one of the last bequests of Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه was that he commanded the six on oath to fear Allah and stressed upon them to maintain justice and fairness.<sup>2</sup>

## 8. Words of Appreciation from ‘Alī for ‘Umar

As Sayyidunā ‘Umar al-Fārūq رضي الله عنه breathed his last, the cloud of grief, sadness, sorrow, and pain covered the entire Muslim Ummah. The Ṣaḥābah رضي الله عنهم grew restless and anxious. All the distinguished personalities were grief-stricken by this great tragedy. At that time, Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه expressed his grief, voiced his love, and pronounced the greatness of Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه in various ways. He appreciated his trustworthiness and honesty and honoured him.

From the countless statements of Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه, we wish to select only a few. The readers will be able to discern the amiable relationship they shared and the trust they had upon one another.

عن ابن عباس قال إني لواقف في قوم فدعوا الله لعمر بن الخطاب و قد وضع على سريره إذا رجل من خلفي قد وضع مرفقه على منكبي يقول يرحمك الله أن كنت لأرجو أن يجعلك مع صاحبك لأني كثير ما كنت أسمع رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم يقول كنت و أبو بكر و عمر و فعلت و أبو بكر و عمر و انطلقت و أبو بكر و عمر أن كنت لأرجو أن يجعلك الله معهما فالتفت فإذا علي بن أبي طالب

1 *Ṭabaqāt Ibn Sa‘d*, vol. 3 pg. 246.

2 Al-Balādhurī.

Ibn ‘Abbās says:

I was standing among a group who were supplicating to Allah for ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb after he was placed on his bier when suddenly a man from behind me placed his elbow upon my shoulder and uttered, “May Allah have mercy on you. I have great hope that Allah will unite you with your two companions (Rasūlullāh ﷺ and Abū Bakr) since I have heard Rasūlullāh ﷺ declaring on many occasions, ‘It was I, Abū Bakr, and ‘Umar. I did, and so did Abū Bakr and ‘Umar. I walked with Abū Bakr and ‘Umar.’ I have burning optimism that Allah will join you with them.” I turned around, and it was ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib.<sup>1,2</sup>

## 9. ‘Alī Expresses His Envy over ‘Umar’s Book of Deeds

After Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه passed away, he was bathed and shrouded. His blessed janāzah was brought forward for Ṣalāt al-Janāzah. At that time, Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه bore witness to the īmān and Islam of Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه in front of all the Muslims ahead of the rows and expressed his aspiration.

This priceless testimony of Sayyidunā ‘Umar’s رضي الله عنه religiousness and truthfulness has not been reported from any other Ṣaḥābī, in the manner pronounced by

---

1 *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī*, vol. 1 pg. 519, 520, chapter on the virtues of Abū Bakr and ‘Umar, Nūr Muḥammadi print, Delhi; *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, vol. 2 pg. 274, chapter on ‘Umar’s merits, Delhi print; *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, pg. 10, chapter on virtues, Delhi print; *Musnad Aḥmad*, vol. 1 pg. 112, musnadāt of ‘Alī, Egypt print, with selection of al-Kanz; *Kanz al-Ummāl*, vol. 6 pg. 365, Ḥadīth: 5717, old Dakkan print.

2 Caution: For the benefit of the scholars, we would like to notify that the narration which we have quoted from scores of muḥaddithīn has been reported by al-Ḥākim Nīshāpūrī from Ibn ‘Abbās رضي الله عنه in *al-Mustadrak*. After reproducing the narration, he asserts, “This ḥadīth is ṣaḥīḥ according to the standards of al-Bukhārī and Muslim, but they have not reported it.” (*Al-Mustadrak*, vol. 3, pg. 68, book on recognising the Ṣaḥābah). He claims that they have not reported it. This humble servant, author of the book says, “How could al-Ḥākim have said this whereas al-Bukhārī has reported this narration with variation in wording in the chapter on the merits of ‘Umar in his *al-Ṣaḥīḥ* (vol. 1 pg. 519 – 520). This was negligence on his part. May Allah forgive him and us. Glory be the One who does not forget, does not err, is not negligent, and does not blunder.”

Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ. He articulated the chastity and flawlessness of the entire life of Sayyidunā ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ in one brief sentence, thus voicing his full conviction and faith in the man.

Scores of muḥaddithīn, Fuḡahā’, and historians—both Sunnī and Shī’ī—have reported this narration through their respective chains of transmission. A slideshow of some of these traditions will be staged for the readers in a unique pattern.

### a. Abū Yūsuf’s *Kitāb al-Āthār*

قال حدثنا يوسف عن أبيه عن أبي حنيفة عن أبي جعفر محمد بن علي عن علي بن أبي طالب رضي الله عنه أنه قال لعمر و هو مسجى ما أحد أحب إلي أن ألقى الله تعالى بمثل صحيفته من هذا المسجى

Yusuf narrated to us—from his father—from Abū Ḥanīfah—from Abū Ja‘far Muḥammad ibn ‘Alī—from ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ that he announced concerning ‘Umar who was shrouded:

There is no one with whose book of deeds I will be more pleased to meet Allah سُبْحَانَ رَبِّيَ than this shrouded man.<sup>1</sup>

### b. Imām Muḥammad ibn al-Ḥasan’s *Kitāb al-Āthār*

قال الإمام محمد أخبرنا أبو حنيفة قال حدثنا أبو جعفر محمد بن علي قال جاء علي بن أبي طالب إلى عمر بن الخطاب حين طعن فقال رحمتك الله فوالله ما في الأرض أحد كنت ألقى الله بصحيفته أحب إلي منك

Imām Muḥammad reports—Abū Ḥanīfah informed us saying—Abū Ja‘far Muḥammad ibn ‘Alī narrated to us saying:

‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib came to ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb after he was stabbed and submitted, “May Allah be merciful to you. By Allah, there is no one on the face of the earth with whose book of deeds I am happier to meet Allah than yours.”<sup>2</sup>

1 *Kitāb al-Āthār*, pg. 215, Ḥadīth: 952, Egypt print, Lajnat Iḥyā’ Ma‘ārif al-Nu‘māniyyah, Dakkan.

2 *Kitāb al-Āthār*, pg. 146, chapter on the merits of the Ṣaḡhābah, Anwār Muḥammadī print, Lucknow, old edition.

### c. Testimony of Imām Muḥammad al-Bāqir

Qāḍī Abū Mu‘ayyad Muḥammad ibn Maḥmūd al-Khawārizmī (d. 665 A.H.) has backed this Murtaḍwī statement with a number of isnāds in his book *Jāmi‘ Masānīd al-Imām al-A‘ẓam*. This is one narration reported on the strength of Imām Muḥammad al-Bāqir:

حدثنا أبو حنيفة عن أبي جعفر محمد بن علي بن الحسين بن علي بن أبي طالب رضوان الله عليهم أجمعين قال أتيتُه فسلمت عليه و قعدت إليه ... فقلت له يرحمك الله هل شهد علي موت عمر فقال سبحان الله أو ليس القائل ما أحد من الناس أحب إلي من أن ألقى الله بصحيفته من هذا المسجى ثم زوجه بنته لولا أنه رآه أهلا ما كان يزوجه إياه و كانت أشرف نساء العلمين جدها رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم و أبوها علي ذو الشرف المنيف و المنقبة في الإسلام و أمها فاطمة بنت رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم و أخوها الحسن و الحسين سيدا شباب أهل الجنة و جدتها خديجة

Abū Ḥanīfah narrated to us—from Abū Ja‘far Muḥammad ibn ‘Alī ibn al-Ḥusayn ibn ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib عليه السلام who said:

I approached him, greeted him, and sat by him. I then submitted, “May Allah have mercy on you. Was ‘Alī present at ‘Umar’s funeral?”

He said, “Glorified is Allah! Is he not the one who declared: ‘There is no person more beloved to me to meet Allah with his book of deeds than this shrouded man.’ He then married his daughter to him. If he did not deem him worthy, he would not have married her to him. Moreover, she was the noblest women of the world. Her grandfather is Rasūlullāh صلى الله عليه وسلم; her father is ‘Alī—possessor of sublime nobility and merit in Islam; her mother is Fāṭimah the daughter of Rasūlullāh صلى الله عليه وسلم; her brothers are Ḥasan and Ḥusayn, the leaders of the youth of Jannah; and her grandmother is Khadījah.<sup>1</sup>

### d. Musnad Aḥmad

Imām Aḥmad reports this statement via various chains of transmission.

---

1 *Jāmi‘ Masānīd al-Imām al-A‘ẓam*, vol. 1 pg. 204, chapter on ‘Umar’s virtues, *Dā‘irat al-Ma‘ārif* print, Dakkan.

أبو معشر نجیح المدیني مولی بنی هاشم عن نافع عن ابن عمر قال وضع عمر بن الخطاب رضي الله عنه بين المنبر و القبر فجاء علي رضي الله عنه حتى قام بين يدي الصفوف فقال هو هذا ثلاث مرات ثم قال رحمة الله عليك ما من خلق الله تعالى أحب إلي من أن ألقاه بصحيفته بعد صحيفه النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم من هذا المسجى

Abū Ma‘shar Najīḥ al-Madīnī, the freed slave of the Banū Hāshim—from Nāfi‘—from Ibn ‘Umar who relates:

‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb رضي الله عنه was laid down between the pulpit and grave. Subsequently, ‘Alī رضي الله عنه arrived and stood ahead of the rows and declared, “Here he is!” thrice. He continued, “May Allah’s mercy enshroud you! There is no creation of Allah سبحانه وتعالى more cherished to me to meet Him with his good deeds after the good deeds of the Nabī صلى الله عليه وسلم than this shrouded man.”<sup>1</sup>

#### e. *Musnad Aḥmad*

يونس بن أبي يعقوب عن عون بن أبي جحيفة عن أبيه قال كنت عند عمر و هو مسجى ثوبه قد قضى نحوه فجاء علي رضي الله عنه فكشف الثوب عن وجهه ثم قال رحمة الله عليك أبا حفص فوالله ما بقي بعد رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم أحب إلي من أن ألقى الله تعالى بصحيفته منك

Yūnus ibn Abī Ya‘qūb—from ‘Awn ibn Abī Juḥayfah—from his father who reports:

I was by ‘Umar who was shrouded in material after he had just passed away. Just then, ‘Alī رضي الله عنه came and uncovered his face and then stated, “Allah’s mercy be upon you, Abū Ḥafṣ! By Allah, there remains none after Rasūlullāh صلى الله عليه وسلم more pleasing to me to meet Allah with his book of deeds than you.”<sup>2</sup>

#### f. *Ṭabaqāt Ibn Sa‘d*

This declaration of Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه is reported in twelve traditions in *Ṭabaqāt Ibn Sa‘d*. Five of these isnāds lead up to Imām Ja‘far al-Ṣādiq and Muḥammad al-

1 *Musnad Aḥmad*, vol. 1 pg. 109, musnadāt ‘Alī, with selection of *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*.

2 *Ibid*.

Bāqir. Three reports are only from Muḥammad al-Bāqir. One leads upto Zayd ibn ‘Alī and another to Muḥammad ibn al-Ḥanafīyyah. The other traditions are reported from others besides these Hāshimites. Despite the slight variations of the different reports, the same statement of Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ is transmitted. We are sufficing on quoting one narration from Muḥammad al-Bāqir. The others can be checked in the original book, the reference of which we have provided for the scholars.

أخبرنا أنس بن عياض الليثي عن جعفر بن محمد عن أبيه أن عليا لما غسل عمر بن الخطاب و كفن و حمل على سريره وقف عليه فأتنى عليه و قال والله ما على الأرض رجل أحب إلي أن ألقى الله بصحيفته من هذا المسجي بالثوب

Anas ibn ‘Iyāḍ al-Laythī informed us—from Ja‘far ibn Muḥammad—from his father:

After ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb was washed and shrouded and placed on his bier, ‘Alī stood over him. He praised him and said, “By Allah, there is no man on earth more beloved to me to meet Allah with his book of deeds than this man wrapped with a shroud.”<sup>1</sup>

## Notification

Let the scholars be aware that this narration is documented in *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī*, vol. 1 pg. 520, chapter on ‘Umar’s virtues. However, there is slight difference in wording and it is attached to the narration of togetherness. In a like manner, this narration appears in *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, vol. 3, chapter on ‘Umar’s merits, but is fixed with another narration, i.e. Allah will unite you with your two companions.

## g. Al-Mustadrak

Al-Ḥākim reports via his chain:

---

<sup>1</sup> *Ṭabaqāt Ibn Sa‘d*, vol. 3 pg. 269 – 270, chapter on ‘Umar’s life, Leiden print, Europe; *Muṣannaf Ibn Abī Shaybah*, vol. 12 pg. 37 – 38, book on virtues, Karachi print.



سفيان بن عيينة عن جعفر بن محمد عن أبيه عن جابر بن عبد الله أن عليا دخل على عمر وهو مسجى فقال صلى الله عليك ثم قال ما من الناس أحد أحب إلي أن ألقى الله بما في صحيفته من هذا المسجى

Sufyān ibn ‘Uyaynah—from Ja‘far ibn Muḥammad—from his father—from Jābir ibn ‘Abd Allāh:

‘Alī entered ‘Umar’s presence whereas he was wrapped in a shroud. He submitted, “May Allah send salutations upon you.” He then stated, “There is no person more beloved to me to meet Allah with what is in his book of deeds than this man wrapped in shroud.”<sup>1</sup>

### The Musajjā Narration with the Shī‘ah

The respected readers will be pleased to hear that the narration which we have quoted from various books has been deemed authentic by the Shī‘ah scholars and mujtahidīn. Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ publicly expressed his sentiments of envy and admiration for Sayyidunā ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ at his funeral, so that his feelings towards him may be realised by all those present.

#### a. *Ma‘ānī al-Akḥbār*

Shaykh al-Ṣadūq Ibn Bābawayh al-Qummī reports via his sanad:

نظر إلى الثاني و هو مسجى بثوبه ما أحد أحب إلي أن ألقى الله بصحيفته من هذا المسجى

He gazed at the second (khalīfah) while he lay wrapped in a shroud, “There is none more beloved to me to meet Allah with his good deeds than this shrouded man.”<sup>2</sup>

#### b. *Kitāb al-Shāfi*

روى جعفر بن محمد عن أبيه عن جابر بن عبد الله لما غسل عمر و كفن دخل علي عليه السلام فقال صلى الله عليه ما على الأرض أحد أحب إلي أن ألقى الله بصحيفته من هذا المسجى بين أظهركم

1 *Al-Mustadrak*, vol. 3 pg. 93 – 94, with *Talkhīṣ* of al-Dhahabī. Al-Dhahabī has not criticised this narration.

2 *Ma‘ānī al-Akḥbār*, pg. 117, chapter 245, old Iran print.

Ja'far ibn Muḥammad narrates—from his father—from Jābir ibn 'Abd Allāh:

After 'Umar was washed and shrouded, 'Alī entered and submitted, “May Allah send salutations upon him. There is no one on earth more beloved to me to meet Allah with his book of deeds than this man wrapped before you.”<sup>1</sup>

## Clarification

The readers should know that the Shī'ī mujtahidīn and scholars like Shaykh al-Ṣadūq, Sayyid Murtaḍā 'Alam al-Hudā, Shaykh Abū Ja'far al-Ṭūsī, and their like have not labelled the musajjā narration baseless or fabricated. On the other hand, respecting their inherent habit, they forwarded interpretations and explanations to it and labelled it a khabar wāḥid, and consequently passed the verdict of it being non beneficial and indefinite, whereas a khabar wāḥid being *mufīd ḡann* (giving the benefit of strong belief) is an accepted principle. Moreover, the scores of muḥaddithīn that have reported it, their numbers reach the level of mash-hūr in meaning. To interpret and deny everything stems from hatred and opposition. Justice demands that prejudice be dumped and impartially be adopted when pondering over the issue. Furthermore, the spear of Taqīyyah is poked everywhere, even here, as a last resort.

## 10. 'Alī's Presence at 'Umar's Burial

This is the last heading of section four. After Sayyidunā 'Umar's ﷺ Ṣalāt al-Janāzah was performed, and he was about to be buried, Sayyidunā 'Alī ﷺ with other friends descended into his grave to lower his blessed body. He took full advantage of this last opportunity to fulfil the rights of his bosom friend and laid him to rest in his final resting place.

To get a better understanding of this incident, read these snippets of the scholars and historians.

---

<sup>1</sup> *Kitāb al-Shāfi*, pg. 171, 177, with *Talkhīṣ al-Shāfi*, pg. 428, old Iran print.

- a. Ibn Jarīr al-Ṭabarī records in the events of year 23 A.H. in the chapter discussing the incident of shūrā:

و نزل في قبره يعني في قبر عمر الخمسة يعني أهل الشورى ألخ

He descended into ‘Umar’s grave as one of five of the council.<sup>1</sup>

- b. Ibn Athīr al-Jazarī writes in *al-Kāmil*, chapter on the discussion of ‘Umar’s martyrdom:

نزل في قبره (عمر) عثمان و علي و الزبير و عبد الرحمن بن عوف و سعد بن أبي وقاص و عبد الله بن عمر

‘Uthmān, ‘Alī, Zubayr, ‘Abd al-Raḥmān ibn ‘Awf, Sa‘d ibn Abī Waqqāṣ, and ‘Abd Allāh ibn ‘Umar descended into ‘Umar’s grave.<sup>2</sup>

- c. Ḥāfiẓ Ibn Kathīr writes in *al-Bidāyah*:

نزل في قبره مع ابنه عبد الله أهل الشورى سوى طلحة فإنه كان غائبا

With his son, ‘Abd Allāh, the men of the council descended into his grave besides Ṭalḥah since he was absent.<sup>3</sup>

## Summary of Section Four

Here are a list of important points to summarise section four.

1. Some of the narrations presented have excellent isnāds and are worthy of being called *silsilat al-dhahab* (golden chains). For example, the isnāds of *Kitāb al-Āthār* of Imām Abū Yūsuf and Imām Muḥammad. These A’immah narrate from the A’immah (of the Ahl al-Bayt). This shows that they benefitted academically from each other. This is clear indication to their strong bond.

---

1 *Tārīkh al-Ṭabarī*, vol. 5 pg. 38, Egypt print.

2 *Al-Kāmil*, vol. 3 pg. 28.

3 *Al-Bidāyah*, vol. 7 pg. 145, Egypt print.

2. Sayyidunā ‘Umar asked the interpretation of his dream from Sayyidunā ‘Alī’s wife, Sayyidah Asmā’ bint ‘Umays رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهَا, which suggested his imminent death. This shows their mutual love.
3. Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ testified that Rasūlullāh صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ was pleased with Sayyidunā ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ when he left this world. This is a testimony of his perfect īmān.
4. Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ confirmed the undisputed Fārūqī khilāfah, i.e. that this khilāfah was neither usurped nor appropriated, and there existed no dispute over Sayyidunā ‘Umar’s رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ appointment as khalīfah.
5. Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ expressed his desire to sacrifice his life for Sayyidunā ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ and also sounded the happy tidings of him being the leader of the dwellers of Jannah from the tongue of nubuwwah.
6. Sayyidunā ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ selected Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ as one of the members of the assembly to choose the khalīfah after him which points to the degree of faith he had in him. He also included his own son, ‘Abd Allāh ibn ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ, in the council, with clear instructions that he is only to give his counsel but not to be given a position of authority. This is an unmatched example of his innocence from ulterior motives and personal benefits.
7. Sayyidunā ‘Umar favoured Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ with special pieces of advice which highlights the sincerity and goodwill they cherished for each other.
8. Sayyidunā ‘Alī had high aspirations in Sayyidunā ‘Umar’s perpetual union with Rasūlullāh صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ and Abū Bakr رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ which Allah manifested.
9. Sayyidunā ‘Alī expressed his desire to meet Allah with a book of deeds like Sayyidunā ‘Umar’s رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ. This is a testimonial of his religiousness, and a wonderful proof for his good deeds and chastity.
10. It is evident from the narrations that Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ was around at Sayyidunā ‘Umar’s ghusl and kafn and participated in his Ṣalāt al-Janāzah and burial. In fact, he descended into his grave to lay him to rest, thus fulfilling the right of the intimate friendship they shared.

All of these incidents and anecdotes establish beyond doubt that their relationship was extremely sincere and remained perpetually strong. The reality is that these eminent men were not separated from each other but remained in close proximity to each other. Their hearts were united, not divided. Instead of turning away from each other, they embraced each other. Their hearts were open to each other, not closed. They were loving to each other, not hateful. They did not usurp each other's rights, but fulfilled them. And Allah is witness over what we declare!



## Chapter Four

This chapter will be divided into two sections. In the first section, the relationship Sayyidunā ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ had with Rasūlullāh’s صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ honourable uncle Sayyidunā ‘Abbās رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ will be discussed with incidents of their mutual faith and trust. In the second section, his relationship with Rasūlullāh’s صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ and Sayyidunā ‘Alī’s رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ cousin, Sayyidunā ‘Abd Allāh ibn ‘Abbās رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ, will be highlighted. All these will substantiate that Sayyidunā ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ appreciated and honoured the Banū Hāshim at every level.

### Section One

This section will be sub-divided into five headings.

#### 1. Tawassul in Allah’s Court

During the Fārūqī reign, when there were no rains and people were constrained due to the famine, Sayyidunā ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ would implore Allah سُبْحَانَهُ وَتَعَالَى for showers of mercy by presenting the being of Sayyidunā ‘Abbās ibn ‘Abd al-Muṭṭalib رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ as tawassul. The incident is as follows. This incident is quoted from *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī*:

عن أنس بن مالك إن عمر بن الخطاب كان إذا فحطوا استسقى بالعباس بن عبد المطلب رضي الله تعالى عنه فقال اللهم إنا كنا نتوسل إليك بنبينا صلى الله عليه وسلم فتسقيننا وإنا نتوسل إليك بعم نبينا فاسقنا قال فيسقون

Anas ibn Mālik reports:

When people were struck with famine, ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb would beseech Allah for rain through the medium of ‘Abbās ibn ‘Abd al-Muṭṭalib رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ. He would supplicate, “O Allah, we would make tawassul to You through Your Nabī صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ and You would provide us with rain. And now we make

tawassul to You with our Nabī's uncle, so provide us with rain." And rain was showered upon them.<sup>1</sup>

An addition is found in *al-Mustadrak* and *Kanz al-'Ummāl*. It says that Sayyidunā 'Umar رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ delivered a sermon on this occasion wherein he said, "O people! Rasūlullāh صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ respected and honoured his paternal uncle 'Abbās and fulfilled his oaths, just as a son honours the rights of his father. So, O people, emulate your Nabī in respect of his honourable uncle and make him a wasīlah to Allah in the face of calamities."

## 2. The Gutter Incident between 'Abbās and 'Umar

The details of this incident can be learnt from the books of ḥadīth and Siyar. We will quote the tradition of *Musnad Aḥmad*:

عن عبيد الله بن عباس بن عبد المطلب أخي عبد الله قال كان للعباس ميزاب على طريق عمر بن الخطاب رضي الله عنه فلبس عمر ثيابه يوم الجمعة و قد كان ذبيح للعباس فرخان فلما وافى الميزاب صب ماء بدم الفرخين فأصاب عمر وفيه دم الفرخين فأمر عمر بقلعه ثم رجع عمر فطرح ثيابه و لبس ثيابا غير ثيابه ثم جاء فصلى بالناس فأتاه العباس فقال والله إنه لموضع الذي وضعه النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم فقال عمر للعباس وأنا أعزم عليك لما صعدت على ظهري حتى تضعه في الموضع الذي وضعه رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم ففعل ذلك العباس رضي الله عنه

'Ubayd Allāh ibn 'Abbās ibn 'Abd al-Muṭṭalib, 'Abd Allāh's brother, narrates:

'Abbās had a gutter on the path of 'Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ. One day, 'Umar wore his clothes on the Day of Jumu'ah, and two young birds had just been slaughtered for 'Abbās. As he was passing the gutter, water polluted with the blood of the birds dripped onto 'Umar's clothes so he ordered that

---

1 *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī*, vol. 1 pg. 137, chapters on istisqā', section four, Nūr Muḥammadī print, Delhi; *Tārīkh Khalīfah ibn Khayyāt*, pg. 109, under the year 18 A.H., new edition; *al-Mustadrak*, vol. 3 pg. 334, book on recognising the Ṣaḥābah, Hyderabad Dakkan print; *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, vol. 7 pg. 65, with reference to al-Bukhari, Ibn Sa'd, Ibn Khuzaymah, Abū 'Awānah, al-Ṭabarānī, Ibn Ḥibbān, and al-Bayhaqī, Hyderabad Dakkan print, old edition.



the gutter be removed. He then turned back, took of his clothes, and wore someone else's clothes. Thereafter, he came and led the people in ṣalāh. 'Abbās then approached him and said, "By Allah, indeed this is the place where the Nabī ﷺ attached it (the gutter). So 'Umar told 'Abbās, "I take a determination upon you that you will climb my back and reconnect it exactly where Rasūlullāh ﷺ fixed it." 'Abbās complied and did just that.<sup>1</sup>

### 3. 'Abbās's Exalted Position in 'Umar's Sight

Ibn Jarīr al-Ṭabarī relates an event of the year 15 A.H. prior to the conquest of Bayt al-Maqdis in which Sayyidunā 'Umar and Sayyidunā 'Abbās رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُمَا travel to Shām. Many aspects of mutual respect and honour are contained in this incident. A number of scholars have recorded it. We will present one such narration:

عن عدي بن سهل قال لما استمد أهل الشام عمر على أهل فلسطين استخلف عليا و خرج ممدا لهم فقال علي أين تخرج بنفسك إنك تريد عدوا كلبا فقال إني أبادر بجهاد العدو موت العباس إنكم لو فقدتم العباس لانتفض بكم الشر كما تنتفض أول الجبل

'Adī ibn Sahl reports:

When the armies in Shām demanded reinforcements from 'Umar against the inhabitants of Palestine, he appointed 'Alī deputy and left to reinforce them. 'Alī submitted with concern, "Where are you off to? You are intending to face a doggish enemy. (i.e. just as precautions are taken for a dog attack, you should take precautions of safety.)"

'Umar replied pointing to a significant point, "I wish to hasten to wage jihād against the enemy prior to 'Abbās's death. Indeed, if you lose 'Abbās, evil will spread all around you just like when the top of the rope is slashed."<sup>2</sup>

1 *Musnad Aḥmad*, vol. 1 pg. 210, musnadāt 'Abbās, with selections of *Kanz al-Ummāl*; *Muṣannaf 'Abd al-Razzāq*, vol. 8 pg. 292, Beirut print; Abū Dāwūd Sulaymān ibn al-Ash'ath al-Sijistānī: *Kitāb al-Marāsīl*, pg. 44, chapter regarding traditions regarding harm, Egypt print; *Majma' al-Zawā'id*, vol. 4 pg. 206, chapter regarding reconciliation, Aḥmad narrated it and his narrators are reliable; *Siyar A'lām al-Nubalā'*, vol. 2 pg. 70, biography of 'Abbās ibn 'Abd al-Muṭṭalib.

2 *Tārīkh al-Ṭabarī*, vol. 4 pg. 159, the year 15 A.H., chapter on the conquest of Bayt al-Maqdis, old Egypt print; *Siyar A'lām al-Nubalā'*, vol. 2 pg. 58, biography of 'Abbās ibn 'Abd al-Muṭṭalib; *Kanz al-Ummāl*, vol. 7 pg. 69, Ḥadīth: 568, with reference to Sayf ibn 'Umar and Ibn 'Asākir, old print.

Al-Dhahabī adds:

Sayyidunā ‘Abbās رضي الله عنه was ahead of them mounted on a horse. He was an extremely handsome man. The Roman army general and the Christian patriarch came forward and greeted him thinking him to be the khalīfah of Islam. ‘Abbās رضي الله عنه indicated to them that he was not the khalīfah, but rather ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb رضي الله عنه was the khalīfah of the Muslims.

*Kanz al-‘Ummāl* has this final addition:

Thereafter, during the khilāfah of Sayyidunā ‘Uthmān رضي الله عنه, Sayyidunā ‘Abbās رضي الله عنه passed away in Ramaḍān 32/33 A.H. By Allah, from that time, evil burst and spread among the people.

#### 4. ‘Abbās’s honour in ‘Umar’s and ‘Uthmān’s Eyes

Honouring and showing kindness to the seniors is one of the obligations of Islam. Sayyidunā ‘Abbās ibn ‘Abd al-Muṭṭalib رضي الله عنه was senior to the Khulafā’ in age and had the great fortune of being the uncle of Rasūlullāh صلى الله عليه وسلم, due to which he was deserving of the utmost of respect and honour. Following this, both the Khulafā’ (Sayyidunā ‘Umar and Sayyidunā ‘Uthmān رضي الله عنه) made a concerted effort during their reigns to show him the highest of deference and reverence.

Have a look at the following report to get a glimpse of this aspect:

إن العباس بن عبد المطلب لم يمر بعمر ولا بعثمان و هما راكبان إلا نزلا حتى يجوز العباس إجلالا له و يقولون عم النبي صلى الله عليه و سلم

‘Abbās ibn ‘Abd al-Muṭṭalib would not pass by ‘Umar or ‘Uthmān while they were mounted except that they would alight until he passed, out of honour for him. They would exclaim in esteem, “The uncle of the Nabī صلى الله عليه وسلم”<sup>1</sup>

---

1 *Al-Istī‘āb*, vol. 3 pg. 98, biography of ‘Abbās ibn ‘Abd al-Muṭṭalib, with *al-Iṣābah; Siyar A‘lām al-Nubalā’*, vol. 2 pg. 68, biography of ‘Abbās; *Tahdhīb al-Tahdhīb*, vol. 5 pg. 123, same chapter.

It appears as follows in *Kanz al-‘Ummāl* with reference to Ibn ‘Asākir:

عن ابن شهاب قال أبو بكر و عمر في ولايتهما لا يلتقى العباس منهما واحد و هو راكب إلا نزل عن دابته  
و قادها و مشى مع العباس حتى بلغه منزله أو مجلسه فيمارقه

Ibn Shihāb said:

Abū Bakr and ‘Umar, during their khilāfah, none of them would meet ‘Abbās while he was mounted except that he would dismount from his animal, and walk with ‘Abbās, while leading the conveyance, until he would reach ‘Abbās’s home or place of destination. Only then would he separate from him.<sup>1</sup>

## 5. Looking after the Monetary Rights of ‘Abbās during the Fārūqī Khilāfah

Towards the end of the Fārūqī khilāfah, many conquests were made and wealth poured into Madīnah. Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه set up a meeting to discuss the distribution of wealth. It was decided that those who rendered the initial and most services to Islam should be placed first.

Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه issued orders that the relatives of Rasūlullāh صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم be given precedence when handing out stipends and that a register be drawn up of with the name of all those to receive stipends which should be kept in the treasury and which will prove beneficial in future. Masters of the genealogy of tribes were tasked with drawing up the register with the correct lineage and names of people. Read the upcoming narration which elucidates on this point.

فدعا عقيل بن أبي طالب و مخرمة بن نوفل و جبير بن مطعم و كانوا من نساب قريش فقال اكتبوا الناس  
على منازلهم ... و لكن ابدأوا بقراة النبي صلى الله عليه و آله الأقرب فالأقرب حتى تضعوا عمر حيث  
وضعه الله

1 *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, vol. 7 pg. 69, Ḥadīth: 567, first print.

He called ‘Aqīl ibn Abī Ṭālib, Makhramah ibn Nawfal, and Jubayr ibn Muṭ‘im who were genealogists of the Quraysh and ordered, “Write the names of the people according to their status.” (Someone suggested that they begin with the tribe of the khilāfah of the Muslims, ‘Umar.) He said, “Instead, begin with the family of the Nabī ﷺ, in order of closeness to him until you place ‘Umar where Allah placed him.”<sup>1</sup>

## Warning

Brothers that are interested in research should be informed that this aspect has been confirmed by the Shī‘ī scholars. Have a look at *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah* of Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd.<sup>2</sup> Such Shī‘ī texts were quoted verbatim in chapter two, section four of this book.

For further elucidation on this matter, read the following passages:

و فرض للعباس ثم لعلي رضي الله تعالى عنهما و فرض لنساء المهاجرات ففرض لصفيية بنت عبد  
المطلب ستة آلاف درهم و لأسماء بنت عميس ألف درهم إلخ

He allocated for ‘Abbās and then for ‘Alī. He stipulated for the Muhājirāt women. He stipulated for Ṣafīyyah bint ‘Abd al-Muṭṭalib (Rasūlullāh’s ﷺ paternal aunt) 6000 dirhams and for Asmā’ bint ‘Umays (who was in the wedlock of Sayyidunā ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib ﷺ at the time) 1000 dirhams.<sup>3</sup>

1 *Ṭabaqāt Ibn Sa’d*, vol. 3 pg. 213, section one, chapter on ‘Umar, old Leiden print, Europe; *Tārīkh al-Ṭabarī*, vol. 5 pg. 23, the year 23 A.H., discussion on allocating stipends; *Kitāb al-Amwāl*, pg. 224, chapter on stipulating stipends from the Fay’, Egypt print; *al-Sunan al-Kubrā*, vol. 6 pg. 364, chapters on division of the wealth of Fay’ and booty.

2 *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*, vol. 3 pg. 166, 176, Beirut print, under the text: may Allah favour him for he straightened crookedness.

3 *Ṭabaqāt Ibn Sa’d*, vol. 3 pg. 213 – 214, section one, chapter on ‘Umar; *Kitāb al-Kharāj*, pg. 43 – 44, section on ‘Umar’s allocation for the Ṣaḥābah of Rasūlullāh ﷺ, under the heading: distribution of wealth between the Ṣaḥābah, Egypt print; *Futūḥ al-Buldān*, pg. 454 – 455, chapter on stipends during the khilāfah of ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb, Egypt print; *Kitāb al-Amwāl*, pg. 224 – 226, chapter on allocation of stipends.

## Conclusions to this Section

- In adverse times of famine, Sayyidunā ‘Umar used Sayyidunā ‘Abbās رضي الله عنه to make tawassul to Allah and advised others to do the same. This was owing to his honour and respect.
- In the gutter matter, he relied on the honesty of Sayyidunā ‘Abbās رضي الله عنه, and immediately retracted his command. He humbled himself and appreciated the prophetic command and instructed that it be reconnected.
- Sayyidunā ‘Umar chose Sayyidunā ‘Abbās رضي الله عنه as his companion on his journey to Shām. Sayyidunā ‘Abbās رضي الله عنه led the army. He regarded ‘Abbās’s noble presence the reason for the safety of the Muslims from internal strife and discord.
- He displayed utmost respect to Rasūlullāh’s صلى الله عليه وسلم and Sayyidunā ‘Alī’s uncle to the extent that he would dismount from his conveyance and allow him to pass.
- He stipulated an annual allowance for Sayyidunā ‘Abbās رضي الله عنه from the wealth of Fay’ etc. on the basis of his kinship to Rasūlullāh صلى الله عليه وسلم, despite ‘Abbās ibn ‘Abd al-Muṭṭalib رضي الله عنه not being from the early Muhājirīn. He also allocated stipends for Rasūlullāh’s صلى الله عليه وسلم and Sayyidunā ‘Alī’s رضي الله عنه aunt and for the latter’s wife. This was due to his deep reverence for the Banū Hāshim. Glory be to Allah for their beautiful companionship.

Beloved readers, kindly ponder over these aspects.

All these incidents are signs of the harmonious relationship these seniors enjoyed. Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه held Rasūlullāh’s صلى الله عليه وسلم uncle Sayyidunā ‘Abbās رضي الله عنه in high esteem. They respected one another. If you look with an eye of impartiality, then this is definitely Sayyidunā ‘Umar’s رضي الله عنه utmost respect for the Banū Hāshim. Despite all of this, if someone still harps on the existence of hatred, enmity, and animosity between them, then this is the product of jealousy and prejudice which is incurable. We have related authentic incidents verbatim without addition or subtraction. Those with sound and just temperaments will understand the reality.

## Section Two

The relationship between Sayyidunā ‘Umar and Sayyidunā ‘Abd Allāh ibn ‘Abbās ibn ‘Abd al-Muṭṭalib رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُمَا will be highlighted here. ‘Abd Allāh is the son of Rasūlullāh’s صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ uncle Sayyidunā ‘Abbās رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ and the cousin of Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ. He is an individual of merit and knowledge from the Banū Hāshim. Rasūlullāh صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ prayed for increase in his knowledge which was certainly answered. He holds a very high academic position among the Banū Hāshim, just below Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ. The Shī‘ī mujtahidīn have attested to his academic prowess in many narrations. Shaykh Abū Ja‘far al-Ṭūsī has reported on this issue in *Al-Amālī*. Ibn ‘Abbās addressed someone saying:

قال ثكلتك أمك علي علمني و كان علمه من رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله و رسول الله علمه الله من فوق عرشه فعلم النبي صلى الله عليه وآله من الله و علم علي من النبي و علمي من علم علي

May your mother be bereaved of you! ‘Alī taught me and his knowledge was from Rasūlullāh صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ. And Rasūlullāh صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ was taught by Allah from above His ‘Arsh. So the Nabī’s صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ knowledge is from Allah and ‘Alī’s knowledge is from the Nabī and my knowledge is from ‘Alī.<sup>1</sup>

It should be known that the upcoming Shī‘ī scholars and mujtahidīn have duly praised and given credibility to Sayyidunā ‘Abd Allāh ibn ‘Abbās ibn ‘Abd al-Muṭṭalib رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُمَا and have listed him as one of Sayyidunā ‘Alī’s رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ special supporters.

1. *Majālis al-Mu‘minīn* by Qāḍī Nūr Allah Shūstarī, majlis 3, introduction 3, under the first group among the famous Banū Hāshimites.
2. *Tanqīḥ al-Maqāl* by ‘Abd Allāh al-Māmaqānī, discussion on Ibn ‘Abbās.
3. *Muntahā al-Āmāl* by Shaykh ‘Abbās al-Qummī, volume 1, chapter 3, section 15.

---

1 *Al-Amālī*, vol. 1 pg. 11, Najaf Ashraf print, Iraq.

After this clarification, we will now present some incidents highlighting the bond between Sayyidunā ‘Umar and Sayyidunā ‘Abd Allāh ﷺ under few headings. We hope the readers will enjoy it.

## 1. Ibn ‘Abbās’s Inclusion in ‘Umar’s Consultations

### a. *Ṭabaqāt Ibn Sa’d*

عن عطاء بن يسار أن عمر و عثمان كانا يدعوان ابن عباس فيشير مع أهل بدر و كان يفتي في عهد عمر و عثمان إلى يوم مات

‘Aṭā’ ibn Yasār relates:

Indeed, ‘Umar and ‘Uthmān would call Ibn ‘Abbās who would give counsel with the participants of Badr. And he would pass verdicts during the reign of ‘Umar and ‘Uthmān until he passed away.<sup>1</sup>

### b. *Ṭabaqāt Ibn Sa’d*

عن مروان بن أبي سعيد عن ابن عباس قال دخلت على عمر بن الخطاب يوما فسألني عن مسألة كتب إليه بها يعلى بن أمية من اليمن و أحبته فيها فقال عمر أشهد أنك تنطق عن بيت نوبة

From Marwān ibn Abī Sa’īd—from Ibn ‘Abbās who reports:

I entered the presence of ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb one day who asked me about a ruling which Ya’lā ibn Umayyah had written to him about from Yemen. I answered him, upon which he remarked, “I testify that you speak from the house of nubuwwah.”<sup>2</sup>

---

1 *Ṭabaqāt Ibn Sa’d*, vol. 2 pg. 120, biography of Ibn ‘Abbās; Ibid report from Sa’īd ibn Jubayr that ‘Umar would include Ibn ‘Abbās with the participants of Badr in the mashwarah; *Musnad Aḥmad*, vol. 1 pg. 14, musnadāt ‘Umar al-Fārūq, ‘Āṣim ibn Kulayb reports from his father from Ibn ‘Abbās a narration of a similar kind.

2 *Ṭabaqāt Ibn Sa’d*, vol. 2 pg. 122, biography of Ibn ‘Abbās

### c. *Kanz al-Ummāl* with reference to Ibn Saʿd

عن يعقوب بن يزيد قال كان عمر بن الخطاب يستشير عبد الله بن عباس في الأمر إذا هممه و يقول غص  
غواص

Yaʿqūb ibn Yazīd says:

ʿUmar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb would seek counsel from ʿAbd Allāh ibn ʿAbbās in important matters. He would tell him, “Dive, O diver (into the ocean of knowledge) (i.e. ponder deeply over the matter and answer).”<sup>1</sup>

## 2. Al-Fārūq visits Ibn ʿAbbās

It appears in *Ṭabaqāt Ibn Saʿd*:

عبد الرحمن بن أبي زناد عن أبيه أن عمر بن الخطاب دخل على ابن عباس يعوده و هو يحم فقال عمر  
أخل بنا مرضك فالله المستعان

ʿAbd al-Raḥmān ibn Abī Zinād reports—from his father:

ʿUmar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb entered Ibn ʿAbbās’s home to visit him in his sickness; he was suffering with fever. ʿUmar said, “Your sickness has disturbed our work. And help is sought from Allah alone!”<sup>2</sup>

## 3. Praise for ʿUmar on the Tongue of Ibn ʿAbbās

The acclaimed Shīʿī historian Mirzā Muḥammad Taqī Lisān al-Mulk (d. 1297 A.H.) quotes from another famous Shīʿī historian al-Masʿūdī (d. 346 A.H) in his book *Nāsikh al-Tawārīkh* fine words of admiration and approval from the tongue of Sayyidunā ʿAlī’s cousin Sayyidunā ʿAbd Allāh ibn ʿAbbās for Sayyidunā ʿUmar رضي الله عنه, wherein he describes his qualities in a splendid way. This narration will be presented from both the original and transmitted books as proof against the Shīʿah. Kindly accept.

---

1 *Kanz al-Ummāl*, vol. 7 pg. 53, Ḥadīth: 413, old print.

2 *Ṭabaqāt Ibn Saʿd*, vol. 2 pg. 123, biography of Ibn ʿAbbās, old print.



رحم الله أبا حفص كان والله حليف الإسلام و مأوى الأيتام و منتهى الإحسان و محل الإيمان و كهف الضعفاء و معقل الحنفاء و قام بحق الله صابرا محتسبا حتى أوضح الدين و فتح البلاد و آمن البلاد و أعقب الله من ينقصه اللعنة إلى يوم القيامة

May Allah shower his mercy on Abū Ḥafṣ. By Allah, he was the confederate of Islam, the sanctuary of the orphans, the frontier of kindness, the house of imān, the cave for the weak, and the fortress of the orthodox. He established the right of Allah, bearing patiently and anticipating reward until he promulgated dīn, conquered the cities, and gave safety to the faithful. Allah’s curse till the Day of Qiyāmah be upon the one who condemns him.<sup>1</sup>

#### 4. Ibn ‘Abbās’s reliance on Fārūqī Narrations

It appears in *Musnad Aḥmad* under the musnadāt of Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه:

عن قتادة عن أبي العالية عن ابن عباس قال شهد عندي رجال مرضيون منهم عمر و أرضيهم عندي عمر إن نبي الله صلى الله عليه و سلم كان يقول لا صلوة بعد العصر حتى تغرب الشمس و لا صلوة بعد الصبح حتى تطلع الشمس

From Qatādah—from Abū al-‘Āliyah—from Ibn ‘Abbās who said:

Few men who are reliable—among whom is ‘Umar—bore testimony in my presence, and the most pleasing to me of them is ‘Umar that the nabī صلى الله عليه وسلم would say, “There is no ṣalāh after ‘Aṣr until the sun sets and there is no ṣalāh after Fajr until the sun rises.”<sup>2</sup>

This is only one example of Sayyidunā Ibn ‘Abbās learning a narration from Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه. Otherwise, there are innumerable narrations like these in *Musnad Aḥmad* and other ḥadīth compilations. However, the noteworthy sentence is: *the most pleasing to me of them is ‘Umar*. This is a great testimony of Sayyidunā ‘Umar’s religiousness, trustworthiness, and truthfulness by Ibn ‘Abbās رضي الله عنه.

1 *Murūj al-Dhahab*, vol. 3 pg. 60, mention of the Ṣaḥābah and their praise; *Nāsikh al-Tawārīkh*, vol. 5 pg. 144, book two, Iran print.

2 *Musnad Aḥmad*, vol. 1 pg. 18, Egypt print.

## 5. Fārūq’s Truthfulness according to the Report of the Banū Hāshim

Imām al-Bukhārī reports via his sanad in *Al-Tārīkh al-Kabīr*:

عن عطاء عن عبد الله بن عباس عن الفضل بن عباس عن النبي صلى الله عليه و سلم قال الحق بعدي مع عمر حيث كان

From ‘Aṭā’—from ‘Abd Allāh ibn ‘Abbās—from al-Faḍl ibn ‘Abbās—from the Nabī ﷺ who said:

The truth after me is with ‘Umar wherever he is.<sup>1</sup>

## 6. Ibn ‘Abbās views Abū Bakr’s and ‘Umar’s Statement as Sharῑ Proof

It is clearly stated in the books of ḥadīth that the method of deducing religious rulings of Sayyidunā ‘Abd Allāh ibn ‘Abbās ﷺ was that he would find the answer firstly in the Book of Allah. If he could not locate it, then he would search through the Prophetic traditions. If he did not find an answer, then he would determine Sayyidunā Abū Bakr’s and Sayyidunā ‘Umar’s ﷺ decision in this matter and practice accordingly. Senior ‘Ulamā’ have documented this methodology of his at many places

Al-Bayhaqī’s *al-Sunan al-Kubrā* and al-Baghawī’s *Sharḥ al-Sunnah*:

عن عبيد الله بن أبي يزيد قال سمعت عبد الله بن عباس إذا سئل عن شيء هو في كتاب الله قال به و إذا لم يكن في كتاب الله و قاله رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم قال به و إذا لم يكن في كتاب الله و لم يقله رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم و قاله أبو بكر و عمر رضي الله عنهما قال به و إلا اجتهد رأيه

‘Ubayd Allāh ibn Abī Yazīd explains:

I heard that when ‘Abd Allāh ibn ‘Abbās was asked about anything which is present in the Book of Allah, he would pass judgment according to that. And if it was not found in the Book of Allah and Rasūlullāh ﷺ had commented on it, he would pass judgement accordingly. If it was not

---

1 *Al-Tārīkh al-Kabīr*, vol. 4 pg. 114, section one, under Faḍl ibn ‘Abbās.

found in the above two sources and Abū Bakr and ‘Umar رضي الله عنهما had declared regarding it, he would pass judgement accordingly. Otherwise, he would make ijtihād and pass verdict according to his opinion.<sup>1</sup>

Hāfiẓ Ibn Taymiyyah al-Ḥarrānī has elucidated on this point in his own words in *al-Fatāwā al-Kubrā*. We present the text for the benefit of the readers:

و قد ثبت عن ابن عباس أنه كان يفتي من كتاب الله فإن لم يجد فيما سنه رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم فإن لم يجد أفتى بقول أبي بكر و عمر و لم يكن يفعل ذلك بعثمان و علي و ابن عباس حبر الأمة و أعلم الصحابة و أفقههم في زمانه و هو يفتي بقول أبي بكر و عمر مقدما لقولهما على قول غيرهما من الصحابة و قد ثبت عن النبي صلى الله عليه و سلم أنه قال اللهم فقهه في الدين و علمه التأويل

It is established concerning Ibn ‘Abbās that he would pass verdict from the Book of Allah. If he could not locate anything therein, then by what Rasūlullāh صلى الله عليه وسلم founded. If he could not, then he would pass judgement according to Abū Bakr’s and ‘Umar’s opinion. He would not do the same with ‘Uthmān and ‘Alī. Ibn ‘Abbās was the scholar of the Ummah and the most knowledgeable and best jurist among the Ṣaḥābah of his era. And he is passing verdict according to Abū Bakr’s and ‘Umar’s view, giving precedence to their stance over all the Ṣaḥābah besides them. It is authentically transmitted that Rasūlullāh صلى الله عليه وسلم supplicated, “O Allah, give him the understanding of dīn and teach him the commentary (of Qur’ān).”<sup>2</sup>

## Summary of Points Highlighted in this Section

- In the Fārūqī khilāfah, just as Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه was an important member and pillar of the shūrā gathering of the Ṣaḥābah, Sayyidunā ‘Umar included Sayyidunā Ibn ‘Abbās in important consultations and held his opinion in high esteem.
- The khalīfah of the Muslims goes to visit Sayyidunā ‘Abd Allāh ibn ‘Abbās when he was unwell. This reflects their mutual love and friendship as well as Sayyidunā ‘Umar’s appreciation and honour for the Banū Hāshim.

1 *Al-Sunan al-Kubrā*, vol. 10 pg. 115, Dakkan print; *Sharḥ al-Sunnah*, vol. 1 pg. 208.

2 *Al-Fatāwā al-Kubrā*, vol. 1 pg. 466.

- ‘Abd Allāh ibn ‘Abbās praised the second khalīfah in glowing terms. This indicates their mutual trust and is an amazing example of their love for the truth. The opposition cannot deny this fact.
- They transmitted and learnt aḥādīth from each other. According to the Hāshimites, Sayyidunā ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ was an extremely reliable and trustworthy narrator.
- The members of the Banū Hāshim and Ibn ‘Abbās رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُمَا report the declaration of Rasūlullāh صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ, “The truth is with ‘Umar wherever he is.” The khilāfah of the second khalīfah as well as all his accomplishments and religious endeavours were true and correct.
- It is evident that the Hāshimites took Sayyidunā ‘Umar’s رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ statements as Shar‘ī proof and accepted his views as substantiation for religious rulings.

May Allah سُبْحَانَهُ وَتَعَالَى unite all the Muslims and grant us the obedience of our religious elders who were examples of pure love and fondness, and epitomes of *merciful* among themselves.

## Chapter Five

This is the final chapter of the Fārūqī Section of *Ruḥamā' Baynahum*.

We intended to gather the brief statements of Sayyidunā 'Alī's عليه السلام offspring in praise, adoration, and supplication for Sayyidunā 'Umar عليه السلام. A fair person will, after examining these narrations, accept the fact that these two seniors enjoyed a harmonious relationship and were bosom friends, and will applaud their congenial bond.

This chapter will be divided into five sections as follows:

- **Section One:** The Statements of Sayyidunā Ḥasan, Muḥammad ibn al-Ḥanafīyyah, 'Abd Allāh al-Maḥḍ ibn Ḥasan al-Muthannā, and others.
- **Section Two:** The Statements of Imām Zayn al-'Ābidīn and his son Zayd
- **Section Three:** The Statements of Imām Muḥammad al-Bāqir
- **Section Four:** The Statements of Imām Ja'far al-Ṣādiq
- **Section Five:** 'Alī's offspring with the Name 'Umar

## Section One

### The Statements of Sayyidunā Ḥasan, Muḥammad ibn al-Ḥanafiyah, ‘Abd Allāh al-Mahḍ ibn Ḥasan al-Muthannā, and others

#### 1. Ḥasan’s Confirmation that there existed No Disagreement between ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb and ‘Alī al-Murtaḍā

Muḥibb al-Ṭabarī quotes from Ibn al-Sammān in *al-Riyād al-Naḍirah*:

أنه أخرج في كتابه عن الحسن بن علي قال لا أعلم عليا خالف عمر ولا غير شيئا مما صنع حين قدم الكوفة

He documents in his book from Ḥasan ibn ‘Alī who announced, “I do not know of ‘Alī opposing ‘Umar, nor of him changing anything ‘Umar instated when he came to Kūfah.”<sup>1</sup>

#### 2. Muḥammad ibn al-Ḥanafiyah’s Question concerning ‘Umar and Abū Bakr and ‘Alī’s Answer

Muḥammad ibn al-Ḥanafiyah is one of the children of Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ who holds a lofty position of virtue and excellence after Sayyidunā Ḥasan and Sayyidunā Ḥusayn رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُمَا. The Shī‘ī scholar and mujtahid Sayyid Jamāl al-Dīn ibn ‘Inabah writes concerning him in *‘Umdat al-Ṭālib*:

كان محمد بن الحنفية أحد رجال الدهر في العلم و الزهد و العبادة و الشجاعة و هو أفضل ولد علي بن أبي طالب بعد الحسن و الحسين

Muḥammad ibn al-Ḥanafiyah was one of the unique men of his time in knowledge, asceticism, worship, and bravery. He is the most superior among the offspring of ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib after Ḥasan and Ḥusayn.<sup>2</sup>

1 *Al-Riyād al-Naḍirah*, vol. 2 pg. 85, chapter on ‘Alī’s narration on ‘Umar’s virtue, Egypt print; *Izālat al-Khafa’ ‘an Khilāfat al-Khulafā’*, vol. 1 pg. 107, old print (Persian), final discussion on the masanīd of the Ṣaḥābah and Tābi‘īn.

2 *‘Umdat al-Ṭālib fī Ansāb Āl Abī Ṭālib*, pg. 352, section 3, Najaf Ashraf print.

Muḥammad ibn al-Ḥanafīyyah states:

قلت لأبي أي الناس خير بعد النبي صلى الله عليه و سلم قال أبو بكر قال قلت ثم من قال عمر قلت ثم أنت قال ما أنا إلا رجل من المسلمين

I asked my father, “Who is the most superior after the nabī ﷺ?”

“Abū Bakr,” he replied.

I enquired, “Then who?”

“Umar,” was his answer.

I said, “Then you.”

He responded, “I am only an ordinary man from the Muslims.”<sup>1</sup>

### 3. ‘Alī’s Children Use ‘Umar’s Action as Evidence in Fiqhī Rulings

Ibn Qutaybah al-Dīnawarī relates this story in *al-Ma‘ārif*:

و كان عبد الله بن الحسن بن الحسن يكنى أبا محمد و كان خيرا و رأي يوما يمسح على خفيه فقتل له تمسح فقال نعم قد مسح عمر بن الخطاب و من جعل عمر بينه و بين الله فقد استوثق

‘Abd Allāh ibn al-Ḥasan ibn al-Ḥasan was given the agnomen Abū Muḥammad. He was a pious man. One day he was seen making masaḥ upon his leather socks so he was asked, “You make masaḥ?”

“Yes,” he replied, “‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb had made masaḥ. Whoever takes ‘Umar (as proof) between him and Allah, has held onto a strong rope.”<sup>2</sup>

---

1 *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī*, vol. 1 pg. 518, chapter on Abū Bakr’s virtues, Delhi print; *Sunan Abī Dāwūd*, vol. 2 pg. 288, book on Sunnah, chapter on precedence, Mujtabā’ī print, Delhi; *Hilyat al-Awliyā’*, vol. 5 pg. 78, discussion on Rabī ibn Abī Rāshid, *Kanz al-Ummāl*, vol. 6 pg. 366, 370, old Dakkan print.

2 *Al-Ma‘ārif*, pg. 93, chapter on ‘Alī’s khilāfah, Egypt print, old edition.

#### 4. ‘Aqīl’s Praise for ‘Umar

Sayyidunā ‘Alī’s ﷺ biological brother, Sayyidunā ‘Aqīl ibn Abī Ṭālib relates:

إن النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم قال لعمر بن الخطاب إن غضبك عز و رضاك حكم

Certainly, the Nabī ﷺ said to ‘Umar, “Your anger is out of honour for religion and your pleasure is wisdom.”<sup>1</sup>

---

1 *Akhbār Aṣbahān*, vol. 1 pg. 97, Leiden print, Europe.



## Section Two

### The Statements of Imām Zayn al-‘Ābidīn and his son Zayd

Some of the statements of Sayyidunā ‘Alī ibn al-Ḥusayn (Zayn al-‘Ābidīn) رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ and his son, Imām Zayd رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ, will be reproduced in praise and favour of Sayyidunā ‘Umar al-Fārūq رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ. This will highlight his rank in their eyes.

#### 1. ‘Umar and Abū Bakr Enjoyed that Proximity to Rasūlullāh صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ as they Enjoy Presently

It is recorded in *Musnad Aḥmad*:

حدثني أبو معمر عن ابن أبي حازم قال جاء رجل إلى علي بن الحسين فقال ما كان منزلة أبي بكر و عمر من النبي صلى الله عليه و سلم فقال منزلتهما الساعة

Abū Ma‘mar narrated to me—from Ibn Abī Ḥāzim who says:

A man approached ‘Alī ibn al-Ḥusayn and asked, “What was Abū Bakr’s and ‘Umar’s proximity to Rasūlullāh صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ?”

He replied, “Just as their position now.”<sup>1</sup>

#### 2. Acknowledging ‘Umar’s Virtue and Rejecting those who Disrepute him

The scholars should be aware that there is a lengthy narration from Zayn al-‘Ābidīn in *Ḥilyat al-Awliyā’* wherein he debunked, with Qur’ānic verses, those Iraqi men who were objecting and criticising Sayyidunā Abū Bakr, Sayyidunā ‘Umar, and Sayyidunā ‘Uthmān رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ. He bore testimony to the fact that they were not among the people whom the Qur’ān teaches to seek Allah’s forgiveness on their behalf. The verse reads:

---

1 *Musnad Aḥmad*, vol. 4, musnadāt Dhī al-Yadayn, Egypt, with selection of al-Kanz; *Sīrat ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb*, pg. 32 – 33, 216, Egypt print; *Tahdhīb al-Tahdhīb*, vol. 7 pg. 306, biography of ‘Alī ibn al-Ḥusayn; *Tārīkh al-Khulafā’*, pg. 40, section in the aḥādīth related on his virtue (al-Ṣiddīq) coupled with ‘Umar besides those that passed, Mujtabā’ī print, Delhi.

وَالَّذِينَ جَاءُوا مِنْ بَعْدِهِمْ يَقُولُونَ رَبَّنَا اغْفِرْ لَنَا وَلِإِخْوَانِنَا الَّذِينَ سَبَقُونَا بِالْإِيمَانِ وَلَا تَجْعَلْ فِي قُلُوبِنَا غِلًّا لِلَّذِينَ آمَنُوا رَبَّنَا إِنَّكَ رَءُوفٌ رَحِيمٌ

And [there is a share for] those who came after them, saying, “Our Lord, forgive us and our brothers who preceded us in faith and put not in our hearts [any] resentment toward those who have believed. Our Lord, indeed You are Kind and Merciful.”<sup>1</sup>

Towards the end, he curses them and orders them to leave his presence.

قال اخرجوا فعل الله بكم

He yelled, “Get out. May Allah deal with you!”<sup>2</sup>

Ḥāfiẓ Ibn Kathīr has reported from Zubayr ibn Bakkār the following address of Zayn al-‘Ābidīn to the Iraqis:

فقوموا عني لا بارك الله فيكم ولا قرب دوركم أتم مستهزئون بالإسلام ولستم من أهله

Get up from here and leave. May Allah not bless you and may your homes be devoid of mercy. You are jesting with Islam, and you are not from its adherents.<sup>3</sup>

Imām Zayd رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ is Zayn al-‘Ābidīn’s biological son and Muḥammad al-Bāqir’s brother. He says:

عن زيد أن عليا يشبه بعمر في السيرة

Zayd says, “‘Alī resembled ‘Umar in sīrah.”<sup>4</sup>

1 Sūrah al-Ḥaṣhr: 10.

2 *Ḥīlyat al-Awliyā*, vol. 3 pg. 137, biography of ‘Alī ibn al-Ḥusayn, Egypt print.

3 *Al-Bidāyah*, vol. 9 pg. 107, discussion on ‘Alī ibn al-Ḥusayn.

4 *Al-Riyāḍ al-Naḍīrah*, vol. 2 pg. 85, chapter on ‘Alī’s reports on ‘Umar’s virtues.

Owing to this Zayd would say:

البراءة من أبي بكر و عمر براءة من علي

Dissociation from Abū Bakr and ‘Umar is dissociation from ‘Alī.<sup>1</sup>

Allow us now to present the quotations of Zayd from books regarded reliable by the Shī‘ah where Zayd acknowledges Sayyidunā ‘Umar’s رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ religiousness and attests to the correctness of his actions, so that this aspect be accepted from both sides. We have discussed these issues in more detail in the last chapter of the Ṣiddīqī section.

Sayyid Jamāl al-Dīn ibn ‘Inabah writes in *‘Umdat al-Ṭālib* while discussing Zayd al-Shahīd:

و كان أصحاب زيد لما خرج سألوه ما تقول في أبي بكر و عمر فقال ما أقول فيهما إلا الخير و ما سمعت من أهلي فيهما إلا الخير فقالوا لست بصاحبنا ... و تفرقوا عنه فقال رفضونا القوم فسموا الرافضة

When Zayd rebelled (against the khalīfah of the time), his supporters asked him, “What do you say about Abū Bakr and ‘Umar?”

He replied, “I only speak good about them. And I heard my family speaking only favourably of them.”

They said, “You are not our leader.”

They deserted him, so he exclaimed, “They abandoned us.” So they were called the Rāfiḍah (deserters).<sup>2</sup>

Mirzā Taqī Lisān al-Mulk, Qājār, the Prime Minister of the Qājār King, has related this story in *Nāsikh al-Tawārīkh* in the following manner:

---

1 *Sīrat ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb*, pg. 32 – 33, Egypt print; *al-Riyāḍ al-Naḍīrah*, vol. 1 pg. 58.

2 *‘Umdat al-Ṭālib*, information about Zayd the martyr.

که طائفه از معارف کوفه بازید بیعت کرده بودند در خدمتش حضور یافته گفتند رحیمک الله در حق ابی بکر و عمر چه گوئی فرمود در باره ایشان جز بخیر سخن نکنم و از اهل خود نیز در حق ایشان جز سخن خیر نشنیده ام ... بالجمله زید فرمود ایشان بر کسے ظلم و ستم نراندند و بکتاب و سنت رسول کارکردند

A group of the famous people of Kūfah (who pledged allegiance to Zayd) came upto him and said, “May Allah have mercy on you. What are your thoughts on Abū Bakr and ‘Umar?”

Zayd replied, “I only speak positively and favourably of them. And I only heard my family (the Ahl al-Bayt) speaking good of them.” (This means that the entire family entertained good thoughts about Abū Bakr and ‘Umar.)

He continued, “Abū Bakr and ‘Umar did not tolerate a single person being oppressed or harassed and adhered strictly to the Book of Allah and Rasūlullāh’s ﷺ Sunnah.”<sup>1</sup>

---

1 *Nāsikh al-Tawārīkh*, vol. 2 pg. 590, Iran print, old edition.

## Section Three

### The Statements of Imām Muḥammad al-Bāqir

In this section, the statements of Imām Muḥammad al-Bāqir in favour of Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه will be quoted. In the fifth chapter of the Ṣiddīqī section, they were quoted in greater detail. We repeat them here so that those brothers who did not read the Ṣiddīqī section do not remain unaware of the statements of the Ahl al-Bayt and benefit fully from them.

#### 1. The Person who does not Recognise Abū Bakr’s and ‘Umar’s Virtue is Ignorant of the Prophetic Sunnah

حدثنا يونس بن بكير عن محمد بن إسحاق عن أبي جعفر محمد بن علي قال من لم يعرف فضل أبي بكر  
و عمر رضي الله عنهما فقد جهل السنة

Yūnus ibn Bukayr narrated to us—from Muḥammad ibn Ishāq—from Abū Ja‘far Muḥammad ibn ‘Alī who declared:

Whoever does not recognise the virtue of Abū Bakr and ‘Umar رضي الله عنهما is ignorant of the Sunnah.<sup>1</sup>

#### 2. Muḥammad al-Bāqir loved and befriended Abū Bakr and ‘Umar and sought Forgiveness for them

حدثنا زهير عن جابر قال قلت لمحمد بن علي أكان منكم أهل البيت أحد يسب أبا بكر و عمر قال لا  
فأحبهما و أتولاهما و أستغفر لهما

Zuhayr narrated to us—from Jābir who said: I asked Muḥammad ibn ‘Alī, “Is there anyone from you, the Ahl al-Bayt, who curses Abū Bakr and ‘Umar?”

---

1 *Ḥilyat al-Awliyā’*, vol. 3 pg. 185, biography of Muḥammad al-Bāqir; *al-Riyāḍ al-Naḍīrah*, vol. 5 pg. 57, chapter 5, with reference to Ibn al-Sammān.

He replied, “No. I love them, befriend them, and seek forgiveness for them.”<sup>1</sup>

### 3. Imām al-Bāqir Dissociates Himself from those who Dissociate from Abū Bakr and ‘Umar

#### First Narration

حدثنا شعبة الخياط مولى جابر الجعفي قال قال لي أبو جعفر محمد بن علي لما ودعته أبلغ أهل الكوفة إنني بريء ممن تبرأ من أبي بكر وعمر رضي الله تعالى عنهما وأرضاهما

Shu‘bah al-Khayyāṭ, the freed slave of Jābir al-Ju‘fī narrated to us saying: Abū Ja‘far Muḥammad ibn ‘Alī instructed me when I went to bid him farewell, “Pass this message to the people of Kūfah that I am exonerated from him who dissociates from Abū Bakr and ‘Umar—may Allah ﷻ be pleased with them and may He make them happy.”<sup>2</sup>

#### Second Narration

عن عمرو بن شمر عن جابر قال قال لي محمد بن علي يا جابر بلغني أن قوما بالعراق يزعمون أنهم يحبوننا ويتناولون أبا بكر وعمر رضي الله عنهما ويزعمون أنني أمرتهم بذلك فأبلغهم إنني إلى الله منهم بريء والذي نفس محمد بيده لو وليت لتقربت إلى الله تعالى بدمائهم لالتني شفاعته محمد إن لم أكن أستغفر لهما وأترحم عليهما إن أعداء الله لغافلون عنهما

From ‘Amr ibn Shimr—from Jābir who said:

Muḥammad ibn ‘Alī said to me, “O Jābir, it has reached me that some people in Iraq feel that they love us but at the same time curse Abū Bakr and ‘Umar ﷺ and think that I have instructed them to do so. So convey my message to them that I exonerate myself from them to Allah. By the Being in whose Hands lies Muḥammad’s life, had I been in authority, I

1 *Ṭabaqāt Ibn Sa‘d*, vol. 5 pg. 236, biography of Muḥammad al-Bāqir, Leiden print, Europe.

2 *Ḥilyat al-Awliyā’*, vol. 3 pg. 185, biography of Muḥammad al-Bāqir; *al-Riyāḍ al-Naḍīrah*, vol. 1 pg. 58, chapter 5.

would have sought proximity to Allah by shedding their blood. May I not receive Muḥammad’s intercession if I do not seek forgiveness for them and supplicate for mercy upon them. Undoubtedly, the enemies of Allah are negligent of them.”<sup>1</sup>

### Third Narration

وأخرج الدارقطني عن أبي حنيفة أنه لما قدم المدينة سأل أبا جعفر الباقر عن أبي بكر و عمر فترحم عليهما فقال له أبو حنيفة إنهم ليقولون عندنا بالعراق أنك تبرأ منهما فقال معاذ الله كذبوا ورب الكعبة ثم ذكر لأبي حنيفة تزويج علي بنه أم كلثوم بنت فاطمة من عمر و أنه لو لم يكن لها أهلا ما زوجه إياها فقال أبو حنيفة لو كتبت إليهم فقال لا يطيعوني بالكتاب

Al-Dāraqūṭnī documents from Abū Ḥanīfah that when he arrived in Madīnah, he asked Abū Ja‘far al-Bāqir about Abū Bakr and ‘Umar. Al-Bāqir prayed for mercy upon them. So Abū Ḥanīfah told him, “Those with us in Iraq claim that you are exempt from them.”

He said, “Allah forbid! They have spoken a lie, by the Rabb of the Ka‘bah!”

He then mentioned to Abū Ḥanīfah ‘Alī marrying his daughter Umm Kulthūm bint Fāṭimah to ‘Umar and that had he not been worthy, he would not have married her to him.

Abū Ḥanīfah suggested, “Why do you not write to them?”

He said, “They will not obey me by letter.”<sup>2</sup>

### Fourth Narration

Ibn Jarīr al-Ṭabarī has reported a similar narration from Kathīr al-Nawā’ wherein Imām Muḥammad al-Bāqir رحمه الله labels those who dissociate from Sayyidunā Abū

---

1 Ibid.

2 *Al-Ṣawā’iq al-Muḥriqah*, pg. 28, section five on the misconceptions of the Shī‘ah, misconception 11, Egypt print, with *Taḥīr al-Jinān*; Muwaffaq ibn Aḥmad al-Makkī: *al-Manāqib li al-Imām al-A‘zam*, vol. 2 pg. 165; al-Kurdī: *al-Manāqib*, vol. 2 pg. 110, Dakkan print.

Bakr and Sayyidunā ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُمَا as misguided and erroneous and encourages love and friendship with Sayyidunā Abū Bakr and Sayyidunā ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُمَا.<sup>1</sup>

#### 4. The Ruling of Leasing Lands for Farming in Lieu of a Third or Fourth of the Produce

Imām Muḥammad al-Bāqir رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ has provided as evidence for the permissibility of the above ruling:

قال سمعت أبا جعفر يقول آل أبي بكر و آل عمر و آل علي يدفعون أرضهم بالثلث و الربع

I heard Abū Ja’far saying, “Abū Bakr’s, ‘Umar’s, and ‘Alī’s family would lease their lands in lieu of a third and fourth (of the produce).”<sup>2</sup>

It is apparent from this *istidlāl* that the religion of all these individuals was the same. They did not practice on another religion. They presented the senior’s actions as proof in religious rulings. This is a clear proof for their mutual goodwill, friendship, and religious faith.

#### 5. The Declaration of Imām Muḥammad al-Bāqir

Finally, we like to cite the declaration of Imām Muḥammad al-Bāqir رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ which both the Shī‘ī and Sunnī scholars have documented. It is reported on the authority of Kathīr al-Nawā’. There is no need to present proof for his adherence to Shī‘ism. Many points are deduced from this declaration, some of which are listed below:

- Sayyidunā Abū Bakr and Sayyidunā ‘Umar did not destroy the rights of the Ahl al-Bayt even to the weight of an atom.
- They are worthy of friendship and love in both worlds.

---

1 *Tafsīr al-Ṭabarī*, vol. 14 pg. 26, with Nīshāpūrī, under the verse: as brothers upon couches, facing each other; *Tafsīr Ibn Kathīr*, vol. 2 pg. 553, under same verse, Egypt print.

2 *Muṣannaf ‘Abd al-Razzāq*, vol. 8 pg. 101.



- Mughīrah and Bannān have fabricated lies in the name of the Imāms and propagated them among the Muslims.

قال أبو بكر (الجوهري) ... قال يحيى بن المتوكل أبو عقيل كثير النواء قلت لأبي جعفر محمد بن علي جعلني الله فداك أرايت أبا بكر و عمر هل ظلماكم من حقاكم شيئا أوقال ذهابا به من حقاكم فقال لا والذي أنزل القرآن على عبده ليكون للعلمين نذيرا ما ظلمانا من حقا منقال حبة من خردل قلت جعلت فداك أفأتولاهما قال نعم ويحك تولهما في الدنيا والآخرة و ما أصابك في عنقي ثم قال فعل الله بالمغيرة و بنان فإنهما كذبا علينا أهل البيت

Abū Bakr al-Jawharī says—Yaḥyā ibn al-Mutawākkil Abū ‘Aqīl Kathīr al-Nawā’ reports:

I said to Abū Ja’far Muḥammad ibn ‘Alī, “May I be sacrificed for you for Allah’s sake! Do you feel that Abū Bakr and ‘Umar deprived you of any of your rights—or he said: trampled your rights?”

He answered, “No. By the being who revealed the Qur’ān upon His special servant so that he may be a warner for the worlds, they did not deprive us of our rights to the extent of a mustard seed.”

I said, “May I be sacrificed for you, should I befriend them?”

“Yes, woe to you,” he yelled, “befriend them in the world and the Hereafter. And whatever calamity befalls you in your endeavour is on my shoulders.”

He continued, “May Allah deal with Mughīrah (ibn Sa’īd) and Bannān in a befitting manner for they have fabricated lies in our, the Ahl al-Bayt’s, name.”<sup>1</sup>

This declaration of Muḥammad al-Bāqir is extremely weighty and deserves supreme attention. We implore the readers to read over it again and again, and obtain guidance from it.

---

1 ‘Allāmah Nūr al-Dīn al-Sahmūdī: *Wafā’ al-Wafā’ bi Akhbār Dār al-Mustafa*, vol. 3 pg. 1001, chapter on his charity صلى الله عليه وسلم; *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*, vol. 4 pg. 113, discussion on Fadak, section one, Beirut print, Shām.

## Section Four

### The Statements of Imām Ja‘far al-Şādiq

This section will contain the statements of Imām Ja‘far al-Şādiq رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ in favour of Sayyidunā Abū Bakr and Sayyidunā ‘Umar رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُمَا, their virtue and honour. This has been discussed in great detail in the fifth chapter of the Şiddīqī section and will be reproduced here briefly.

#### 1. Those who do not Befriend Abū Bakr and ‘Umar will Not Receive Rasūlullāh’s صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ Intercession

عن سالم بن أبي حفصة قال قال جعفر بن محمد رضي الله عنه أبو بكر جدي أفسب الرجل جده لا نالتي شفاعة محمد إن لم أكن أتولاهما و أبرأ من عدوهما

Sālim ibn Abī Ḥafṣah reports that Ja‘far ibn Muḥammad رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ said:

Abū Bakr is my grandfather. Does anyone swear at his grandfather? May I not receive Muḥammad’s intercession if I do not befriend them and dissociate from their enemies.<sup>1</sup>

#### 2. Abū Bakr and ‘Umar were just leaders and steadfast on the truth, and Allah’s mercy upon them on the Day of Qiyāmah

فقال يا ابن رسول الله ما تقول في حق أبي بكر و عمر فقال عليه السلام هما إمامان عادلان قاسطان كانا على الحق و ماتا عليه فعليهما رحمة الله يوم القيامة

He asked, “O son of Rasūlullāh صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ! What do you say about Abū Bakr and ‘Umar?”

He replied, “They were just and fair leaders. They remained upon the truth and died upon the same. May Allah’s mercy be upon them on the Day of Qiyāmah.”<sup>2</sup>

1 *Sīrat ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb*, pg. 32, Egypt print; Imām Aḥmad: Kitāb al-sunnah, pg. 197, Makkah Mukarramah print.

2 *Iḥqāq al-Ḥaqq*, vol. 1 pg. 16, old Egypt print, vol. 1 pg. 70, new Tehran print, with footnotes of Najafī.

### 3. Ja‘far befriended Abū Bakr and ‘Umar and greeted them with the masnūn salām at their graves

والمروي عن جعفر بن محمد أنه كان يتولاهما و يأتي القبر فيسلم عليهما مع تسليمه على رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم

It is reported that Ja‘far ibn Muḥammad befriended them and would approach the grave and greet them when he greeted Rasūlullāh ﷺ.<sup>1</sup>

The scholars should also be notified that the author of *al-Shāfi* Sayyid Murtaḍā ‘Alam al-Hudā could not come up with any sensible answer to this. At the end, he was constrained to present the ancient solution of Taqiyah.

---

1 *Kitāb al-Shāfi*, pg. 238, with *Talkhīṣ al-Shāfi*, old print; *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*, vol. 4 pg. 140, Fadak discussion, third section.

## Section Five

### ‘Alī’s offspring with the Name ‘Umar

This is final section of chapter five. Hereunder, we wish to enlighten the readers that Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه named his children ‘Umar. Sayyidunā Ḥasan رضي الله عنه also named one of his sons ‘Umar. Similarly, the Shī‘ah have listed one of the sons of Sayyidunā Ḥusayn رضي الله عنه as ‘Umar. Likewise, Zayn al-‘abidin named one of his children after ‘Umar.

Sayyidunā ‘Umar’s رضي الله عنه name featuring among the children of Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه, generation after generation, is nothing accidental or coincidental, nor a once off happening. This was an authentic reality and practice which remained among the Imāms.

This proves with no uncertainty that there existed love, compassion, friendship, unity, etc., between Sayyidunā ‘Alī and Sayyidunā ‘Umar رضي الله عنه. There was no type of personal, religious, or political hatred, animosity, distaste, opposition, or enmity.

To prove this matter, the upcoming narrations are strong evidences. We will present quotations verbatim from books regarded reliable by the Shī‘ah seniors.

This aspect was discussed with detail in the seventh section of chapter five of the Ṣiddīqī section and citations from both Sunnī and Shī‘ī books were reproduced. We will suffice here on reproducing from Shī‘ī books for purposes of brevity.

#### 1. ‘Umar’s Blessed Name among the Offspring of ‘Alī

- a. The famous Shī‘ī historian Aḥmad ibn Abī Ya‘qūb ibn Ja‘far al-Kātib (d. 258/259 A.H.) in his *Tārīkh Ya‘qūbī* while enumerating the sons of Sayyidunā ‘Alī رضي الله عنه lists ‘Umar ibn ‘Alī as number eleven. The text reads:

وكان له من الولد الذكور أربعة عشر ذكرا الحسن والحسين ومحسن مات صغيرا أمهم فاطمة بنت رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم ... و عمر أمه أم حبيب بنت ربيعة البكرية إلخ

He had 14 sons viz. Ḥasan, Ḥusayn, Muḥassin who passed away in infancy—their mother is Fāṭimah bint Rasūlullāh ﷺ... and ‘Umar whose mother is Umm Ḥabīb bint Rabī‘ah al-Bakriyyah.<sup>1</sup>

- b. The renowned Shīrī scholar, al-Mufīd (Muḥammad ibn Muḥammad ibn al-Nu‘mān) (d. 413 A.H.) in his *al-Irshād*, in the chapter of Amīr al-Mu‘minīn’s offspring, enumerates 27 children of his with their names. Beginning with Ḥasan and Ḥusayn, he lists ‘Umar and Ruqayyah at number 6 and 7, considering them as twins. He writes:

و عمر و رقية كانا توأمين

‘Umar and Ruqayyah were twins.<sup>2</sup>

- c. The prominent gatherer of virtues and genealogist of the Shī‘ah ‘Alī ibn Īsā Arbīlī lists 14 sons and 19 daughters of Sayyidunā ‘Alī ﷺ in his book *Kashf al-Ghummah fī Ma‘rifat al-A‘immah*. ‘Umar ibn ‘Alī features number 13 on his list:

الذكور الحسن والحسين ومحمد الأكبر عبيد الله وأبو بكر والعباس وعثمان وجعفر وعبد الله ومحمد الأصغر ويحيى وعون وعمر ومحمد الأوسط عليهم السلام

Sons: Ḥasan, Ḥusayn, Muḥammad al-Akbar, ‘Ubayd Allāh, Abū Bakr, ‘Abbās, ‘Uthmān, Ja‘far, ‘Abd Allāh, Muḥammad al-Aṣghar, Yaḥyā, ‘Awn, ‘Umar, and Muḥammad al-Awsaṭ—may peace be upon them.<sup>3</sup>

- d. Sayyid Jamāl al-Dīn Aḥmad ibn ‘Alī commonly known as Ibn ‘Inabah (d. 828 A.H.) mentions in section five of *‘Umdat al-Ṭālib fī Ansāb Āl Abī Ṭālib*:

1 *Tārīkh Ya‘qūbī*, vol. 2 pg. 213, biography of ‘Alī al-Murtaḍā, new Beirut print.

2 *Al-Irshād*, pg. 167 – 168, new Tehran print.

3 *Kashf al-Ghummah fī Ma‘rifat al-A‘immah*, vol. 1 pg. 590, with *Tarjamat al-Manāqib*, new print, Tabrez Tehran.

ذكر عقب عمر الأطراف بن أمير المؤمنين عليه السلام أمه الصهباء التعلبية

Discussion on the children of ‘Umar al-Aṭraf ibn Amīr al-Mu‘minīn عليه السلام.  
His mother is al-Ṣahbā’ al-Tha‘labiyah from the captives of Yamāmah.<sup>1</sup>

- e. Mullā Al-Bāqir Majlisī (d. 1110/1111) the legendary Shī‘ī mujtahid of the 11th century begins a chapter on the number of martyrs of the Ahl al-Bayt (who were martyred on the Day of ‘Āshūrā’) in *Jalā’ al-‘Uyūn* (Persian). He writes:

نز نفر از فرزندان امیر المؤمنین حضرت سید الشهدا و عباس و پسر او محمد و عمر و عثمان و جعفر و ابراهیم و عبد الله اصغر و محمد اصغر پسران امیر المؤمنین علیه السلام

Nine of the children of Amīr al-Mu‘minīn: Sayyid al-Shuhadā’ (Ḥusayn), ‘Abbās, his grandson Muḥammad, ‘Umar, ‘Uthmān, Ja‘far, Ibrāhīm, and ‘Abd Allāh Aṣghar and Muḥammad Aṣghar—the grandsons of Amīr al-Mu‘minīn.<sup>2</sup>

- f. Section six of *Muntahā al-Āmāl* of ‘Abbās al-Qummī of the 14th century has a list of the issue of Sayyidunā ‘Alī Amīr al-Mu‘minīn عليه السلام:

عمر و رقیه کبری ست که هر دو تن توام از مادر متولد شدند و مادر ایشان ام حبیب دختر ربیعہ است

‘Umar and Ruqayyah the eldest both were born to an *umm walad*<sup>3</sup>, Umm Ḥabīb bint Rabī‘ah.<sup>4</sup>

(Umm Ḥabīb is also called al-Ṣahbā’ al-Tha‘labiyah.)

- g. ‘Abbās Qummī writes the biography of this son in *Tuḥfat al-Aḥbāb*:

1 *‘Umdat al-Ṭālib*, pg. 361, Najaf Ashraf print, Iraq, latest edition of Ḥaydariyyah publishers.

2 *Jalā’ al-‘Uyūn*, pg. 464 – 465, Tehran print, 1334 edition.

3 A slave girl who gives birth to the children of her Master, and will be freed on the death of her owner.

4 *Muntahā al-Āmāl*, vol. 1 pg. 187 – 192.

عمر بن علی بن ابی طالب کنیت اش ابو القاسم مادرش صہباء است و با رقیہ توأم بدنیا ایدہ و اِنجَناب بفساحت زبان و سماحت طبع معروف بود ... و او اِخر کس ست از پسران امیر المومنین کہ وفات کردہ اِخ

‘Umar ibn ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib: His agnomen was Abū al-Qāsim. His mother was Ṣahbā’. He entered the world as a twin with his sister Ruqayyah. He was famous for his eloquence and magnanimity. And he is the last son of Amīr al-Mu’minīn to pass away.<sup>1</sup>

### The summary of these narrations:

- Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ had a son by the name ‘Umar.
- His agnomen was Abū al-Qāsim and his title was al-Aṭraf.
- He was born as a twin with his sister Ruqayyah bint ‘Alī.
- Their mother’s name was al-Ṣahbā’ al-Tha‘labiyyah al-Bakriyyah who was captured from the Banū Taghlib tribe during the Ṣiddīqī khilāfah. Her agnomen was Umm Ḥabīb. She is the daughter of Rabī‘ah. She was gifted to Sayyidunā ‘Alī by Sayyidunā Abū Bakr رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُمَا.
- ‘Umar was very eloquent and magnanimous.
- He was the last son of Sayyidunā ‘Alī رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ to leave this world.

## 2. ‘Umar’s Name among the Children of Ḥasan

- a. Aḥmad ibn Ya‘qūb ibn Ja‘far states that Sayyidunā Ḥasan رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ had 8 sons. His third son was ‘Umar.

و كان للحسن من الولد ثمانية ذكور وهم الحسن بن الحسن (المثنى) و أمه خولة بنت منظور الفزارية و زيد بن الحسن و أمه أم بشر بنت أبي مسعود الأنصاري الخزرجي و عمر و القاسم و أبو بكر و عبد الرحمن لأمهات أولاد شتى و طلحة و عبيد الله

Ḥasan had eight sons. They are: Ḥasan ibn al-Ḥasan (al-Muthannā) whose mother is Khawlah bint Manzūr al-Fazāriyyah; Zayd ibn al-Ḥasan whose

1 *Tuḥfat al-Aḥbāb*, pg. 251 – 252, ‘Umar ibn ‘Alī.

mother is Umm Bishr bint Abī Mas‘ūd al-Ansari al-Khazrajī; ‘Umar, Qāsim, Abū Bakr, and ‘Abd al-Raḥmān—from various umm walads; Ṭalḥah and ‘Ubayd Allāh.<sup>1</sup>

- b. Mufīd as well as al-Arbīlī have dedicated a section to the biography of Ḥasan (al-Muthannā) ibn al-Imām al-Ḥasan رضي الله عنه wherein he lists ‘Umar ibn al-Ḥasan as one of Ḥasan al-Muthannā’s sons as well as Abū Bakr ibn al-Ḥasan.<sup>2</sup>
- c. Ibn ‘Inabah has enumerated Zayd, Ḥasan al-Muthannā, ‘Abd Allāh (whose agnomen is Abū Bakr), ‘Umar, etc. as the sons of Sayyidunā Ḥasan رضي الله عنه.<sup>3</sup>
- d. Mullā Al-Bāqir Majlisī lists the martyrs of Karbalā’ in *Jalā’ al-‘Uyūn*:

و چهار نفر از فرزندان امام حسن ابو بكر و عبد الله و قاسم و بشر و بعضی بجائے بشر عمر گفته اند و از فرزندان امام حسین آنچه مشهور ست علی اکبر و عبد الله که در کنار حضرت شهید شد و بعضی ابراهیم و محمد و حمزه و علی دیگر و جعفر و عمر و زید گفته اند

Four from the sons of Imām Ḥasan, viz. Abū Bakr, ‘Abd Allāh, Qāsim, and Bishr. Some have substituted Bishr with ‘Umar. And from the sons of Imām Ḥusayn, these are the famous figures ‘Alī Akbar, ‘Abd Allāh who was martyred alongside him, Ibrāhīm, Muḥammad, Hamzah, ‘Alī the second, Ja‘far, ‘Umar, and Zayd.<sup>4</sup>

- e. ‘Abbās al-Qummī states while discussing the children of Imām Ḥasan رضي الله عنه:

---

1 *Tārīkh Ya‘qūbī*, vol. 2 pg. 228, list of the children of Imām Ḥasan ibn ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib, new Beirut print.

2 *Al-Irshād*, pg. 176, chapter on discussion on the children of Ḥasan ibn ‘Alī رضي الله عنه; *Kashf al-Ghummah*, vol. 2 pg. 158, Tabrez print, Iran, with Tarjamat *al-Manāqib* Fārisī.

3 *‘Umdat al-Ṭālib*, pg. 81, discussion on Imām Ḥasan’s offspring, Ḥaydariyyah Publishers print, Najaf Ashraf, Iraq.

4 *Jalā’ al-‘Uyūn*, pg. 464 – 465, chapter on the number of he martyrs of the Ahl al-Bayt martyred on the day of ‘Āshūrā’.



‘Umar ibn al-Ḥasan and two full brothers Qāsim and ‘Abd Allāh. Their mother was an Umm Walad.<sup>1</sup>

## Summary

- Imām Ḥasan Mujtabā ibn ‘Alī al-Murtaḍā رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُمَا had eight sons, with difference of some narrations.
- ‘Umar ibn al-Ḥasan is one son by consensus.
- His mother was an Umm Walad.
- According to some scholars he was killed with his uncle Sayyidunā Ḥusayn رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ on the plains of Karbalā’.

## 3. ‘Umar’s Name in the Progeny of Zayn al-‘abidin

- a. In *Uṣūl al-Kāfi*, book on proof, chapter on the decision taken between the claim of truth and falsehood in the matter of Imāmah, Muḥammad ibn Ya‘qūb al-Kulaynī records an incident of condolence which makes mention of ‘Umar ibn ‘Alī ibn al-Ḥusayn. The text is:

عن عبد الله بن إبراهيم بن محمد الجعفري قال أتينا خديجة بنت عمر بن علي بن الحسين بن علي بن أبي طالب عليهم السلام نعزيها بآبن بنتها فوجدنا عندها موسى بن عبد الله بن الحسن فإذا هي في ناحية قريبا من النساء فعزيناها

‘Abd Allāh ibn Ibrāhīm ibn Muḥammad al-Ja‘farī reports:

We came to Khadijah bint ‘Umar ibn ‘Alī ibn al-Ḥusayn ibn ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ to give her condolence over the death of her nephew. We found Mūsā ibn ‘Abd Allāh ibn al-Ḥasan by her. She was in the corner close to the women. We conveyed our condolences to her.<sup>2</sup>

1 *Muntahā al-Āmāl*, vol. 1 pg. 240, Tehran print.

2 *Uṣūl al-Kāfi*, pg. 225, Nawl Kashawr print, Lucknow.

- b. In the chapter of the children of ‘Alī ibn al-Ḥusayn, Muḥammad lists 15 of his children, viz. Muḥammad al-Bāqir, ‘Abd Allāh, Ḥasan, Ḥusayn, Zayd, ‘Umar, Ḥusayn al-Aṣghar, ‘Abd al-Raḥmān, Sulaymān, ‘Alī, etc. ‘Umar’s name appears sixth on the list. After the 10 sons, the daughters were listed.<sup>1</sup>
- c. ‘Alī ibn Īsā al-Arbilī lists the names of Zayn al-‘Ābidīn’s children. He lists Muḥammad al-Bāqir first, Zayd second, and ‘Umar third. (Zayd and ‘Umar’s mother was an Umm Walad.)<sup>2</sup>
- d. There is mention of ‘Umar ibn Zayn al-‘Ābidīn in ‘*Umdat al-Ṭālib*.<sup>3</sup>
- e. ‘Abbās al-Qummī has written in *Muntahā al-Āmāl* while discussing the children of Zayn al-‘abidin:

... زید و عمر از ام ولد دیگر الخ

Zayd and ‘Umar from another Umm Walad.<sup>4</sup>

- f. The same author lists Zayn al-‘Ābidīn’s son ‘Umar al-Ashraf while enumerating all individuals with the name ‘Umar in *Tuḥfat al-Aḥbāb*. He praises and compliments him extensively. He says:

عمر از فضلای تابعین و جلیل القدر صاحب ورع و والی صدقات پیغمبر و امیر المؤمنین بوده الخ

‘Umar was among the distinguished Tābi‘īn, a man of dignity, abstinence, and administrator of the charity of Rasūlullāh ﷺ and Amīr al-Mu‘minīn.<sup>5</sup>

1 *Al-Irshād*, pg. 244, new Tehran print, 1377 edition.

2 *Kashf al-Ghummah*, vol. 2 pg. 284, chapter on the children of ‘Alī ibn al-Ḥusayn رَحْمَةُ اللَّهِ.

3 ‘*Umdat al-Ṭālib*, pg. 194, section two, pg. 305, maqṣad four, Ḥaydariyyah print, Najaf Ashraf, Iraq.

4 *Muntahā al-Āmāl*, vol. 2 pg. 43, 45, 46, the children of Zayn al-‘abidin.

5 *Tuḥfat al-Aḥbāb*, pg. 257, under the names ‘Umar, Tehran print.

## Concluding Words

This brings the Fārūqī section of *Ruḥamā' Baynahum* to a close. This is the second volume of this book.

We would just like to present to the honoured readers a brief summary of the main aspects highlighted in this volume. This volume was divided into five chapters and each chapter was sub-divided into 2, 4, or 5 sections. All in all, there were 17 sections which covered and encompassed a myriad of focusses and themes.

The amiable relationship Sayyidunā 'Umar رضي الله عنه enjoyed with Sayyidunā 'Alī, his noble wife, and his children has been discussed thoroughly. Our objective was not to encompass all the beautiful moments they shared, nor is this possible. This aspect is extremely vast and all the books are not at my disposal. Moreover, it is a mammoth task to encompass all the books that are available. I have gathered whatever I could according to my limited ability. May Allah سُبْحَانَهُ وَتَعَالَى accept our humble efforts.

This was only an academic and practical manifestation of the Glorious Lord's declaration: *They are merciful among themselves*. This is a humble service in front of the great services the seniors of religion and legends of our Ummah have rendered. May Allah سُبْحَانَهُ وَتَعَالَى accept it and resurrect us in their noble company and grant us their companionship in the hereafter. This will be an illustration of His vast Benevolence and all Encompassing Magnanimity.

After this, the third volume, labelled 'Uthmānī, will follow. If Allah's سُبْحَانَهُ وَتَعَالَى special assistance is our attendant, then it will be brought to a conclusion. And help is sought only from Allah سُبْحَانَهُ وَتَعَالَى, and reliance is placed solely upon Him. May Allah send His salutations and peace upon the choicest of His creation, the crème de la crème, and upon his family, and Companions.

*This humble servant: Muḥammad Nāfi' (May Allah forgive him)*

*Jāmi'ah Muḥammadī Sharīf, Jhang, Pakistan.*

## Bibliography

#	Name of Book	Name of Author	Year of Demise (A.H.)
1	<i>Muwatta'</i>	Imām Malik	179
2	<i>Kitāb al-Kharāj</i>	Imām Abū Yūsuf	182
3	<i>Kitāb al-Āthār</i>	Imām Abū Yūsuf	182
4	<i>Kitāb al-Āthār</i>	Imām Muḥammad	189
5	<i>Kitāb al-Ḥujjah</i>	Imām Muḥammad	189
6	<i>Kitāb al-Kharāj</i>	Yaḥyā ibn Ādam al-Qurashī	203
7	<i>Al-Muṣannaf</i>	ʿAbd al-Razzāq Ṣanʿānī	211
8	<i>Musnad Ḥumaydī</i>	Ḥāfiẓ Abū Bakr ʿAbd Allāh al-Zubayr Ḥumaydī	219
9	<i>Kitāb al-Amwāl</i>	Abū ʿUbayd Qāsim ibn Sallām	224
10	<i>Gharīb al-Ḥadīth</i>	Abū ʿUbayd Qāsim ibn Sallām	224
11	<i>Al-Sunan</i>	Saʿīd ibn Manṣūr	227
12	<i>Al-Ṭabaqāt</i>	Muḥammad ibn Saʿd	230/235
13	<i>Al-Muṣannaf</i>	Abū Bakr ʿAbd Allāh ibn Muḥammad ibn Abī Shaybah	235
14	<i>Nasab Quraysh</i>	Abū ʿAbd Allāh al-Muṣʿab ibn ʿAbd Allāh ibn Muṣʿab al-Zubayrī	236
15	<i>Tārīkh Khalīfah ibn Khayyāt</i>	Khalīfah ibn Khayyāt, Abū ʿAmr	240
16	<i>Al-Musnad with selections from Kanz al-ʿUmmāl</i>	Imām Aḥmad ibn Ḥambal	241
17	<i>Kitāb al-Muḥabbar</i>	Abū Jaʿfar Muḥammad ibn Ḥabīb ibn Umayyah al-Baghdādī	245
18	<i>Al-Tārīkh al-Kabīr</i>	Imām Muḥammad ibn Ismāʿīl al-Bukhārī	256

19	<i>Al-Tārīkh al-Şaghīr</i>	Imām Muḥammad ibn Ismā'īl al-Bukhārī	256
20	<i>Şahīḥ al-Bukhārī</i>	Imām Muḥammad ibn Ismā'īl al-Bukhārī	256
21	<i>Şahīḥ Muslim</i>	Imām Muslim ibn Ḥajjāj al-Qushayrī	260
22	<i>Al-Sunan</i>	Abū 'Abd Allāh Muḥammad ibn Yazīd Mājah (Ibn Mājah)	273/275
23	<i>Kitāb al-Marāsīl</i>	Abū Dāwūd Sulaymān ibn Ash'ath al-Sijistānī	275
24	<i>Jāmi' al-Tirmidhī</i>	Abū 'Īsā Muḥammad ibn 'Īsā al-Tirmidhī	275/279
25	<i>Sunan Abī Dāwūd</i>	Abū Dāwūd Sulaymān ibn Ash'ath al-Sijistānī	275
26	<i>Al-Ma'ārif</i>	Ibn Qutaybah, Abū Muḥammad 'Abd Allāh ibn Muslim ibn Qutaybah al-Kātib al-Dīnawarī	276
28	<i>Futūḥ al-Buldān</i>	Ibn Qutaybah, Abū Muḥammad 'Abd Allāh ibn Muslim ibn Qutaybah al-Kātib al-Dīnawarī	276
29	<i>Kitāb Qiyām al-Layl wa Qiyām Ramadan</i>	Şaykh Muḥammad ibn Naşr al-Marwazī	294
30	<i>Musnad Abī Ya'lā</i>	Aḥmad ibn 'Alī al-Mawşilī	307
31	<i>Tārīkh al-Umam wa l-Mulūk</i>	Abū Ja'far al-Ṭabarī	310
32	<i>Kitāb al-Kunā wa al-Asmā'</i>	Abū Bashar Muḥammad ibn Aḥmad ibn Ḥammād al-Dūlābī	310
33	<i>Sharḥ Ma'ānī al-Āthār</i>	Imām al-Ṭaḥāwī	321
34	<i>Kitāb al-Amālī</i>	Abū Qāsim 'Abd al-Raḥmān ibn Ishāq al-Dhujājī	340

35	<i>Sunan al-Dāraquṭnī</i>	Abū al-Ḥasan ‘Alī ibn ‘Umar Al-Dāraquṭnī	
36	<i>Al-Mustadrak</i>	Abū ‘Abd Allāh Muḥammad ibn ‘Abd Allāh al-Ḥākim al-Nīshāpūrī	405
37	<i>Ḥilyat al-Awliyā</i>	Abū Nu‘aym Aḥmad ibn ‘Abd Allāh al-Aṣbahānī	430
38	<i>Faḍā’il Abī Bakr al-Ṣiddīq with other articles like Sharḥ Thulāthiyyāt al-Bukhārī, etc.</i>	Abū Ṭālib Muḥammad ibn ‘Alī ibn al-Fatḥ al-Ḥarbī al-‘Ushārī	446
39	<i>Jamharat Ansāb al-‘Arab</i>	Abū Muḥammad ‘Alī ibn Aḥmad ibn Sa’īd, Ibn Ḥazm al-Zāhirī al-Andulusī	456
40	<i>Al-Sunan al-Kubrā</i>	Abū Bakr Aḥmad ibn Ḥusayn al-Bayhaqī	458
41	<i>Al-Istī‘āb with Al-Iṣābah of Ibn Ḥajar</i>	Ibn ‘Abd al-Barr Abī ‘Amr Yūsuf ibn ‘Abd al-Barr al-Namarī	463
42	<i>Kitāb al-Kifāyah fī ‘ilm al-Riwāyah</i>	Khaṭīb al-Baghdādī	463
43	<i>Kitāb al-Tamhīd</i>	Ibn ‘Abd al-Barr	463
44	<i>Jāmi’ Bayān al-‘Ilm</i>	Ibn ‘Abd al-Barr	463
45	<i>Uṣūl Fakhṛ al-Islam with Sharḥ Kashf al-Asrār</i>	‘Alī ibn Muḥammad al-Bazdawī	482
46	<i>Uṣūl Sarakhsī</i>	Shams al-A’immah Abū Bakr Muḥammad ibn Aḥmad ibn Abī Sahl al-Sarakhsī	483/490

47	<i>Al-Manāqib li al-Imām A'zam</i>	Al-Muwaḥḥid ibn Aḥmad al-Makkī	568
48	<i>Sharḥ al-Sunnah</i>	Imām al-Baghawī Abū Muḥammad Ḥusayn ibn Mas'ūd al-Farrā' al-Baghawī	516
49	<i>Talkhīṣ Ibn 'Asākir</i>	Ibn Badrān	571
50	<i>Sīrat 'Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb</i>	Ibn Jazarī Abū al-Farj ibn al-Jawzī	597
51	<i>Usd al-Ghābah</i>	Ibn al-Athīr 'Izz al-Dīn	630
52	<i>Al-Tārīkh al-Kāmil</i>	Ibn Athīr al-Jazarī	630
53	<i>Muqaddamah Ibn Ṣalāḥ</i>	Abū 'Amr 'Uthmān ibn Ṣalāḥ Shahrazūrī	643
54	<i>Jāmi' Masānīd Imām A'zam</i>	Qāḍī Khawārizmī Abū al-Muayyad Muḥammad ibn Maḥmūd ibn Muḥammad al-Khawārizmī	665
55	<i>Al-Riyāḍ al-Naḍīrah bi Manāqib al-'Asharah al-Mubasharah</i>	Abū Ja'far Aḥmad Muḥibb al-Ṭabarī	694
56	<i>Tafsīr Madārik</i>	Abū al-Barakāt 'Abd Allāh ibn Aḥmad ibn Mahmud al-Nasaḥī	701
57	<i>Al-Fatāwā al-Kubrā</i>	Ḥāfiẓ Ibn Taymiyyah al-Ḥarrānī	728
58	<i>Tafsīr Gharā'ib al-Qur'ān</i>	Nizām al-Dīn Ḥasan ibn Muḥammad ibn Ḥusayn al-Qummī al-Nīshāpūrī	730
59	<i>Mishkāt al-Maṣābīḥ</i>	Walī al-Dīn Khaṭīb al-Tabrezi	737 (date authored)

60	<i>Tafsīr Baḥr al-Muḥīṭ</i>	Athīr al-Dīn Abū ‘Abd Allāh Muḥammad ibn Yūsuf Abū Ḥayyān al-Andulusī	745/754
61	<i>Tadhkirat al-Ḥuffāz</i>	Shams al-Dīn Abū ‘Abd Allāh ibn ‘Uthmān al-Dhahabī	748
62	<i>Siyar A’lām al-Nubalā’</i>	Al-Dhahabī	748
63	<i>Al-Bā’ith al-Ḥathīth</i>	Ibn Kathīr ‘Imād al-Dīn Abū al-Fidā’ al-Dimashqī	774/775
64	<i>Tafsīr Ibn Kathīr</i>	Ibn Kathīr ‘Imād al-Dīn Abū al-Fidā’ al-Dimashqī	774/775
65	<i>Al-Bidāyah wa al-Nihāyah</i>	Ibn Kathīr ‘Imād al-Dīn Abū al-Fidā’ al-Dimashqī	774/775
66	<i>Majma‘ al-Zawā‘id</i>	Nūr al-Dīn al-Haythamī	807
67	<i>Al-Manāqib li Imām A‘zam</i>	Shaykh Muḥammad ibn Muḥammad ibn Shihāb al-Kurdī	827
68	<i>Lisān al-Mizān</i>	Ḥāfiẓ Ibn Ḥajar Abū al-Faḍl Aḥmad ibn ‘Alī al-‘Asqalānī	852
69	<i>Tahdhīb al-Tahdhīb</i>	Ḥāfiẓ Ibn Ḥajar Abū al-Faḍl Aḥmad ibn ‘Alī al-‘Asqalānī	852
70	<i>Kitāb al-Is‘āf fi Aḥkām al-Awqāf</i>	Shaykh Burhān al-Dīn ibn Mūsā al-Ṭarābulusī	905
71	<i>Wafā’ al-Wafā’ bi Akhbār Dār al-Mustafa</i>	‘Allāmah Nūr al-Dīn al-Sahmūdī	911
72	<i>Tārīkh al-Khulafā’</i>	Jalāl al-Dīn al-Suyūṭī	911
73	<i>Tanzīh al-Sharīah al-Marfū‘ah</i>	‘Alī ibn Muḥammad ibn ‘Irāq al-Kinānī	963



74	<i>As-Ṣawā'iq al-Muḥriqah</i>	Ibn Ḥajar al-Makkī Shihāb al-Dīn Aḥmad ibn Ḥajar al-Haythamī	973/5
75	<i>Kanz al-'Ummāl</i>	'Alī Muttaqī al-Hindī	975
76	<i>Kashf al-Zunūn</i>	Ḥājī Khalīfah Mustafā ibn 'Abd Allāh Kātib Chalbī	1067/1068
77	<i>Izālat al-Khafā 'an Khilāfat al-Khulafā'</i>	Shāh Walī Allah Muḥaddith al-Dahlawī	1176
78	<i>Nabrās Sharḥ Sharḥ 'Aqā'id</i>	Moulānā 'Abd al-'Azīz Parhār wī	1239
79	<i>Tuḥfat Ithnā 'Ashariyyah</i>	Shāh 'Abd al-'Azīz al-Dahlawī	1239
80	<i>Rūḥ al-Ma'ānī</i>	Sayyid Mahmud Ālūsī	1270

## Shīī books

1	<i>Tārīkh Ya‘qūbī</i>	Aḥmad ibn Abī Ya‘qūb ibn Ja‘far al-Kātib al-‘Abbāsī	256/258
2	<i>Akhbār al-Ṭiwāl</i>	Abū Ḥanīfah Aḥmad ibn Dawūd al-Dīnawarī	282
3	<i>Qurb al-Isnād</i>	‘Abd Allāh ibn Ja‘far al-Ḥimyarī Abū al-‘Abbās al-Qummī	3rd century
4	<i>Uṣūl al-Kāfī</i>	Muḥammad ibn Ya‘qūb al-Kulaynī al-Rāzī	329
5	<i>Furū‘ Al-Kāfī</i>	Muḥammad ibn Ya‘qūb al-Kulaynī al-Rāzī	329
6	<i>Murūj al-Dhahab</i>	Abd al-Ḥasan ‘Alī ibn Ḥusayn ibn ‘Alī al-Mas‘ūdī	346
7	<i>‘Ilal al-Sharā‘i‘</i>	Ṣadūq Abū Ja‘far Muḥammad ibn ‘Alī ibn Bābawayh al-Qummī	381
8	<i>Ma‘ānī al-Akhbār</i>	Ṣadūq Abū Ja‘far Muḥammad ibn ‘Alī ibn Bābawayh al-Qummī	381
9	<i>Rijāl Kashshī</i>	Abū ‘Amr Muḥammad ibn ‘Umar ibn ‘Abd al-‘Azīz al-Kashshī	4th century
10	<i>Nahj al-Balāghah</i>	Sayyid Sharīf Raḍī ‘Abd al-Ḥasan Muḥammad ibn Abī Aḥmad Ḥusayn	404
11	<i>Tanzīh al-Ambiyā‘</i>	Sayyid Murtaḍā ‘Alam al-Hudā	406
12	<i>Kitāb al-Shāfi‘i with Talkhīṣ al-Shāfi‘i</i>	Sayyid Murtaḍā ‘Alam al-Hudā	406
13	<i>Kitāb al- Irshād</i>	Al-Mufīd (Muḥammad ibn Nu‘mān)	413
14	<i>Al-Amālī</i>	Abū Ja‘far Muḥammad ibn Ḥasan Shaykh al-Ṭā‘ifah Ṭūsī	460
15	<i>Tahdhīb al-Aḥkām</i>	Abū Ja‘far Muḥammad ibn Ḥasan al-Ṭūsī	460
16	<i>Al-Istibṣār</i>	Abū Ja‘far Muḥammad ibn Ḥasan al-Ṭūsī	460

17	<i>Al-Ihtijāj</i>	Abū Manşūr Aḥmad ibn ‘Alī at-Ṭabarī	548
18	<i>Manāqib Khawārizmī</i>	Akhṭab Khawārizm al-Muwaffaq ibn Aḥmad ibn Muḥammad al-Bakrī al-Makkī	568
19	<i>Manāqib Ibn Shaharāshūb</i>	Muḥammad ibn ‘Alī ibn Shaharāshūb Māzindarānī	588
20	<i>Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah (Ḥadīdī)</i>	Abū Ḥāmid ‘Abd al-Hamīd Bahā’ al-Dīn Muḥammad al-Madā’inī ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd	656
21	<i>Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah (Ibn Maytham)</i>	Kamāl al-Dīn Maytham ibn ‘Alī ibn Maytham al-Baḥrānī	679
22	<i>Kashf al-Ghummah fī Ma’rifat al-A’immah with Tarjamat al-Manāqib Fārisī</i>	‘Alī ibn ‘Īsā al-Arbīlī	
23	<i>‘Umdat al-Ṭālib fī Ansāb Āl Abī Ṭālib</i>	Sayyid Jamāl al-Dīn ibn ‘Inabah	828
24	<i>Ma’ālim al-Uṣūl</i>	Sayyid Jamāl al-Dīn Abū Manşūr Ḥasan ibn Zayn al-Dīn	1011
25	<i>Iḥqāq al-Ḥaqq</i>	Qāḍī Nūr Allah Shūstarī	1019
26	<i>Majālis al-Mu’minīn</i>	Qāḍī Nūr Allah Shūstarī	1019
27	<i>Bihār al-Anwār</i>	Mullā al-Bāqir Majlisī	1111
28	<i>Jalā’ al-‘Uyūn</i>	Mullā al-Bāqir Majlisī	1111
29	<i>Bihār al-Anwār</i>	Mullā Al-Bāqir Majlisī	1111
30	<i>Ḥaqq al-Yaqīn</i>	Mullā Al-Bāqir Majlisī	1111
31	<i>Ḥamlah Ḥaydarī</i>	Mirzā Rafī’ Bādhil Īrānī	1119 date authored
32	<i>Al-Durrah al-Najfiyyah Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah</i>	Ibrāhīm ibn Ḥājī Ḥusayn al-Dunbulī	1291

33	<i>Nāsikh al-Tawārīkh</i>	Mirzā Muḥammad Taqī Lisān al-Mulk Wazīr Aʿẓam Qāchār Shah Iran	1297
34	<i>Tārīkh Ṭarāz Madh-hab Muẓaffarī</i>		13th century
35	<i>Tanqīḥ al-Maqāl</i>	ʿAbd Allāh al-Māmaqānī	1300
36	<i>Muntahā al-Āmāl</i>	ʿAbbās al-Qummī	1359
37	<i>Tuḥfat al-Aḥbāb</i>	ʿAbbās al-Qummī	1359
38	<i>Muntahā al-Āmāl</i>	ʿAbbās al-Qummī	1359
39	<i>Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah Tarjamah Fārisī</i>	Fayḍ al-Islām Sayyid ʿAlī Naqī	1362 date authored
40	<i>Tarjamah Maṣāʾib al-Nawāṣib Fārisī</i>	Mirzā Muḥammad ʿAlī Rashtī	1334
41	<i>Falak al-Najāh fī al-Imāmah wa al-Ṣalāh</i>	Amīr Sīn Ḥakīm Muḥammad ʿAlī Jhangwī	14th century

